



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
The National Assembly for Wales**

**Cofnod y Trafodion
The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mercher, 21 Tachwedd 2012
Wednesday, 21 November 2012**

Cynnwys
Contents

3	Datganiad: Bil Is-ddeddfau Llywodraeth Leol (Cymru) Statement: Local Government Byelaws (Wales) Bill
3	Cwestiynau i Weinidog yr Amgylchedd a Datblygu Cynaliadwy Questions to the Minister for Environment and Sustainable Development
24	Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog Tai, Adfywio a Threftadaeth Questions to the Minister for Housing, Regeneration and Heritage
44	Datganiad gan y Llywydd Statement by the Presiding Officer
44	Cynnig i Atal Rheolau Sefydlog mewn perthynas â'r Dyddiad Cau ar gyfer Cyflwyno Busnes ar 2 Ionawr 2013 Motion to Suspend Standing Orders in relation to Tabling Deadlines on 2 January 2013
45	Cynnig Gweithdrefnol Procedural Motion
45	Dadl y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig: Pwysau'r Gaeaf Welsh Conservatives Debate: Winter Pressures
71	Dadl Plaid Cymru: Y Gyllideb Ewropeaidd Plaid Cymru Debate: The European Budget
100	Dadl Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru: Y Cod Gweinidogol Welsh Liberal Democrats Debate: The Ministerial Code
117	Cyfnod Pleidleisio Voting Time

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were
spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 1.30 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd (Rosemary Butler) yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 1.30 p.m. with the Presiding Officer (Rosemary Butler) in the Chair.*

**Datganiad: Bil Is-ddeddfau Llywodraeth Leol (Cymru)
Statement: Local Government Byelaws (Wales) Bill**

The Presiding Officer: The National Assembly for Wales is now in session. Members will be aware that the Supreme Court ruled this morning that the Local Government Byelaws (Wales) Bill is within the legislative competence of the Assembly. [Applause.] I welcome today's judgment and I am grateful to the Supreme Court for its thorough examination of the matter. I will today dispatch the letters patent to Her Majesty for Royal Assent and I will inform Members once assent has been given.

Y Llywydd: Mae Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn awr yn eistedd. Bydd yr Aelodau yn ymwybodol i'r Goruchaf Lys ddyfarnu y bore yma fod Bil Is-ddeddfau Llywodraeth Leol (Cymru) o fewn cymhwysedd deddfwriaethol y Cynulliad. [Cymeradwyaeth.] Croesawaf y dyfarniad heddiw, ac rwy'n ddiolchgar i'r Goruchaf Lys am ei archwiliad trylwyr o'r mater. Byddaf heddiw yn anfon y llythyrau patent at Ei Mawrhydi i gael Cydsyniad Brenhinol, a byddaf yn hysbysu'r Aelodau unwaith bod cydsyniad wedi ei roi.

**Cwestiynau i Weinidog yr Amgylchedd a Datblygu Cynaliadwy
Questions to the Minister for Environment and Sustainable Development**

Canllawiau Amgylcheddol

1. Simon Thomas: *Pa ganllawiau amgylcheddol sydd ar waith ynghylch tynnu dwr o afonydd ar gyfer cynlluniau ynni. OAQ(4)0195(ESD)*

Gweinidog yr Amgylchedd a Datblygu Cynaliadwy (John Griffiths): Mae Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yn rheoleiddio tynnu dŵr o'n hafonydd. Mae canllaw ar gael o'r enw 'Good Practice Guidelines on Hydropower' er 2009, sy'n seiliedig ar waith a wnaed gan Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd ar y cyd â Chymdeithas Ynni Dŵr Prydain. Mae'r canllaw hwn yn cael ei adolygu ar hyn o bryd.

Simon Thomas: Fel y dywedwch, mae'r canllaw sydd ar waith ar hyn o bryd yn cael ei adolygu, sy'n peri tipyn o ofid i un o'm hetholwyr, sy'n ffermio Glancrychan ger Llanymddyfri. Mae fy etholwr eisiau tynnu dŵr o afon i gynhyrchu ynni ar gyfer ei fferm, ond mae'r canllawiau wedi newid o hybu tynnu dŵr ar gyfer ynni i ystyried dŵr ar gyfer ynni yn yr un ffordd â dŵr ar gyfer dyfrhau. Fodd bynnag, mae dŵr a ddefnyddir

Environmental Guidelines

1. Simon Thomas: *What environmental guidelines are in place regarding extracting water from rivers for energy schemes. OAQ(4)0195(ESD)*

The Minister for Environment and Sustainable Development (John Griffiths): The Environment Agency regulates the abstraction of water from our rivers. Since 2009, guidance in this area has been available through the 'Good Practice Guidelines on Hydropower', a guide based on work undertaken jointly by the Environment Agency and the British Hydropower Association. This guidance is currently being reviewed.

Simon Thomas: As you say, the guidance is currently being reviewed, which is of some concern to a constituent of mine who farms Glancrychan near Llandovery. My constituent wants to take water from a river in order to generate energy for his farm, but the guidance has gone from promoting water abstraction for energy to treating water for energy in the same way as water for irrigation. However, water that is used for

ar gyfer ynni yn cael ei ddychwelyd i'r afon, tra bo dŵr ar gyfer dyfrhau yn cael ei ddefnyddio ar y tir. A wnewch chi ailystyried hyn er mwyn sicrhau bod ffermwyr Cymru yn gallu defnyddio hynny o ynni o'r dŵr ag sy'n ddiogel yn amgylcheddol, ond sydd hefyd yn helpu i gynnal y fferm deuluol?

John Griffiths: We are keen to strike the appropriate balance. We want to see hydropower going forward in Wales while at the same time understanding its environmental impact. The new guidelines will try to strike that balance as effectively as possible.

William Graham: You will know that an adviser to your Government has suggested that Wales has substantial advantages in terms of water power, although we are not necessarily delivering on the scale of that potential, particularly with regard to natural advantages in respect of low carbon. In your sustainable development White Paper, will you give clear guidance on the delivery of hydroelectricity and clean energy?

John Griffiths: The sustainable development White Paper and Bill will outline our strategy to embed mainstream sustainable development in terms of a governance framework that shapes everything that we undertake along with other public sector organisations that are subject to the duty.

On hydropower, there are some important new developments, such as Community Energy Wales, which I helped launch at the Hay festival this summer, that will help to work up projects and provide necessary advice and assistance. Ynni'r Fro is also important in that regard. However, as I said in response to Simon Thomas's initial question, we have to get the balance right and understand the particular environmental circumstances in Wales and how we can marry those up with the most effective development of hydropower.

Blaenoriaethau (yr Amgylchedd Naturiol)

2. Llyr Huws Gruffydd: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am flaenoriaethau Llywodraeth Cymru ar gyfer yr amgylchedd*

energy is returned to the river, while water for irrigation is used on land. Will you reconsider this, in order to ensure that Welsh farmers are able to use as much energy from water as is safe, environmentally, while also helping them to maintain the family farm?

John Griffiths: Rydym yn awyddus i gael cydbwysedd priodol. Rydym am weld ynni dŵr yn datblygu yng Nghymru ac ar yr un pryd ddeall ei effaith ar yr amgylchedd. Bydd y canllawiau newydd yn ceisio cael y cydbwysedd hwnnw mor effeithiol ag y bo modd.

William Graham: Fe wyddoch fod un o gynghorwyr eich Llywodraeth wedi awgrymu bod gan Gymru fanteision sylweddol o ran ynni dŵr, er nad ydym o bosibl yn cyflawni'r holl botensial hwnnw, yn enwedig o ran manteision naturiol mewn perthynas â charbon isel. Yn eich Papur Gwyn ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy, a wnewch chi roi canllawiau clir ar gyflenwi trydan dŵr ac ynni glân?

John Griffiths: Bydd y Papur Gwyn a'r Bil ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy yn amlinellu ein strategaeth i ymgorffori datblygu cynaliadwy prif ffrwd o ran fframwaith llywodraethu sy'n ffurfio popeth yr ydym yn ymgymryd ag ef ynghyd â sefydliadau eraill yn y sector cyhoeddus sy'n ddarostyngedig i'r ddyletswydd.

O ran ynni dŵr, mae rhai datblygiadau newydd pwysig, megis Ynni Cymunedol Cymru, y gwneuthum helpu i'w lansio yng Ngŵyl y Gelli yr haf hwn, a fydd yn helpu i lunio prosiectau a rhoi'r cyngor a'r cymorth angenrheidiol. Mae Ynni'r Fro hefyd yn bwysig yn hynny o beth. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedais mewn ymateb i gwestiwn cyntaf Simon Thomas, rhaid inni gael y cydbwysedd yn iawn a deall y sefyllfa amgylcheddol benodol yng Nghymru a sut y gallwn gyfuno'r rheini â'r ffyrdd mwyaf effeithiol o ddatblygu ynni dŵr.

Priorities (the Natural Environment)

2. Llyr Huws Gruffydd: *Will the Minister make a statement on the Welsh Government's priorities for the natural environment.*

naturiol. OAQ(4)0184(ESD)

John Griffiths: Fy amcan yw sicrhau'r dull mwyaf cynaliadwy ac effeithiol o reoli adnoddau naturiol Cymru.

Llyr Huws Gruffydd: Diolch am yr ateb, Weinidog. O ystyried pwysigrwydd rhywogaethau a chynefinoedd unigol yn y dull ecosystemau ac amgylchedd iach, a wnewch chi ailddatgan eich ymrwymiad i ddiogelu rhywogaethau unigol er mwyn cyrraedd y targed 2020 i atal a gwrthdroi, lle bo modd, colli bywyd gwyllt yng Nghymru?

John Griffiths: I am happy to reassure Llyr and other Members that biodiversity is at the very heart of what Welsh Government aims to do under the new approaches of ecosystem services and managing our natural resources. I know that that will be uppermost in the minds of the team newly assembled in the natural resources body for Wales and the important work that it will have to do.

Llyr Huws Gruffydd: Diolch am yr ateb hwnnw. A ydych, felly, yn cytuno â chyrrff a mudiadau amgylcheddol sydd wedi disgrifio'r posibilrwydd o doriadau sylweddol yn y gyllideb Ewropeaidd, ac yng nghyllideb y polisi amaethyddol cyffredin yn benodol, fel trychineb i gynefinoedd bywyd gwyllt a rhywogaethau ar draws tirweddau gwledig?

John Griffiths: These were matters that were discussed at a meeting that I had with the third sector in Wales just this morning. I know that other meetings have taken place between the sector, Welsh Government officials and my ministerial colleague Alun Davies. Those meetings are set to continue, and I hope very much that we can ensure that the future of European structural funding supports our Living Wales policies as strongly as possible.

Kenneth Skates: Minister, one in six properties in England and Wales is at risk of flooding, yet fewer than half of those who own those properties are aware of the risk. This comes at a time when the Environment Agency warns that, due to the heavy rain

OAQ(4)0184(ESD)

John Griffiths: My aim is to ensure the most sustainable and effective management of Wales's natural resources.

Llyr Huws Gruffydd: Thank you for the reply, Minister. Given the importance of individual species and habitats in the ecosystems approach and a healthy environment, will you restate your commitment to safeguarding individual species in order to achieve the 2020 target to halt and reverse, where possible, the loss of biodiversity in Wales?

John Griffiths: Rwy'n fwy na pharod i roi sicrwydd i Llyr ac Aelodau eraill y bydd bioamrywiaeth wrth wraidd yr hyn y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn anelu at ei wneud o dan y dull newydd o gynnig gwasanaethau ecosystem a rheoli ein hadnoddau naturiol. Gwn y bydd hynny ar flaen meddwl y tîm sydd newydd ei gynnull yn y corff adnoddau naturiol i Gymru a'r gwaith pwysig y bydd yn rhaid iddo wneud.

Llyr Huws Gruffydd: Thank you for that reply. Do you, therefore, agree with environmental bodies and organisations that have described the potential for significant cuts in the European budget, and specifically in the common agricultural policy budget, as a disaster for wildlife habitats and species right across rural landscapes?

John Griffiths: Trafodwyd y materion hyn mewn cyfarfod a gefais gyda'r trydydd sector yng Nghymru y bore yma. Gwn fod cyfarfodydd eraill wedi cael eu cynnal rhwng y sector, swyddogion Llywodraeth Cymru a'm cyd-Weinidog, Alun Davies. Bydd y cyfarfodydd hynny yn parhau, a gobeithiaf yn fawr iawn y gallwn sicrhau bod dyfodol cyllid cronfeydd strwythurol Ewrop yn cefnogi ein polisiâu yn Cymru Fyw hyd yr eithaf.

Kenneth Skates: Weinidog, mae un o bob chwe eiddo yng Nghymru a Lloegr mewn perygl o lifogydd, ond eto mae llai na hanner y rhai sy'n berchen ar yr eiddo dan sylw yn ymwybodol o'r perygl. Daw hyn ar adeg pan fo Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yn rhybuddio,

during the summer, we are going to be far more at risk of flooding during the winter. What work are you doing with Environment Agency Wales to ensure that the risks of flooding are highlighted, and that individuals in areas like north Wales take appropriate action to mitigate the impact that flooding can have on their homes and communities?

John Griffiths: I thank Ken Skates for that question. I have said a number of times that flood risk is at the very top of my agenda, because of the risk to life, limb and property. Key in our effort to deal with the risk of flooding is to raise awareness in our communities and across Wales. The Environment Agency has done some very good work around flood awareness Wales and the campaign that takes that forward. I have made it clear to natural resources Wales that I very much expect it to prioritise that work and continue the progress made to date.

Russell George: Minister, in terms of marine planning, many of the activities that we undertake on land have an effect on our seas, and only by considering the full range of sectors and sea users in a spatial context can we understand the relationships between the activities and their cumulative impacts on the marine environment. I am sure that you will agree that the marine planning system needs to complement and integrate with the terrestrial system. Therefore, how will the Government undertake the full integration process to ensure that a true whole ecosystem approach is delivered for Wales?

John Griffiths: I very much agree with Russell George that we must properly integrate our land use planning system with the marine environment and planning aspects. Our new approach around 'Sustaining a Living Wales' and the work of natural resources Wales will be very important in terms of taking forward that integrated approach. We have much work to do yet around marine planning and a lot of important work is taking place with our land use planning system, and we will have it uppermost in our minds to make those necessary connections.

o ganlyniad i'r glaw trwm yn ystod yr haf, y bydd llawer mwy o berygl o lifogydd yn ystod y gaeaf. Pa waith yr ydych yn ei wneud gydag Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd Cymru i sicrhau y caiff peryglon llifogydd eu amlygu, a bod unigolion mewn ardaloedd fel y gogledd yn cymryd camau priodol i leihau'r effaith y gall llifogydd ei chael ar eu cartrefi a'u cymunedau?

John Griffiths: Diolch i Ken Skates am y cwestiwn hwnnw. Rwyf wedi dweud dro ar ôl tro bod perygl llifogydd ar frig fy agenda, oherwydd y perygl i fywyd ac eiddo. Un rhan allweddol o'n hymdrech i ymdrin â pherygl llifogydd yw codi ymwybyddiaeth yn ein cymunedau a ledled Cymru. Mae Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd wedi gwneud gwaith da iawn ynghylch ymwybyddiaeth o lifogydd yng Nghymru a'r ymgyrch sy'n hyrwyddo hynny. Rwyf wedi ei gwneud yn glir i cyfoeth naturiol Cymru fy mod yn sicr yn disgwyl i'r corff flaenoriaethu'r gwaith hwnnw a pharhau â'r cynnydd a wnaed hyd yn hyn.

Russell George: Weinidog, o ran cynllunio morol, mae llawer o'r gweithgareddau yr ydym yn eu cynnal ar y tir yn cael effaith ar ein moroedd, a dim ond drwy ystyried yr holl sectorau a holl ddefnyddwyr y môr mewn cyd-destun gofodol y gallwn ddeall y cysylltiadau rhwng y gweithgareddau a'u heffeithiau cronus ar yr amgylchedd morol. Fe gytunwch, mae'n siŵr gennyf, fod angen i'r system cynllunio morol ategu'r system ddaearol ac integreiddio â hi. Felly, sut y bydd y Llywodraeth yn ymgymryd â'r broses integreiddio lawn er mwyn sicrhau bod dull gweithredu ecosystem gyfan gwirioneddol yn cael ei gyflwyno i Gymru?

John Griffiths: Cytunaf â Russell George fod yn rhaid inni integreiddio ein system cynllunio defnydd tir â'r amgylchedd morol ac agweddau cynllunio mewn ffordd briodol. Bydd dull gweithredu newydd 'Cynnal Cymru Fyw' a gwaith cyfoeth naturiol Cymru yn bwysig iawn o ran datblygu dull gweithredu integredig o'r fath. Mae gennym lawer o waith i'w wneud eto ym maes cynllunio morol ac mae llawer o waith pwysig yn cael ei wneud ar ein system cynllunio defnydd tir, a bydd y gwaith o greu'r cysylltiadau angenrheidiol hynny ar flaen ein meddwl.

William Powell: In the light of your response to Llyr Huws Gruffydd on the issue of the European budget, what discussions have you had with Owen Smith and other Westminster colleagues about the potential danger to the natural environment of Wales from a reduction in the European budget?

John Griffiths: These are matters that are regularly discussed with a whole range of ministerial colleagues here in Wales and at Westminster.

William Powell: Thank you for that answer, Minister. On a different issue, I have had quite significant representations from the forestry sector about its disappointment at the level of representation on the natural resources body for Wales. What reassurance can you offer the Chamber that the Welsh Government is serious about the future of forestry in Wales?

John Griffiths: I have been at pains to stress on many occasions in the Chamber, and outside, that forestry matters are central to our work around natural resources Wales and 'Sustaining a Living Wales'. It would be wrong to look at the board in terms of representation of sectoral interests; we approach the board, and its work, in an integrated way. We have experienced and knowledgeable officials who currently work in Forestry Commission Wales, who will transfer to the new body, and who will be an important resource for us.

Elin Jones: Mae angen hybu bwyta'n iach ymysg ein pobl ifanc, y tu fewn a'r tu allan i ysgolion. A gytunwch y dylai fod asesiad o'r effaith ar iechyd yn y sytem gynllunio bob tro y gwneir cais cynllunio am gaffi bwyd sydyn o gwmpas ysgolion?

John Griffiths: I pause before answering as I am not sure whether this is the appropriate supplementary question for question 2.

The Presiding Officer: Order. I am being very kind this afternoon.

John Griffiths: Diolch am eich cwestiwn,

William Powell: Yng ngoleuni eich ymateb i Llyr Huws Gruffydd ar fater y gyllideb Ewropeaidd, pa drafodaethau yr ydych wedi'u cael ag Owen Smith a chyd-Aelodau eraill yn San Steffan ynglŷn â'r perygl posibl i amgylchedd naturiol Cymru os caiff y gyllideb Ewropeaidd ei lleihau?

John Griffiths: Caiff y materion hyn eu trafod yn rheolaidd gydag amrywiaeth eang o gyd-Weinidogion yma yng Nghymru ac yn San Steffan.

William Powell: Diolch am yr ateb hwnnw, Weinidog. Ar fater gwahanol, rwyf wedi cael eithaf tipyn o sylwadau gan y sector coedwigaeth am ei siom ynglŷn â lefel ei gynrychiolaeth ar y corff adnoddau naturiol i Gymru. Pa sicrwydd y gallwch ei gynnig i'r Siambr fod Llywodraeth Cymru o ddifrif ynghylch dyfodol coedwigaeth yng Nghymru?

John Griffiths: Rwyf wedi bod yn awyddus iawn i bwysleisio ar sawl achlysur yn y Siambr, a'r tu allan iddi, bod materion coedwigaeth yn ganolog i'n gwaith ym maes cyfoeth naturiol Cymru a 'Cynnal Cymru Fyw'. Ni fyddai'n iawn edrych ar y bwrdd o ran cynrychiolaeth buddiannau sectoraidd; rydym yn ymwneud â'r bwrdd, a'i waith, mewn ffordd integredig. Mae gennym swyddogion profiadol a gwybodus sy'n gweithio ar hyn o bryd yng Nghomisiwn Coedwigaeth Cymru, a fydd yn trosglwyddo i'r corff newydd, ac a fydd yn adnodd pwysig inni.

Elin Jones: Healthy eating needs to be promoted among our young people, inside and outside schools. Do you agree that the planning system should include a health impact assessment every time an application is made for a fast-food establishment around schools?

John Griffiths: Oedaf cyn ateb gan nad wyf yn siŵr a yw hwn yn gwestiwn atodol priodol ar gyfer cwestiwn 2.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Rwy'n teimlo'n garedig iawn y prynhawn yma.

John Griffiths: Thank you for your question,

Elin.

It is perfectly possible, under our current planning system, to address these issues. For example, in Wrexham and Bridgend, the local authorities have used supplementary planning guidance and the exclusion order approach to deal with hot food and hot-food takeaways. Therefore, it is perfectly possible to address these matters within our current planning regime. Furthermore, 'Planning Policy Wales' has provisions that deal with health impact, and how that should be addressed through our planning system.

Asesiadau o'r Effaith ar Iechyd

3. Mark Isherwood: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu swyddogaeth Asesiadau o'r Effaith ar Iechyd mewn ystyriaethau cynllunio. OAQ(4)0196(ESD)*

John Griffiths: 'Planning Policy Wales' sets out the Welsh Government's land use planning policy framework. It requires local planning authorities to take health issues into consideration when preparing development plans, and when making planning decisions as appropriate.

Mark Isherwood: Thank you for that reply. After a Welsh Government planning inspector dismissed an appeal in Flintshire last month, he expressed concern that the effect of air pollution and noise from the neighbouring A55 on those who might eventually live on the site had not been taken into account when the local authority considered the planning application. During a business statement and announcement in the Chamber, I called for a statement on Welsh Government policy and, particularly, on whether health impact assessments should be made a requirement for planning considerations that might have an impact on health and wellbeing. The Minister for Finance and Leader of the House told us that she was sure that the Minister for Environment and Sustainable Development was taking this matter on board, in collaboration with the Minister for Health and Social Services. What action have you taken, and can you assure us that you are

Elin.

Mae'n gwbl bosibl, o dan ein system gynllunio bresennol, i fynd i'r afael â'r materion hyn. Er enghraifft, yn Wrecsam a Phen-y-bont ar Ogwr, mae'r awdurdodau lleol wedi defnyddio canllawiau cynllunio atodol a gorchmynion gwahardd er mwyn ymdrin â safleoedd bwyd poeth a chludfwyd. Felly, mae'n gwbl bosibl mynd i'r afael â'r materion hyn o fewn ein cyfundrefn gynllunio gyfredol. At hynny, mae 'Polisi Cynllunio Cymru' yn cynnwys darpariaethau sy'n ymdrin ag effaith ar iechyd, a sut y dylid mynd i'r afael â hynny drwy ein system gynllunio.

Health Impact Assessments

3. Mark Isherwood: *Will the Minister outline the role of Health Impact Assessments in planning considerations. OAQ(4)0196(ESD)*

John Griffiths: Mae 'Polisi Cynllunio Cymru' yn nodi fframwaith polisi cynllunio defnydd tir Llywodraeth Cymru. Mae'n ei gwneud yn ofynnol i awdurdodau cynllunio lleol ystyried materion iechyd wrth baratoi cynlluniau datblygu, ac wrth wneud penderfyniadau cynllunio fel y bo'n briodol.

Mark Isherwood: Diolch am yr ateb hwnnw. Ar ôl i un o arolygwyr cynllunio Llywodraeth Cymru wrthod apêl yn sir y Fflint y mis diwethaf, mynegodd bryder nad oedd effaith llygredd aer a sŵn o'r A55 gerllaw ar y rhai a allai yn y pen draw fyw ar y safle wedi cael ei hystyried pan ystyriodd yr awdurdod lleol y cais cynllunio. Yn ystod datganiad a chyhoeddiad busnes yn y Siambr, galwais am ddatganiad am bolisi Llywodraeth Cymru ac, yn arbennig, ynghylch a ddylai asesiadau o'r effaith ar iechyd gael eu gwneud yn ofyniad ar gyfer ystyriaethau cynllunio a allai gael effaith ar iechyd a lles. Dywedodd y Gweinidog Cyllid ac Arweinydd y Tŷ wrthym ei bod yn sicr bod Gweinidog yr Amgylchedd a Datblygu Cynaliadwy yn rhoi sylw i'r mater hwn, ar y cyd â'r Gweinidog Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Pa gamau yr ydych wedi'u cymryd, ac a allwch roi sicrwydd inni eich bod yn wir yn rhoi sylw i hyn?

indeed taking this on board?

John Griffiths: I have looked at ‘Planning Policy Wales’, and I believe that it adequately addresses health impact issues in the planning system. We also have technical advice note 11, which deals with noise, and sets out advice on circumstances under which noise assessments would be appropriate. I should give the usual health warning, as it were, that I cannot and will not comment on specific planning matters or applications that are either in the system or have been decided upon.

Clymog Japan

4. Peter Black: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y gyfraith yng nghyswllt clymog Japan. OAQ(4)0183(ESD)*

John Griffiths: The Welsh Government is currently working with the Law Commission to review and reform wildlife legislation in Wales. An important aspect is to investigate the possible introduction of measures to allow authorities to take enforcement action in relation to invasive non-native species, such as Japanese knotweed.

Peter Black: Thank you for that answer, Minister. You will know that there are big issues around Japanese knotweed for people trying to get a mortgage when the knotweed is on adjoining land. One issue for local authorities is where it is on private land, and having the power to take action on that. Could you give us the timescale for the changes that you are envisaging, and will that require primary legislation?

1.45 p.m.

John Griffiths: We are working with the Law Commission and we are subject to its timetable on that. The environment Bill that we will take forward in this Assembly term is one possible vehicle, but that is not to say that there might not be others. I very much understand the problems that the Member raises and has raised before; I know that these are significant in the area that he represents. We will work with the Wales biodiversity partnership on this, as it has a group looking

John Griffiths: Rwyf wedi edrych ar ‘Polisi Cynllunio Cymru’, a chredaf ei fod yn ymdrin yn ddigonol ag effeithiau ar iechyd yn y system gynllunio. Mae nodyn cyngor technegol 11 hefyd, sy’n ymdrin â sŵn, ac yn rhoi cyngor ar yr amgylchiadau lle byddai asesiadau o sŵn yn briodol. Dylwn roi’r rhybudd arferol, fel petai, na allaf wneud sylwadau ar faterion na cheisiadau cynllunio penodol sydd naill ai yn y system neu sydd wedi’u penderfynu ac ni wnaf hynny.

Japanese Knotweed

4. Peter Black: *Will the Minister make a statement on the law in relation to Japanese Knotweed. OAQ(4)0183(ESD)*

John Griffiths: Mae Llywodraeth Cymru wrthi’n gweithio gyda Chomisiwn y Gyfraith i adolygu a diwygio deddfwriaeth bywyd gwyllt yng Nghymru. Un agwedd bwysig yw ymchwilio i’r posibilrwydd o gyflwyno mesurau i ganiatáu i awdurdodau gymryd camau gorfodi mewn perthynas â rhywogaethau anffordorol ymledol, megis clymog Japan.

Peter Black: Diolch ichi am yr ateb hwnnw, Weinidog. Byddwch yn ymwybodol bod problemau mawr yn gysylltiedig â chlymog Japan i bobl sy’n ceisio cael morgais os yw’n tyfu ar dir cyfagos. Un broblem i awdurdodau lleol yw ble yn union y mae’n tyfu ar dir preifat, ac a oes ganddynt y pŵer i weithredu ar hynny. A allech chi roi amserlen o ran y newidiadau yr ydych yn eu rhagweld, ac a fydd angen deddfwriaeth sylfaenol?

John Griffiths: Rydym yn gweithio gyda Chomisiwn y Gyfraith ac yn dibynnu ar ei amserlen o ran hynny. Mae Bil yr amgylchedd yr ydym yn bwriadu ei gyflwyno yn y tymor Cynulliad hwn yn gyfrwng posibl, ond nid yw hynny’n dweud nad oes eraill. Deallaf yn llwyr y problemau y mae’r Aelod yn eu codi ac y mae wedi’u codi o’r blaen; gwn fod y rhain yn sylweddol yn yr ardal y mae’n ei chynrychioli. Byddwn yn gweithio gyda phartneriaeth bioamrywiaeth

at invasive non-native species. There are also projects under way in Wales that we hope will give us some important practical experience as to the best ways of tackling this major problem.

Mike Hedges: May I raise the urgency of dealing with knotweed, because of the effect that it is having on a number of people, including those who are trying to sell their houses in Swansea? Can the Minister provide an update on progress being made to eradicate knotweed?

John Griffiths: As I mentioned in my answer to Peter Black, I very much recognise the scale of the problem and the issues for private landowners, councils and others. I have mentioned previously to the Member that one possible way forward is an insect that potentially offers a way of at least reducing, if not eradicating, Japanese knotweed. There is a number of other projects under way. I would be happy to write to the Member with the findings of those projects to date.

Byron Davies: Minister, I appreciate that your Government updated the Japanese knotweed guidelines, through changes in legislation and eradication guidance, earlier this year and I appreciate the answers that you have just given. Taking your answers into account, with this new guidance in mind, can you be specific and outline whether the new guidance and legislation are working and that we are bringing the menace of Japanese knotweed to heel?

John Griffiths: I would not want to mislead any Member by stating that we have identified a method of dealing with Japanese knotweed quickly and easily. It is a very difficult problem and is quite extensive in Wales, unfortunately. That is why we have brought together the Wales biodiversity partnership with a number of projects to look at what might be the best way forward. As well as the work of the Law Commission, there is the possibility of a European directive to give us further assistance in

Cymru ar hyn, gan ei fod wedi sefydlu grŵp i edrych ar rywogaethau anfredol ymledol. Mae prosiectau hefyd ar y gweill yng Nghymru yr ydym yn gobeithio y byddant yn rhoi rhywfaint o brofiad ymarferol pwysig inni ynghylch y ffyrdd gorau o fynd i'r afael â'r broblem fawr hon.

Mike Hedges: A gaf nodi'r angen i ymdrin â chlymog Japan ar fyrder, oherwydd yr effaith y mae'n ei chael ar nifer o bobl, gan gynnwys y rhai sy'n ceisio gwerthu eu tai yn Abertawe? A all y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am y cynnydd sy'n cael ei wneud i gael gwared ar glymog Japan?

John Griffiths: Fel y soniais yn fy ateb i Peter Black, rwyf yn llwyr gydnabod maint y broblem a'r materion sy'n codi i dirfeddianwyr preifat, cynghorau ac eraill. Rwyf wedi sôn o'r blaen wrth yr Aelod mai un ffordd bosibl ymlaen yw pryfyn sydd o bosibl yn cynnig ffordd o leihau clymog Japan o leiaf, os nad ei waredu'n llwyr. Mae nifer o brosiectau eraill ar y gweill. Byddwn yn fwy na pharod i ysgrifennu at yr Aelod gyda chanfyddiadau'r prosiectau hynny hyd yn hyn.

Byron Davies: Weinidog, gwerthfawrogaf fod eich Llywodraeth wedi diweddarau'r canllawiau ar glymog Japan, drwy newidiadau mewn deddfwriaeth a chanllawiau ar ei waredu, yn gynharach eleni a gwerthfawrogaf yr atebion yr ydych newydd eu rhoi. Gan ystyried eich atebion, a chyda'r canllawiau newydd mewn cof, a allwch chi fod yn benodol a nodi a yw'r canllawiau a'r ddeddfwriaeth newydd yn gweithio ac a ydym yn ennill y frwydr yn erbyn clymog Japan?

John Griffiths: Nid wyf am gamarwain unrhyw Aelod drwy ddweud ein bod wedi nodi dull o ymdrin â chlymog Japan yn gyflym ac yn rhwydd. Mae'n broblem anodd iawn ac yn un eithaf helaeth yng Nghymru, yn anffodus. Dyna pam rydym wedi dwyn ynghyd bartneriaeth bioamrywiaeth Cymru gyda nifer o brosiectau i ystyried y ffordd orau ymlaen. Yn ogystal â gwaith Comisiwn y Gyfraith, mae posibilrwydd o gyfarwyddeb Ewropeaidd i roi mwy o gymorth inni ymdrin â chyfrifoldebau. Fodd bynnag, bydd yn

dealing with responsibilities. However, it will be an effort that will have to be maintained over a period of time.

Jocelyn Davies: With this becoming a blight on property sales, what assessment have you carried out of the extent of the spread of this weed across the country?

John Griffiths: It is an extensive problem in Wales, unfortunately. It is particularly problematic in south Wales, and particularly problematic in Swansea. So, it is extensive. The Environment Agency has carried out some mapping work, looking at particular areas of environmental concern and the extent of Japanese knotweed as a problem. I would be happy to write to the Member to share that information.

Prisau Ynni Domestig

5. Joyce Watson: *Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael gyda Llywodraeth y DU ynghylch prisiau ynni domestig. OAQ(4)0197(ESD)*

John Griffiths: I am concerned about the impact of increasing domestic energy prices on householders. Following recent energy price increases and announcements of increased profits by some suppliers, I met with Greg Barker, Minister of State at the Department of Energy and Climate Change, at the beginning of this week to discuss what action the UK Government and Ofgem are taking to protect consumers.

Joyce Watson: Thank you for that answer, Minister. Scrapping the very complex and devious tariff system is to be welcomed. However, all the UK Government's proposals will do is change billing, not pricing. That is not what Cameron promised when he said that energy companies would be forced to put people on the lowest rate automatically. The cost of energy is the problem here: there has been a trebling of bills since 2004. In the fuel poverty—

The Presiding Officer: Order. Are you coming to the question?

Joyce Watson: Yes.

gofyn am ymdrech dros gyfnod o amser.

Jocelyn Davies: Gan ei fod yn effeithio ar werthu eiddo, pa asesiad yr ydych wedi'i gynnal o ledaeniad y chwynnyn hwn dros y wlad?

John Griffiths: Mae'n broblem helaeth yng Nghymru, yn anffodus. Ceir problem arbennig yn y de, yn enwedig yn Abertawe. Felly, mae'n broblem helaeth. Mae Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd wedi gwneud rhywfaint o waith mapio, gan edrych ar ardaloedd penodol sydd o bryder amgylcheddol ac mae lledaeniad clymog Japan yn broblem. Byddwn yn barod i ysgrifennu at yr Aelod i rannu'r wybodaeth honno.

Domestic Energy Prices

5. Joyce Watson: *What discussions has the Minister had with the UK Government regarding domestic energy prices. OAQ(4)0197(ESD)*

John Griffiths: Rwy'n pryderu am effaith prisiau ynni cynyddol ar ddeiliaid tai. Yn sgîl cynnydd diweddar ym mhrisiau ynni a chyhoeddiadau am elw cynyddol gan rai cyflenwyr, cefais gyfarfod â Greg Barker, y Gweinidog Gwladol yn yr Adran Ynni a Newid Hinsawdd, ar ddechrau'r wythnos hon i drafod pa gamau y mae Llywodraeth y DU ac Ofgem yn eu cymryd i ddiogelu defnyddwyr.

Joyce Watson: Diolch am yr ateb hwnnw, Weinidog. Mae'r penderfyniad i gael gwared ar y system tariff gymhleth a chyfrwys iawn i'w groesawu. Fodd bynnag, y cyfan y bydd cynigion Llywodraeth y DU yn ei wneud yw newid dulliau bilio, nid prisio. Nid dyna'r hyn a addawodd Cameron pan ddywedodd y byddai cwmnïau ynni yn cael eu gorfodi i roi pobl ar y gyfradd isaf yn awtomatig. Mae cost ynni yn broblem yma: mae biliau wedi treblu ers 2004. Yn y—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. A ydych yn dod at y cwestiwn?

Joyce Watson: Ydw.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you.

Y Llywydd: Diolch yn fawr.

Joyce Watson: In the fuel poverty debate last Wednesday, you said that you would look at what the Welsh Government could do to encourage collective energy switching. Could you give me an update on that, please?

Joyce Watson: Yn y ddadl ar dlodi tanwydd ddydd Mercher diwethaf, dywedasoch y byddech yn edrych ar yr hyn y gallai Llywodraeth Cymru ei wneud i annog defnyddwyr i newid cyflenwr ynni ar y cyd. A allech roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf imi ar hynny, os gwelwch yn dda?

John Griffiths: I agree with the Member on the seriousness of these issues. Many people are rightly angry about increasing prices at a time of substantial profits for energy companies, and there are major questions for the companies and the system of regulation. Collective switching is a constructive response to these issues, and the role of the Welsh Government is to ensure that local authorities, right across Wales, are uniformly aware of the potential benefits of collective switching and that they have access to advice and support to help them to develop schemes in their areas.

John Griffiths: Cytunaf â'r Aelod ynglŷn â difrifoldeb y materion hyn. Mae llawer o bobl yn ddig ynglŷn â'r prisiau cynyddol pan fo cwmnïau ynni yn gwneud elw sylweddol, a hynny'n gwbl deg, a chyfyd cwestiynau mawr i'r cwmnïau a'r system reoleiddio. Mae newid ar y cyd yn ymateb adeiladol i'r problemau hyn, a rôl Llywodraeth Cymru yw sicrhau bod awdurdodau lleol, ledled Cymru, i gyd yn ymwybodol o fanteision posibl newid ar y cyd a'u bod yn cael y cyngor a'r cymorth i'w helpu i ddatblygu cynlluniau yn eu hardaloedd.

Darren Millar: I am sure that you will welcome the simplification of tariffs that has been announced by the UK Government. Do you regret that the previous UK Labour Government did not take any action to address this issue?

Darren Millar: Rwy'n siŵr y byddwch yn croesawu'r ymgais i symleiddio tariffau a gyhoeddwyd gan Lywodraeth y DU. A ydych yn gresynu na chymerodd Llywodraeth Lafur flaenorol y DU unrhyw gamau i fynd i'r afael â'r mater hwn?

John Griffiths: On the contrary, I think that the previous UK Labour Government did many valuable and important things to tackle fuel poverty in the round. What we see at the moment is a lack of success in doing what the people of Wales and the wider UK very much demand, which is the effective regulation and control of the energy companies and their pricing systems. What we have heard recently does not tackle affordability adequately. There are many concerns that what might happen is the removal of the lowest tariffs. That would be a matter of great concern for all of us here today.

John Griffiths: I'r gwrthwyneb, yn fy marn i, gwnaeth Llywodraeth Lafur flaenorol y DU bethau gwerthfawr a phwysig i fynd i'r afael â thlodi tanwydd yn gyffredinol. Yr hyn a welwn ar hyn o bryd yw methiant i wneud yr hyn y mae pobl Cymru a'r DU ehangach yn galw'n daer amdano, sef rheoleiddio a rheoli cwmnïau ynni a'u systemau priso'n effeithiol. Nid yw'r hyn yr ydym wedi'i glywed yn ddiweddar yn mynd i'r afael yn ddigonol â fforddiadwyedd. Mae cryn bryder mai'r hyn a allai ddigwydd yw bod y cwmnïau'n cael gwared ar y tariffau isaf. Byddai hynny'n fater o bryder mawr i bob un ohonom yma heddiw.

Alun Ffred Jones: Mae tlodi tanwydd bellach yn effeithio ar tua un rhan o dair o gartrefi Cymru. Mae problem arbennig yn y de-orllewin a'r gogledd-orllewin oherwydd natur y tai, sy'n aml yn hen, a'r ffaith nad yw llawer o'r tai mewn ardaloedd gwledig ar y

Alun Ffred Jones: Fuel poverty now impacts around a third of Welsh homes. There is a particular problem in the south-west and the north-west because of the nature of the houses, which are often old, and the fact that many of the houses in rural areas are

grid nwy cenedlaethol. Pa gamau penodol y mae eich Llywodraeth yn eu cymryd i helpu'r teuluoedd hynny sy'n byw mewn ardaloedd llai ffafriol o'r fath?

John Griffiths: We are taking and have taken steps to try to ensure that more homes in Wales are connected to the gas grid, and we will continue with that work, because it is one important potential solution to these problems. Nest is very much designed to address issues in rural as well as urban Wales. We know that packages provided under Nest to date have had a proportionally greater benefit for rural households compared to urban ones. There are many examples in terms of energy efficiency in Wales, of external cladding being provided and imaginative solutions around micro renewable energy devices. We have some answers to these issues, but there is a problem of scale and much remaining to do.

Julie Morgan: The big six suppliers are about to increase average bills by £100 a year. Does the Minister agree that there is an urgent need to encourage a new customer-focused approach in the energy market that is not driven by the need to make excessive profits for external stakeholders such as that offered by Co-operative Energy, which was set up only 18 months ago, but has announced a 2% reduction in its bills from next month?

John Griffiths: Any energy company that sets a good example in terms of understanding affordability and fuel poverty issues is setting an important example to other energy companies. I very much understand the anger that exists around substantially rising prices at a time of significant profits for major energy companies. Those concerns are heightened at a time of economic crisis when there is a lack of disposable income. I join the Member in hoping to see much greater progress on these matters in short order.

Blaenoriaethau (Gorllewin De Cymru)

not connected to the national gas grid. What specific steps is your Government taking to assist those families who live in less favoured areas of those sorts?

John Griffiths: Rydym yn cymryd ac wedi cymryd camau i geisio sicrhau bod mwy o gartrefi yng Nghymru yn cael eu cysylltu â'r grid nwy, a byddwn yn parhau â'r gwaith hwnnw, gan ei fod yn cynnig un ateb pwysig posibl i'r problemau hyn. Cafodd Nyth ei gynllunio'n benodol i fynd i'r afael â phroblemau mewn ardaloedd gwledig yn ogystal ag ardaloedd trefol Cymru. Gwyddom fod mwy o aelwydydd mewn ardaloedd gwledig wedi cael budd o'r pecynnau a ddarparwyd o dan Nyth na rhai mewn ardaloedd trefol. Gwelir llawer o enghreifftiau o ran effeithlonrwydd ynni yng Nghymru, o ddarparu cladin allanol ynghyd ag atebion creadigol sy'n defnyddio dyfeisiau ynni adnewyddadwy micro. Mae gennym rai atebion i'r problemau hyn, ond mae'r broblem yn un fawr ac mae llawer i'w wneud o hyd.

Julie Morgan: Mae'r chwe chyflenwr mawr ar fin cynyddu biliau cyfartalog £100 y flwyddyn. A yw'r Gweinidog yn cytuno bod angen dybryd i annog dulliau gweithredu newydd yn y farchnad ynni sy'n canolbwyntio ar gwsmeriaid ac nad ydynt wedi'u hysgogi gan yr angen i wneud elw gormodol i randdeiliaid allanol megis yr un a gynigir gan y Co-operative Energy, sydd ond wedi'i sefydlu ers 18 mis, ond sydd wedi cyhoeddi gostyngiad o 2% yn ei filiau o'r mfiis nesaf ymlaen?

John Griffiths: Mae unrhyw gwmni ynni sy'n rhoi esiampl dda o ran deall fforddiadwyedd a materion tlodi tanwydd yn esiampl bwysig i gwmnïau ynni eraill. Deallaf yn llwyr y dichter ynglŷn â phrisiau sy'n cynyddu'n sylweddol pan fo cwmnïau ynni mawr yn gwneud elw mawr. Mae'r pryderon hyn yn cael eu dwysáu ar adeg o argyfwng economaidd, pan fo incwm gwario yn brin. Fel yr Aelod, hoffwn weld llawer mwy o gynnydd ar y materion hyn yn fuan.

Priorities (South Wales West)

6. Byron Davies: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu ei flaenoriaethau ar gyfer Gorllewin De Cymru. OAQ(4)0185(ESD)*

John Griffiths: I am committed to fulfilling across Wales the commitments that are set out for my portfolio in the programme for government.

Byron Davies: I have been somewhat surprised by the issue of developers altering floodplain levels. A good example of this problem can be found on land to the west of Pontarddulais town centre, where during the creation of a new access road to Tesco as part of the agreement, a substantial amount of waste has been produced, which has been dumped, and there are now concerns that the next major flood will be much higher than usual due to the ground level being increased. You said earlier that flood risk is at the top of the agenda, so will you outline in broad terms the way in which you plan to protect floodplains and look into this specific case, which is of concern locally?

John Griffiths: As I mentioned earlier, I am unable to comment in planning terms on any particular development, but in terms of flood risk, we have a robust policy in terms of our technical advice note on flooding, which deals with development on floodplains. At the end of last year, we launched our national strategy for flood risk management and coastal erosion risk management, and we have a suite of regional and local plans sitting underneath that framework. We also raise awareness of risk. There is a lot of work going on at the moment to deal with these flooding issues, and I hope very much that the coming together of key partners will make sure that we do all possible work into the future.

David Rees: Minister, I have often highlighted the excellent forest areas in the Afan valley and the way in which they have become a focal point for tourists, whether they be mountain walkers or mountain bikers. Will you confirm that, following the creation of the new resources Wales body, the forestry section will continue to manage both these wonderful woodlands and the public facilities to ensure that visitors have a great

6. Byron Davies: *Will the Minister outline his priorities for South Wales West. OAQ(4)0185(ESD)*

John Griffiths: Rwyf wedi ymrwymo i gyflawni'r ymrwymiadau a nodir ar gyfer fy mhortffolio yn y rhaglen lywodraethu dros Gymru gyfan.

Byron Davies: Rwyf wedi fy synnu braidd gan achosion o ddatblygwyr yn newid lefelau gorlifdiroedd. Ceir enghraifft dda o'r broblem hon ar dir i'r gorllewin o ganol tref Pontarddulais, lle y cynhyrchwyd cryn dipyn o wastraff yn ystod y gwaith o greu ffordd fynediad newydd i Tesco fel rhan o'r cytundeb, sydd wedi cael ei adael, ac erbyn hyn mae pryderon y bydd y llifogydd mawr nesaf yn llawer uwch na'r arfer am fod lefel y ddaear yn uwch. Dywedasoeh yn gynharach fod perygl llifogydd ar frig yr agenda, felly a wnewch chi nodi'n fras sut yr ydych yn bwriadu amddiffyn gorlifdiroedd ac ymchwilio i'r achos penodol hwn, sydd o bryder yn lleol?

John Griffiths: Fel y soniais yn gynharach, ni allaf wneud sylwadau ar unrhyw ddatblygiad penodol o safbwynt cynllunio, ond o ran perygl llifogydd, mae gennym bolisi cadarn ar ffurf ein nodyn cyngor technegol ar lifogydd, sy'n ymdrin â datblygu ar orlifdiroedd. Ddiwedd y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, lansiodd ein strategaeth genedlaethol ar gyfer rheoli perygl llifogydd ac erydu arfordirol, ac mae gennym gyfres o gynlluniau rhanbarthol a lleol o dan y fframwaith hwnnw. Rydym hefyd yn codi ymwybyddiaeth o'r perygl. Mae llawer o waith yn mynd rhagddo ar hyn o bryd i ymdrin â'r problemau hyn o ran llifogydd, a mawr obeithiaf y bydd dod â phartneriaid allweddol ynghyd yn sicrhau ein bod yn gwneud yr holl waith posibl yn y dyfodol.

David Rees: Weinidog, rwyf yn aml wedi tynnu sylw at yr ardaloedd ardderchog o goedwig yng Nghwm Afan a'r ffordd y maent wedi dod yn ganolbwynt i dwristiaid, boed yn gerddwyr mynydd neu'n feicwyr mynydd. A wnewch chi gadarnhau, yn sgîl creu'r corff adnoddau naturiol newydd i Gymru, y bydd yr adran goedwigaeth yn parhau i reoli'r coetiroedd gwych hyn a'r cyfleusterau cyhoeddus er mwyn sicrhau bod

experience, thus reassuring local businesses that they will return time and again?

John Griffiths: I thank David Rees for that question. It is very encouraging to all of us in terms of the progress that has been made since devolution regarding the use of forestry in Wales. It has been a very positive story. It is about recreation, leisure use and tourism, as well as the commercial felling of timber, for example. Therefore, we clearly wish not only to maintain the rate of progress that we have seen through the work of the Forestry Commission, the Welsh Government and others since devolution, but to speed that up with natural resources Wales. Therefore, I understand the points that David Rees has mentioned, and I assure him that we will address these issues effectively under natural resources Wales.

Y Corff Adnoddau Naturiol

7. Angela Burns: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am Gorff Adnoddau Naturiol newydd Cymru. OAQ(4)0189(ESD)*

John Griffiths: I thank Angela Burns for that question. Following the appointment of the chair, chief executive and board members of natural resources Wales, the board had its first meeting on 7 November. The development of the future operating model for the new organisation and work to ensure day 1 readiness is progressing as planned.

Angela Burns: Minister, one of the first challenges facing the natural resources body will be how to deal with the ash dieback disease that is beginning to permeate the entire UK and which has been confirmed at a site in Carmarthenshire, in my constituency. What is your latest assessment of the spread of the disease? What will be the cost of controlling this and where will the funding for those costs come from?

John Griffiths: We are very much joined up with the Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs in the UK Government in dealing with ash dieback. Sadly, it has been found in other areas of Wales as well as

ymwelwyr yn cael profiad gwych, a thrwy hynny dawelu meddwl busnesau lleol y byddant yn dychwelyd dro ar ôl tro?

John Griffiths: Diolch i David Rees am y cwestiwn hwnnw. Mae'n galonogol iawn i bob un ohonom o safbwynt y cynnydd sydd wedi'i wneud ers datganoli o ran y defnydd o goedwigaeth yng Nghymru. Bu'n stori gadarnhaol iawn. Mae a wnelo â hamdden, defnydd hamdden a thwristiaeth, yn ogystal â gweithgarwch torri coed masnachol, er enghraifft. Felly, mae'n amlwg ein bod nid yn unig am barhau â'r cynnydd yr ydym wedi'i weld drwy waith y Comisiwn Coedwigaeth, Llywodraeth Cymru ac eraill ers datganoli, ond hefyd ei gyflymu gyda cyfoeth naturiol Cymru. Felly, deallaf y pwyntiau y mae David Rees wedi'u crybwyll, ac rwy'n rhoi sicrwydd iddo y byddwn yn mynd i'r afael â'r materion hyn yn effeithiol o dan cyfoeth naturiol Cymru.

The Natural Resources Body

7. Angela Burns: *Will the Minister provide an update on the new Natural Resources Body for Wales. OAQ(4)0189(ESD)*

John Griffiths: Diolch i Angela Burns am y cwestiwn hwnnw. Yn dilyn penodiad y cadeirydd, y prif weithredwr ac aelodau'r bwrdd i cyfoeth naturiol Cymru, cyfarfu'r bwrdd am y tro cyntaf ar 7 Tachwedd. Mae'r gwaith o ddatblygu model gweithredol y sefydliad newydd yn y dyfodol a gwaith i sicrhau ei fod yn barod o'r diwrnod cyntaf yn mynd rhagddo yn ôl y bwriad.

Angela Burns: Weinidog, un o'r heriau cyntaf sy'n wynebu'r corff adnoddau naturiol fydd sut i ymdrin â chlefyd y coed ynn sy'n dechrau ymdreiddio drwy'r DU gyfan ac sydd wedi cael ei gadarnhau ar safle yn sir Gaerfyrddin, yn fy etholaeth i. Beth yw eich asesiad diweddaraf o ledaeniad y clefyd? Faint y bydd yn ei gostio i'w reoli ac o ble y daw'r cyllid i dalu'r costau hynny?

John Griffiths: Rydym mewn cysylltiad agos iawn ag Adran yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig yn Llywodraeth y DU wrth ymdrin â chlefyd y coed ynn. Yn anffodus, mae wedi cael ei ganfod mewn

Carmarthenshire. Thus far, in terms of confirmed incidents, they involve relatively new planting rather than more established woodland. However, we have done a lot of work to survey potential areas of disease, working, as I said, as part of a national UK picture given that disease, as we know, does not respect national boundaries. That work continues, so it is not possible to give an estimate of the cost of the measures to deal with the disease at the moment. However, I certainly undertake to keep Members informed of the disease picture and our efforts to counter it as we move forward.

ardaloedd eraill o Gymru yn ogystal â sir Gaerfyrddin. Hyd yma, o ran achosion a gadarnhawyd, maent yn codi mewn planhigfeydd cymharol newydd yn hytrach na choetir mwy sefydledig. Fodd bynnag, rydym wedi gwneud llawer o waith i gynnal arolwg o'r ardaloedd lle y gall y clefyd fod, gan weithio ar y cyd, fel y dywedais, fel rhan o ddarlun cenedlaethol yn y DU o gofio nad yw clefyd, fel y gwyddom, yn parchu ffiniau cenedlaethol. Mae'r gwaith hwnnw yn parhau, felly nid oes modd rhoi amcangyfrif o gost y mesurau i ymdrin â'r clefyd ar hyn o bryd. Fodd bynnag, rwyf yn sicr yn addo rhoi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i Aelodau am hynt y clefyd a'n hymdrechion i'w atal yn y dyfodol.

2.00 p.m.

Yr Arglwydd Elis-Thomas: Bydd y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol ein bod ni, fel Pwyllgor Amgylchedd a Chynaliadwyedd, wedi dilyn proses sefydlu cyfoeth naturiol Cymru, fel yr ydym yn ei alw erbyn hyn, o'r dechrau. Byddwn yn edrych ymlaen at groesawu'r cadeirydd a'r prif weithredwr i'r adeilad hwn i wynebu'r pwyllgor yfory. Hoffwn sicrhau'r Gweinidog, ac a wnaiff dderbyn, y byddwn ni fel pwyllgor yn parhau i gadw golwg fanwl ar ddatblygiad y corff hwn fel ei fod yn cyrraedd ac yn sylweddoli'r weledigaeth yr ydym i gyd yn y Siambr hon yn gobeithio amdani gan y corff?

Lord Elis-Thomas: The Minister will be aware that we, as the Environment and Sustainability Committee, have followed the process of the establishment of natural resources Wales, as it is now called, from the outset. We look forward to welcoming the chair and chief executive to this building to face the committee tomorrow. I would assure the Minister, and will he accept, that we as a committee will continue to keep a close eye on the development of this body so that it does attain and realise the vision that all of us in the Chamber hope for from that body?

John Griffiths: I thank Dafydd Elis-Thomas for his question. I know very well that the committee has done a valuable job of work in looking not just at the creation of natural resources Wales, but also at 'Sustaining a Living Wales', in terms of the policy that goes along with the organisational change. I am very pleased that the chair and chief executive are appearing before the committee tomorrow, because I think that that early engagement between the body and the committee will be a good opportunity for the committee and the chief executive and chair to have an exchange of views and an important discussion. I look forward to the committee taking a continuing interest as we move ahead.

John Griffiths: Diolch i Dafydd Elis-Thomas am ei gwestiwn. Gwn yn iawn fod y pwyllgor wedi gwneud gwaith gwerthfawr nid yn unig wrth ystyried y broses o greu cyfoeth naturiol Cymru, ond hefyd 'Cynnal Cymru Fyw', o ran y polisi sy'n mynd law yn llaw â newid sefydliadol. Rwy'n falch iawn bod y cadeirydd a'r prif weithredwr yn ymddangos gerbron y pwyllgor yfory, oherwydd credaf y bydd y cysylltiad cynnar hwnnw rhwng y corff a'r pwyllgor yn gyfle da i'r pwyllgor a'r prif weithredwr a'r cadeirydd gyfnewid barn a chael trafodaeth bwysig. Edrychaf ymlaen at weld y pwyllgor yn parhau i gymryd diddordeb wrth i ni symud ymlaen.

Antoinette Sandbach: Minister, you answered earlier a question on the representation of the forestry sector. You said

Antoinette Sandbach: Weinidog, gwnaethoch ateb cwestiwn yn gynharach ynghylch cynrychiolaeth y sector

that you did not want to look at a sectoral approach, but representatives of both the Environment Agency Wales and Countryside Council for Wales are on the board. So, in fact, Forestry Commission Wales is the only one of the three organisations not represented on the board. Do you therefore agree, having given assurances previously, that there is value in allowing Assembly Members the opportunity to scrutinise future chief executives and chairs of the natural resources body before their appointment so that the Welsh public can have full confidence that this body will be run in the interests of the whole of Wales?

John Griffiths: The Member is looking at the composition of the board in a sectoral way, which, as I said earlier, is not the Welsh Government's approach. If we are talking about integration and joining up in terms of organisation, policy working-up and delivery, then I think that it is important not to take that rather narrow and restrictive view. We have a robust public appointments procedure, which we abide by, and I think it has been effective in this case.

Antoinette Sandbach: Minister, for other appointments, Assembly Members have, effectively, an opportunity to vote for or endorse a particular appointee. One of the other concerns about the creation of this body is the spiralling costs. At this early stage, over £1 million has been spent on IT consultancy, PR, marketing, legal advice and pensions, and £86,000 has been spent on job advertisements. Can you tell us your estimate of the total bill for rebranding all the vehicles, buildings, letterheads and other property of the new natural resources body, because the public will want to see whether or not your Government can deliver value for money?

John Griffiths: Llywydd, I can inform the Member that the costs to date are entirely within the business case and contingencies set.

Coed Castan a Choed Castan Melys

8. William Graham: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y camau sy'n cael eu cymryd i*

coedwigaeth. Dywedasoch nad oeddech am weld dull gweithredu sectoraidd, ond mae cynrychiolwyr o Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd Cymru a Chyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru yn aelodau o'r bwrdd. Felly, mewn gwirionedd, Comisiwn Coedwigaeth Cymru yw'r unig un o'r tri sefydliad nad yw wedi'i gynrychioli ar y bwrdd. A ydych yn cytuno felly, ar ôl rhoi sicrwydd o'r blaen, y byddai'n werthfawr rhoi cyfle i Aelodau'r Cynulliad graffu ar waith prif weithredwyr a chadeiryddion y corff adnoddau naturiol yn y dyfodol cyn eu penodi fel y gall y cyhoedd yng Nghymru fod yn hyderus y bydd y corff hwn yn cael ei redeg er lles Cymru gyfan?

John Griffiths: Mae'r Aelod yn edrych ar aelodaeth y bwrdd mewn ffordd sectoraidd, nad yw'n ddull gweithredu, fel y dywedais, a goleddir gan Lywodraeth Cymru. Os ydym yn sôn am integreiddio a chydgyssylltu o ran trefniadaeth, llunio polisiau a chyflawni, yna credaf ei bod yn bwysig peidio ag arddel y safbwynt hwnnw sydd braidd yn gul a chyfyngol. Mae gennym drefn penodiadau cyhoeddus gadarn, yr ydym yn cadw ati, a chredaf iddi fod yn effeithiol yn yr achos hwn.

Antoinette Sandbach: Weinidog, yn achos penodiadau eraill, mae Aelodau'r Cynulliad wedi cael cyfle i bleidleisio dros benodai neu ei gymeradwyo, i bob diben. Un o'r pryderon eraill ynglŷn â chreu'r corff hwn yw'r costau cynyddol. Ar y cam cynnar hwn, mae dros £1 filiwn wedi cael ei wario ar ymgynghoriaeth TG, cysylltiadau cyhoeddus, marchnata, cyngor cyfreithiol a phensiynau, a gwariwyd £86,000 ar hysbysebion swyddi. A allwch ddweud wrthym beth yw eich amcangyfrif o gyfanswm y bil ar gyfer ailfrandio holl gerbydau, adeiladau, papur pennawd ac eiddo arall y corff adnoddau naturiol newydd, oherwydd bydd y cyhoedd am weld a yw eich Llywodraeth yn gallu rhoi gwerth am arian?

John Griffiths: Lywydd, gallaf hysbysu'r Aelod bod y costau hyd yma yn hollol unol â'r achos busnes a'r cynlluniau wrth gefn a bennwyd.

Sweet Chestnut and Horse Chestnut Trees

8. William Graham: *Will the Minister make a statement on the measures being taken to*

ddiogelu coed castan a choed castan melys yng Nghymru. OAQ(4)0191(ESD)

John Griffiths: The Welsh Government is working with the Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs and the Forestry Commission on measures to protect sweet chestnut and horse chestnut trees in Wales from damaging diseases.

William Graham: Thank you for your answer, Minister. Researchers believe that the majority of trees in England and Wales are now infected by the leaf miner moth. The Natural Environment Research Council's Centre for Ecology and Hydrology, which investigated the impact of this moth, has said that:

'Long term prognosis is not good. The worst case scenario is that it could be the end of our conker trees.'

Minister, I would like you to give greater assurance that you will do what you can to preserve our chestnut trees. If we have to do the same as for ash trees and perhaps recognise that they all have to be cut down, what provision will you make for replacement?

John Griffiths: There are different issues involved with regard to sweet chestnut trees and horse chestnut trees, which are not related as trees. The moth issue is applicable to horse chestnut trees, but not to sweet chestnut trees. We are aware of these issues. Again, as I mentioned in my initial answer, we very much work with the UK Government and the Forestry Commission on these matters. We will keep up-to-speed with the emerging disease picture, and I undertake to keep Members informed as appropriate.'

Parthau Cadwraeth Morol

9. Simon Thomas: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am barthau cadwraeth morol. OAQ(4)0193(ESD)*

John Griffiths: Rwy'n eich cyfeirio at fy natganiad ar 5 Tachwedd a oedd yn amlinellu'r camau nesaf ar gyfer y parthau

protect sweet chestnut and horse chestnut trees in Wales. OAQ(4)0191(ESD)

John Griffiths: Mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn gweithio gydag Adran yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig a'r Comisiwn Coedwigaeth ar fesurau i ddiogelu coed castan melys a choed castan yng Nghymru rhag clefydau niweidiol.

William Graham: Diolch ichi am eich ateb, Weinidog. Cred ymchwilwyr fod y rhan fwyaf o'r coed yng Nghymru a Lloegr bellach wedi'u heintio gan y gwyfyn turio dail. Mae Canolfan Ecoleg a Hydroleg Cyngor Ymchwil yr Amgylchedd Naturiol a ymchwiliodd i effaith y gwyfyn hwn, wedi dweud:

Nid yw'r rhagolygon yn yr hirdymor yn dda. Y senario gwaethaf oll yw y gallai fod ar ben ar ein coed concyrs.

Weinidog, hoffwn pe baech yn rhoi mwy o sicrwydd y byddwch yn gwneud popeth o fewn eich gallu i ddiogelu ein coed castan. Os bydd yn rhaid inni wneud yr un peth ag yr ydym yn ei wneud yn achos coed ynn a chydabod o bosibl y bydd yn rhaid iddynt i gyd gael eu torri, pa ddarpariaeth a wnewch am gael rhai newydd yn eu lle?

John Griffiths: Cyfyd materion gwahanol o ran coed castan melys a choed castan, nad ydynt yn perthyn i'w gilydd fel coed. Mae problem gwyfynod yn berthnasol i goed castan, ond nid i goed castan melys. Rydym yn ymwybodol o'r problemau hyn. Unwaith eto, fel y soniais yn fy ateb gwreiddiol, rydym yn cydweithio â Llywodraeth y DU a'r Comisiwn Coedwigaeth ar y materion hyn. Byddwn yn sicrhau ein bod yn cael y darlun diweddaraf o ran datblygiad clefydau, ac ymrwymaf i hysbysu'r Aelodau fel y bo'n briodol.

Marine Conservation Zones

9. Simon Thomas: *Will the Minister make a statement on marine conservation zones. OAQ(4)0193(ESD)*

John Griffiths: I refer you to my statement of 5 November outlining the next steps for marine conservation zones in Wales.

cadwraeth morol yng Nghymru.

Simon Thomas: Diolch, Weinidog, am yr ateb hwnnw. Rwy'n croesawu'r ffaith eich bod wedi sefydlu panel i ailedrych ar y mater hwn. Mae'r môr yn rhywbeth sy'n gyffredin i ni gyd, ac mae'n anodd gwahaniaethu rhwng buddiannau gwahanol garfannau. Mae dynesiad yr economegydd Elinor Ostrom, er enghraifft, yn bwysig o ran y mater hwn achos mae'n tanlinellu bod y môr yn bwysig i bawb sy'n ei ddefnyddio. Yn y cyd-destun hwnnw, a ydych yn gallu ein sicrhau y bydd barn pysgotwyr, a'r ddogfen gynhwysfawr a gynhyrchwyd gan y pysgotwyr sy'n defnyddio'r ardaloedd hyn, yn cael triniaeth lawn yn yr ailystyriaeth sy'n cael ei gynnal gan y panel?

John Griffiths: I thank Simon Thomas for that question. As mentioned in response to an earlier question, it is very much a matter of balancing different interests. However, I have been very keen to say that there is a level of agreement on the importance of having sustainable seas, sustainable fisheries and sustainable recreation, leisure and tourism in Wales. Therefore, I feel that, hopefully, it is not as difficult as some might imagine to reconcile the different interests. We had a very good meeting here with the Welsh Fisherman's Association, which has produced a very interesting document. I assure the Member that that document will be fully considered as we move forward with this policy.

Angela Burns: The Welsh Conservatives welcome the additional scrutiny that is being provided by the task and finish group on marine conservation zones. As you will be aware, one of the big concerns is the lack of buy-in from local communities. This is a key strand that has been identified by Dr Dylan Evans, who, as you know, has set up marine reserves throughout the world. What weight will your task and finish group give to those particular issues, and how will it gauge the true support of local communities?

John Griffiths: The task and finish group is very mindful of the community impacts and views, not least because they were very clearly and strongly expressed at a variety of

Simon Thomas: Thank you, Minister, for that response. I welcome the fact that you have established a panel to review this issue. The sea is something that is common to us all, and it is difficult to distinguish between the interests of various groups. The approach of the economist Elinor Ostrom, for example, is important with regard to this matter because it emphasises that the sea is important everyone who uses it. In that context, could you assure us that the views of those who fish, and the comprehensive document that was produced by those who fish in these areas, will get full treatment in the reconsideration that is being undertaken by the panel?

John Griffiths: Diolch i Simon Thomas am y cwestiwn hwnnw. Fel y soniwyd mewn ymateb i gwestiwn cynharach, mater o gael cydbwysedd rhwng buddiannau gwahanol ydyw. Fodd bynnag, bwm yn awyddus iawn i nodi bod rhywfaint o gytundeb ynglŷn â phwysigrwydd moroedd cynaliadwy, pysgodfeydd cynaliadwy a hamdden a thwristiaeth gynaliadwy yng Nghymru. Felly, teimlaf, gobeithio, nad yw mor anodd cysoni'r buddiannau gwahanol ag y tybia rhai. Cawsom gyfarfod da iawn yma gyda Chymdeithas Pysgotwyr Cymru, sydd wedi llunio dogfen ddiddorol iawn. Gallaf roi sicrwydd i'r Aelod y bydd y ddogfen honno yn cael ei hystyried yn llawn wrth inni fwrw ymlaen â'r polisi hwn.

Angela Burns: Mae'r Ceidwadwyr Cymreig yn croesawu'r gwaith craffu ychwanegol sy'n cael ei wneud gan y grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen ar barthau cadwraeth morol. Fel y gwyddoch, un o'r pryderon mawr yw'r diffyg cefnogaeth ymhlith y cymunedau lleol. Mae hon yn elfen allweddol sydd wedi cael ei nodi gan Dr Dylan Evans, sydd, fel y gwyddoch, wedi sefydlu gwarchodfeydd morol ledled y byd. Pa bwys y bydd eich grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen yn ei roi ar y materion penodol hynny, a sut y bydd yn mesur y gefnogaeth wirioneddol ymhlith cymunedau lleol?

John Griffiths: Mae'r grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen yn ymwybodol iawn o'r effeithiau ar gymunedau, yn bennaf am iddynt gael eu mynegi'n glir iawn ac yn gryf mewn sawl

events as we took forward the first stage of what has always been an extensive multi-stage consultation process. That evidence of those impacts will be there as an initial starting point for the work of that group.

Ynni Adnewyddadwy

10. Kirsty Williams: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am bwysigrwydd cynlluniau ynni adnewyddadwy ar raddfa fach i Gymru wledig. OAQ(4)0192(ESD)*

John Griffiths: The Welsh Government recognises that small-scale renewable energy schemes are vital to rural Wales, particularly in those areas that are off the gas grid. We fully support further activity in this sector, and this is reflected in the support available from the Welsh Government's Ynni'r Fro programme.

The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrats (Kirsty Williams): I thank the Minister for his answer. I have recently been contacted by a number of constituents who are concerned that changes to the river abstraction regulations for hydropower projects will make those projects uneconomical for them to implement on farm. Given that you have just said that such projects are vital to the Welsh rural economy, will you outline specifically to the Chamber what steps you will take to allow such hydropower schemes to go ahead on farms in my constituency?

John Griffiths: There is a lot of work ongoing, which we touched upon earlier, in terms of looking at the guidelines applicable to hydropower schemes. It is important to understand the energy needs and what small-scale renewable energy can achieve for us in Wales, which we are very mindful of. That is why we now have Community Energy Wales and Ynni'r Fro as important organisations in helping the development of those schemes. As I also said earlier, it is important that we understand the environmental circumstances of Wales. We have a lot of high head hydro potential in Wales, but that has particular

digwyddiad gwahanol wrth inni gymryd y cam cyntaf mewn proses a fu, o'r dechrau, yn broses ymgynghori aml-gam. Caiff y dystiolaeth honno o'r effeithiau hynny ei defnyddio fel man cychwyn gwaith y grŵp hwnnw.

Renewable Energy

10. Kirsty Williams: *Will the Minister make a statement on the importance of small scale renewable energy schemes to rural Wales. OAQ(4)0192(ESD)*

John Griffiths: Mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn cydnabod bod cynlluniau ynni adnewyddadwy ar raddfa fach yn hanfodol i gefn gwlad Cymru, yn enwedig yn yr ardaloedd hynny nad ydynt wedi'u cysylltu â'r grid nwy. Rydym yn llwyr gefnogi gweithgaredd pellach yn y sector hwn, ac mae hyn yn cael ei adlewyrchu yn y cymorth sydd ar gael o dan raglen Ynni'r Fro Llywodraeth Cymru.

Arweinydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Kirsty Williams): Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am ei ateb. Mae nifer o etholwyr wedi cysylltu â mi yn ddiweddar i fynegi eu pryder y bydd newidiadau i'r rheoliadau ynglŷn â thynnu dŵr o afonydd ar gyfer prosiectau ynni dŵr yn golygu y bydd y prosiectau hynny yn annarbodus iddynt eu gweithredu ar y fferm. Gan eich bod newydd ddweud bod prosiectau o'r fath yn hanfodol i economi wledig Cymru, a wnewch chi nodi'n benodol yn y Siambr pa gamau y byddwch yn eu cymryd i ganiatáu i gynlluniau ynni dŵr o'r fath gael eu datblygu ar ffermydd yn fy etholaeth?

John Griffiths: Mae llawer o waith yn mynd rhagddo, y cyfeiriwyd ato'n gynharach, o ran edrych ar y canllawiau sy'n berthnasol i gynlluniau ynni dŵr. Mae'n bwysig deall anghenion ynni a'r hyn y gall ynni adnewyddadwy ar raddfa fach ei gyflawni inni yng Nghymru, sy'n rhywbeth yr ydym yn ymwybodol iawn ohono. Dyna pam yr ydym bellach wedi sefydlu Ynni Cymunedol Cymru ac Ynni'r Fro fel sefydliadau pwysig i helpu i ddatblygu'r cynlluniau hynny. Fel y dywedais yn gynharach hefyd, mae'n bwysig ein bod yn deall sefyllfa amgylcheddol Cymru. Mae gennym lawer o botensial o ran

environmental and fishing aspects to it. Therefore, we need to look at these different matters carefully and strike the right balance, and that is why we are looking at these new revised guidelines.

Russell George: Minister, I am sure that you will agree with me that small-scale renewable energy schemes must be looked upon favourably, especially hydro schemes that make good use of the abundance of our water sources. A number of constituents have also contacted me about small hydro schemes and their frustration with regard to the hurdles that they have to jump over in terms of conversations with the Environment Agency. I noted your response to Simon Thomas earlier. Clearly, Simon Thomas and Kirsty Williams also have constituents with the same issues. Can you confirm when the updated version of the hydropower good practice scheme guidelines will be updated? Can you also confirm that you would agree that the new version should be less onerous and help landowners and other parties rather than hinder them?

John Griffiths: The work is under way at the current time. It involves the Environment Agency on a UK level carrying out work. Obviously, we need to understand the particular circumstances in Wales in arriving at the most appropriate guidelines here. We have worked with the Environment Agency on a more user-friendly system for hydropower schemes. I am pleased to say that the time involved in dealing with such applications has been reduced substantially, and I am sure that all Members would welcome that.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Weinidog, rwyf wedi gwranddo'n ofalus ar eich atebion i Kirsty Williams a Russell George. Nid yw'n glir beth yn union yw eich safbwynt ar hyn. Mae'r cwestiwn yn ddigon syml: a ydych yn credu bod y canllawiau sy'n cael eu gosod gan Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yn golygu ei bod yn anoddach i gynlluniau hydro yng nghefn gwlad Cymru fod yn hyfyw a chael eu gweithredu? A yw hynny'n eich poeni? A ydych yn bwriadu trafod hynny ag Asiantaeth

cynhyrchu pen uchel yng Nghymru, ond mae iddo oblygiadau penodol o ran yr amgylchedd a physgota. Felly, mae angen inni edrych ar y gwahanol faterion hyn yn ofalus a chael y cydbwysedd cywir, a dyna pam yr ydym yn edrych ar y canllawiau newydd diwygiedig hyn.

Russell George: Weinidog, fe gytunwch, mae'n siŵr, fod yn rhaid i gynlluniau ynni adnewyddadwy ar raddfa fach gael ystyriaeth ffafriol, yn enwedig cynlluniau ynni dŵr sy'n gwneud defnydd da o'r doreth o ffynonellau dŵr sydd gennym. Mae nifer o etholwyr wedi cysylltu â mi hefyd am gynlluniau ynni dŵr bach a'u rhwystredigaeth o ran y rhwystrau y mae'n rhaid iddynt eu goresgyn o ran sgysiau gydag Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd. Sylwais ar eich ymateb i Simon Thomas yn gynharach. Yn amlwg, mae gan Simon Thomas a Kirsty Williams etholwyr sy'n codi'r un problemau hefyd. A allwch gadarnhau pryd y caiff y canllawiau ar arferion da cynlluniau ynni dŵr eu diweddarau? A allwch hefyd gadarnhau y byddech yn cytuno y dylai'r fersiwn newydd fod yn llai beichus a helpu tîrffeddiawyr a phartion eraill yn hytrach na bod yn rhwystr iddynt?

John Griffiths: Mae'r gwaith yn mynd rhagddo ar hyn o bryd. Mae angen i Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd ar lefel y DU ymgymryd â gwaith. Yn amlwg, mae angen inni ddeall yr amgylchiadau penodol yng Nghymru wrth benderfynu ar y canllawiau mwyaf priodol yma. Rydym wedi gweithio gydag Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd ar system fwy hwylus ar gyfer cynlluniau ynni dŵr. Rwy'n falch o nodi bod yr amser a dreulir yn ymdrin â cheisiadau o'r fath wedi gostwng yn sylweddol, ac rwy'n siŵr y byddai pob Aelod yn croesawu hynny.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Minister, I have listened carefully to your responses to Kirsty Williams and Russell George. It is not clear exactly what your stance is on this. The question is quite simple: do you believe that the guidelines being put in place by the Environment Agency mean that it is more difficult for hydro schemes in rural Wales to be viable and to be implemented? Does that concern you? Do you intend to discuss that with the Environment Agency? Do you

yr Amgylchedd? A ydych yn bwriadu edrych ar y canllawiau hyn unwaith yn rhagor i weld a ellir rhyddhau'r system er mwyn datblygu mwy o'r cynlluniau hydro hyn yng nghefn gwlad?

John Griffiths: As I said, work is ongoing to review these guidelines at present. I have had meetings with the Environment Agency and the industry on a number of occasions where these issues have been discussed. As I say, we have seen progress with regard to the time within which the Environment Agency deals with applications, but we need to understand the particular circumstances of Wales. We all want to protect our environment, including our water in Wales, as well as to take forward renewable energy as effectively as possible.

Ffermydd Paneli Solar Mawr

II. Nick Ramsay: Pa gyngor y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'i roi i gynghorau Cymru ynghylch lleoli ffermydd paneli solar ar raddfa fawr. OAQ(4)0186(ESD)

John Griffiths: Our planning policies on renewable energy are set out in 'Planning Policy Wales'. Furthermore, in 2011, we produced practice guidance on the planning implications of renewable and low-carbon energy that includes specific reference to solar farms.

Nick Ramsay: Thank you for that answer, Minister. While I agree that solar energy will play an increasingly vital role in Wales's energy supply, you will be aware of concerns in my constituency in the area surrounding Usk, about which I wrote to you recently, regarding the proliferation of large solar panel farms appearing on agricultural land. Will you give guidance to councils that, where possible, such farms should be sited on either brownfield sites or in areas of the landscape where they will have the minimal impact on surrounding residents.

John Griffiths: Once again, I am unable to comment on any particular applications or developments. 'Planning Policy Wales' deals with these matters. We have a toolkit for planners, 'Planning for Renewable and Low

intend to review these guidelines once again to see whether the system could be freed up in order to develop more of these hydro schemes in rural areas?

John Griffiths: Fel y dywedais, mae gwaith yn mynd rhagddo i adolygu'r canllawiau hyn ar hyn o bryd. Rwyf wedi cael cyfarfodydd gydag Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd a'r diwydiant ar sawl achlysur lle mae'r materion hyn wedi cael eu trafod. Fel y dywedais, rydym wedi gweld cynnydd o ran yr amser a gymer Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd i ymdrin â cheisiadau, ond mae angen inni ddeall amgylchiadau penodol Cymru. Rydym i gyd am warchod ein hamgylchedd, gan gynnwys ein dŵr yng Nghymru, yn ogystal â datblygu ynni adnewyddadwy mor effeithiol â phosibl.

Large-scale Solar Panel Farms

II. Nick Ramsay: What advice has the Minister provided to Welsh councils concerning the siting of large scale solar panel farms. OAQ(4)0186(ESD)

John Griffiths: Mae ein polisiau cynllunio ar ynni adnewyddadwy wedi'u nodi yn 'Polisi Cynllunio Cymru'. At hynny, yn 2011, cyhoeddwyd canllawiau ymarfer ar oblygiadau cynllunio ynni adnewyddadwy a charbon isel sy'n cynnwys cyfeiriad penodol at ffermydd solar.

Nick Ramsay: Diolch am yr ateb hwnnw, Weinidog. Er fy mod yn cytuno y bydd ynni'r haul yn chwarae rôl gynyddol bwysig yng nghyflenwad ynni Cymru, byddwch yn ymwybodol o'r pryderon yn fy etholaeth yn ardal Brynbuga, yr ysgrifennais atoch yn eu cylch yn ddiweddar, o ran y cynnydd yn nifer y ffermydd panel solar mawr sy'n ymddangos ar dir amaethyddol. A wnewch chi roi arweiniad i gynghorau, lle bo'n bosibl, y dylai ffermydd o'r fath gael eu lleoli naill ai ar safleoedd tir llwyd neu mewn tirwedd lle y byddant yn cael yr effaith leiaf bosibl ar drigolion yn yr ardal gyfagos.

John Griffiths: Unwaith eto, ni allaf wneud sylwadau ar unrhyw geisiadau na datblygiadau penodol. Mae 'Polisi Cynllunio Cymru', yn ymdrin â'r materion hyn. Mae pecyn cymorth ar gael i gynllunwyr,

Carbon Energy', which deals with a variety of renewable energies, including solar energy. It is also possible for local authorities to take forward supplementary planning guidance to deal with aspects of these matters. I think that 'Planning Policy Wales' clearly states that whether solar panels should be considered where that takes good-quality land out of agricultural production depends on a number of variable site-specific factors, including the density of panels per unit area, their proximity to each another, their height off the ground and the robustness of supporting structures.

2.15 p.m.

Simon Thomas: Minister, did you know that a solar farm in south Pembrokeshire could produce as much as 80% of the energy of a solar farm of the same size in Catalonia or Andalucia, which shows the potential in Wales? However, there is a problem. One of my constituents wants to develop a 25-acre solar farm, a £20 million-worth investment, in Upper Marros near Pendine between Pembrokeshire and Carmarthenshire. That development, however, is stymied by a lack of capacity on the grid to take the power from the solar farm. It would cost £0.3 million upfront to connect it, at the moment. What is your Government doing to ensure that our grid is capable of taking power from developments such as solar farms, which help to maintain healthy, vibrant countryside communities?

John Griffiths: As I have mentioned a number of times already today, I am unable to comment on particular matters, but, in general, I recognise and understand these issues. We have a great solar resource and potential in Wales that we want to harness to best effect. The First Minister and I have constant conversations and meetings with the grid to address these issues. One of our frustrations at the moment is the lack of power for the Welsh Government to address energy issues in the round. As Members will be aware, the First Minister has been robust in stating his ambitions for Wales to have further consenting powers as far as energy is concerned, and we will continue to make those requests.

'Cynllunio ar gyfer Ynni Adnewyddadwy a Charbon Isel', sy'n ymdrin ag amrywiaeth o ynni adnewyddadwy, gan gynnwys ynni'r haul. Mae hefyd yn bosibl i awdurdodau lleol ddatblygu canllawiau cynllunio atodol i ymdrin ag agweddau ar y materion hyn. Credaf fod 'Polisi Cynllunio Cymru' yn nodi'n glir fod p'un a ddylai paneli solar gael eu hystyried lle mae hynny'n defnyddio tir amaethyddol da yn dibynnu ar nifer o ffactorau amrywiol sy'n ymwneud â'r safle penodol, gan gynnwys dwysedd y paneli fesul ardal uned, pa mor agos i'w gilydd ydynt, eu taldra oddi ar y ddaear a chadernid y strwythurau ategol.

Simon Thomas: Weinidog, a wyddech y gallai fferm solar yn ne Sir Benfro gynhyrchu cymaint â 80% o'r ynni fferm solar o'r un maint yng Nghatalonia neu Andalucia, sy'n dangos y potensial yng Nghymru? Fodd bynnag, cyfyd problem. Mae un o'm hetholwyr yn awyddus i ddatblygu fferm solar 25 erw, buddsoddiad gwerth £20 miliwn, ym Marros Uchaf ger Pentywyn rhwng sir Benfro a sir Gaerfyrddin. Fodd bynnag, mae'r datblygiad hwnnw yn cael ei rwystro gan ddiffyg capasiti ar y grid i dderbyn y pŵer oddi ar y fferm solar. Byddai'n costio £0.3 miliwn ymlaen llaw i gysylltu iddo, ar hyn o bryd. Beth mae eich Llywodraeth yn ei wneud i sicrhau bod ein grid yn gallu derbyn pŵer o ddatblygiadau megis ffermydd solar, sy'n helpu i gynnal cymunedau iach a bywiog yng nghefn gwlad?

John Griffiths: Fel yr wyf wedi sôn sawl gwaith yn barod heddiw, ni allaf wneud sylwadau ar faterion penodol, ond, yn gyffredinol, rwy'n cydnabod ac yn deall y problemau hyn. Mae gennym adnodd a photensial mawr yng Nghymru o ran ynni'r haul, yr ydym am eu harneisio yn y ffordd orau. Mae'r Prif Weinidog a minnau yn cael sgysiau a chyfarfodydd drwy'r amser gyda'r grid i fynd i'r afael â'r materion hyn. Un o'n rhwystredigaethau ar hyn o bryd yw diffyg pŵer gan Lywodraeth Cymru i fynd i'r afael â materion ynni yn gyffredinol. Fel y gŵyr Aelodau, mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi bod yn gadarn wrth ddatgan ei uchelgais dros gael pŵerau cydsynio pellach i Gymru o ran ynni, a byddwn yn parhau i wneud y ceisiadau

hynny.

Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog Tai, Adfywio a Threftadaeth Questions to the Minister for Housing, Regeneration and Heritage

Gwaddol yr Olympics

1. William Graham: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu polisiau Llywodraeth Cymru i sicrhau ein bod yn gwireddu'r gwaddol Olympaidd ehangaf posibl.*
OAQ(4)0192(HRH)

The Minister for Housing, Regeneration and Heritage (Huw Lewis): I thank the Member for South Wales East for that question. Our athletes at the London Olympic and Paralympic Games were truly inspirational. Work is now under way to harness that inspiration and to ensure that opportunities to participate in sport and to undertake sustained physical activity are readily available and are embedded in wider Government policies.

William Graham: I am grateful to the Minister for his reply, and I share the sentiments that he expressed. However, I am a little more concerned about investment in tourism, and not just in relation to sporting activities. The Minister will recall the retention of the Ryder Cup by the European team at the Celtic Manor Resort in 2010, which offered great possibilities that do not appear to have been realised. Can he give us an idea of what he intends to do so that these remarkable and if not once-in-a-lifetime then once-in-a-very-few-years opportunities have a sustained benefit in Wales?

Huw Lewis: I thank William Graham for that question. He is quite right to point to the special opportunities that were afforded by the Ryder Cup, and let us hope that events like that are not once in a lifetime, but come along more regularly than we have been used to in the past. I can tell him that I undertook an interesting and informative trip to Glasgow last week to look at the preparations that are being made for the Commonwealth Games in 2014. We have some lessons to learn, not just about getting ready and

Olympic Legacy

1. William Graham: *Will the Minister outline the Welsh Government's policies to ensure we realise the widest Olympic legacy.*
OAQ(4)0192(HRH)

Y Gweinidog Tai, Adfywio a Threftadaeth (Huw Lewis): Diolch i'r Aelod dros Ddwyrain De Cymru am y cwestiwn hwnnw. Mae ein hathletwyr yng Ngemau Olympaidd a Gemau Paralympaidd Llundain yn wirioneddol ysbrydoledig. Mae gwaith bellach yn mynd rhagddo i harneisio'r ysbrydoliaeth honno ac i sicrhau bod cyfleoedd i gymryd rhan mewn chwaraeon a gweithgarwch corfforol parhaus ar gael yn rhwydd ac yn cael eu hymgorffori ym mholisiau ehangach y Llywodraeth.

William Graham: Rwy'n ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog am ei ateb, ac rwy'n rhannu'r teimladau a fynegodd. Fodd bynnag, rwyf ychydig yn fwy pryderus am fuddsoddi mewn twristiaeth, ac nid dim ond mewn perthynas â gweithgareddau chwaraeon. Bydd y Gweinidog yn cofio pan gadwodd tîm Ewrop Gwpan Ryder yng Ngwesty'r Celtic Manor yn 2010, a gynigiodd bosibiliadau mawr nad ydynt, yn ôl pob golwg, wedi eu gwireddu. A all roi syniad inni o'r hyn y mae'n bwriadu ei wneud fel bod y cyfleoedd hynod hyn sy'n gymharol brin yn cael budd parhaus yng Nghymru?

Huw Lewis: Diolch i William Graham am y cwestiwn hwnnw. Mae yn llygad ei le i dynnu sylw at y cyfleoedd arbennig a gynigiwyd gan Gwpan Ryder, a gadewch inni obeithio nad digwyddiadau unwaith mewn oes yw'r cyfryw ddigwyddiadau, ond eu bod yn codi'n fwy rheolaidd nag yr ydym wedi arfer ag ef yn y gorffennol. Gallaf ddweud wrtho imi fynd ar daith ddiddorol ac addysgiadol i Glasgow yr wythnos ddiwethaf i edrych ar y paratodau sy'n mynd rhagddynt ar gyfer Gemau'r Gymanwlad yn

preparing for large sporting events and their economic spin-offs, but about our general level of preparedness for them. I am asking officials to look closely at the lessons that Glasgow is learning in the run-up to 2014.

Lindsay Whittle: Minister and fellow athletes, 18 of 22 local authorities are cutting back on sport funding in Wales, and BBC Wales is also cutting back on the reporting of sport. Can you outline what funds the Welsh Government has made available to plug the substantial gap left in sports funding in Wales that has resulted from the Olympics? Otherwise, the only legacy for many of our children will be a vague recollection of someone running through their village or town holding a torch.

Huw Lewis: I cannot say that I quite share the gloomy outlook that the athletic Lindsay Whittle seems to endorse. In Wales, our preparations for the Olympics ran right through the Olympic time period. We were planning for the post-Olympic period well before the Olympics even occurred. Initiatives such as our Sport Wales community strategy, which has been supported by funding of £9 million over the next three years, will give thousands of young people a chance to shine and an opportunity to contribute through sport to their community irrespective of their circumstances.

For Gemau Cymru, for instance, delivered through the Urdd, we have the next two financial years guaranteed, again involving thousands of Welsh young people in multiple sports events. Our Get Set programme will involve 1,200 schools across Wales being offered guidance through this online teaching resource. In addition to that, the Minister for Education and Skills and I have set up a schools and physical activity task and finish group, chaired by Baroness Tanni Grey-Thompson, which will report to us by 2013 on how schools can help to increase levels of physical activity among children and young people. It is true to say that there has been a positive rise in the levels of physical activity

2014. Mae gennym rai gwersi i'w dysgu, nid yn unig am gael yn barod a pharatoi ar gyfer digwyddiadau chwaraeon mawr a'u sgil-ffeithiau economaidd, ond am ein lefel gyffredinol o barodrwydd ar eu cyfer. Rwy'n gofyn i'r swyddogion edrych yn ofalus ar y gwersi y mae Glasgow yn eu dysgu yn y cyfnod cyn 2014.

Lindsay Whittle: Weinidog a chyd-athletwyr, mae 18 o'r 22 awdurdod lleol yn lleihau cyllid chwaraeon yng Nghymru, ac mae BBC Cymru hefyd yn lleihau i ba raddau y maent yn gohebu ar chwaraeon. Allwch chi amlinellu faint o gyllid y mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi ei sicrhau i lenwi'r bwlch sylweddol sydd wedi'i adael o ran cyllid chwaraeon yng Nghymru yn sgil y o'r Gemau Olympaidd? Fel arall, yr unig etifeddiaeth i lawer o'n plant fydd brith gof o rywun yn cario ffagl yn rhedeg drwy eu pentref neu dref.

Huw Lewis: Ni allaf ddweud fy mod yn rhannu'r rhagolygon llwm y mae'r athletaidd Lindsay Whittle yn eu cefnogi, yn ôl pob golwg. Yng Nghymru, roedd ein paratoadau ar gyfer y Gemau Olympaidd yn cwmpasu holl gyfnod y Gemau Olympaidd. Roeddem yn cynllunio ar gyfer y cyfnod ôl-Olympaidd ymhell cyn i'r Gemau Olympaidd ddigwydd hyd yn oed. Bydd mentrau fel ein strategaeth gymunedol Chwaraeon Cymru, a gefnogwyd gan gyllid o £9 miliwn dros y tair blynedd nesaf, yn rhoi cyfle i filoedd o bobl ifanc ddisgleirio a bydd yn gyfle i gyfrannu drwy gyfrwng chwaraeon at eu cymuned waeth beth fo'u hamgylchiadau.

Ar gyfer Gemau Cymru, er enghraifft, a ddarperir drwy'r Urdd, mae gennym y ddwy flwyddyn ariannol nesaf yn sicr, gan unwaith eto gynnwys miloedd o bobl ifanc o Gymru mewn llu o ddigwyddiadau chwaraeon. Bydd ein rhaglen Bydd Barod yn golygu cynnig arweiniad i 1,200 o ysgolion ledled Cymru drwy'r adnodd addysgu ar-lein hwn. At hynny, mae'r Gweinidog Addysg a Sgiliau a minnau wedi sefydlu grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen ysgolion a gweithgarwch corfforol, a gadeirir gan y Farwnes Tanni Grey-Thompson, a fydd yn adrodd inni erbyn 2013 ar sut y gall ysgolion helpu i gynyddu lefelau o weithgarwch corfforol ymhlith plant a phobl ifanc. Mae'n wir dweud y bu cynnydd

among children, particularly younger children, over the past few years.

Kirsty Williams: I am sure that you would agree, Minister, that some of the most iconic images of this summer's Olympics were the highs and lows of the British road cycling team. What steps is the Welsh Government taking to secure stages of the Tour de France in Wales in future years? Would he not agree that the countryside and the hills and valleys of the Brecon and Radnorshire constituency would prove to be a fantastic backdrop to this world-famous race?

Huw Lewis: I thank the Member for Brecon and Radnorshire for that question. These are early days, of course, and I understand that discussions between the major events unit here at the Welsh Assembly, rather than my sports division, and the organisers behind the Tour de France have started some preliminary communication. I would agree that her constituency has unparalleled—no, I had better not say that. It has a high degree of attractiveness when it comes to this sort of event. I might suggest the road between the Storey Arms and the top end of Cefn Coed, which would unite our two great constituencies, as an area that could be considered. There are great venues in Wales for major events such as that. We know that we can do it, and we will try our very best to attract the attention of the Tour de France to Wales's fantastic natural assets.

Suzy Davies: Minister, you have been very keen to talk up the success of the cultural Olympiad and, in particular, the Cauldrons and Furnaces project. Will the Arts Council of Wales and other third-party organisations now take a greater role in promoting and interpreting the historic environment in future?

Huw Lewis: I thank Suzy Davies for that question. Yes, absolutely. Since my appointment, I have promoted ever-closer co-operation, I hope—and I believe—between organisations such as Cadw and the arts council. I believe that they have a great deal to learn from each other, and that joint action on issues such as attracting young people to

cadarnhaol yn y lefelau gweithgarwch corfforol ymhlith plant, yn enwedig plant iau, dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf.

Kirsty Williams: Rwy'n siŵr y byddech yn cytuno, Weinidog, mai rhai o'r delweddau mwyaf eiconig o Gemau Olympaidd yr haf hwn oedd llwyddiannau a methiannau tîm beicio ffordd Prydain. Pa gamau y mae Llywodraeth Cymru'n eu cymryd i sicrhau y daw camau o'r Tour de France i Gymru yn y dyfodol? Oni fyddai'n cytuno y byddai cefn gwlad a bryniau a dyffrynnoedd etholaeth Brycheiniog a Sir Faesyfed yn profi i fod yn gefndir gwych i'r ras fyd-enwog hon?

Huw Lewis: Diolch i'r Aelod dros Frycheiniog a Sir Faesyfed am y cwestiwn hwnnw. Maeegis dechrau y mae'r gwaith hwn, wrth gwrs, ac rwy'n deall bod trafodaethau rhwng yr uned digwyddiadau mawr yma yn y Cynulliad, yn hytrach na'm his-adran chwaraeon, a'r trefnwyr a fu'n gyfrifol am y Tour de France wedi dechrau rhywfaint o gyfathrebu cychwynol. Byddwn yn cytuno bod ei hetholaeth heb ei hail—na, gwell imi beidio â dweud hynny. Mae'n ddeniadol iawn o ystyried y math hwn o ddigwyddiad. Efallai y byddwn yn awgrymu'r ffordd rhwng y Storey Arms a phen uchaf Cefn Coed, a fyddai'n uno ein dwy etholaeth fawr, fel ardal y gellid ei hystyried. Mae lleoliadau gwych yng Nghymru ar gyfer digwyddiadau mawr fel hynny. Gwyddom y gallwn wneud hynny, a gwnawn ein gorau glas i ddenu sylw'r Tour de France i asedau naturiol gwych Cymru.

Suzy Davies: Weinidog, yr ydych wedi bod yn awyddus iawn i sôn am lwyddiant yr Olympiad diwylliannol ac, yn benodol, y prosiect Crochan a Ffwrnais. A fydd Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru a sefydliadau trydydd parti eraill bellach yn chwarae mwy o rôl i hyrwyddo a dehongli'r amgylchedd hanesyddol yn y dyfodol?

Huw Lewis: Diolch i Suzy Davies am y cwestiwn hwnnw. Byddant, ar bob cyfrif. Ers fy mhenodi, rwyf wedi hyrwyddo cydweithredu agosach byth, rwy'n gobeithio—ac yn credu—rhwng sefydliadau fel Cadw a chyngor y celfyddydau. Credaf fod ganddynt lawer i'w ddsygu oddi wrth ei gilydd, a bod gweithredu ar y cyd ar faterion

Cadw monuments, but also by offering activities and educational experiences when those children arrive in those venues, is important, particularly in tough economic times. I do not think that young people necessarily distinguish whether Cadw or the arts council has organised a particular event. What they are looking for is a good, inspirational educational experience, and we should supply that.

Suzy Davies: Thank you for that answer. I am glad to hear that the door is open to that. The success of the Olympics was made possible, of course, by the involvement of a great number of volunteers and greater co-operative working. In your historic environment strategy, Minister, you state that you will explore options such as the creation of a Welsh heritage alliance, which has great potential for decentralised local empowerment. Where have you got to on that, and would you consider making a fuller statement on the progress made on that attractive policy objective as soon as possible?

Huw Lewis: Work is ongoing. I agree with you, as I think that the idea of a Welsh heritage alliance has multiple benefits. The first is in building and co-ordinating the volunteer base that, to a large extent, already exists out there, with enthusiastic people who have adopted, through one means or another, a heritage location or building within their communities. We now need to move on towards a degree of national co-ordination, and put an arm around the shoulder, if you like, of those smaller organisations or individuals, and bring them together as a community of volunteers that is sustained, informed and drawn into the interpretation of some of our fantastic heritage locations up and down the country.

Lleoedd Addoli sydd wedi'u Rhestru

2. Mike Hedges: *Faint o lefydd addoli y mae Cadw wedi'u rhestru fel rhai Gradd 1 neu Radd 2. OAQ(4)0180(HRH)*

Huw Lewis: There are currently 3,153 listings in Wales relating to places of worship. The vast majority are churches and

fel denu pobl ifanc i henebion Cadw, ond hefyd drwy gynnig gweithgareddau a phrofiadau addysgol pan fydd y plant hynny yn cyrraedd y lleoliadau hynny, yn bwysig, yn enwedig mewn cyfnod economaidd anodd. Nid wyf yn meddwl bod pobl ifanc o reidrwydd yn gwybod ai Cadw neu gyngor y celfyddydau sydd wedi trefnu digwyddiad penodol. Yr hyn y maent yn chwilio amdano yw profiad addysgol ysbrydoledig, da, a dylem ddarparu hynny.

Suzy Davies: Diolch am yr ateb hwnnw. Rwy'n falch o glywed bod y drws yn agored i hynny. Bu llwyddiant y Gemau Olympaidd yn bosibl, wrth gwrs, yn sgil cyfranogiad nifer fawr o wirfoddolwyr a mwy o weithio cydweithredol. Yn eich strategaeth amgylchedd hanesyddol, Weinidog, nodwch y byddwch yn edrych ar opsiynau fel y gwaith o greu cynghrair treftadaeth Gymreig, sydd â photensial mawr ar gyfer camau grymuso lleol datganoledig. Ble ydych chi wedi cyrraedd ar hynny, ac a fydddech yn ystyried gwneud datganiad llawnach ar y cynnydd a wnaed ar yr amcan polisi deniadol hwnnw cyn gynted ag y bo modd?

Huw Lewis: Mae gwaith yn mynd rhagddo. Cytunaf â chi, gan fy mod yn credu bod gan y syniad o gynghrair treftadaeth Gymreig nifer o fanteision. Y fantais gyntaf yw adeiladu a chyd-drefnu'r sylfaen o wirfoddolwyr sydd, i raddau helaeth, eisoes yn bodoli, gyda phobl frwdfrydig sydd wedi mabwysiadu, drwy un ffordd neu'r llall, leoliad treftadaeth neu adeilad o fewn eu cymunedau. Nawr mae angen inni symud ymlaen tuag at rywfaint o gydgyssylltu cenedlaethol, a mynwesu, os mynnwch chi, y sefydliadau llai hynny neu unigolion, a dod â nhw at ei gilydd fel cymuned o wirfoddolwyr a gaiff ei chynnal, ei hysbysu a'i chynnwys yn y dehongliad o rai o'n lleoliadau treftadaeth gwych ledled y wlad.

Listed Places of Worship

2. Mike Hedges: *How many places of worship are listed as Grade 1 or Grade 2 by Cadw. OAQ(4)0180(HRH)*

Huw Lewis: Ar hyn o bryd mae 3,153 o leoedd addoli wedi'u rhestru yng Nghymru. Mae'r mwyafrif helaeth yn eglwysi a chapeli,

chapels but, occasionally, other structures, such as gates or religious statues, have also been listed. There are 214 listed at grade I, 525 listed at grade II*, and 2,414 listed at grade II.

Mike Hedges: I thank the Minister for his response. To many of us, these chapels and churches are more important to Wales than the castles of Norman invaders. What action can be taken to identify 100 or so key buildings in Wales and to ensure their continuation? There are so many buildings that you cannot fund and protect them all, but you could bring it down to a small number of key buildings. What action can be taken on that? Will you ask a taskforce to look at which buildings desperately need to be protected for the future of the people of Wales?

Huw Lewis: I thank you for that point. You have raised the idea of setting up a chapels taskforce a number of times, I know, Mike, and we have exchanged correspondence about the protection of chapels. I agree with you on the importance of getting to grips with that issue for Wales's built landscape. I have asked my officials in Cadw to consider the possibility of initiating a task and finish group to look at ecclesiastical exemption in the context of the heritage protection legislation that is currently in preparation. It is important that we look closely at the issue of religious buildings, including chapel buildings, in view of the decline in listed places of worship in active use. This is a real issue, and I am very much alive to the problems that we face.

I do not necessarily share your view that we can save only a few. A twin-track approach is possible here. First, in every community up and down Wales, there are thousands of places of worship that are empty but unlisted and might be considered relatively ordinary. I would be anxious to work with church and chapel groups—and Faith in Affordable Housing is one such group with whom we are currently working—to see whether we can include those churches and chapels as part of our empty homes programme, moving them towards residential or some other form of conversion. You are quite right that listed

ond, o bryd i'w gilydd, mae strwythurau eraill, fel giatiau neu gerfluniau crefyddol, hefyd wedi cael eu rhestru. Mae 214 wedi'u rhestru yn radd I, 525 wedi'u rhestru yn radd II*, a 2,414 wedi'u rhestru yn radd II.

Mike Hedges: Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am ei ymateb. I lawer ohonom, mae'r capeli ac eglwysi hyn yn bwysicach i Gymru na chestyll goresgynwyr Normanaidd. Pa gamau y gellir eu cymryd i nodi oddeutu 100 o adeiladau allweddol yng Nghymru a sicrhau eu parhad? Mae cynifer o adeiladau fel na allwch eu hariannu a'u gwarchod i gyd, ond gallech gynnwys nifer fach o adeiladau allweddol. Pa gamau y gellir eu cymryd i'r perwyl hwnnw? A fyddwch yn gofyn i dasglu edrych ar ba adeiladau y mae angen iddynt gael eu gwarchod yn ddirfawr ar gyfer dyfodol pobl Cymru?

Huw Lewis: Diolch ichi am y pwynt hwnnw. Gwn eich bod wedi codi'r syniad o sefydlu tasglu capeli nifer o weithiau, Mike, ac rydym wedi cyfnewid gohebiaeth ynghylch gwarchod capeli. Cytunaf â chi ynghylch pwysigrwydd mynd i'r afael â'r mater hwnnw ar gyfer tirlun adeiledig Cymru. Rwyf wedi gofyn i'm swyddogion yn Cadw ystyried y posibilrwydd o sefydlu grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen i ystyried eithriadau eglwysig yng nghyd-destun y ddeddfwriaeth gwarchod treftadaeth sydd wrthi'n cael ei pharatoi. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn edrych yn ofalus ar adeiladau crefyddol, gan gynnwys adeiladau capeli, o ystyried y dirywiad yn nifer y lleoedd addoli rhestredig a ddefnyddir ar hyn o bryd. Mae hon yn broblem fawr, ac rwy'n ymwybodol iawn o'r problemau a wynebwn.

Nid wyf o reidrwydd yn rhannu eich barn mai dim ond ychydig y gallwn eu hachub. Mae ymagwedd ddeublyg yn bosibl yma. Yn gyntaf, ym mhob cymunedol ledled Cymru, mae miloedd o leoedd addoli sy'n wag ond heb eu rhestru ac y gellid eu hystyried yn gymharol gyffredin. Byddwn yn awyddus i weithio gyda grwpiau eglwysig a chapeli—ac mae Faith in Affordable Housing yn un grŵp o'r fath yr ydym yn gweithio gydag ef ar hyn o bryd—i weld a allwn gynnwys yr eglwysig a chapeli hynny fel rhan o'n rhaglen cartrefi gwag, gan eu symud tuag at ddefnydd preswyl neu ryw fath arall o drawnewid.

places of worship are generally more special and are tougher nuts to crack. The idea of a task and finish group will initially help to set us on the right course.

Darren Millar: Minister, you will be aware that I have raised concerns with you over the future of Písgah chapel in Loughor. There was an application to demolish that chapel, which was subsequently withdrawn. You will be aware of the association of that chapel with Evan Roberts of the 1904 religious revival in Wales, and so that is an example of a very important national building that does not have any kind of listed or protected status. What action will you take to ensure that chapels such as that are registered on some sort of protected list for the future, whether that is within the existing graded listed system or not?

Huw Lewis: I thank the Member for his correspondence on the issues surrounding Písgah chapel. He is right to be concerned. The Member will be aware that, as part of the build-up to the heritage Bill, we are looking at ideas for the local protection and local listing of those buildings that may not make it to a national list but that have significant local importance. If that is the view of the community, that is a valid starting point for thinking about ways in which such buildings could be protected. This conversation also needs to surround protection. Critically, we also need to think about systems in which future alternative uses and the restoration of buildings for those uses are a part of the conversation. It is the future of a building that secures the interpretation of its past.

William Powell: Minister, as you will be aware, the organisation Friends of Friendless Churches has been active over many years in Wales, and it currently receives 70% of its Welsh funding from Cadw. I draw your attention to the work that needs to be carried out in Llanellieu in Powys, where much has been done to safeguard a building. Given that achievement, will you please outline your expectations of the future work of Friends of Friendless Churches and would you

Rydych yn llygad eich lle bod lleoedd addoli rhestredig yn gyffredinol yn fwy arbennig a'u bod yn fwy cymhleth. Bydd y syniad o grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen yn helpu i ddechrau i'n llywio ar y trywydd cywir.

Darren Millar: Weinidog, byddwch yn ymwybodol fy mod wedi codi pryderon gyda chi dros ddyfodol capel Písgah yng Nghasllwchwr. Roedd cais i ddymchwel y capel hwnnw, a dynnwyd yn ôl. Byddwch yn ymwybodol o'r cysylltiad rhwng y capel hwnnw ac Evan Roberts o ddiwygiad crefyddol 1904 yng Nghymru, ac felly mae'n enghraifft o adeilad cenedlaethol pwysig iawn nad oes ganddo unrhyw fath o statws rhestredig neu warchoddedig. Pa gamau a gymerwch i sicrhau bod capeli o'r fath yn cael eu cofrestru ar ryw fath o restr a ddiogelir ar gyfer y dyfodol, boed hynny o fewn y system rhestru â gradd bresennol ai peidio?

Huw Lewis: Diolch i'r Aelod am ei ohebiaeth ar y materion yn ymwneud â chapel Písgah. Mae yn llygad ei le i fod yn bryderus. Bydd yr Aelod yn ymwybodol, fel rhan o'r gwaith sy'n arwain at y Bil treftadaeth, ein bod yn ystyried syniadau ar gyfer gwarchod yn lleol a rhestru yn lleol yr adeiladau hynny nad ydynt o bosibl yn cyrraedd rhestr genedlaethol ond sy'n arwyddocaol iawn yn lleol. Os mai dyna farn y gymuned, mae hwnnw'n fan cychwyn dilys ar gyfer meddwl am ffyrdd y gallai adeiladau o'r fath gael eu gwarchod. Mae angen i'r drafodaeth hon hefyd drafod gwarchod. Yn feirniadol, mae angen inni feddwl hefyd am systemau lle mae defnydd amgen yn y dyfodol ac adfer adeiladau ar gyfer y defnydd hwnnw yn rhan o'r drafodaeth. Dyfodol adeilad sy'n sicrhau sut y caiff ei orffennol ei ddehongli.

William Powell: Weinidog, fel y gwyrddoch, mae'r sefydliad Cyfeillion Eglwysi Difyfaill wedi bod yn weithgar ers blynyddoedd lawer yng Nghymru, ac ar hyn o bryd mae'n cael 70% o'i gyllid yng Nghymru gan Cadw. Tynnaf eich sylw at y gwaith sydd angen ei wneud yn Llanellieu ym Mhowys, lle y mae llawer wedi ei wneud i ddiogelu adeilad. O gofio'r cyflawniad hwnnw, a wnewch chi amlinellu eich disgwyliadau o ran gwaith Cyfeillion Eglwysi Difyfaill yn y dyfodol ac

undertake to confirm the importance of it within the wider Cadw strategy?

2.30 p.m.

Huw Lewis: Yes, I am happy to do that; when no-one else was active in the landscape of trying to look after places like Llanellieu, the Friends of Friendless Churches was there. However, in the era that we are entering now, the most important factor is that we have co-ordination across sectors. I am enthused that a meeting has been arranged by the National Churches Trust to consider the scope for a new body to support all Christian places of worship in Wales—to bring together partners of all denominations. If we can get over that hurdle, incorporating organisations such as Faith in Affordable Housing, Friends of Friendless Churches and the other organisations active out there, and bring everyone together, we could make great strides in the near future.

David Rees: To support the maintenance of these grade I and grade II listed buildings—and you also mentioned restoration—we need to ensure that the appropriately skilled workforce exists in Wales. What progress is being made on developing those heritage skills needed in Wales to ensure that our buildings, including the chapels and churches mentioned, are restored and maintained to standards that we and Cadw expect?

Huw Lewis: I contend, and most people in the heritage sector would agree, that there is a shortfall in terms of a highly skilled workforce that is comfortable with working on traditional buildings, using traditional methods. I have been working closely alongside Jeff Cuthbert, the Deputy Minister for Skills, to discuss how we could address that skills shortfall. I am convinced that Wales could lead the way in the UK in terms of both providing training up to those higher levels of building skills, and of stimulating demand in the imaginative ways in which we could embark on historic building regeneration within communities.

Blaenoriaethau (Gogledd Cymru)

a fyddech yn fodlon cadarnhau ei bwysigrwydd o fewn strategaeth ehangach Cadw?

Huw Lewis: Ydw, rwy'n hapus i wneud hynny; pan nad aeth neb arall ati i geisio gwarchod lleoedd fel Llaneleu, roedd Cyfeillion Eglwysi Digyfaill yno. Fodd bynnag, yn yr oes sydd ohoni, y ffactor pwysicaf yw ein bod wedi cyd-drefnu ar draws y sectorau. Rwy'n frwdfrydig bod cyfarfod wedi ei drefnu gan yr Ymddiriedolaeth Eglwysi Genedlaethol i ystyried y cwmpas i gorff newydd gefnogi pob lle addoli Cristnogol yng Nghymru—i ddwyn ynghyd bartneriaid o bob enwad. Os gallwn oresgyn y rhwystr hwnnw, gan gynnwys cyrff gwreiddiol fel Faith in Affordable Housing, Cyfeillion Eglwysi Digyfaill a'r cyrff eraill sy'n gweithredu ar hyn o bryd, a dwyn pawb ynghyd, gallem wneud camau breision yn y dyfodol agos.

David Rees: Er mwyn cefnogi'r gwaith o gynnal a chadw'r adeiladau rhestredig gradd I a gradd II hyn—a gwnaethoch hefyd sôn am adfer—mae angen inni sicrhau bod y gweithlu â'r sgiliau priodol yn bodoli yng Nghymru. Pa gynnydd sy'n cael ei wneud ar ddatblygu'r sgiliau treftadaeth hynny sydd eu hangen yng Nghymru i sicrhau bod ein hadeiladau, gan gynnwys y capeli a'r eglwysi a grybwyllwyd, yn cael eu hadfer a'u cynnal a'u cadw i safonau yr ydym ni a Cadw yn eu disgwyl?

Huw Lewis: Rwy'n dadlau, a byddai'r rhan fwyaf o bobl yn y sector treftadaeth yn cytuno, bod diffyg o ran gweithlu tra medrus sy'n gyfforddus yn gweithio ar adeiladau traddodiadol, gan ddefnyddio dulliau traddodiadol. Rwyf wedi bod yn gweithio'n agos ochr yn ochr â Jeff Cuthbert, y Dirprwy Weinidog Sgiliau, i drafod sut y gallem fynd i'r afael â'r diffyg sgiliau. Rwy'n argyhoeddedig y gallai Cymru arwain y ffordd yn y DU o ran darparu hyfforddiant hyd at y lefelau uwch hynny o sgiliau adeiladu, ac ysgogi galw yn y ffyrdd dychmygus y gallem ddechrau adfywio adeiladau hanesyddol o fewn cymunedau.

Priorities (North Wales)

3. Antoinette Sandbach: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu ei flaenoriaethau yng nghyswllt Gogledd Cymru ar gyfer y 12 mis nesaf. OAQ(4)0191(HRH)*

Huw Lewis: I am committed to fulfilling, across Wales, the commitments that are set out for my portfolio in the programme for government. This includes supporting and promoting museums, archives and libraries, encouraging wider access to high-quality arts for all and the introduction of the housing and heritage Bills.

Anotinette Sandbach: One matter not included in your list was the high street. You will be aware that the British Retail Consortium's recent survey identified that one in 10 shops are currently vacant nationally and that, in Wales, the figure is higher again. Given the urgent need to revitalise our high streets in north Wales, could you explain why you have taken so long to take forward the recommendations of the Enterprise and Business Committee's report, which was published in January 2012? Your own consultation will not close until February 2013. In the meantime, there is a document available from the Welsh Conservatives that you might wish to look at.

Huw Lewis: Yes, and the Member will be aware that I welcomed the document from the Welsh Conservatives as a contribution to this debate. The Member will also be aware—and I do not accept that there has been any delay here—that we are moving rapidly towards a realignment of regeneration efforts, particularly in relation to town centres and seaside towns as per our manifesto commitments. That would include necessarily a concentrated look at the health of our high streets.

You will be aware that we are engaged in regeneration work up and down our seven regeneration areas across Wales between now and 2014, each and every one of which has undertakings towards their local communities and the local authorities within them. Before we move on to change our areas of operation, I am determined that we fulfil our commitments and meet our promises to those

3. Antoinette Sandbach: *Will the Minister outline his priorities for North Wales during the next 12 months. OAQ(4)0191(HRH)*

Huw Lewis: Rwy'n ymrwymedig i gyflawni, ledled Cymru, yr ymrwymadau sydd wedi eu nodi ar gyfer fy mhorthffolio yn y rhaglen lywodraethu. Mae hyn yn cynnwys cefnogi a hyrwyddo amgueddfeydd, archifau a llyfrgelloedd, gan annog mynediad ehangach i gelfyddydau o safon i bawb a chyflwyno'r Biliau tai a threftadaeth.

Anotinette Sandbach: Un mater nad yw wedi'i gynnwys yn eich rhestr oedd y stryd fawr. Byddwch yn ymwybodol bod arolwg diweddar Consortiwm Manwerthu Prydain wedi nodi bod un o bob 10 o siopau yn wag ar hyn o bryd yn genedlaethol ac, yng Nghymru, mae'r ffigur yn uwch eto. O ystyried yr angen brys i adfywio ein stryd fawr yn y gogledd, a allech egluro pam eich bod wedi cymryd cyhyd i weithredu ar argymhellion adroddiad y Pwyllgor Menter a Busnes, a gyhoeddwyd ym mis Ionawr 2012? Ni fydd eich ymgynghoriad eich hun yn dod i ben tan fis Chwefror 2013. Yn y cyfamser, mae dogfen ar gael gan y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig y gallech fod yn awyddus i fwrw golwg drosti.

Huw Lewis: Ie, a bydd yr Aelod yn ymwybodol imi groesawu'r ddogfen gan y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig fel cyfraniad at y ddatl hon. Bydd yr Aelod hefyd yn ymwybodol—ac nid wyf yn derbyn y bu unrhyw oedi yma—ein bod yn symud yn gyflym tuag at ail-alinio ymdrechion adfywio, yn enwedig mewn perthynas â chanol trefi a threfi glan môr yn unol ag ymrwymadau ein maniffesto. Byddai hynny o reidrwydd yn golygu edrych yn ofalus ar gyflwr ein strydoedd mawr.

Byddwch yn ymwybodol ein bod yn cymryd rhan mewn gwaith adfywio ar draws ein saith ardal adfywio ledled Cymru rhwng nawr a 2014, y mae gan bob un ohonynt ymgymeriadau tuag at eu cymunedau lleol a'r awdurdodau lleol oddi mewn iddynt. Cyn inni symud ymlaen i newid ein hardaloedd gweithredu, rwy'n benderfynol ein bod yn cyflawni ein hymrwymadau ac yn cyflawni

communities that are currently a part of our regeneration areas. To do anything else would have been dishonourable.

Kenneth Skates: The Communities, Equality and Local Government Committee, on which I sit, recently published a report into the future of the Welsh premier league, part of which examined third and fourth generation pitches. Our report highlighted how countries such as Sweden and Northern Ireland have specific strategies for installing 3G and 4G pitches, and which receive support and assistance from their own governments in respect of this. Will you examine how the Welsh Government can develop its own strategy to install 3G and 4G pitches in communities and areas in north Wales?

Huw Lewis: I thank Ken Skates for that question. I am fully aware of the flexibility of usage afforded by the new 3G and 4G pitches and I am grateful to the committee for its report following its inquiry into the Welsh premier league. I will, of course, consider the report very carefully and respond to the recommendations in due course.

Alun Ffred Jones: Ar yr un thema, diolch am ddod draw i Fangor y diwrnod o'r blaen a chyfarfod gyda chynrychiolwyr o'r ymddiriedolaeth bêl-droed gymunedol a Chlwb Pêl-droed Dinas Bangor. A wnewch chi ymuno â mi wrth longyfarch cyngor y ddinas a'r clwb ar gartref newydd y clwb, a llongyfarch y clwb ar ei lwyddiant yn y gynghrair? Hefyd, a fydddech yn barod i gynnig eich cefnogaeth i greu safle cae-pobtywydd 3G er budd pêl-droed gymunedol a'r ardal ym Mangor?

Huw Lewis: It was a pleasure to visit Bangor. One of the very interesting aspects of the proposals put forward by Bangor City Football Club was that it was not a proposal solely from the club about a 3G pitch. It was very much a community proposal, including partnerships through the local authority, the city council and the university, as well as a strong voluntary base within the community. That kind of strength in partnership will be

ein haddewidion i'r cymunedau hynny sy'n rhan o'n hardaloedd adfywio ar hyn o bryd. Byddai gwneud unrhyw beth arall wedi bod yn gywilyddus.

Kenneth Skates: Cyhoeddodd y Pwyllgor Cymunedau, Cydraddoldeb a Llywodraeth Leol, yr wyf yn aelod ohono, adroddiad yn ddiweddar ar ddyfodol uwch-gynghrair Cymru, ac ystyriodd rhan ohono feysydd chwarae trydedd a phedwaredd genhedlaeth. Amlygodd ein hadroddiad sut y mae gan wledydd fel Sweden a Gogledd Iwerddon strategaethau penodol ar gyfer gosod caeau 3G a 4G, ac sy'n cael cefnogaeth a chymorth gan eu llywodraethau eu hunain mewn perthynas â hyn. A fyddwch yn edrych ar sut y gall Llywodraeth Cymru ddatblygu ei strategaeth ei hun i osod caeau 3G a 4G mewn cymunedau ac ardaloedd yn y gogledd?

Huw Lewis: Hoffwn ddiolch i Ken Skates am y cwestiwn hwnnw. Rwy'n gwbl ymwybodol o'r defnydd hyblyg a gynigir gan y caeau 3G a 4G newydd ac rwyf yn ddiolchgar i'r pwyllgor am ei adroddiad yn dilyn ei ymchwiliad i uwch-gynghrair Cymru. Byddaf, wrth gwrs, yn ystyried yr adroddiad yn ofalus iawn ac yn ymateb i'r argymhellion maes o law.

Alun Ffred Jones: On the same theme, thank you for coming to Bangor the other day and meeting representatives of the community football trust and Bangor City Football Club. Will you join me in congratulating the city council and the football club on its new home, and in congratulating the club on its success in the league? Also, would you be prepared to offer your support to the creation of an all-weather 3G pitch that will bring benefit to community football and the wider community in Bangor?

Huw Lewis: Roedd yn bleser ymweld â Bangor. Un o'r agweddau diddorol iawn ar y cynigion a gyflwynwyd gan Glwb Pêl-droed Dinas Bangor oedd nad cynnig oddi wrth y clwb yn unig ydoedd am gae 3G. Roedd yn bendant yn gynnig cymunedol, gan gynnwys partneriaethau drwy'r awdurdod lleol, cyngor y ddinas a'r brifysgol, yn ogystal â sylfaen wirfoddol gref yn y gymuned. Bydd y math hwnnw o gryfder mewn partneriaeth yn rhan

very much a part of how the Welsh Government could best respond to the committee's report and to the issues around the need for 3G and 4G upgrades across the country.

Prosiectau Adfywio

4. Ann Jones: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am y prosiectau adfywio sy'n mynd rhagddynt yn Nyffryn Clwyd. OAQ(4)0189(HRH)*

Huw Lewis: The focus for regeneration within the Vale of Clwyd in 2012 will continue to be on the coast through the north Wales coast regeneration area programme. Priorities over the next 12 months will be to progress the delivery of the west Rhyl housing improvement project.

Ann Jones: I thank you for the number of visits that you make to Rhyl to see the ongoing projects developing. I am sure that everybody who is associated with those visits welcomes the fact that you have taken that interest into west Rhyl's housing. Do you agree that, because of the way in which Denbighshire County Borough Council is now focusing on regeneration in Rhyl, together with the work that your officials are doing, Rhyl is on the right track and that we have every confidence, both for the residents and for those who want to come to work in Rhyl, that we will provide jobs and good housing, and that this will be done through your regeneration programme and through a Welsh Labour Government?

Huw Lewis: Thank you for those comments, Ann. Some excellent progress has been made on the housing agenda particularly in terms of the west Rhyl housing improvement project that aims to remake the housing offer in the area, and therefore there is no shortage of ambition there. Also, the developments at the Foryd Harbour have the potential to create a real high-quality visitor destination. Those Members who know Rhyl and have had a perspective on it over time will, I am sure, agree that the steps forward, in partnership with the local community, have been nothing short of remarkable over the last couple of years.

Mark Isherwood: One of the regeneration

fawr o sut y gallai Llywodraeth Cymru ymateb orau i adroddiad y pwyllgor ac i'r materion ynghylch yr angen am uwchraddio 3G a 4G ledled y wlad.

Regeneration Projects

4. Ann Jones: *Will the Minister provide an update on the on-going regeneration projects in the Vale of Clwyd. OAQ(4)0189(HRH)*

Huw Lewis: Bydd y ffocws ar gyfer adfywio yn Nyffryn Clwyd yn 2012 yn parhau i fod ar yr arfordir drwy raglen ardal adfywio arfordir y gogledd. Y blaenoriaethau dros y 12 mis nesaf fydd bwrw ati i gyflwyno prosiect gwella tai gorllewin y Rhyl.

Ann Jones: Diolch ichi am y nifer o ymweliadau rydych yn eu gwneud â'r Rhyl i weld y prosiectau parhaus yn datblygu. Rwy'n siŵr bod pawb sy'n gysylltiedig â'r ymweliadau hynny yn croesawu'r ffaith eich bod wedi cymryd y diddordeb hwnnw yn nhai gorllewin y Rhyl. A ydych yn cytuno, oherwydd y ffordd y mae Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Sir Ddinbych bellach yn canolbwyntio ar adfywio yn y Rhyl, ynghyd â'r gwaith y mae eich swyddogion yn ei wneud, fod y Rhyl ar y trywydd iawn a bod gennym bob hyder, ar gyfer y trigolion a'r rheini sydd am ddod i weithio yn y Rhyl, y byddwn yn darparu swyddi a thai da, ac y gwneir hyn drwy eich rhaglen adfywio a thrwy Lywodraeth Lafur Cymru?

Huw Lewis: Diolch ichi am y sylwadau hynny, Ann. Gwnaed rhywfaint o gynnydd ardderchog ar yr agenda tai yn enwedig o ran prosiect gwella tai gorllewin y Rhyl sy'n anelu at ailwampio'r tai sydd ar gael yn yr ardal, ac felly does dim prinder uchelgais yno. Hefyd, mae gan y datblygiadau yn Harbwr y Foryd y potensial i greu cyrchfan o safon i ymwelwyr. Bydd yr Aelodau hynny sy'n gwybod am y Rhyl ac sydd wedi llunio barn arni dros gyfnod o amser, rwy'n sicr, yn cytuno bod y camau ymlaen, mewn partneriaeth â'r gymuned leol, wedi bod yn rhyfeddol dros y ddwy flynedd ddiwethaf.

Mark Isherwood: Un o'r prosiectau adfywio

projects in the Vale of Clwyd was Rhyl Youth Action Group, providing vital services to young people, and its building providing a home to several other key organisations working in the locality. How do you respond to concern that the building that RYAG owned was purchased with funding of around £1.2 million or £1.3 million, which included funding from the Welsh Government and Wales European Funding Office, but was never finished? It has been valued at only £350,000 now and it has been alleged that money was diverted to internal works rather than sticking to grant specification. Therefore, should not a project receiving so much Government money have had proper project management, proper checks and inspections and effective financial controls?

Huw Lewis: Shortly after my appointment, I was made aware of the somewhat troubled history of the Rhyl Youth Action Group, alongside the fantastic work that has been done through the organisation—let us not forget that. RYAG has now applied to go into administration. My officials, alongside the Wales Council for Voluntary Action, are working to try to find a solution that ensures that the physical asset, in which we have invested—and you are right to draw attention to that—is safeguarded, so that we have a built asset for Rhyl, and for Rhyl’s young people, and that we continue to offer the young people of Rhyl the excellent services that were delivered from that building. I am convinced that we can find a way through this. I am not tempted, at this point, to withdraw from this kind of work in Rhyl. There have been problems, but they have been overcome substantially, and there is a future to look forward to.

Llyr Huws Gruffydd: Rwy’n siŵr y byddwch yn ymwybodol, fel y mae pob un ohonom, fod sawl tafarn wedi cau yn nhrefi a phentrefi Dyffryn Clwyd yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf, fel sydd wedi digwydd ar draws Cymru. Mae enghreifftiau hefyd yng Nghymru o gymunedau yn cymryd cyfrifoldeb am eu tafarn leol eu hunain ar sail menter gymdeithasol. Fodd bynnag, y realiti yw bod angen amser ar gymunedau sy’n

yn Nyffryn Clwyd oedd Grŵp Gweithredu Ieuenctid y Rhyl, sy’n darparu gwasanaethau hanfodol i bobl ifanc, ac mae ei adeilad yn gartref i nifer o sefydliadau allweddol eraill sy’n gweithio yn yr ardal. Sut ydych chi’n ymateb i’r pryder bod yr adeilad oedd yn eiddo i RYAG wedi cael ei brynu gyda thua £1.2 miliwn neu £1.3 miliwn, a oedd yn cynnwys cyllid gan Lywodraeth Cymru a Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru, ond na chafodd ei orffen? Mae wedi ei brisio yn £350,000 yn unig yn awr a honnwyd i arian gael ei ddargyfeirio i waith mewmol yn hytrach na glynu wrth fanyleb y grant. Felly, oni ddylai prosiect sy’n derbyn cymaint o arian y Llywodraeth fod wedi cael trefniadau rheoli prosiect priodol, archwiliadau ac arolygiadau priodol a rheolaethau ariannol effeithiol ar waith?

Huw Lewis: Yn fuan ar ôl fy mhenodi, cefais wybod am hanes cythryblus braidd Grŵp Gweithredu Ieuenctid y Rhyl, ochr yn ochr â’r gwaith gwych sydd wedi’i wneud drwy’r sefydliad—gadewch inni beidio ag anghofio hynny. Mae RYAG bellach wedi gwneud cais i fynd i ddwylo’r gweinyddwyr. Mae fy swyddogion, ochr yn ochr â Chyngor Gweithredu Gwirfoddol Cymru, yn gweithio i geisio dod o hyd i ateb sy’n sicrhau bod yr ased ffisegol, yr ydym wedi buddsoddi ynddo—ac rydych yn llygad eich lle i dynnu sylw at hynny—yn cael ei ddiogelu, fel bod gennym ased adeiledig ar gyfer y Rhyl, ac ar gyfer pobl ifanc y Rhyl, a’n bod yn parhau i gynnig y gwasanaethau ardderchog a ddarparwyd gennym o’r adeilad hwnnw i bobl ifanc y Rhyl. Rwy’n argyhoeddedig y gallwn ddod o hyd i ffordd drwy hyn. Nid wyf yn cael fy nhemtio, ar y pwynt hwn, i dynnu’n ôl o’r math hwn o waith yn y Rhyl. Bu problemau, ond fe’u goresgynnwyd yn sylweddol, ac mae dyfodol i edrych ymlaen ato.

Llyr Huws Gruffydd: I am sure that you, like the rest of us, will be aware that many public houses have closed in the towns and villages of the Vale of Clwyd in recent years, as has happened across Wales. There are examples in Wales where communities have taken responsibility for the pubs themselves as social enterprises. However, the reality is that communities that do this need time to come together in order to co-ordinate and

gwneud hyn er mwyn iddynt ddod at ei gilydd i baratoi a threfnu eu menter, ac yna i fynd amdani i adfywio'r dafarn. A wnewch chi felly gynnal trafodaethau gyda chwmnïau tafarndai mawrion er mwyn gweld a oes modd iddynt ystyried, mewn sefyllfa lle mae tafarn yn cau, roi'r cynnig cyntaf i'r gymuned leol i berchenogi'r dafarn, gan fod yn barod i roi'r amser angenrheidiol er mwyn adeiladu'r drefniadaeth a'r capasiti angenrheidiol er mwyn manteisio ar y cyfle hwnnw?

Huw Lewis: The Member raises an interesting point. I do not believe that any community has been untouched by the problems that public houses are currently facing, with many of them going out of business. I would be happy to undertake some work in that direction.

Trigolion Caerdydd a'r Cymoedd

5. Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Andrew R.T. Davies): *Pa gamau y mae'r Gweinidog yn eu cymryd i wella bywydau trigolion Caerdydd a'r cymoedd. OAQ(4)0182(HRH)*

Huw Lewis: I am committed to fulfilling, across Wales, the commitments that are set out for my portfolio in the programme for government. This includes increasing the supply of affordable housing, creating better-quality sporting opportunities, and addressing the changing roles of our town centres across Wales.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Thank you for that answer, Minister. One key issue in your portfolio of responsibilities is social housing. Various opinions have been offered that suggest that, with the restrictions and the building regulations, and with the increasing costs that builders face in Wales, there may be a detrimental impact on builders starting new sites across Wales. Do you believe that that could impact on some of your social housing targets, because, if builders do not look to build here in Wales, then social housing targets will not be met?

Huw Lewis: I am confident that my target of 7,500 additional affordable homes being built by the end of this Assembly term will be met,

organise their enterprise before going for it and regenerating their pub. Will you enter into discussion with the large pub companies to see whether they can consider, in a situation where a pub closes, offering ownership in the first instance to the community, giving it the time needed to put all the necessary arrangements and capacity in place so that it can take advantage of the opportunity?

Huw Lewis: Mae'r Aelod yn codi pwynt diddorol. Nid wyf yn credu bod unrhyw gymuned heb gael ei chyffwrdd gan y problemau y mae tafarndai yn eu hwynebu ar hyn o bryd, gyda llawer ohonynt yn mynd allan o fusnes. Byddwn yn fwy na pharod i wneud rhywfaint o waith i'r perwyl hwnnw.

The Residents of Cardiff and the Valleys

5. The Leader of the Opposition (Andrew R.T. Davies): *What steps is the Minister taking to improve the lives of the residents of Cardiff and the valleys. OAQ(4)0182(HRH)*

Huw Lewis: Rwy'n ymrwymedig i gyflawni, ledled Cymru, yr ymrwymïadau sydd wedi eu nodi ar gyfer fy mhortffolio yn y rhaglen lywodraethu. Mae hyn yn cynnwys cynyddu'r cyflenwad o dai fforddiadwy, creu cyfleoedd chwaraeon o ansawdd gwell, a mynd i'r afael â rolau newidiol ein canol trefi ledled Cymru.

Andrew RT Davies: Diolch am yr ateb hwnnw, Weinidog. Un mater allweddol yn eich portffolio o gyfrifoldebau yw tai cymdeithasol. Cynigiwyd safbwyntiau amrywiol sy'n awgrymu, gyda'r cyfyngiadau a'r rheoliadau adeiladu, a chyda'r costau cynyddol y mae adeiladwyr yn eu hwynebu yng Nghymru, efallai y bydd effaith andwyol ar adeiladwyr sy'n dechrau ar safleoedd newydd ledled Cymru. A ydych yn credu y gallai hynny effeithio ar rai o'ch targedau tai cymdeithasol, oherwydd, os nad yw adeiladwyr yn edrych i adeiladu yma yng Nghymru, yna ni fydd targedau tai cymdeithasol yn cael eu cyflawni?

Huw Lewis: Rwy'n hyderus y bydd fy nharged o 7,500 o gartrefi fforddiadwy ychwanegol yn cael eu hadeiladu erbyn

while we also have the courage to stick to our quality standards when it comes to safety, through sprinkler installation, and through the environmental standards that we have committed to. Taking the environmental standards—or the energy standards—as an example, I take on board the worries of the housebuilders, and I look forward to dialogue with them about these issues. It is right that we have a conversation that is not necessarily conducted through the media, in terms of how we overcome these issues, and assist the sector to do well through the coming period. However, if you take a look at those energy standards you will see that these are European requirements, and if, across the border in England they are not working towards those European requirements, they will find, come 2021, I believe, that they will be breaching European law. We will not do that in Wales. We will provide the people of Wales with good-quality, warm homes, even though times are difficult.

Julie Morgan: One important aspect of people's lives is to have access to arts and culture. Does the Minister agree that the Artes Mundi prize, which is based in Cardiff, and is supported by the Welsh Government, gives people in Cardiff and from further afield, a unique opportunity to see innovative art and artists?

Huw Lewis: I do indeed I was privileged to be at the opening of Artes Mundi this year, which has become one of the most important dates in the contemporary arts calendar anywhere in the UK. It is a genuinely international competition that gives people—and not just in Wales—the opportunity to experience high-quality, contemporary visual art, and attracts huge numbers of visitors from other countries. I am looking forward to attending the announcement of the prize winner next week.

2.45 p.m.

The Leader of Plaid Cymru (Leanne Wood): In this document, 'A Greenprint for the Valleys', my party, the Party of Wales, has argued for the setting up of a community buildings programme to transform heritage

diwedd tymor y Cynulliad hwn yn cael ei gyflawni, tra byddwn hefyd yn ddigon dewr i gadw at ein safonau ansawdd o ran diogelwch, drwy osod taenellwyr, a thrwy'r safonau amgylcheddol yr ydym wedi ymrwymo iddynt. Gan ystyried y safonau amgylcheddol—neu'r safonau ynni—fel enghraifft, rwy'n derbyn pryderon yr adeiladwyr tai, ac edrychaf ymlaen at drafod y materion hyn â hwy. Mae'n iawn ein bod yn cael trafodaeth na chaiff ei chynnal o reidrwydd yn y cyfryngau, o ran sut y byddwn yn goresgyn y materion hyn, a chynorthwyo'r sector i wneud yn dda drwy'r cyfnod sydd i ddod. Fodd bynnag, os edrychwch ar y safonau ynni hynny fe welwch fod y rhain yn ofynion Ewropeaidd, ac os nad ydynt yn gweithio tuag at y gofynion Ewropeaidd hynny ar draws y ffin yn Lloegr, credaf y byddant yn sylweddoli, yn 2021, y byddant yn torri cyfraith Ewropeaidd. Ni fyddwn yn gwneud hynny yng Nghymru. Byddwn yn darparu cartrefi cynnes o safon i bobl Cymru, er bod hwn yn gyfnod anodd.

Julie Morgan: Un agwedd bwysig ar fywydau pobl yw cael mynediad i'r celfyddydau a diwylliant. A yw'r Gweinidog yn cytuno bod gwobr Artes Mundi, sydd wedi'i lleoli yng Nghaerdydd, a'i chefnogi gan Lywodraeth Cymru, yn rhoi cyfle unigryw i bobl yng Nghaerdydd a thu hwnt weld celf ac artistiaid arloesol?

Huw Lewis: Cytunaf yn wir. Cefais y fraind o fod yn agoriad Artes Mundi eleni, sydd wedi dod yn un o'r dyddiadau pwysicaf yng nghalendr y celfyddydau cyfoes unrhyw le yn y DU. Mae'n gystadleuaeth wirioneddol ryngwladol sy'n rhoi'r cyfle i bobl—ac nid dim ond yng Nghymru—brofi celf weledol gyfoes o safon, ac mae'n denu nifer fawr o ymwelwyr o wledydd eraill. Rwy'n edrych ymlaen at fynd i achlysur cyhoeddi enillydd y wobwr yr wythnos nesaf.

Arweinydd Plaid Cymru (Leanne Wood): Yn y ddogfen hon, 'Cynllun Gwyrddio'r Cymoedd', mae fy mhlaid, Plaid Cymru, wedi dadlau dros sefydlu rhaglen adeiladau cymunedol i drawsnewid adeiladau

buildings like disused pubs, schools and chapels into fully sustainable, modern, community facilities that could provide services such as childcare, money advice or information on green technology, for example. What are your views on the use of derelict buildings for regeneration purposes? Do you believe that there is scope to channel funding from streams like the Big Lottery Fund or EU funding into a community buildings programme of this type?

Huw Lewis: My view is that, in almost all circumstances, we should cease to view derelict or unused buildings—which are sometimes of some architectural importance or value—as liabilities, and begin to see them as assets in our communities. There are many ways in which we can approach this. I am committed to this and have asked my officials to keep it at the forefront of their minds as we construct our new regeneration strategy as it affects town centres. You are quite right to mention the importance of the lottery and of European funding, and what we need are bespoke packages for each particular building embedded within each town-centre landscape to make sure that end uses are secured and, of course, that the investment to make those end uses possible is attained. None of this is easy—it will take a great deal of work—but I think that the end result is far better than allowing derelict buildings simply to be seen as a problem and to continue to cause visual and economic problems within our high streets.

Eluned Parrott: A few weeks ago I raised the issue of the availability of suitable social housing for larger families, with specific reference to the Somali community in Cardiff, which has raised the issue in case work with me. Back in 2002, the Welsh Government published the black and minority ethnic housing action plan for Wales. What progress has the Minister made in implementing the aims set out in that, and how many larger social houses have been created since 2002?

Huw Lewis: I will have to write to the Member on the specifics of progress in

treftadaeth fel tafarndai, ysgolion a chapeli segur yn gyfleusterau cymunedol modern, cwbl gynaliadwy a allai ddarparu gwasanaethau fel gofal plant, cyngor ariannol neu wybodaeth am dechnoleg werdd, er enghraifft. Beth yw eich barn ar y defnydd o adeiladau adfeiledig at ddibenion adfywio? A ydych yn credu bod lle i sianelu cyllid o ffrydiau fel y Gronfa Loteri Fawr neu arian yr UE i mewn i raglen adeiladau cymunedol o'r fath?

Huw Lewis: Yn fy marn i, ym mron pob amgylchiad, dylem roi'r gorau i ystyried adeiladau adfeiledig neu segur—sydd weithiau o gryn bwysigrwydd neu werth pensaernïol—fel rhwymedigaethau, a dechrau eu hystyried yn asedau yn ein cymunedau. Mae sawl ffordd y gallwn ymdrin â hyn. Rwy'n ymrwymedig i hyn ac rwyf wedi gofyn i'm swyddogion gadw hyn mewn cof wrth inni lunio ein strategaeth adfywio newydd gan ei bod yn effeithio ar ganol trefi. Rydych yn hollol iawn i sôn am bwysigrwydd y loteri ac arian Ewropeaidd, a'r hyn sydd ei angen arnom yw ymgorffori pecynnau pwrpasol ar gyfer pob adeilad penodol o fewn pob tirlun canol tref i wneud yn siŵr y cânt eu defnyddio yn y pen draw yn sicr ac, wrth gwrs, bod y buddsoddiad i sicrhau bod hyn yn bosibl yn cael ei gyflawni. Nid yw hyn yn hawdd—bydd yn cymryd cryn dipyn o waith—ond credaf fod y canlyniad terfynol yn llawer gwell na chaniatáu i adeiladau adfeiledig gael eu hystyried yn broblem a pharhau i achosi problemau gweledol ac economaidd ar ein strydoedd mawr.

Eluned Parrott: Ychydig wythnosau yn ôl codais y mater o argaeledd tai cymdeithasol addas ar gyfer teuluoedd mwy, gan gyfeirio'n benodol at y gymuned Somali yng Nghaerdydd, sydd wedi codi'r mater mewn gwaith achos gyda mi. Yn ôl yn 2002, cyhoeddodd Llywodraeth Cymru y cynllun gweithredu ar dai i bobl dduon a lleiafrifoedd ethnig ar gyfer Cymru. Pa gynnydd y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'i wneud wrth weithredu'r amcanion a nodwyd yn hwnnw, a sawl tŷ cymdeithasol mwy o faint sydd wedi'i greu ers 2002?

Huw Lewis: Bydd yn rhaid imi ysgrifennu at yr Aelod ar fanylion y cynnydd mewn

relation to the plan. I am aware that most of our registered social landlords, for instance, have an eye to the needs of larger families, particularly in our inner city areas. I would also ask Eluned Parrott to be maybe a little more proactive when it comes to talking to her colleagues at Westminster as regards issues like the benefit cap, which will affect almost exclusively those larger families and cause a great deal of economic trouble in Wales and across the United Kingdom.

Vaughan Gething: I welcome your restatement of commitment to housing quality in one of your earlier responses. You will be aware that Community Housing Cymru has today launched a campaign on the impact of welfare reform, in particular on housing. It estimates that 40,000 people in Wales will be affected—that follows on from Lynne Neagle's excellent short debate yesterday. Has the Government undertaken any independent assessment of the number of families in Wales that it expects to be adversely affected by the pending welfare reform changes in housing?

Huw Lewis: I thank Vaughan Gething for that. I was at the CHC launch, and he is quite right to point to the importance of this work. The picture at the moment remains partial. We know, for instance, that the Department for Work and Pensions indicates that 40,000 people would be affected by the bedroom tax issue, with an average loss of income of £11 a week. It is difficult to get to grips with the exact picture of how every family in receipt of benefit would be affected across Wales as a whole. We are working towards that. It might take some time to get a complete and comprehensive picture of the whole thing. A number of local authorities are undertaking work in advance of that Welsh Government work, one of which is Cardiff. We have a much better picture of what might be happening in Cardiff and Flintshire than in some other parts of Wales. However, this picture is beginning to form and it is not pretty.

Darparu Tai

perthynas â'r cynllun. Rwy'n ymwybodol bod y rhan fwyaf o'n landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig, er enghraifft, yn cadw golwg ar anghenion teuluoedd mwy o faint, yn enwedig yn ein hardaloedd canol dinas. Byddwn hefyd yn gofyn i Eluned Parrott fod ychydig yn fwy rhagweithiol efallai o ran trafod â'i chyd-aelodau yn San Steffan mewn perthynas â materion fel y cap budd-daliadau, a fydd yn effeithio ar bron bob teulu mwy o faint ac yn achosi cryn dipyn o drafferth economaidd yng Nghymru a ledled y Deyrnas Unedig.

Vaughan Gething: Croesawaf eich ailddatganiad o ymrwymiad i ansawdd tai yn un o'ch atebion cynharach. Byddwch yn ymwybodol bod Tai Cymunedol Cymru wedi lansio ymgyrch heddiw ar effaith diwygio lles, yn enwedig ar dai. Mae'n amcangyfrif y bydd yn effeithio ar 40,000 o bobl yng Nghymru—sy'n dilyn ymlaen o ddadl fer ragorol Lynne Neagle ddoe. A yw'r Llywodraeth wedi gwneud unrhyw asesiad annibynnol o nifer y teuluoedd yng Nghymru y mae'n disgwyl i'r newidiadau diwygio lles sydd yn yr arfaeth ym maes tai effeithio'n andwyol arnynt?

Huw Lewis: Diolch i Vaughan Gething am hynny. Yr oeddwn yn lansiad y Cyngor Iechyd Cymuned, ac mae'n hollol iawn i dynnu sylw at bwysigrwydd y gwaith hwn. Mae'r darlun ar hyn o bryd yn parhau i fod yn anghyflawn. Gwyddom, er enghraifft, fod yr Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau yn nodi y byddai mater treth ystafell wely yn effeithio ar 40,000 o bobl, gyda cholled incwm o £11 yr wythnos, ar gyfartaledd. Mae'n anodd mynd i'r afael â'r union ddarlun o sut yr effeithid ar bob teulu sy'n derbyn budd-dal ledled Cymru gyfan. Rydym yn gweithio tuag at hynny. Efallai y bydd yn cymryd peth amser i gael darlun cyflawn a chynhwysfawr o'r holl beth. Mae nifer o awdurdodau lleol yn ymgymryd â gwaith cyn y gwaith hwnnw sydd i'w gyflawni gan Lywodraeth Cymru, ac un o'r rhain yw Caerdydd. Mae gennym ddarlun llawer gwell o'r hyn a allai fod yn digwydd yng Nghaerdydd a Sir y Fflint nag mewn rhai rhannau eraill o Gymru. Fodd bynnag, mae'r darlun hwn yn dechrau dod yn glir ac nid yw'n ddeniadol.

Provision of Housing

6. Angela Burns: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf ynghylch darparu tai yng ngorllewin Cymru. OAQ(4)0188(HRH)*

Huw Lewis: My priorities for the provision of housing across Wales are set out in my housing White Paper. To directly support affordable housing in west Wales in 2012-13, we have made available funding of £1.7 million in Pembrokeshire and £2.2 million in Carmarthenshire for affordable housing through the social housing grant.

Angela Burns: Thank you for that answer. Are you able to tell us what percentage of the money that you have given to Pembrokeshire will be able to be deployed within the national park? You will be aware that previous Ministers for housing have had some degree of issue with national parks throughout Wales and the inability to put low-cost housing, social housing and community housing projects into national parks. In fact, a few years ago, I think that only five new low-cost houses were built in Pembrokeshire Coast National Park. Could you update us on what steps you are able to take to ensure that national parks have a rich diversity of people living within them?

Huw Lewis: You said, 'a rich diversity of people living within them'—I could not have put that better myself. I will have to write you with the specifics on Pembrokeshire Coast National Park and the current picture in terms of affordable housing. National parks should not be under any misapprehension about the need for affordable housing within their boundaries, like very other part of Wales. The avoidance of affordable housing within national park areas, particularly for young families, essentially ossifies communities and condemns them over time to death. The national parks must be a proactive partner in making sure that that sort of thing does not happen and that young families can afford to live in the areas where, quite often, they were born and brought up.

Elin Jones: Mae cynllun Cylch Caron yn un o'r cynlluniau mwyaf cyffrous yn fy

6. Angela Burns: *Will the Minister provide an update on the provision of housing in west Wales. OAQ(4)0188(HRH)*

Huw Lewis: Mae fy mlaenoriaethau ar gyfer y ddarpariaeth o dai ledled Cymru wedi eu nodi yn fy Mhapur Gwyn ar dai. I gefnogi tai fforddiadwy yn uniongyrchol yn y gorllewin yn 2012-13, rydym wedi sicrhau bod £1.7 miliwn ar gael yn Sir Benfro a £2.2 miliwn yn Sir Gaerfyrddin ar gyfer tai fforddiadwy drwy'r grant tai cymdeithasol.

Angela Burns: Diolch am yr ateb hwnnw. A allwch ddweud wrthym beth fydd canran yr arian yr ydych wedi ei roi i Sir Benfro y gellir ei defnyddio o fewn y parc cenedlaethol? Byddwch yn ymwybodol bod Gweinidogion Tai blaenorol wedi cael rhywfaint o broblem gyda pharciau cenedlaethol ledled Cymru a'r anallu i ddarparu tai cost isel, tai cymdeithasol a phrosiectau tai cymunedol o fewn parciau cenedlaethol. Yn wir, ychydig flynyddoedd yn ôl, rwy'n meddwl mai dim ond pum tŷ cost isel newydd a adeiladwyd ym Mharc Cenedlaethol Arfordir Penfro. A allech roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf inni ynghylch pa gamau rydych yn gallu eu cymryd i sicrhau bod gan barciau cenedlaethol amrywiaeth cyfoethog o bobl yn byw ynddynt?

Huw Lewis: Dywedasoeh, 'amrywiaeth cyfoethog o bobl yn byw ynddynt'—ni allwn fod wedi dweud hynny'n well fy hun. Bydd yn rhaid imi ysgrifennu atoch gyda manylion Parc Cenedlaethol Arfordir Penfro a'r darlun presennol o ran tai fforddiadwy. Ni ddylai parciau cenedlaethol fod o dan unrhyw gamargraff ynglŷn â'r angen am dai fforddiadwy o fewn eu ffiniau, fel pob rhan arall o Gymru. Mae'r ffaith bod ardaloedd parciau cenedlaethol yn osgoi tai fforddiadwy, yn enwedig ar gyfer teuluoedd ifanc, yn y bôn yn cyfyngu cymunedau ac yn eu condemnio dros amser i farwolaeth. Mae'n rhaid i'r parciau cenedlaethol fod yn bartner rhagweithiol wrth wneud yn siŵr nad yw hynny'n digwydd, a bod teuluoedd ifanc yn gallu fforddio byw yn yr ardaloedd lle, yn aml iawn, y cawsant eu geni a'u magu.

Elin Jones: The Cylch Caron initiative is one of the most exciting initiatives in my

etholaeth. Mae'n gynllun ar y cyd sy'n ymwneud ag iechyd, gwasanaethau cymdeithasol a darpariaeth tai, ac mae'r cyngor sir a'r bwrdd iechyd yn frwd iawn drosto. Yn ogystal, mae'r Gweinidog Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, sy'n eistedd nesaf atoch, wedi dweud bod y cynllun yn flaenoriaeth iddi. A yw'r cynllun hefyd yn flaenoriaeth i chi, fel Gweinidog tai, ac a wnewch chi gydweithio â'r Gweinidog Iechyd ar fyrder i gymeradwyo'r cais, fel y gall symud yn nes at gael ei wireddu?

Huw Lewis: There is co-working between the Minister for health and me in relation to mutual benefit. We are all well aware of the intimate connection between good housing and good health, and closer co-working is part of my agenda and that of the Minister for health going forward. I will write to the Member concerning the specific project that she mentioned.

Y Cyflenwad Tai

7. Mark Isherwood: *Pa gynigion sydd gan y Gweinidog i gynyddu'r cyflenwad o dai yn y farchnad dai gyfan. OAQ(4)0194(HRH)*

Huw Lewis: My proposals for a whole-system approach to housing via our role as system steward are set out in my housing White Paper. This will rely on the contribution of both the public and private sectors and will require greater collaboration and strategic direction from local authorities.

Mark Isherwood: The key reason for affordability or the lack of it is supply and demand. The European Commission has said that we should address the destabilising impact of high and volatile house prices and high household debt by implementing a comprehensive housing reform programme to increase supply and alleviate affordability. The group chair of a north Wales-based construction company told me that building homes in Wales is no longer profitable and that, unlike the Welsh Government, they cannot continue to spend money unless the end product at least covers the cost. Only yesterday, the chief executive of Redrow, Wales's biggest housebuilder, said that parts of Wales will become no-go

constituency. It is a joint health, social services and housing initiative, and the county council and the health board are very keen on it. In addition, the Minister for Health and Social Services, who is sitting next to you, has said that the initiative is a priority for her. Is the initiative also a priority for you, as Minister for housing, and will you work with the Minister for health as a matter of urgency to approve the bid, so that it can move closer to becoming a reality?

Huw Lewis: Mae cydweithio rhwng y Gweinidog Iechyd a minnau mewn perthynas â chyd-fudd. Rydym i gyd yn ymwybodol o'r cysylltiad agos rhwng tai da ac iechyd da, ac mae cydweithio agosach yn rhan o'm hagenda ac agenda'r Gweinidog Iechyd yn y dyfodol. Byddaf yn ysgrifennu at yr Aelod ynghylch y prosiect penodol y soniodd amdano.

Housing Supply

7. Mark Isherwood: *What proposals does the Minister have to increase whole market housing supply. OAQ(4)0194(HRH)*

Huw Lewis: Mae fy nghynigion ar gyfer ymagwedd system gyfan at dai drwy gyfrwng ein rôl fel stiward y system wedi eu nodi yn fy Mhapur Gwyn ar dai. Bydd hyn yn dibynnu ar gyfraniad y sector cyhoeddus a'r sector preifat a bydd angen mwy o gydweithredu a chyfeiriad strategol gan awdurdodau lleol.

Mark Isherwood: Y rheswm allweddol dros fforddiadwyedd neu ddiffyg fforddiadwyedd yw cyflenwad a galw. Mae'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd wedi dweud y dylem fynd i'r afael ag effaith ansefydlogi prisiau tai uchel a chyfnewidiol a dyledion uchel cartrefi drwy roi rhaglen diwygio tai gynhwysfawr ar waith i gynyddu'r cyflenwad a lleddfu fforddiadwyedd. Dywedodd cadeirydd grŵp o gwmni adeiladu yn y gogledd wrthyf nad yw adeiladu cartrefi yng Nghymru yn broffidiol mwyach ac, yn wahanol i Lywodraeth Cymru, ni allant barhau i wario arian oni bai bod y cynnyrch terfynol o leiaf yn cwmpasu'r gost. Dim ond ddoe, dywedodd prif weithredwr Redrow, adeiladwr tai mwyaf Cymru, y bydd rhannau

areas, and cited Wrexham and the south Wales Valleys, if tougher building regulations are introduced at the current time. How do you respond to ongoing concerns expressed by, among others, the Home Builders Federation and Community Housing Cymru that the cumulative impact, regardless of their good intention, of added regulations at a time when the sector is struggling will have the opposite effect to a whole-market solution? They need to sit down and agree with the Welsh Government how they can deliver that enhanced supply.

Huw Lewis: The answer to the Member's question is in his own comments: sit down and talk this through. I am very sensitive to the pressures on the housebuilding community at the moment. As part of that, just last week, I announced the NewBuy Cymru scheme—a mortgage guarantee scheme that will guarantee 3,000 mortgages for new-build properties up and down the country. It would be nice if, alongside some of the negative commentary that we have heard over the last few days, we could also have a conversation about the positives that have been accomplished and the positives that might be available to us in the near future. There is a conversation to be had. We are determined, as a Government, to make sure that we do not leave behind a legacy of poor quality housebuilding.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Weinidog, cyfeiriwyd at y math o ddatganiadau sydd wedi'u gwneud am gost adeiladu yng Nghymru o'i gymharu â'r gost yn Lloegr. A oes gennych ddadansoddiad o'r gost honno, sy'n dangos y gwahaniaeth rhwng cost adeiladu yng Nghymru a'r gost yn Lloegr, er mwyn inni allu gweld a oes sylwedd i'r math o ddatganiadau sydd wedi'u gwneud yn ddiweddar?

Huw Lewis: The short answer is 'no', and I do not know how much that would teach us. Every part of Wales would be different—we would have to prepare a different analysis for almost every district of Wales, taking into account issues like land value, whether the land needs remediating, whether there is public subsidy and so on. A very complicated picture would emerge. I do not know whether

o Gymru yn dod yn ardaloedd dim mynediad, a nododd Wrecsam a Chymoedd y de fel enghreifftiau, pe cyflwynid rheoliadau adeiladu llymach ar hyn o bryd. Sut ydych chi'n ymateb i bryderon parhaus a fynegir gan, ymhlith eraill, y Ffederasiwn Adeiladwyr Cartrefi a Chartrefi Cymunedol Cymru bod effaith gronnu rheoliadau ychwanegol, ar adeg pan mae'r sector yn ei chael hi'n anodd, er gwaethaf eu bwriad da, yn cael yr effaith groes i ateb marchnad gyfan? Mae angen iddynt eistedd i lawr a chytuno gyda Llywodraeth Cymru sut y gallant ddarparu'r cyflenwad gwell hwnnw.

Huw Lewis: Mae ateb i gwestiwn yr Aelod yn ei sylwadau ei hun: eistedd i lawr a thrafod hyn. Rwy'n ystyriol iawn o'r pwysau ar y gymuned adeiladu tai ar hyn o bryd. Fel rhan o hynny, dim ond yr wythnos ddiwethaf, cyhoeddais gynllun newydd NewBuy Cymru—cynllun gwarantu morgais a fydd yn gwarantu 3,000 o forgeisi ar gyfer eiddo adeiladu newydd ledled y wlad. Byddai'n braf pe gallem, ochr yn ochr â rhai o'r sylwadau negyddol yr ydym wedi eu clywed dros yr ychydig ddyddiau diwethaf, hefyd gael trafodaeth am y pethau cadarnhaol sydd wedi cael eu cyflawni a'r pethau cadarnhaol a allai fod ar gael inni yn y dyfodol agos. Mae trafodaeth i'w chael. Rydym yn benderfynol, fel Llywodraeth, i wneud yn siŵr nad ydym yn gadael etifeddiaeth o adeiladu tai o ansawdd gwael.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Minister, reference has been made to the kind of comments made about the cost of building in Wales as compared with the cost in England. Do you have an analysis of that cost, showing the differences between the cost of building in Wales and the cost in England, so that we can judge whether there is a basis for the kind of comments made recently?

Huw Lewis: Yr ateb byr yw 'nac oes', ac nid wyf yn gwybod faint y byddem yn ei ddysgu o hynny. Byddai pob rhan o Gymru yn wahanol—byddai'n rhaid inni baratoi dadansoddiad gwahanol ar gyfer bron pob ardal o Gymru, gan ystyried materion fel gwerth y tir, p'un a oes angen adfer y tir, a oes cymhorthdal cyhoeddus ac ati. Byddai darlun cymhleth iawn yn dod i'r amlwg. Ni

we would learn much from comparing the apples of Wales with the pears of England. We need to make sure that housebuilding continues to be attractive for the private sector, that affordable housing continues to be constructed by whichever means possible within the constraints of the public purse, and that we work ever more closely with the private rented sector. That sector is set to grow and I am determined that it should grow with quality as its primary emphasis.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Weinidog, nid yw'r datganiadau a wnaed gan Steve Morgan yn ymwneud â chost tir; maent yn ymwneud â chost adeiladu ar ôl prynu tir. Ni allaf ddeall pam rydych yn dweud ei bod yn amhosibl cael dadansoddiad o gost adeiladu yng Nghymru o'i gymharu â Lloegr, gan anwybyddu cost y tir yn y lle cyntaf. Ond, rwy'n cytuno mai ansawdd sy'n bwysig. Ni fyddai o unrhyw werth cael nifer fawr o dai o ansawdd isel; ni fyddai hynny o gymorth i neb. Rwy'n pwysu arnoch i edrych am y dadansoddiad hwnnw. Heb ddadansoddiad o'r fath, ni fyddwn yn gwybod pa sylwedd sydd i'r datganiadau hyn. O ran Steve Morgan, byddech yn dweud, 'Wel, fe fyddai'n dweud hynny, yn byddai', ond mae angen inni fod yn glir ynghylch union gost adeiladu yng Nghymru.

Huw Lewis: I accept much of what the Member says. We need that conversation. We have that detailed conversation on a site-by-site basis when it comes to the development of new housing, whether for social rent or private purchase. I cannot accept the completely bleak picture painted by Steve Morgan in his comments. I know that there is a constructive conversation to be had with Redrow and other housebuilding partners. I am convinced and confident that housebuilding in Wales will continue and that we will hit our targets as a Government.

Peter Black: Minister, I welcome the announcement last week of the mortgage guarantee scheme, which was suggested by the Welsh Liberal Democrats. However, I note that the commencement date in your press release is spring 2013. Can you give us a firmer indication as to when exactly the scheme will be up and running and when details will be available to builders and

wn a fyddem yn dysgu llawer o gymharu afalau Cymru â gellyg Lloegr. Mae angen inni wneud yn siŵr bod adeiladu tai yn parhau i fod yn ddeniadol ar gyfer y sector preifat, bod tai fforddiadwy yn parhau i gael eu hadeiladu drwy ba fodd bynnag sy'n bosibl o fewn cyfyngiadau'r pwrs cyhoeddus, a'n bod yn gweithio yn agosach byth gyda'r sector rhentu preifat. Mae'r sector hwnnw yn mynd i dyfu ac rwy'n benderfynol y dylai dyfu gydag ansawdd fel ei brif bwyslais.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Minister, the comments made by Steve Morgan were not about the cost of land; they were about the cost of building when the land had been bought. I cannot understand why you say that it is impossible to get an analysis of the cost of building in Wales as compared with England, ignoring the cost of the land in the first place. However, I do agree that the important thing is quality. There is no value in having lots of poor-quality housing; that would not help anyone. I urge you to look for such an analysis—without it, we will not know whether or not these comments are based on fact. As far as Steve Morgan is concerned, it is a case of 'Well, he would say that, wouldn't he?', but we need to be clear about the exact cost of building in Wales.

Huw Lewis: Rwy'n derbyn llawer o'r hyn y mae'r Aelod yn ei ddweud. Mae angen y drafodaeth honno arnom. Cawn y drafodaeth fanwl honno fesul safle mewn perthynas â datblygu tai newydd, boed ar gyfer rhent cymdeithasol neu bryniant preifat. Ni allaf dderbyn y darlun cwbl lwm a grëwyd gan Steve Morgan yn ei sylwadau. Gwn fod trafodaeth adeiladol i'w chael gyda Redrow a phartneriaid adeiladu tai eraill. Rwy'n argyhoeddedig ac yn hyderus y bydd adeiladu tai yng Nghymru yn parhau ac y byddwn yn cyflawni ein targedau fel Llywodraeth.

Peter Black: Weinidog, croesawaf y cyhoeddiad a wnaed yr wythnos ddiwethaf ar y cynllun gwarantu morgais, a awgrymwyd gan Ddemocratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru. Fodd bynnag, nodaf fod y dyddiad cychwyn yn eich datganiad i'r wasg yn ystod gwanwyn 2013. A allwch chi roi syniad gwell inni o ran pryd yn union y bydd y cynllun yn weithredol a phryd y bydd manylion ar gael i

individuals around Wales who want to take advantage of it?

3.00 p.m.

Huw Lewis: Well, in spring 2013. Conversations need to be had, particularly in terms of growing the group of potential lenders around that partnership. I am confident that, within Wales, we will have a larger number of lenders interested in our scheme than was the case across the border for the English equivalent scheme. There are technical nuts and bolts that need to be put in place over the next couple of months. When we have an exact start date, I will announce it to this Chamber.

Peter Black: Thank you for that answer, Minister. I am disappointed that, five or six months after the scheme was first announced, you are still trying to iron out those sorts of details. Builders are now currently planning for spring and the sales in spring, and reservations and exchanges of contract are being put in place for that. They would benefit tremendously from having the scheme up and running sooner rather than later, particularly in terms of jobs and investment in Wales. Can I ask you to reconsider the timetable and look at whether they can be brought in much quicker, given the long lead-in time to the announcement last week?

Huw Lewis: You can ask me, but I will not. We will not have a half-baked scheme; we will do this properly. We will make sure that it fits our needs in Wales. I have said in the Chamber and elsewhere at the beginning of the conversation around mortgage guarantees that we need a scheme in Wales that also suits the needs of smaller housebuilders and smaller lenders. Our home-grown housebuilders and lenders tend to be smaller in scale. We want something that does not exclude the big players, but that also fits the needs of the smaller housebuilder and lender and that, therefore, fits with the needs of parts of rural Wales, particularly, where large-scale schemes are not necessarily part of the conversation.

adeiladwyr ac unigolion ledled Cymru sydd am fanteisio arno?

Huw Lewis: Wel, yn ystod gwanwyn 2013. Mae angen cael trafodaethau, yn enwedig o ran tyfu'r grŵp o fenthycwyr posibl mewn perthynas â'r bartneriaeth honno. Rwy'n hyderus y bydd gennym, yng Nghymru, nifer fwy o fenthycwyr sydd â diddordeb yn ein cynllun nag oedd yr achos ar draws y ffin ar gyfer y cynllun cyfatebol yn Lloegr. Mae angen rhoi elfennau technegol ar waith dros yr ychydig fisoedd nesaf. Pan fyddwn yn cael union ddyddiad dechrau, byddaf yn ei gyhoeddi i'r Siambr hon.

Peter Black: Diolch ichi am yr ateb hwnnw, Weinidog. Rwy'n siomedig eich bod, bum neu chwe mis ar ôl cyhoeddi'r cynllun gyntaf, yn dal i geisio cytuno ar y mathau hynny o fanylion. Mae adeiladwyr bellach yn cynllunio ar gyfer y gwanwyn a'r gwerthiannau yn y gwanwyn, ac mae cymalau cadw a chyfnewid contract yn cael eu rhoi ar waith ar gyfer hynny. Byddent yn cael budd aruthrol o gael y cynllun ar waith yn gynt yn hytrach nag yn hwyrach, yn enwedig o ran swyddi a buddsoddiad yng Nghymru. A allaf ofyn ichi ailystyried yr amserlen ac edrych ar b'un a ellir eu cyflwyno yn gynt o lawer, o ystyried y cyfnod hir yn arwain at y cyhoeddiad yr wythnos ddiwethaf?

Huw Lewis: Gallwch ofyn imi, ond ni wnaf hynny. Ni fydd gennym gynllun annigonol; byddwn yn gwneud hyn yn iawn. Byddwn yn gwneud yn siŵr ei fod yn cyd-fynd â'n hanghenion yng Nghymru. Rwyf wedi dweud yn y Siambr ac mewn manau eraill ar ddechrau'r drafodaeth ar warantau morgais bod angen cynllun arnom yng Nghymru sydd hefyd yn addas i anghenion adeiladwyr tai llai o faint a benthycwyr llai o faint. Mae ein hadeiladwyr tai a'n benthycwyr brodorol yn tueddu i fod yn llai mewn maint. Rydym am gael rhywbeth nad yw'n eithrio'r cwmnïau mawr, ond sydd hefyd yn diwallu anghenion yr adeiladwr tai a'r benthyciwr llai o faint ac sydd, felly, yn diwallu anghenion rhannau o gefn gwlad Cymru, yn enwedig, lle nad yw cynlluniau ar raddfa fawr o reidrwydd yn rhan o'r drafodaeth.

Datganiad gan y Llywydd
Statement by the Presiding Officer

The Presiding Officer: Before we move to the next item, I wish to announce the results of the legislative ballot held today. I am pleased to announce that Mark Isherwood may seek the Assembly's agreement to introduce a Member-proposed community care direct payments (Wales) Bill. Congratulations.

Y Llywydd: Cyn inni symud at yr eitem nesaf, hoffwn gyhoeddi canlyniadau'r balot deddfwriaethol a gynhaliwyd heddiw. Rwy'n falch o gyhoeddi y caiff Mark Isherwood geisio cytundeb y Cynulliad i gyflwyno Bil taliadau uniongyrchol gofal yn y gymuned (Cymru) a gynigir gan Aelod. Llongyfarchiadau.

Cynnig i Atal Rheolau Sefydlog mewn perthynas â'r Dyddiad Cau ar gyfer
Cyflwyno Busnes ar 2 Ionawr 2013
Motion to Suspend Standing Orders in relation to Tabling Deadlines
on 2 January 2013

Cynnig NNDM5101 Rosemary Butler

Motion NNDM5101 Rosemary Butler

Cynnig bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales:

1. Yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 33.6 a 33.8, yn atal:

1. In accordance with Standing Orders 33.6 and 33.8, suspends:

a) Rheol Sefydlog 12.20(i) er mwyn caniatáu i gynigion ar gyfer dadleuon ddydd Mawrth 8 Ionawr 2013 gael eu cyflwyno ddydd Mercher 2 Ionawr; a

a) Standing Order 12.20(i) to allow motions for debate on Tuesday 8 January 2013 to be tabled on Wednesday 2 January 2013; and

b) y rhan honno o Reol Sefydlog 12.59 sy'n ei gwneud yn ofynnol bod cwestiynau llafar yn cael eu cyflwyno o leiaf 5 niwrnod gwaith cyn eu bod i gael eu hateb, er mwyn caniatáu i gwestiynau llafar i'w hateb ddydd Mawrth 8 Ionawr gael eu cyflwyno ddydd Mercher 2 Ionawr 2013.

b) that part of Standing Order 12.59 that requires oral questions to be tabled at least 5 working days before they are to be answered, to allow the oral questions for answer on Tuesday 8 January 2013 to be tabled on Wednesday 2 January 2013.

2. Yn cytuno y bydd y Rheolau Sefydlog hyn yn cael eu hatal ar ddydd Mercher 2 Ionawr yn unig.

2. Agrees that this suspension will apply on Wednesday 2 January only.

William Graham: I move the motion.

William Graham: Cynigiau y cynnig.

The Presiding Officer: The proposal is to suspend Standing Orders on 2 January 2013. Does any Member object? I see that there are no objections. The motion is, therefore, agreed in accordance with Standing Order No. 12.36.

Y Llywydd: Y cynnig yw atal Rheolau Sefydlog ar 2 Ionawr 2013. A oes unrhyw Aelod yn gwrthwynebu? Gwelaf nad oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad. Mae'r cynnig, felly, wedi'i dderbyn, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 12.36.

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion agreed.*

Cynnig Gweithdrefnol Procedural Motion

The Presiding Officer: We now have a procedural motion. I ask Andrew R.T. Davies to move that motion.

Y Llywydd: Yn awr mae gennym gynnig trefniadol. Gofynnaf i Andrew R.T. Davies gynnig y cynnig hwnnw.

Cynnig gweithdrefnol

Procedural motion

Mae Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 12.32, yn gohirio'r ddadl fer a gyflwynwyd yn enw Andrew R.T. Davies.

The National Assembly for Wales, under Standing Order No. 12.32, postpones the short debate tabled in the name of Andrew R.T. Davies.

Andrew R.T. Davies: I move the motion.

Andrew RT Davies: Cynigiau y cynnig.

The Presiding Officer: I think that you had better tell people what it is.

Y Llywydd: Rwy'n meddwl y byddai'n well ichi ddweud wrth bobl beth ydyw.

Andrew R.T. Davies: It is to delay the short debate.

Andrew RT Davies: Cynnig ydyw i ohirio'r ddadl fer.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you. I am sorry; I think that I should have done that myself. I beg your pardon. [*Laughter.*]

Y Llywydd: Diolch. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf; credaf y dylwn fod wedi gwneud hynny fy hun. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf. [*Chwerthin.*]

Andrew R.T. Davies: I do not mind taking over. [*Laughter.*]

Andrew R.T. Davies: Rwy'n fwy na pharod i gymryd drosodd. [*Chwerthin.*]

The Presiding Officer: I am very glad that you are here this afternoon.

Y Llywydd: Rwy'n falch iawn eich bod yma y prynhawn yma.

It has been moved that, under Standing Order No. 12.32, we postpone the short debate tabled in the name of Andrew R.T. Davies. The proposal is to agree the motion. Does any Member object? I see that there are no objections. The motion is, therefore, agreed in accordance with Standing Order No. 12.36.

Cynigiwyd, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 12.32, y dylem ohirio'r ddadl fer a gyflwynwyd yn enw Andrew R.T. Davies. Y cynnig yw derbyn y cynnig. A oes unrhyw Aelod yn gwrthwynebu? Gwelaf nad oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad. Mae'r cynnig, felly, wedi'i dderbyn, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 12.36.

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion agreed*

Dadl y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig Welsh Conservatives Debate

Pwysau'r Gaeaf Winter Pressures

The Presiding Officer: I have selected amendments 1 and 3 in the name of Aled Roberts, and amendment 2 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.

Y Llywydd: Rwyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1 a 3 yn enw Aled Roberts, a gwelliant 2 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.

Cynnig NDM5098 William Graham

Motion NDM5098 William Graham

Cynnig bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales:

1. Yn nodi'r effaith negyddol y gall pwysau'r gaeaf ei chael ar gyflenwi gwasanaethau cyhoeddus allweddol ac ar fywydau pobl mewn cymunedau ledled Cymru.

1. Notes the negative impact winter pressures can have on the delivery of key public services and on the lives of people in communities across Wales.

2. Yn credu bod gan Lywodraeth Cymru ran allweddol i'w chwarae wrth liniaru unrhyw faich a roddir ar bobl ledled Cymru oherwydd pwysau'r gaeaf.

2. Believes the Welsh Government has a key role to play in alleviating any burden placed on people across Wales by winter pressures.

3. Yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i weithredu Strategaeth Pwysau'r Gaeaf ar draws portffolios i sicrhau bod cynlluniau wrth gefn effeithiol ar waith i fynd i'r afael â'r effaith a gaiff pwysau'r gaeaf ar fywydau yng Nghymru.

3. Calls on the Welsh Government to implement a cross-portfolio Winter Pressures Strategy to ensure effective contingency plans are in place to tackle the impact that winter pressures place on Welsh life.

4. Yn credu y dylai fod gan un o Weinidogion Cymru gyfrifoldeb cyffredinol dros ymateb i ddigwyddiadau a allai godi oherwydd tywydd difrifol y gaeaf yng Nghymru.

4. Believes a designated Welsh Minister should have overarching responsibility for responding to events which could arise as a consequence of severe winter weather in Wales.

Byron Davies: I move the motion.

Byron Davies: Cynigiaf y cynnig.

This is a Welsh Conservatives motion for a debate on the impact of winter pressures on the delivery of public services, and I call on Labour Ministers to develop a cross-portfolio winter pressures strategy.

Mae hwn yn gynnig gan y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig am ddadl ar effaith pwysau'r gaeaf ar ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, a galwaf ar Weinidogion Llafur i ddatblygu strategaeth pwysau'r gaeaf ar draws portffolios.

This is a timely debate, following the Minister's statement yesterday that touched on the broad-brush preparations for inclement weather. Today, hopefully, we can tackle the detail of the preparations of the Government, local authorities and the trunk road agencies,

Mae hon yn ddadl amserol, yn dilyn datganiad y Gweinidog ddoe a gyfeiriodd at y paratodau bras ar gyfer tywydd garw. Heddiw, gobeithio, gallwn fynd i'r afael â manylion paratodau'r Llywodraeth, awdurdodau lleol a'r asiantaethau cefnffyrdd,

as well as the resilience of our key public services. The Welsh Conservatives are calling for a strategy that encompasses plans for road gritting, keeping schools open and supporting the smooth running of public transport. We have called for this year on year. Admittedly, the resilience forum goes some way towards tackling this, but, in our opinion, it does not go far enough. We must take urgent action on fuel poverty and support for farmers, and implement a series of measures to relieve winter pressure on the national health service. For example, earlier this week, the Welsh Conservatives released figures that show that Wales has the lowest uptake of flu vaccination of all the UK nations for every at-risk group. Ambulance response-time targets for category A calls were missed in September 2012 for the fourth consecutive month, despite the Welsh Government having the lowest target in Britain—65% compared to 75% in Scotland and England.

In recent years, this Labour Government has been caught on the hop by sudden inclement weather that has brought large parts of Wales to a standstill. Being ill-prepared for severe winter weather causes considerable inconvenience for commuters, shoppers and tourists, and has a significant cost to the Welsh economy. This year, we must ensure that we have a robust, cross-cutting strategy to deal effectively with winter pressures to ensure that public services, local councils and the Welsh Government are fully prepared.

Keeping our infrastructure networks running is critical in order to keep schools open, allow people to get to work, enable the emergency services to operate and prevent our entire economy from grinding to a halt. This may be an appropriate juncture to note that we will be accepting all the amendments. We must work in partnership to ensure that local authorities and other stakeholders are ready for the worst. It is also important for the Minister to be clear in his mind, if disaster does strike, at what point he will step

yn ogystal â chyfnerthedd ein gwasanaethau cyhoeddus allweddol. Mae'r Ceidwadwyr Cymreig yn galw am strategaeth sy'n cwmpasu cynlluniau ar gyfer graeanu ffyrdd, cadw ysgolion ar agor a chefnogi'r gwaith o sicrhau bod trafndiaeth gyhoeddus yn rhedeg yn ddiraffferth. Rydym wedi galw am hyn flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn. Rhaid cyfaddef, mae'r ffordd cydnerth yn mynd ychydig o'r ffordd tuag at fynd i'r afael â hyn, ond, yn ein barn ni, nid yw'n mynd yn ddigon pell. Rhaid inni weithredu ar fyrder o ran tlodi tanwydd a chymorth i ffermwyr, a rhoi ar waith gyfres o fesurau i leihau pwysau'r gaeaf ar y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol. Er enghraifft, yn gynharach yr wythnos hon, cyhoeddodd y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig ffigurau sy'n dangos mai yng Nghymru y mae'r ganran isaf o bobl sy'n cael eu brechu rhag y fflw ymhlith holl wledydd y DU ar gyfer pob grŵp sy'n wynebu risg. Methwyd â chyflawni targedau amseroedd ymateb ambiwlans ar gyfer galwadau categori A ym mis Medi 2012 am y pedwerydd mis yn olynol, er i Lywodraeth Cymru bennu'r targed isaf ym Mhrydain—65% o'i gymharu â 75% yn yr Alban a Lloegr.

Yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf, mae'r Llywodraeth Lafur hon wedi cael ei dal gan y tywydd garw sydyn sydd wedi achosi problemau dybryd mewn rhannau helaeth o Gymru. Mae peidio â bod yn barod ar gyfer tywydd mawr y gaeaf yn achosi cryn anghyfleustra i gymudwyr, siopwyr a thwristiaid, ac mae'n gost sylweddol i economi Cymru. Eleni, rhaid inni sicrhau bod gennym strategaeth gadarn a thrawsbynciol i ymdrin yn effeithiol â phwysau'r gaeaf er mwyn sicrhau bod gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, cynghorau lleol a Llywodraeth Cymru yn hollol barod.

Mae sicrhau bod ein rhwydweithiau seilwaith yn parhau'n weithredol yn hanfodol er mwyn cadw ysgolion ar agor, ei gwneud yn bosibl i bobl gyrraedd y gwaith, galluogi'r gwasanaethau brys i weithredu ac atal ein heconomi gyfan rhag dod i stop. Efallai fod hon yn adeg briodol i nodi y byddwn yn derbyn pob gwelliant. Rhaid inni weithio mewn partneriaeth i sicrhau bod awdurdodau lleol a rhanddeiliaid eraill yn barod ar gyfer y gwaethaf. Mae hefyd yn bwysig i'r Gweinidog fod yn glir ei feddwl, os bydd

in and take charge. We mentioned this yesterday and we would really like to know, should inclement weather come upon us to the degree that you have to intervene, how you would do this, as the Assembly needs to be satisfied that the Minister has the willingness to step in and show leadership in a crisis.

I want to touch upon one aspect of winter resilience that I believe we have yet to plan for adequately, and that is the delivery of bulk and bottled liquefied petroleum gas and domestic fuel oil to homes and businesses that do not have access to the mains gas network. This aspect of our fuel supply is especially vulnerable, as around 75% of the customer base of Calor Gas, for example, may be located in rural areas and often in relatively isolated locations. While the industry has some proactive systems already in place, there is much that the Minister can do to support it. The Scottish Government has an extremely good record of working with the industry and taking decisive action in times of crisis. It is a good model to follow and I urge the Minister and the Government to discuss these issues with their Scottish counterparts and share best practice.

Some of the issues that the industry wants tackled are fairly low-level but necessary, and I am sure that they would also help other public services and key utility companies. I know that the industry would appreciate the Welsh Government's assistance in urging local authorities to share information on gritting plans in advance, so that they are better able to plan their delivery schedules. If advances have already been made in this regard, then I would welcome the Minister sharing the details with us. Similarly, it would help if local authorities were encouraged to grit the access roads to domestic fuel and oil-filling plants as a priority.

The Welsh Government and local authorities must be much better at identifying genuinely vulnerable customers and should share the list with the industry so that it can add them

trychineb, pryd yn union y bydd yn camu i mewn a chymryd yr awenau. Soniwyd am hyn ddoe a hoffem wir wybod, os bydd tywydd garw, i ba raddau y byddai'n rhaid ichi ymyrryd, sut y byddech yn gwneud hyn, gan fod angen i'r Cynulliad fod yn fodlon bod y Gweinidog yn barod i gamu i mewn a rhoi arweiniad mewn argyfwng.

Rwyf am sôn am un agwedd ar gynllunio i wrthsefyll y gaeaf nad ydym eto wedi cynllunio ar ei chyfer yn ddigonol yn fy marn i, sef darparu swmpgyflenwadau neu boteli o nwy petrolewm hylifedig neu olew tanwydd domestig i gartrefi a busnesau nad ydynt wedi'u cysylltu â'r prif rwydwaith nwy. Mae'r agwedd hon ar ein cyflenwad tanwydd yn wendid penodol, gan fod tua 75% o gwsmeriaid Calor Gas, er enghraifft, mewn ardaloedd gwledig o bosibl ac yn aml mewn lleoliadau cymharol anghysbell. Er bod gan y diwydiant rai systemau rhagweithiol ar waith eisoes, mae llawer y gall y Gweinidog ei wneud i'w chefnogi. Mae gan Lywodraeth yr Alban record arbennig o dda o weithio gyda'r diwydiant a chymryd camau pendant ar adegau o argyfwng. Mae'n fodel da i'w ddilyn ac anogaf y Gweinidog a'r Llywodraeth i drafod y materion hyn gyda Gweinidogion yn yr Alban a rhannu arfer gorau.

Mae rhai o'r materion y mae'r diwydiant am weld yn cael eu trafod yn bethau eithaf bach ond angenrheidiol, ac rwy'n siŵr y byddent hefyd yn helpu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus eraill a chwmnïau cyfleustodau allweddol. Gwn y byddai'r diwydiant yn gwerthfawrogi cefnogaeth Llywodraeth Cymru i annog awdurdodau lleol i rannu gwybodaeth am gynlluniau graenu ymlaen llaw, fel y gallant gynllunio eu hamserlenni dosbarthu'n well. Os yw camau eisoes wedi cael eu cymryd o ran hyn, yna byddai'n dda gennyf pe bai'r Gweinidog yn rhannu'r manylion gyda ni. Yn yr un modd, byddai o gymorth pe bai awdurdodau lleol yn cael eu hannog i raeau'r ffyrdd mynediad i safleoedd tanwydd a llenwi olew domestig fel blaenoriaeth.

Rhaid i Lywodraeth Cymru ac awdurdodau lleol wneud yn llawer gwell o ran nodi cwsmeriaid sy'n wirioneddol agored i niwed a dylent rannu'r rhestr gyda'r diwydiant fel y

to our priority registers. I know that the Minister is looking into this and that he shares my concern about unregistered carers.

One small but important issue is that the Welsh Government must adopt a protocol on the distribution of heating fuel during periods of severe weather, similar to that adopted in Scotland. This is essential for the rural communities up and down Wales that rely on heating fuel and are particularly vulnerable to periods of severe weather.

Therefore, Minister, as I said at the outset, we welcomed much of your statement yesterday, but I hope that this debate will give us an opportunity to iron out the details. The weather in Wales is unpredictable and, while I am often tempted to blame the Welsh Labour Government for severe weather, I accept that it is not devolved, yet. However, responsibility in a crisis caused by severe weather rests squarely on your shoulders. Wales will look to you for quick, decisive action should the worst happen. I hope that you will take seriously my remarks on heating fuels, fuel poverty and resilience in our public services and that you will address them before the crisis rather than during it.

Gwelliant 1—Aled Roberts

Cynnwys ar ddiwedd pwynt 1:

'ac yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i gynllunio yn unol â hynny i ddelio â'r pwysau hynny'.

Gwelliant 3—Aled Roberts

Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

Yn nodi'r dirywiad sylweddol mewn amseroedd ymateb ambiwlansys yn ystod misoedd y gaeaf ac yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i weithio gydag Ymddiriedolaeth Ambiwllans Cymru i sicrhau bod targedau ymateb yn cael eu cyrraedd drwy gydol y flwyddyn.

Peter Black: I move amendments 1 and 3 in

gall eu hychwanegu at ein cofrestr blaenoriaeth. Gwn fod y Gweinidog yn edrych ar hyn a'i fod yn rhannu fy mhryder am ofalwyr heb eu cofrestru.

Un mater bach ond pwysig yw bod yn rhaid i Lywodraeth Cymru fabwysiadu protocol ynglŷn â dosbarthu tanwydd gwresogi yn ystod cyfnodau o dywydd garw, yn debyg i'r un a fabwysiadwyd yn yr Alban. Mae hyn yn hanfodol i'r cymunedau gwledig ar hyd a lled Cymru, sy'n dibynnu ar danwydd gwresogi ac sy'n wynebu risgiau penodol yn ystod cyfnodau o dywydd garw.

Felly, Weinidog, fel y dywedais ar y dechrau, croesawyd llawer o'ch datganiad ddoe, ond gobeithiaf y bydd y ddatl hon yn rhoi cyfle inni ddatrys y manylion. Mae'r tywydd yng Nghymru yn anrhagweladwy ac, er fy mod yn cael fy nhemtio yn aml i roi'r bai ar Lywodraeth Llafur Cymru am dywydd garw, derbyniaf nad yw eto wedi'i ddatganoli, Fodd bynnag, chi, yn sicr, sy'n gorfod ysgwyddo'r cyfrifoldeb pan fo argyfwng o ganlyniad i dywydd garw. Bydd Cymru yn disgwyl ichi weithredu'n gyflym ac yn bendant os digwydd y gwaethaf. Gobeithiaf y byddwch yn cymryd o ddifrif fy sylwadau ar danwydd gwresogi, tloedi tanwydd a chydnerthedd yn ein gwasanaethau cyhoeddus ac y byddwch yn ymdrin â hwy cyn yr argyfwng yn hytrach nag yn ystod yr argyfwng.

Amendment 1—Aled Roberts

Insert at the end of point 1:

'and calls on the Welsh Government to plan accordingly to deal with those pressures'.

Amendment 3—Aled Roberts

Add as a new point at the end of motion:

Notes the severe deterioration in ambulance response times during the winter months and calls on the Welsh Government to work with the Welsh Ambulance Trust to ensure that response targets are met all year around.

Peter Black: Cynigiau welliannau 1 a 3 yn

the name of Aled Roberts.

The issue that we are concerned with, which is reflected in our amendments, is not so much the preparedness of the Welsh Government and the various statutory agencies for winter, but the impact on already-struggling public services in Wales. The health service in particular does not always meet its targets currently, so we wonder what impact severe weather will have on those particular bodies. Certainly, when the Minister made his statement yesterday, it was clear that a lot of work has gone in to resilience and preparedness for severe weather. I noted that the amount of salt being held by local authorities and the Welsh Government is at a record level. I have no doubt that that will be used to keep roads open if we are faced with a snowfall comparable to that seen a couple of years ago. I welcome the fact that that is happening.

However, when you look at the pressure on services, which increase during winter, and the issues that arise from that, there is a need for further work on getting the basics right to ensure that those services are up to scratch in terms of dealing with that pressure. In poor weather, we have more slips and falls and people get ill due to the cold weather. We have other issues in relation to heating, for example, with people struggling to pay to heat their homes and skimping on heating and falling ill as a result.

When you look at the ambulance response times to category A calls, which are the immediately life-threatening calls, you see that the percentage of emergency responders who arrived at the scene within eight minutes in December 2010 was just 47%. The number of calls received then was similar to summer 2012, when the Government had trouble meeting its targets. There were 35,600 emergency calls during that month, which was a 23% increase on November 2010, but again similar to the summer of this year. There was a sharp drop in ambulance response times and a failure to reach the 65% target—a situation that we are in now where,

enw Aled Roberts.

Y mater yr hoffem ei godi, ac a adlewyrchir yn ein gwelliannau, yw nid yn gymaint barodrydd Llywodraeth Cymru na'r asiantaethau statudol amrywiol ar gyfer y gaeaf, ond yn hytrach yr effaith ar wasanaethau cyhoeddus sydd eisoes yn wynebu anawsterau yng Nghymru. Nid yw'r gwasanaeth iechyd yn arbenig bob amser yn cyflawni ei dargedau ar hyn o bryd, felly tybed pa effaith y bydd tywydd garw yn ei chael ar y cyrff penodol hynny. Yn sicr, pan wnaeth y Gweinidog ei ddatganiad ddoe, roedd yn amlwg bod llawer o waith wedi'i wneud ym maes cyfnerthu a pharodrydd ar gyfer tywydd garw. Nodais fod cyflenwadau awdurdodau lleol a Llywodraeth Cymru o halen ar eu lefelau uchaf erioed. Nid oes gennyf unrhyw amheuaeth na fydd hynny'n cael ei ddefnyddio i gadw ffyrdd ar agor os ydym yn wynebu eira tebyg i'r hyn a welwyd ychydig o flynyddoedd yn ôl. Croesawaf y ffaith bod hyn yn digwydd.

Fodd bynnag, pan edrychwch ar y pwysau ar wasanaethau, sy'n cynyddu yn ystod y gaeaf, a'r materion sy'n deillio o hynny, mae angen gwaith pellach i sicrhau bod y pethau sylfaenol yn iawn er mwyn sicrhau bod y gwasanaethau hynny yn cyrraedd y safon o ran ymdrin â'r pwysau hynny. Mewn tywydd garw, mae mwy o bobl yn baglu ac yn syrthio ac mae mwy o bobl yn mynd yn sâl oherwydd y tywydd oer. Cyfyd materion eraill o ran gwres, er enghraifft, gyda phobl yn cael anhawster i dalu am wresogi eu cartrefi ac yn ceisio arbed ar wres ac yn mynd yn sâl o ganlyniad i hynny.

Pan edrychwch ar amseroedd ymateb ambiwlansys i alwadau categori A, sef y galwadau pan fo bywyd mewn perygl, fe welwch mai dim ond 47% o ymatebwyr brys a gyrhaeddodd y lleoliad o fewn wyth munud ym mis Rhagfyr 2010. Roedd nifer y galwadau a dderbyniwyd bryd hynny yn debyg i haf 2012, pan gafodd y Llywodraeth drafferth i gyrraedd ei thargedau. Cafwyd 35,600 o alwadau brys yn ystod y mis hwnnw, sef cynnydd o 23% o gymharu â mis Tachwedd 2010, ond eto yn debyg i'r haf eleni. Gwelwyd gostyngiad sydyn yn amseroedd ymateb ambiwlansys a methiant i gyrraedd y targed o 65%—sefyllfa yr ydym

for the last four months, the ambulance service has failed to meet that 65% target.

That is compounded by the fact that no major hospital in Wales met its four or eight-hour treatment time target in October 2012, which puts more pressure on those services. It increases the delay in transferring patients from ambulances to the accident and emergency department, which has already increased over the last 12 months from around 3,000 to over 5,000. As a result, ambulances are not available to go out and pick up patients, even taking into account the worse conditions on the road. There are issues that need to be addressed in terms of the health service, if we are to have confidence that the health boards are in a fit state to cope with the pressures that are going to be brought to bear on them as a result of the winter.

Moving staff around regions to fill gaps in larger hospitals leads to a centralised service over the winter. It also means that local units are not available, which leads to people having to travel further. Ambulances also have to travel further and more people access the bigger hospitals, putting increasing pressure on them. Therefore, the longer we can keep smaller units open and the more we can encourage people to access treatment locally via their GP, pharmacist or NHS Direct Wales, the more effective our hospitals will be, not just in winter, but all year round. The targets for treatment times in A&E are not being met, as I said. That does not just delay the ambulances; it means that people wait longer as well. It means that they often leave without being treated and have to come back, or it may put pressure on other services as well.

Winter is about keeping people healthy through the cold months. I have noted, as I mentioned yesterday, that the Government has commissioned severe weather warnings that will, hopefully, help it to predict such weather. We did not have heat waves at all in the summer and I am hoping that we are not going to have snow in the winter. However,

ynndi yn awr lle mae'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans wedi methu â chyrraedd y targed hwnnw o 65% am y pedwar mis diwethaf.

Ynghyd â hynny mae'r ffaith nad oes unrhyw ysbyty mawr yng Nghymru wedi cyflawni ei darged i drin cleifion o fewn pedair neu wyth awr ym mis Hydref 2012, sy'n rhoi mwy o bwysau ar y gwasanaethau hynny. Mae'n arwain at fwy o oedi wrth drosglwyddo cleifion o ambiwlansys i'r adran damweiniau ac achosion brys, sydd eisoes wedi cynyddu dros y 12 mis diwethaf o tua 3,000 i dros 5,000. O ganlyniad, nid yw ambiwlansys ar gael i fynd allan i gasglu cleifion, hyd yn oed o ystyried yr amodau gwaeth ar y ffordd. Cyfyd materion y mae angen mynd i'r afael â hwy o ran y gwasanaeth iechyd, os ydym am fod yn hyderus bod y byrddau iechyd mewn cyflwr addas i ymdopi â'r pwysau a wynebiant oherwydd y gaeaf.

Mae symud staff o amgylch y rhanbarthau i lenwi bylchau mewn ysbytai mwy o faint yn arwain at wasanaeth canolog dros y gaeaf. Mae hefyd yn golygu nad yw unedau lleol ar gael, sy'n golygu bod pobl yn gorfod teithio ymhellach. Rhaid i ambiwlansys deithio ymhellach hefyd ac mae mwy o bobl yn mynd i'r ysbytai mawr, gan roi pwysau cynyddol arnynt. Felly, po hiraf y gallwn gadw unedau llai ar agor a mwyaf y gallwn annog pobl i gael triniaeth yn lleol drwy eu meddyg teulu, fferylllydd neu Galw Iechyd Cymru, y mwyaf effeithiol y bydd ein hysbytai, nid yn unig yn y gaeaf, ond drwy gydol y flwyddyn. Nid yw'r targedau ar gyfer amseroedd triniaeth mewn adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys yn cael eu cyflawni, fel y dywedais. Mae hynny nid yn unig yn arafu ambiwlansys, mae'n golygu bod pobl yn aros yn hwy hefyd. Mae'n golygu eu bod yn aml yn gadael heb eu trin ac yn gorfod dod yn ôl, neu gall roi pwysau ar wasanaethau eraill hefyd.

Cadw pobl yn iach yn ystod y misoedd oer yw'r nod yn ystod y gaeaf. Nodais, fel y soniais ddoe, fod y Llywodraeth wedi comisiynu rhybuddion tywydd garw a fydd, gobeithio, yn helpu i ragweld tywydd o'r fath. Ni chafwyd cyfnodau poeth iawn o gwbl yn yr haf a gobeithiaf nad ydym yn mynd i gael eira yn y gaeaf. Fodd bynnag, mae angen

we need to be ready for that. Planning also has to take account of schools, because it is not just about the condition of our schools. In many places, schools have closed not just because staff and pupils could not get there, but because the heating had broken down and that needs to be looked at as well.

There is a huge job of planning to be done as part of the preparation for the winter pressure. I am happy that the Government has done a lot of that planning; what I am not happy about is the condition of the services on which it has to build to meet those pressures. I hope that we can have some assurance from the Minister that those services will be in a far more robust state going into the winter in 2012, than they were in 2010.

Gwelliant 2—Jocelyn Davies

Dileu pwynt 3 a rhoi yn ei le:

Yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i weithio gydag awdurdodau lleol i ddatblygu strategaeth i warchod cymunedau rhag effeithiau tywydd garw yn ystod y gaeaf.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Cynigiau welliant 2 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.

Rwy'n credu bod y gwelliant hwn yn gosod yr holl drafodaeth hon yn ei chyd-destun priodol, oherwydd rydym yn sôn am gydweithrediad rhwng y Llywodraeth ganolog yn y fan hon a llywodraeth leol. Rhaid inni gydnabod mai llywodraeth leol a fydd yn ymateb i lawer iawn o'r galwadau hyn, ac at lywodraeth leol y bydd pobl yn troi pan fydd trafferthion yn eu hwynebu.

3.15 p.m.

Yn y cyd-destun hwnnw, Weinidog, rwyf am ddechre at y drafodaeth a gawsom brynhawn ddoe. Rwy'n meddwl bod perygl yn y ddadl hon y byddwn yn ail-drafod llawer iawn o'r pethau y gwnaethom eu trafod brynhawn ddoe pan wnaeth y Gweinidog ei ddatganiad; nid wyf wedi clywed unrhyw beth newydd yn y drafodaeth hyd yn hyn na chawsom gyfle i gyfeirio ato ddoe. Fodd bynnag, codais gwestiwn gyda chi ddoe,

inni fod yn barod am hynny. Rhaid i waith cynllunio ystyried ysgolion hefyd, oherwydd nid yw'n ymwneud â chyflwr ein hysgolion yn unig. Mewn sawl lle, mae ysgolion wedi cau nid yn unig am na allai staff na disgyblion gyrraedd yno, ond am nad oedd gwres ac mae angen ystyried hynny hefyd.

Mae tasg gynllunio enfawr i'w gwneud fel rhan o baratoi ar gyfer pwysau'r gaeaf. Rwy'n fodlon bod y Llywodraeth wedi gwneud llawer o'r gwaith cynllunio hwnnw; yr hyn nad wyf yn fodlon arno yw cyflwr y gwasanaethau y mae'n rhaid iddi adeiladu arnynt i ymdopi â'r pwysau hynny. Gobeithiaf y gallwn gael rhywfaint o sicrwydd gan y Gweinidog y bydd y gwasanaethau hynny mewn cyflwr llawer cadarnach ar drothwy gaeaf 2012, nag yr oeddent yn 2010.

Amendment 2—Jocelyn Davies

Delete point 3 and replace with:

Calls on the Welsh Government to work with local authorities to develop a strategy to protect communities against the effects of adverse winter weather.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I move amendment 2 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.

I think that this amendment sets this whole debate in its appropriate context, because we are talking about collaboration between central Government here and local government. We have to recognise that it is local government that will be responding to many of these calls, and that it will be to local government that people will turn when they face difficulties.

In that context, Minister, I want to return to the discussion that we had yesterday afternoon. I think that there is a danger in this debate that we will discuss again many of the things that we discussed yesterday afternoon when the Minister made his statement; I have not heard anything new in the discussion so far that we did not have an opportunity to refer to yesterday. However, I raised a question with you yesterday, Minister, about

Weinidog, am y math o bwysau a fyddai ar gynghorau sir o ganlyniad i'ch penderfyniad i dorri ar eu cyllid er mwyn gosod arian yn y gronfa gydweithredu. Gwnaethoch geisio osgoi ateb y cwestiwn hwnnw drwy ddweud y gallem ofyn y cwestiwn i chi y flwyddyn nesaf, gan mai sôn am gyllideb y flwyddyn nesaf yr ydym ni. Fodd bynnag, y gwir amdani yw pan mae awdurdodau lleol yn wynebu toriadau yn eu cyllid yn y flwyddyn ariannol nesaf, mewn sefyllfa fel y sefyllfaoedd sydd yn eu wynebu pan fo tywydd garw, yn aml iawn maent yn gorfod troi at y cronfeydd wrth gefn. Os ydynt yn gwybod bod eu cyllid yn mynd i gael ei dorri yn y flwyddyn ariannol ddilynol, byddant yn llai parod i droi at y cronfeydd wrth gefn hynny. Felly, byddwn yn dymuno i chi ateb y cwestiwn hwnnw a pa un a ydych wedi cael y drafodaeth honno gydag awdurdodau lleol ledled Cymru, oherwydd rwyf yn ymwybodol eu bod yn bryderus iawn am y sefyllfa.

Roedd gaeaf 2010-11 ymysg y gaeafau oeraf a gofnodwyd mewn blynyddoedd diweddar. Felly, cawsom y cyfle i ddysgu llawer iawn o wersi a gwelsom lawer iawn o fethiannau i sicrhau bod pobl yn gallu teithio, mynd i'w gwaith, a chael mynediad i wasanaethau hanfodol. A ydych yn hyderus y flwyddyn hon, Weinidog, bod y Llywodraeth wedi dysgu gwersi ac y bydd y cydweithrediad rhwng y Llywodraeth, awdurdodau lleol a'r gwasanaethau hanfodol yn llawer iawn gwell?

Fel rhywun sy'n cynrychioli nifer o ardaloedd gwledig yn fy etholaeth—rwy'n meddwl y byddai pob Aelod etholedig sydd yn cynrychioli ardaloedd gwledig yn dweud hyn—gwn fod problem fawr yn codi i'r bobl nad ydynt yn byw ar brif ffyrdd. Yn aml iawn, mae ffyrdd gwledig yn cael eu gadael. Mae'n rhaid blaenoriaethu yn y sefyllfaoedd hyn, wrth reswm, ond mae'n rhaid ceisio sicrhau bod pobl yn gallu defnyddio'r ffyrdd. Mae tuedd amlwg i sicrhau bod y priffyrdd yn cael eu clirio gyntaf, ond sut y byddwch yn sicrhau bod y bobl hynny sy'n byw ar y ffyrdd mwy diarffordd hefyd yn cael y cyfle i symud o'u tai a chael mynediad i wasanaethau?

Rwyf i a Phlaid Cymru yn cefnogi llawer iawn o'r pethau y gwnaethoch eu cyflwyno

the kind of pressures that there would be on county councils as a result of your decision to cut their budget in order to put money into the collaboration fund. You tried to avoid answering that question by saying that we could ask you that question next year, as we are talking about next year's budget. However, the truth is that when local authorities are facing cuts in their budget in the next financial year, in a situation such as those which they face in harsh weather, they very often have to turn to reserves. If they know that their budget is going to be cut in the following financial year, they will be less willing to turn to those reserves. Therefore, I would like you to answer that question as to whether you have had that discussion with local authorities across Wales, because I am aware that they are very concerned about the situation.

The winter of 2010-11 was one of the coldest winters on record in recent years. Therefore, we had the opportunity to learn many lessons and we saw many failures to ensure that people could travel, get to work, and access essential services. Are you confident this year, Minister, that the Government has learned lessons and that there will be far better collaboration between the Government, local authorities and essential services?

As someone who represents a number of rural areas in my constituency—I think that every elected Member who represents rural areas would say this—I know that a major problem arises for those people who do not live on main roads. Very often, rural roads are left. We have to prioritise in these situations, of course, but we must try to ensure that people can use the roads. There is an obvious tendency to ensure that the main roads are cleared first, but how will you ensure that those people who live on rural roads also have the opportunity to get out of their homes and to access services?

I and Plaid Cymru support many of the things that you introduced in your statement

yn eich datganiad ddoe. Y cwestiwn mawr, Weinidog, yw: a ydych yn hyderus bod modd eu gwireddu os cawn aeaf eleni tebyg i un 2010-11? Ar ba sail y gallwch ein sicrhau y bydd y gweithredu yn fwy effeithiol eleni?

Darren Millar: If weather forecasters are to be believed—I am a bit sceptical sometimes about that—we are in for a very cold winter, and we need to be prepared for it. I welcome the fact that the Minister for Local Government and Communities made a statement yesterday on cold weather preparedness, but I am not convinced that the NHS in Wales is as prepared as it ought to be.

Just over the weekend, David Sissling, the chief executive of NHS Wales, was trying to give assurances about NHS finances. However, we know, for example, that the health board in north Wales has a £19 million black hole that it is trying to sort out between now and the end of the financial year. We know that, last year, in an attempt to deal with a similar financial black hole, there were closures of minor injuries units across the region, which resulted in even further pressure on accident and emergency departments. I wonder whether we will see a repeat of that in the current financial year. I certainly hope not. However, it does not bode well that, if you look at the statistics, we have lost a fifth of our hospital beds in recent years, we have fewer locations providing services than in previous years, we have already heard about the pressures faced by the ambulance service, which is sliding down the scale in terms of its ability to meet targets. I am very pleased, I have to say, that the Minister is looking to increase the target for ambulances responding to calls within eight minutes to 70%. That is very welcome indeed. However, I wonder whether they are going to be able to do that, given that they are not meeting the 65% target and that we have the worst ambulance performance in the whole of the United Kingdom. It is not just this party that is warning about the ability of the NHS to cope with the forthcoming winter. Even the Royal College of Nursing has warned that it is concerned about the ability of A&E departments to meet the demands

yesterday. The big question, Minister, is: are you confident that you can realise them if we have a winter this year similar to that of 2010-11? On what basis can you assure us that the implementation will be more effective this year?

Darren Millar: Os credwch yr hyn sydd gan y rhai sy'n proffwydo'r tywydd i'w ddweud—bydd gennyf amheuron weithiau am hynny—mae gaeaf oer iawn o'n blaenau, ac mae angen inni fod yn barod amdano. Croesawaf y ffaith i'r Gweinidog Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau wneud datganiad ddoe am barodrwydd ar gyfer tywydd oer, ond nid wyf yn argyhoeddedig bod y GIG yng Nghymru mor barod ag y dylai fod.

Dros y penwythnos, roedd David Sissling, prif weithredwr GIG Cymru, yn ceisio rhoi sicrwydd ynghylch cyllid y GIG. Fodd bynnag, gwyddom, er enghraifft, fod gan y bwrdd iechyd yn y gogledd ddiffyg o £19 miliwn y mae'n ceisio ei unioni rhwng nawr a diwedd y flwyddyn ariannol. Gwyddom, y llynedd, mewn ymgais i ymdrin â diffyg tebyg, i unedau mân anafiadau gael eu cau ar draws y rhanbarth, a arweiniodd at hyd yn oed mwy o bwysau ar adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys. Tybed a fydd yr un peth yn digwydd yn ystod y flwyddyn ariannol gyfredol. Gobeithio na fydd yn digwydd eto. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'n argoeli'n dda, os edrychwch ar yr ystategau. Rydym wedi colli un o bob pum gwely ysbyty yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf, mae llai o leoliadau yn darparu gwasanaethau na chynt, rydym eisoes wedi clywed am y pwysau a wynebir gan y gwasanaeth ambiwlans, sy'n dirywio o ran ei allu i gyrraedd targedau. Rhaid dweud, rwy'n falch iawn bod y Gweinidog yn ystyried cynyddu'r targed ar gyfer ambiwlansys sy'n ymateb i alwadau o fewn wyth munud i 70%. Mae hynny i'w groesawu'n fawr. Fodd bynnag, tybed a allent wneud hynny, o ystyried nad ydynt yn cyflawni'r targed o 65% ac mai gennym ni y mae'r perfformiad gwaethaf o ran gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Nid dim ond y blaid hon sy'n rhybuddio am allu'r GIG i ymdopi â'r gaeaf sydd i ddod. Mae hyd yn oed y Coleg Nyrsio Brenhinol wedi rhybuddio ei fod yn pryderu am allu adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys i

placed upon them. It says that they are at breaking point and we ought to sit up and listen to it.

Poor performance in A&E has been something of a consistent problem for the First Minister since he took over Government; the target has not been met once. During the past month, we heard the Minister for Health and Social Services blaming the poor performance on the increasing number of older people presenting themselves at A&E departments. Yet, in north Wales, the Betsi Cadwaladr University Local Health Board is blaming it on too many younger people turning up at A&E departments and has launched an education campaign. We have the Choose Well application for smartphones, which is supposed to encourage people to choose the right place to present themselves when they have a problem. That has cost about £22 for every person that has downloaded it—that is a pretty extraordinary cost. It does not appear to be having much of an impact, given that the number of people presenting at A&E departments is going up, so I am concerned about the forthcoming winter and the ability of the NHS to cope.

In addition to that, we know that uptake of the flu jab is lower in Wales than in other parts of the United Kingdom. We are woefully missing the uptake targets for frontline health workers, the elderly and other at-risk groups. We have to make sure that we drive the flu jab rates up, otherwise we will have a mini crisis on our hands in terms of the demands that that will place upon A&E departments, particularly with regard to people who already have respiratory problems.

I wonder, Minister, whether you are the appropriate person to take the lead on winter preparedness. I know that you certainly are as far as salt stocks for our roads are concerned, but, as far as other parts of the Government are concerned, there really needs to be a much more joined-up and co-ordinated approach across the Welsh Government. You cannot do it all on your own. I know that you are making the effort with regard to what your department is able to achieve in terms of salt stocks et cetera, but, as far as the NHS is

fodloni'r gofynion arnynt. Mae'n dweud eu bod yn wynebu argyfwng a dylem wrando arno.

Bu perfformiad gwael mewn adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys yn broblem gyson i'r Prif Weinidog ers iddo gymryd yr awenau; nid yw'r targed erioed wedi cael ei gyflawni. Yn ystod y mis diwethaf, clywsom y Gweinidog Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn beio'r perfformiad gwael ar y nifer cynyddol o bobl hŷn sy'n mynd i adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys. Eto i gyd, yn y gogledd, mae Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Prifysgol Betsi Cadwaladr yn rhoi bai ar y ffaith bod gormod o bobl iau yn mynd i adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys ac mae wedi lansio ymgyrch addysg. Mae gennym ap 'Dewis Doeth' ar gyfer ffonau deallus er mwyn ceisio annog pobl i ddewis y lle iawn i fynd pan fo problem. Mae hynny wedi costio tua £22 am bob un sydd wedi ei lawrlwytho—sy'n gost ryfeddol. Nid ymddengys ei fod yn cael rhyw lawer o effaith, o ystyried bod nifer y bobl sy'n mynd i adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys yn cynyddu, felly rwy'n pryderu am y gaeaf sydd i ddod a gallu'r GIG i ymdopi.

Yn ogystal â hynny, gwyddom fod nifer y bobl sy'n cael eu brechu rhag y fflw yn is yng Nghymru nag mewn rhannau eraill o'r Deyrnas Unedig. Rydym yn methu â chyrraedd y targedau ar gyfer gweithwyr iechyd rheng flaen, yr henoed a grwpiau risg eraill o bell ffordd. Rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn cynyddu'r cyfraddau brechu rhag y fflw, fel arall, byddwn yn wynebu tipyn o argyfwng o ran y gofynion ar adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys, yn enwedig o ran pobl sydd eisoes â phroblemau anadlol.

Tybed, Weinidog, ai chi yw'r person priodol i gymryd yr awenau ynglŷn â pharodrwydd ar gyfer y gaeaf. Gwn mai chi yw'r person iawn yn sicr o ran cyflenwadau o halen ar gyfer ein ffyrdd, ond, o ran rhannau eraill o'r Llywodraeth, mae gwir angen am weithredu mwy cydgyssylltiedig ym mhob rhan o Lywodraeth Cymru. Ni allwch wneud y cyfan ar eich pen eich hun. Gwn eich bod yn gwneud yr ymdrech o ran yr hyn y gall eich adran ei gyflawni o ran cyflenwadau o halen ac ati, ond, o ran y GIG, nid wyf yn

concerned, I am not convinced that it is prepared for what will be a very difficult winter. We know that we now have summer pressures on the NHS—that was a new phrase introduced by the Minister this year—we will probably also have spring pressures and autumn pressures next year, but the real pressure on our NHS is largely to do with finances. It is a plague on all your houses, because you have all supported the budgets over the past few years. It is only this party that has stood up and said that you need to invest in the Welsh NHS.

Jenny Rathbone: I remind you that it is the Conservative party that has been promising to do something about energy prices; we hope that that will happen sometime before this winter, but I am not holding my breath.

I would prefer to focus on prevention rather than cure with regard to the winter pressures problem. We are not the only country in the world that has severe winters. Even if this winter were to be the worst winter for 100 years, as some are predicting, we do not have the sort of winters that Scandinavia, Russia, Ukraine and such places do, and those countries do not have the winter pressures problem that we have. That is because of the state of our housing, which simply is not properly insulated for winter weather.

Darren Millar: Will you take an intervention?

Jenny Rathbone: No, not at the moment. I recently held a joint surgery with Nest at its request, which I was very happy to do. However, most of the people who attended this surgery were social housing tenants, who Nest cannot help beyond providing some advice; the Government has given social landlords a different pot of money to ensure that all their properties are up to the Welsh housing quality standard. So, there are two kinds of people that Nest needs to be targeting: private tenants in receipt of benefits, and people living in their own homes who are in receipt of employment and support allowance, or pension credit or something like that. I think that Nest does not sufficiently target its publicity material at

argyhoeddedig ei fod yn barod am yr hyn a fydd yn aeaf anodd iawn. Gwyddom fod y GIG yn wynebu pwysau'r haf bellach—sef ymadrodd newydd a gyflwynwyd gan y Gweinidog eleni—byddwn yn ôl pob tebyg yn wynebu pwysau'r gwanwyn a phwysau'r hydref hefyd y flwyddyn nesaf, ond mae'r pwysau gwirioneddol ar ein GIG yn ymwneud yn bennaf ag arian. A phla ar bob un ohonoch, am eich bod i gyd wedi cefnogi'r cyllidebau dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd diwethaf. Dim ond y blaid hon sydd wedi sefyll i fyny a dweud bod angen ichi fuddsoddi yn y GIG yng Nghymru.

Jenny Rathbone: Hoffwn eich atgoffa mai'r blaid Geidwadol sydd wedi bod yn addo gwneud rhywbeth am brisiau ynni; rydym yn gobeithio y bydd hynny'n digwydd rywbryd cyn y gaeaf hwn, ond nid wyf yn dal fy anadl.

Byddai'n well gennyf ganolbwyntio ar rwystro'r clefyd na'i wella o ran problem pwysau'r gaeaf. Nid ni yw'r unig wlad yn y byd sy'n profi gaeafau garw. Hyd yn oed pe baem yn cael y gaeaf gwaethaf ers canrif eleni, fel y mae rhai yn rhagweld, nid ydym yn cael gaeafau tebyg i wledydd Sgandinafia, Rwsia, Wcráin a'r fath leoedd, ac nid yw'r gwledydd hynny yn wynebu problem pwysau'r gaeaf a wynebir gennym ni, a hynny oherwydd cyflwr ein tai, nad ydynt wedi'u hinswleiddio'n iawn ar gyfer tywydd y gaeaf.

Darren Millar: A wnewch chi dderbyn ymyriad?

Jenny Rathbone: Na wna, ddim ar hyn o bryd. Yn ddiweddar, cynhaliais gymhorthfa ar y cyd â Nyth ar gais Nyth ei hun, rhywbeth yr oeddwn yn barod iawn i'w wneud. Fodd bynnag, tenantiaid tai cymdeithasol oedd y rhan fwyaf o'r bobl a ddaeth i'r gymhorthfa, sef pobl na all Nyth eu helpu ar wahân i roi ychydig o gyngor; mae'r Llywodraeth wedi neilltuo cronfa wahanol o arian ar gyfer landlordiaid cymdeithasol er mwyn sicrhau bod eu holl eiddo yn cyrraedd safon ansawdd tai Cymru. Felly, mae dau fath o bobl y mae angen i Nyth eu targedu: tenantiaid preifat sy'n cael budd-daliadau, a phobl sy'n byw yn eu cartrefi eu hunain sy'n cael lwfans cyflogaeth a chymorth, neu gredyd pensiwn neu rywbeth felly. Credaf nad yw Nyth yn

those two target groups, because only people in those groups will have their needs addressed by Nest. Those living in private rented housing often have the worst housing, because they have the misfortune to have bad landlords. Obviously, that is a generalisation, and there are some very good private landlords. However, I am delighted that Cardiff Council recently condemned a place in which one of my constituents was living with her daughter that had a so-called bedroom that had no natural light or ventilation and was riddled with damp.

Private rents are generally higher than social rents, and that traps many people on low wages into needing to claim benefits to supplement their income. Too often, these people are living in fuel poverty because they are trying to keep the place warm, but it is poorly insulated and they have expensive, ancient heating systems. Therefore, there is a huge problem that I would like Nest to be a bit more focused on doing something about.

According to figures provided by the Department for the Environment and Sustainable Development, Nest managed to organise energy supplier-funded schemes for fewer than 800 households last year, which equates to fewer than 20 per constituency. We are also told that, since November 2011, Nest managed to obtain additional benefits for just over 100 people as the result of a benefits entitlement check, which would be 2.5 people per constituency.

Classically, pensioners are the people most likely not to claim all that they are entitled to. Happily, they have Gordon Brown's winter fuel allowance, which makes a huge difference to what elderly people think that they can afford to spend on heating. I was shocked, nevertheless, last December, during that cold snowy period, to find two pensioners with no heating on at all on one of the coldest days of the year, because they said they could not afford it and that they somehow had to manage without. Last week, a pensioner who had just gratefully received

targeddu ei ddeunydd cyhoeddusrwydd yn ddigonol at y ddau grŵp targed hynny, gan mai dim ond pobl yn y grwpiau hynny y gall Nyth ddiwallu eu hanghenion. Y rhai sy'n byw mewn tai rhent preifat sy'n byw yn y tai gwaethaf yn aml, a hynny am eu bod mor anffodus â rhentu oddi wrth landlordiaid gwael. Yn amlwg, rwy'n cyffredinoli, ac mae rhai landlordiaid preifat da iawn. Fodd bynnag, rwyf wrth fy modd bod Cyngor Caerdydd yn ddiweddar wedi condemnio tŷ lle roedd un o'm hetholwyr yn byw gyda'i merch a oedd yn cynnwys ystafell wely honedig heb unrhyw olau nac awyru naturiol ynddi, a oedd yn llaith ofnadwy.

Mae rhenti preifat yn uwch na rhenti cymdeithasol fel arfer, ac mae hynny'n golygu bod llawer o bobl ar gyflogau isel yn gorfod hawlio budd-daliadau er mwyn ategu eu hincwm. Yn rhy aml, mae'r bobl hyn yn byw mewn tlodi tanwydd oherwydd eu bod yn ceisio cadw'r lle yn gynnes, ond mae wedi'i inswleiddio'n wael ac mae ganddynt systemau gwresogi hynafol, costus. Felly, mae problem enfawr yr hoffwn weld Nyth yn canolbwyntio ychydig mwy arni er mwyn gwneud rhywbeth yn ei chylch.

Yn ôl ffigurau a ddarparwyd gan Adran yr Amgylchedd a Datblygu Cynaliadwy, roedd nifer yr aelwydydd y llwyddodd Nyth i drefnu cynlluniau a ariennir gan gyflenwyr ynni ar eu cyfer yn llai nag 800 y llynedd, sy'n cyfateb i lai na 20 fesul etholaeth. Dywedir wrthym hefyd, ers mis Tachwedd 2011, mai dim ond ar gyfer ychydig dros 100 o bobl y llwyddodd Nyth i gael budd-daliadau ychwanegol ar eu cyfer o ganlyniad i archwiliad o hawl i fudd-daliadau, a fyddai'n cyfateb i 2.5 o bobl fesul etholaeth.

Yn glasurol, pensïynwyr yw'r bobl sydd fwyaf tebygol o beidio â hawlio popeth y mae ganddynt hawl iddo. Yn ffodus, maent yn cael lwfans tanwydd gaeaf Gordon Brown, sy'n gwneud gwahaniaeth enfawr i'r hyn y mae pobl oedrannus yn credu y gallant fforddio i'w wario ar wresogi. Roeddwn yn syfrdanu, serch hynny, fis Rhagfyr diwethaf, yn ystod y cyfnod oer o eira, i ddod o hyd i ddau bensïynwr heb wres ymlaen o gwbl ar un o'r diwrnodau oeraf yn ystod y flwyddyn, am eu bod yn dweud na allent ei fforddio a'u bod yn gorfod gwneud hebddo rywsut. Yr

her winter fuel allowance told me that she thought that it ought not to be paid until after Christmas, because she knew many old people who were going to use it to buy Christmas presents, because they had no other spare money. What might happen to those people if we have a very hard winter is a sobering thought.

The so-called 'asset rich, income poor' may own their homes, but they may be draughty, with ancient heating systems. How much effort does Nest put into advising such people about how they could obtain equity release schemes so that they could get some of the asset out of their homes in order to make them more fit for purpose, with that money repaid when they die or decide to move to a smaller place? That seems to me to be a very important scheme, but it needs careful handling to make sure that older people are not the subject of a scam. In order to limit the numbers of people—

The Presiding Officer: Order. Your time is up.

Antoinette Sandbach: This debate is a welcome opportunity to discuss the challenges faced by communities across Wales, and I will use my contribution to highlight the challenges for communities and businesses in rural Wales. People living and working in the Welsh countryside are no strangers to isolation; it is a fact of life across rural Wales that the services and amenities that are taken for granted in urban areas are scarce and difficult to access. At the onset of winter, the difficulties and hardships faced by rural communities are all the more pressing.

Byron Davies, in opening this debate, highlighted the problems of getting gas and heating oil to off-grid households in rural areas, and that was certainly a problem two years ago in north Wales, during that very harsh winter. Last year, actually, we did not have such a bad winter and it was not so much of a problem. However, there is also

wythnos diwethaf, dywedodd pensïynwraig a oedd newydd gael ei lwfans tanwydd gaeaf ac yn diolch amdano wrthyf ei bod yn credu na ddylai gael ei dalu tan ar ôl y Nadolig, am ei bod yn adnabod llawer o hen bobl a oedd yn bwriadu ei ddefnyddio i brynu anrhegion Nadolig, am nad oedd ganddynt unrhyw arian sbâr arall. Mae'n frawychus meddwl beth a allai ddigwydd i'r bobl hynny os cawn aeaf garw iawn.

Efallai fod pobl sy'n gyfoethog o ran eu hasedau, ond yn dlawd o ran eu hincwm yn berchen ar eu cartrefi, ond gallant fod yn ddrafftig, gyda systemau gwresogi hynafol. Faint o ymdrech y mae Nyth yn ei wneud i gynghori pobl o'r fath am sut y gallent gael cynlluniau rhyddhau ecwiti er mwyn iddynt elwa ar ychydig o ased eu cartrefi er mwyn eu gwneud yn fwy addas i'r diben, gyda'r arian hwnnw yn cael ei ad-dalu pan fyddant yn marw neu'n penderfynu symud i eiddo llai? Ymddengys imi fod y cynllun hwnnw'n bwysig iawn, ond mae angen ei drin yn ofalus i wneud yn siŵr nad yw pobl hyn yn destun sgâm. Er mwyn cyfyngu ar y nifer y bobl—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Mae eich amser ar ben.

Antoinette Sandbach: Mae'r ddadl hon i'w chroesawu fel cyfle i drafod yr heriau a wynebir gan gymunedau ledled Cymru, a byddaf yn defnyddio fy nghyfraniad i dynnu sylw at yr heriau i gymunedau a busnesau yng nghefn gwlad. Mae pobl sy'n byw ac yn gweithio yng nghefn gwlad yn hen gyfarwydd ag arwahanrwydd; mae'n un o ffeithiau bywyd yng nghefn gwlad Cymru bod y gwasanaethau a'r amwynderau a gymerir yn ganiataol mewn ardaloedd trefol yn brin ac yn anodd cael gafael arnynt. Ar ddechrau'r gaeaf, mae'r anawsterau a'r caledi a wynebir gan gymunedau gwledig hyd yn oed yn waeth.

Wrth agor y ddadl hon, tynnodd Byron Davies sylw at y problemau a wynebir gan aelwydydd mewn ardaloedd gwledig nad ydynt wedi'u cysylltu â'r grid o ran cael nwy ac olew gwresogi, ac yn sicr bu'n broblem ddwy flynedd yn ôl yn y gogledd, yn ystod y gaeaf garw iawn hwnnw. Y llynedd, mewn gwirionedd, ni fu cynddrwg â hynny ac felly

the risk of real transport poverty. In rural areas, a privately owned car is essential to daily life, and public transport, with few exceptions, is infrequent, unreliable or non-existent. That makes it all the more important that rural roads are kept clear and safe during the winter months.

3.30 p.m.

I agree with the comments made by Rhodri Glyn Thomas about rural roads, and the Minister might want to look at how local farmers can help, with gritting supplies, in keeping those A and B roads clear. In know that, in Conway, the farmers are given an amount of grit at the beginning of the winter and when really bad snow hits, they go out and spread it on the local roads to help to keep them clear. However, this is not only a case of gritting the roads, but of dealing with the roads, which are in a poor condition. The effect of the last three winters and the backlog of repairs to roads, particularly to potholes, also have an impact. We are looking at a 17-year backlog to deal with the impacts of just the last few winters in Wales, and that is because rural roads are not seen as a priority for local authorities. The prospect of further deterioration is particularly worrying.

Further to your statement yesterday, I agree that it is welcome news that you have taken steps to build up your stocks of road salt, but that should not draw attention away from the condition that rural roads are left in after the winter. There are also considerable pressures on the agricultural community, with the possibility of a combined squeeze because of the abnormally high rainfall earlier this year and the low wheat yields in the US, which mean that feed costs will be substantially higher and the finishing period for Welsh lamb and beef will be extended. Effectively, that will lead to a double squeeze on Welsh farmers. That is exacerbated by the fact that they will be the only farmers in the UK without dedicated less favoured areas support. That applies to the other parts of the UK. That is a clear example of the sort of cross-departmental working that is needed—

ni fu'n gymaint o broblem. Fodd bynnag, mae perygl hefyd o dlodi trafniadaeth go iawn. Mewn ardaloedd gwledig, mae car preifat yn hanfodol i fywyd bob dydd, ac mae trafniadaeth gyhoeddus, gydag ychydig o eithriadau, yn anfynych, yn annibynadwy neu ddim yn bodoli. Mae hynny'n golygu ei bod yn bwysicach fyth bod ffyrdd gwledig yn cael eu cadw'n glir ac yn ddiogel yn ystod misoedd y gaeaf.

Cytunaf â'r sylwadau a wnaed gan Rhodri Glyn Thomas am ffyrdd gwledig, ac efallai y dylai'r Gweinidog ystyried sut y gall ffermwyr lleol helpu, gyda chyflenwadau o raeon, i gadw'r ffyrdd A a B yn glir. Gwn, yng Nghonwy, fod ffermwyr yn cael rhywfaint o raeon ar ddechrau'r gaeaf a phan fo eira mawr, maent yn mynd allan a'i daenu ar y ffyrdd lleol i helpu i'w cadw'n glir. Fodd bynnag, mae a wnelo hyn nid yn unig â graeanu'r ffyrdd, ond ag ymdrin â'r ffyrdd, sydd mewn cyflwr gwael. Mae'r tri gaeaf diwethaf ac ôl-groniad o waith atgyweirio ar ffyrdd, yn enwedig tyllau, hefyd yn cael effaith. Rydym yn edrych ar ôl-groniad o 17 mlynedd i ddelio ag effeithiau'r gaeafau diwethaf yng Nghymru, a hynny am nad yw ffyrdd gwledig yn cael eu hystyried yn flaenoriaeth i awdurdodau lleol. Mae'r posibilrwydd o ddirywio pellach yn achos pryder arbennig.

Yn dilyn eich datganiad ddoe, cytunaf ei bod yn newyddion da eich bod wedi cymryd camau i gronni'ch cyflenwadau o halen ffyrdd, ond ni ddylai hynny dynnu sylw oddi wrth gyflwr ffyrdd gwledig ar ôl y gaeaf. Mae cryn bwysau ar y gymuned amaethyddol hefyd, gyda'r posibilrwydd y cânt eu gwasgu o ddau gyfeiriad sef y glawriad anarferol o uchel yn gynharach eleni, a'r cnwd gwenith gwael yn yr Unol Daleithiau, sy'n golygu y bydd costau porthiant yn sylweddol uwch ac y caiff y cyfnod pesgi ar gyfer oen a gwartheg yng Nghymru ei ymestyn. I bob diben, bydd hyn yn arwain at wasgfa ddwbl ar ffermwyr Cymru. Gwaethygir hynny gan y DU nad ydynt yn cael cymorth penodol i ardaloedd llai ffafriol. Mae hwnnw'n berthnasol i rannau eraill o'r DU. Mae hynny'n enghraifft glir o'r math o waith

and Darren highlighted the health sector, for example. There needs to be a response that looks at all the areas on which these winter pressures can impact.

Mark Isherwood: One in three households in Wales now lives in fuel poverty, and one in five is severely fuel poor, spending more than 20% of its income to stay warm. In 2008, the Welsh Government's 'Living in Wales' survey on fuel poverty reported that 332,000 households in Wales, or 26%, were living in fuel poverty, a figure that had increased from 198,000 households in 2004. At its annual conference in February, National Energy Action Cymru predicted that the number of Welsh households experiencing fuel poverty will exceed 390,000 as energy prices increase.

During winter 2010-11—the last year for which we have figures, although new ones are imminent—Wales had the highest winter mortality rate, both in general and among under-65s, when compared with all of England's regions. There were 1,900 excess winter deaths, up 12% on the previous winter and an enormous 20% compared with non-winter time.

The UK Government has preserved the winter fuel payments, to which we heard reference, in line with the inherited budget, and has made the temporary increase in separate cold weather payments permanent, investing an extra £50 million in these one-off payments made during periods of extreme cold weather.

The UK's mandatory warm home discount scheme helps 2 million vulnerable pensioners and households, providing two thirds more support than under the previous voluntary scheme. In addition, the UK Government provides a Warm Homes Healthy People fund to reduce deaths and to protect individuals and communities from the effects of severe winter weather as part of its cold weather plan for England, but where is the Welsh Government's equivalent?

I welcome work under the Welsh

trawsadrannol sydd ei angen—a thynnodd Darren sylw at y sector iechyd, er enghraifft. Mae angen ymateb sy'n ystyried pob maes y gall pwysau'r gaeaf effeithio arno.

Mark Isherwood: Mae un o bob tair aelwyd yng Nghymru bellach yn byw mewn tlodi tanwydd, ac mae un o bob pump mewn tlodi tanwydd difrifol, gan wario mwy nag 20% o'u hincwm i gadw'n gynnes. Yn 2008, nododd arolwg Llywodraeth Cymru 'Byw yng Nghymru' ar dlodi tanwydd fod 332,000 o aelwydydd yng Nghymru, neu 26%, yn byw mewn tlodi tanwydd, ffigur a oedd wedi cynyddu o 198,000 o aelwydydd yn 2004. Yn ei gynhadledd flynyddol ym mis Chwefror, rhagwelodd National Energy Action Cymru y bydd nifer yr aelwydydd yng Nghymru sy'n dioddef tlodi tanwydd yn mynd y tu hwnt i 390,000 wrth i brisiau ynni gynyddu.

Yn ystod gaeaf 2010-11—y flwyddyn ddiwethaf y mae gennym ffigurau ar ei chyfer, er bod rhai newydd ar fin cael eu cyhoeddi—Cymru oedd â'r gyfradd marwolaethau uchaf yn ystod y gaeaf, yn gyffredinol ac ymhlith pobl o dan 65 oed, o'i chymharu â holl ranbarthau Lloegr. Bu 1,900 o farwolaethau ychwanegol yn ystod y gaeaf, cynnydd o 12% o gymharu â'r gaeaf blaenorol a chynnydd enfawr o 20% o gymharu ag adegau eraill o'r flwyddyn.

Mae Llywodraeth y DU wedi cadw'r taliadau tanwydd gaeaf, y cyfeiriwyd atynt, yn unol â'r gyllideb a etifeddwyd, ac wedi gwneud y cynnydd dros dro mewn taliadau tywydd oer ar wahân yn un parhaol, gan fuddsoddi £50 miliwn ychwanegol yn y taliadau untro hyn a wneir yn ystod cyfnodau o dywydd eithafol o oer.

Mae cynllun disgownt cartrefi cynnes gorfodol y DU yn helpu 2 filiwn o bensiynwyr ac aelwydydd bregus, gan roi dwy ran o dair yn fwy o gymorth na'r cynllun gwirfoddol blaenorol. Yn ogystal, mae Llywodraeth y DU yn darparu cronfa Cartrefi Cynnes Pobl Iach i leihau marwolaethau a diogelu unigolion a chymunedau rhag effeithiau tywydd garw'r gaeaf fel rhan o'i chynllun tywydd oer i Loegr, ond ble mae'r cynllun cyfatebol gan Lywodraeth Cymru?

Croesawaf waith o dan gynllun Nyth

Government Nest scheme, completing more than 1,400 schemes in north Wales alone up to the end of August, and note that the second phase of its Arbed programme aims to reach 4,800 existing homes in Wales by the end of 2015. However, these schemes alone are not a fuel poverty strategy. We urgently need a plan to tackle fuel poverty in the entire Welsh housing stock and its wider complex causes. Wales has very low switch rates between energy providers, although that would help households to keep their costs down. Only a third of Wales's social housing has achieved the Welsh housing quality standard, despite the 100% target for 2012. Despite parallel groups in England and Scotland continuing, the Welsh Government's fuel poverty ministerial advisory group has been scrapped. The Welsh Government should focus on the causes of higher levels of fuel poverty among rural households, engaging with the private and voluntary sectors. In January, I sponsored the Assembly launch of the year 2 findings of NEA Cymru's off-gas project, working with Calor Gas to assist off-grid households facing fuel poverty and to deliver the rural energy advisory programme.

Although urban fuel poverty generally aligns with social poverty, rural fuel poverty is more closely associated with the quality of housing and/or household characteristics. Furthermore, owing to the often isolated physical location of rural households, or their reluctance to admit that there is a problem, area-based indicators do not easily identify rural fuel poverty. There is a need to learn from the energy advisory programme's partnership approach to ensure that Wales can engage the private sector in the delivery of programmes that demonstrate corporate social responsibility and that reach hard-to-reach groups.

Consumer Focus Wales has urged people who use domestic heating oil to buy before prices increase during the winter. People who use heating oil are more likely to be in severe fuel poverty than those reliant on other off-

Llywodraeth Cymru, a gwblhaodd fwy na 1,400 o gynlluniau yn y gogledd yn unig hyd at ddiwedd mis Awst, a nodaf fod ail gam ei rhaglen Arbed yn anelu at gyrraedd 4,800 o gartrefi sy'n bodoli eisoes yng Nghymru erbyn diwedd 2015. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r cynlluniau hyn ar eu pennau eu hunain yn strategaeth tldi tanwydd. Mae angen dybryd am gynllun i fynd i'r afael â thlodi tanwydd yn stoc dai Cymru gyfan a'i achosion cymhleth ehangach. Mae gan Gymru gyfraddau isel o ran newid cyflenwyr ynni, er y byddai hynny'n helpu cartrefi i gadw eu costau i lawr. Dim ond traean o dai cymdeithasol Cymru sydd wedi cyrraedd safon ansawdd tai Cymru, er gwaethaf y targed o 100% ar gyfer 2012. Er bod grwpiau cyfatebol yn Lloegr a'r Alban yn parhau, mae grŵp cynghori gweinidogol ar danwydd tldi Llywodraeth Cymru wedi cael ei ddileu. Dylai Llywodraeth Cymru ganolbwyntio ar achosion o lefelau uwch o dldi tanwydd ymhlith aelwydydd gwledig, gan ymgysylltu â'r sector preifat a'r sector gwirfoddol. Ym mis Ionawr, noddais lansiad canfyddiadau blwyddyn 2 prosiect cartrefi nad ydynt ar y grid nwy NEA Cymru yn y Cynulliad, sy'n gweithio gyda Calor Gas i gynorthwyo aelwydydd nad ydynt wedi'u cysylltu â'r gird ac sy'n wynebu tldi tanwydd ac i gyflwyno'r rhaglen ymgynghorol ar ynni gwledig.

Er bod tldi tanwydd mewn ardaloedd trefol yn cyd-fynd â thlodi cymdeithasol ar y cyfan, mewn ardaloedd gwledig mae mwy o gysylltiad rhwng tldi tanwydd ac ansawdd tai a/neu nodweddion yr aelwyd. At hynny, oherwydd lleoliad cartrefi gwledig, sydd yn aml yn anghysbell neu amharodrwydd aelwydydd i gyfaddef bod problem, nid yw dangosyddion sy'n seiliedig ar ardal yn adnabod tldi tanwydd gwledig yn hawdd. Mae angen dysgu o ddull partneriaeth y rhaglen ymgynghori ar ynni i sicrhau y gall Cymru gael cymorth y sector preifat yn y gwaith o ddarparu rhaglenni sy'n dangos cyfrifoldeb cymdeithasol corfforaethol ac sy'n cyrraedd grwpiau anodd eu cyrraedd.

Mae Llais Defnyddwyr Cymru wedi annog pobl sy'n defnyddio olew gwresogi domestig i brynu cyn bod prisiau yn codi yn ystod y gaeaf. Mae pobl sy'n defnyddio olew gwresogi yn fwy tebygol o fod mewn tldi

grid fuels. Age UK estimates that as many as 25,000 older people could die needlessly because of the cold this winter, and Age Cymru states that as many as 245,000 older people in Wales are not receiving any support from their neighbours. It is therefore asking people to call in on their older neighbours. After being criticised last year for the way in which it dealt with ward closures to cope with extra demand over the winter, Betsi Cadwaladr University Local Health Board, referred to by Darren, is targeting 15 to 19-year-olds to help to relieve demand on accident and emergency departments this winter, saying that too many go to A&E when they could go to GPs or pharmacists.

As well as ringing the Energy Saving Trust, people worried about paying their fuel bills and keeping warm during the winter can ring the Energy Retail Association's Home Heat Helpline, which can also intercede with the energy providers. We therefore call on the Welsh Government to implement an overarching winter pressures strategy that works together and hard to find and help the people who need help the most.

The Minister for Local Government and Communities (Carl Sargeant): I thank the Presiding Officer for the opportunity to respond to this very important debate on winter pressures. Alongside yesterday's statement, I hope that we can provide Members with some more detail on this very important issue. I will start by working through the points raised by Members today, noting the negative impact that winter pressures can have on public services. Winter always brings additional pressure to bear on public services. That is an undeniable and inescapable fact. The reduced daylight, colder temperatures, seasonal flu, and snow all have a negative impact and will lead to disruption in one way or another. The issue for my team and other agencies is how we prepare for that. The severity of the winter is difficult to forecast, and we are unable to predict how much disruption the weather will create. All that we know is that the planning of this process is essential.

tanwydd difrifol na'r rhai sy'n dibynnu ar fathau eraill o danwydd oddi ar y grid. Mae Age UK yn amcangyfrif y gall cymaint â 25,000 o bobl hŷn farw yn ddiangen o oerfel y gaeaf hwn, ac mae Age Cymru wedi datgan nad yw cymaint â 245,000 o bobl hŷn yng Nghymru yn cael unrhyw gymorth gan eu cymdogion. Felly, mae'n gofyn i bobl alw heibio eu cymdogion hŷn. Ar ôl cael ei feirniadu y llynedd am y ffordd yr ymdriniodd â chau wardiau i ymdopi â'r galw ychwanegol dros y gaeaf, mae Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Prifysgol Betsi Cadwaladr, y cyfeiriwyd at hyn gan Darren, yn targedu pobl ifanc 15-19 mlwydd oed i helpu i leihau'r galw ar adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys y gaeaf hwn, gan ddweud bod gormod yn mynd i'r adrannau hynny yn lle mynd at feddygon teulu neu fferyllwyr.

Yn ogystal â ffonio'r Ymddiriedolaeth Arbed Ynni, gall pobl sy'n poeni am dalu eu biliau tanwydd a chadw'n gynnes yn ystod y gaeaf ffonio Llinell Gymorth Gwres Cartrefi'r Gymdeithas Manwerthu Ynni, a all hefyd gyfryngu gyda'r darparwyr ynni. Rydym felly yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i weithredu strategaeth gyffredin ar bwysau'r gaeaf sy'n cydweithio ac yn gwneud ymdrech i ddod o hyd i bobl sydd angen cymorth fwyaf a'u cynorthwyo.

Y Gweinidog Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau (Carl Sargeant): Hoffwn ddiolch i'r Llywydd am y cyfle i ymateb i'r ddadl bwysig iawn hon ar bwysau'r gaeaf. Ochr yn ochr â datganiad ddoe, gobeithio y gallwn roi mwy o fanylion i'r Aelodau am y mater pwysig iawn hwn. Dechreuaf drwy weithio drwy'r pwyntiau a godwyd gan Aelodau heddiw, gan nodi'r effaith negyddol y gall pwysau'r gaeaf ei chael ar wasanaethau cyhoeddus. Mae'r gaeaf bob amser yn rhoi pwysau ychwanegol ar wasanaethau cyhoeddus. Mae honno'n ffaith ddiymwad na ellir ei hosgoi. Mae'r golau dydd cyfyngedig, tymereddau oerach, ffliw tymhorol, ac eira i gyd yn cael effaith negyddol ac yn amharu ar wasanaethau mewn un ffordd neu'i gilydd. Y broblem i'm tîm innau ac asiantaethau eraill yw sut rydym yn paratoi ar gyfer hynny. Mae'n anodd rhagweld pa mor arw fydd y gaeaf, ac ni allwn ragweld i ba raddau y bydd y tywydd yn amharu ar wasanaethau a phobl. Y cyfan a wyddom yw bod cynllunio'r broses

hon yn hanfodol.

Moving to the role that the Welsh Government has to play in alleviating the burden, as stated in the motion tabled, we take that role very seriously. On 3 October, I chaired a meeting of the Wales resilience forum, where the preparations for winter were a main agenda item. The forum brings together top-level representatives from the emergency services at all levels of Government, other responder agencies and the military. The breadth of organisations represented is to enable them all to assess the risk and to prepare for, and respond to, emergencies as they arise. At that meeting, I was able to seek assurances from the key departments, from attendants within local government and Welsh Government, that our partners are in place and ready to act.

In my statement yesterday, I referred to what we are doing to prepare for winter pressures. We are ensuring that we go into winter with the highest ever levels of salt stocks, with forecast provision barns to be kept, as noted in guidance on salt spreading and arrangements for supply. I will pick up on a point that one Member raised about local roads. Local authorities have had increased funding for salt stocks, so that is why there has been an increase in local authority and Welsh Government supplies. It is up to authorities to decide on their salting routes. Whether they are rural routes or side roads, that is a decision for the local authority. I believe that they are well-enough prepared to make those choices, depending on the weather conditions. I will give way to the leader of the opposition.

Andrew R.T. Davies: You mention local authorities. One key provider of services is local health boards. As we saw some two years ago, many hospitals were able to function with staff, but their large outdoor estates—car parks, and so on—were frozen over for many weeks, which made them inaccessible for patients and staff to use. How confident are you that local health boards have winter pressure plans in place for their outdoor estates, so that their facilities can

Gan droi at y rôl sydd gan Lywodraeth Cymru i'w chwarae i ysgafnhau'r baich, fel y nodir yn y cynnig a gyflwynwyd, rydym yn cymryd y rôl honno o ddifrif. Ar 3 Hydref, bûm yn cadeirio cyfarfod o fforwm Cymru gydnerth, lle roedd y paratodau ar gyfer y gaeaf yn un o'r prif eitemau ar yr agenda. Mae'r fforwm yn dwyn ynghyd gynrychiolwyr lefel uchel o'r gwasanaethau brys ar bob lefel o'r Llywodraeth, asiantaethau ymatebwyr eraill a'r fyddin. Ceir cynrychiolaeth eang o sefydliadau er mwyn eu galluogi i gyd i asesu'r risg a pharatoi ar gyfer achosion brys wrth iddynt godi ac ymateb iddynt. Yn y cyfarfod hwnnw, yr oeddwn yn gallu ceisio sicrwydd gan yr adrannau allweddol, gan gynorthwyywyr o fewn llywodraeth leol a Llywodraeth Cymru, bod ein partneriaid yn eu lle ac yn barod i weithredu.

Yn fy natganiad ddoe, cyfeiriais at yr hyn yr ydym yn ei wneud i baratoi ar gyfer pwysau'r gaeaf. Rydym yn sicrhau bod gennym y lefelau uchaf erioed o gyflenwadau o halen ar ddechrau'r gaeaf, gydag ysguboriau darparu yn ôl rhagolygon yn cael eu cadw, fel y nodir yn y canllawiau ar daenu halen a threfniadau cyflenwi. Ymatebaf i bwynt a gododd un Aelod ynghylch ffyrdd lleol. Mae awdurdodau lleol wedi cael mwy o gyllid i brynu cyflenwadau o halen, felly dyna pam y bu cynnydd yng nghyflenwadau awdurdodau lleol a Llywodraeth Cymru. Mater i'r awdurdodau yw penderfynu ar eu llwybrau taenu halen. P'un a ydynt yn llwybrau gwledig neu'n ffyrdd ochr, yr awdurdod lleol sy'n penderfynu. Credaf eu bod wedi paratoi digon i wneud y dewisiadau hynny, yn dibynnu ar y tywydd. Ildiaf i arweinydd yr wrthblaid.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Rydych yn sôn am awdurdodau lleol. Un darparwr gwasanaethau allweddol yw byrddau iechyd lleol. Fel y gwelsom tua dwy flynedd yn ôl, roedd llawer o ysbytai yn gallu gweithredu gyda staff, ond roedd eu hystadau awyr agored mawr—meysydd parcio, ac yn y blaen—o dan rew am nifer o wythnosau, a oedd yn ei gwneud yn amhosibl i gleifion a staff eu defnyddio. Pa mor hyderus ydych bod gan fyrddau iechyd lleol gynlluniau

work for patients and clinicians?

Carl Sargeant: This must be a consideration by the local health boards and local authorities, and I have issued guidance to organisations on the priority areas for salting. These include areas around sheltered accommodation, doctors' surgeries, and so on, which are the main important areas where people congregate, as well as council offices, where the benefits systems are in place. That is in guidance, and I expect authorities and local health boards to ensure that that is in place.

We are communicating the important health messages. I am grateful to Darren Millar for his contribution. I am not sure about the politics of his contribution today, but I know of his effectiveness as a local salesman, because, when Darren tweeted about the Choose Well app, we had an increase of 35,000 people downloading the app. That is a much more cost-effective way for us to introduce the app. I might ask him to do the same for the uptake of the flu jab. However, while we are talking about value for money, let me just say that, last week, we had an election in Wales and across the UK, where the contribution of votes cast versus the cost of voting equated to the most expensive election ever to be held in Wales. It cost around £16.50 per vote cast. Maybe the opposition parties would have much preferred that to go into the already-cut—by the Tory Government—winter fuel allowance, which they have taken out of the pockets of people in Wales. I will give way to Darren Millar.

Darren Millar: Democracy is a price worth paying. If you do not want to pay that price, that is your choice. I wish to refer to your comments regarding my tweets, Minister. I am delighted that 30,000-odd people decided to download the app. I must say that I have a far wider readership than I ever thought. However, the issue here is that you have to get better at publicising these things in order to deliver the impact that they should be

pwysau'r gaeaf ar waith ar gyfer eu hystadau awyr agored, fel y gall eu cyfleusterau fod yn weithredol i gleifion a chlinigwyr?

Carl Sargeant: Rhaid i hyn fod yn ystyriaeth i'r byrddau iechyd lleol ac awdurdodau lleol, ac rwyf wedi cyhoeddi canllawiau i sefydliadau ar y meysydd â blaenoriaeth ar gyfer taenu halen. Mae'r rhain yn cynnwys ardaloedd o amgylch lletyau gwarchod, meddygfeydd, ac yn y blaen, sef y prif feysydd pwysig lle mae pobl yn ymgynnull, yn ogystal â swyddfeydd y cyngor, lle mae'r systemau budd-daliadau yn eu lle. Mae hynny wedi'i nodi mewn canllawiau, a disgwyliaf i awdurdodau a byrddau iechyd lleol sicrhau bod hynny'n cael ei roi ar waith.

Rydym yn cyfleu'r negeseuon iechyd pwysig. Rwy'n ddiolchgar i Darren Millar am ei gyfraniad. Nid wyf yn siŵr ynglŷn â gwleidyddiaeth ei gyfraniad heddiw, ond gwn am ei effeithiolrwydd fel gwerthwr lleol, oherwydd, pan anfonodd Darren drydar am yr ap 'Dewis Doeth', gwelwyd cynnydd o 35,000 o bobl yn ei lawrlwytho. Mae honno'n ffordd lawer mwy costeffeithiol inni ei gyflwyno. Efallai y dylwn ofyn iddo wneud yr un peth i annog pobl i gael brechiad rhag y fflw. Fodd bynnag, tra byddwn yn sôn am werth am arian, gadewch imi nodi, yr wythnos diwethaf, i etholiad gael ei gynnal yng Nghymru a ledled y DU, lle y bu cyfraniad y pleidleisiau a fwriwyd o'u cymharu â chost pleidleisio yn golygu mai hwn fu'r etholiad mwyaf costus erioed i'w gynnal yng Nghymru. Costiodd tua £16.50 y bleidlais a fwriwyd. Efallai y byddai wedi bod yn well o lawer gan y gwrthbleidiau pe bai hynny wedi cael ei wario ar y lwfans tanwydd gaeaf sydd eisoes wedi'i dorri—gan y Llywodraeth Doriadaidd—y maent wedi ei gymryd o bocedi pobl yng Nghymru. Ildiaf i Darren Millar.

Darren Millar: Mae democratiaeth yn bris gwerth ei dalu. Os nad ydych am dalu'r pris hwnnw, eich dewis chi yw hynny. Hoffwn gyfeirio at eich sylwadau am fy negeseuon trydar, Weinidog. Rwyf wrth fy modd i ryw 30,000 o bobl benderfynu lawrlwytho'r ap. Mae gennyf fwy o ddarlennwyr o lawer nag yr oeddwn erioed wedi meddwl, rhaid imi ddweud. Fodd bynnag, y broblem sy'n codi yw bod yn rhaid ichi wella o ran rhoi

having. No-one is saying that the app is useless; what we are saying is that more people need to be aware of these things so that they can have the impact that they are designed to deliver.

Carl Sargeant: I accept the Member's contribution, but rather than constantly criticising, I would much prefer it if he did the things that are most effective, by tweeting about the apps that are important to changing people's lives. I noted the issue about last week's elections in the contributions made from the side of the Chamber that I should not always take notice of. However, let us look at the facts. The contribution to police spend per head of population in Wales is around £90. The cost of the election last week was £16.50 per vote, which is pretty perverse when that money could have been ploughed into front-line policing or health services, or into winter resilience. You have a lot to answer for, over on the opposition benches.

Finally, to bring the debate to a close, I wish to pick up on the important issues that Rhodri Glyn raised, and his contribution regarding yesterday's debate, on the £10 million. I wish to reaffirm our commitment to local authorities and the way in which we are funding them. The Member suggested that this was a cut to local government budgets. However, the Member has clearly not read, or fails to understand, the implications of the new budget. The fact of the matter is that the three-year settlement for local authorities in Wales is a 0.6% uplift, as opposed to a 0.6% reduction in England, which the Liberal Democrats and the Conservative Party preside over.

3.45 p.m.

In Wales, we are investing in local authorities and, in addition to the positive spend, we are increasing a £10 million pot of collaboration funding, to which they can also make a bid. It is additional money, not a cut. We believe that, in working with partners across the public and voluntary sectors, it is important

cyhoeddusrwydd i'r pethau hyn er mwyn iddynt gael yr effaith y dylent ei chael. Nid oes neb yn dweud bod yr ap yn ddiwerth; yr hyn yr ydym yn ei ddweud yw bod angen i fwy o bobl fod yn ymwybodol o'r pethau hyn fel y gallant gael yr effaith y maent wedi'u cynllunio i'w gyflawni.

Carl Sargeant: Derbyniaf gyfraniad yr Aelod, ond yn hytrach na beirniadu drwy'r amser, byddai'n llawer gwell gennyf pe bai'n gwneud y pethau sydd fwyaf effeithiol, drwy drydar am yr aps sy'n bwysig i newid bywydau pobl. Nodais y mater ynglŷn ag etholiadau yr wythnos diwethaf yn y cyfraniadau a wnaed o ochr y Siambr na ddylwn bob amser gymryd sylw ohoni. Fodd bynnag, gadewch inni edrych ar y ffeithiau. Mae'r cyfraniad at wariant yr heddlu y pen o'r boblogaeth yng Nghymru tua £90. Costiodd yr etholiad yr wythnos diwethaf £16.50 y bleidlais, sydd y tu hwnt i bob rheswm, o ystyried y gallai'r arian fod wedi cael ei fuddsoddi mewn plismona rheng flaen neu wasanaethau iechyd, neu i wrthsefyll y gaeaf. Mae gennych lawer i ateb drosto, draw ar feinciau'r wrthblaid.

Yn olaf, er mwyn dod â'r ddadl i ben, hoffwn ymdrin â'r materion pwysig a gododd Rhodri Glyn, a'i gyfraniad o ran dadl ddoe, ynglŷn â'r £10 miliwn. Hoffwn ailddatgan ein hymrwymiad i awdurdodau lleol a'r modd yr ydym yn eu hariannu. Awgrymodd yr Aelod fod hwn yn doriad yng nghyllidebau llywodraeth leol. Fodd bynnag, mae'n amlwg nad yw'r Aelod wedi darllen y gyllideb newydd, neu ei fod wedi methu â deall goblygiadau'r gyllideb newydd. Y ffaith amdani yw bod y setliad tair blynedd ar gyfer awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru yn rhoi cynnydd o 0.6%, yn hytrach na gostyngiad o 0.6% yn Lloegr, lle mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a'r Blaid Geidwadol mewn grym.

Yng Nghymru, rydym yn buddsoddi mewn awdurdodau lleol ac, yn ychwanegol at y gwariant cadarnhaol, rydym yn cynyddu cronfa o £10 miliwn o arian cydweithredu, y gallant hefyd wneud cais iddi. Arian ychwanegol ydyw, nid toriad. Credwn, drwy weithio gyda phartneriaid ar draws y sector

that we prepare for winter. We believe that we have those plans in place. Let us hope, as Peter Black quite rightly said, that we do not have a bad winter and that all of this planning will be a waste of time.

Suzy Davies: I take this opportunity to thank everyone who took part in this debate today. It obviously follows on very timely from the statement made by the Minister yesterday, and it is also very timely for the people watching proceedings in this Chamber, because everyone will be worried about the effects of winter on their lives, particularly following the problems that all of us experienced two years ago.

Byron Davies opened the debate with the major point that the resilience forum is a welcome addition to our landscape, but it really does not go far enough. It does not meet the challenges that we face regarding the health service and fuel poverty, which have been raised by other Members here today. I think that the main thrust of his part of the debate was about keeping Wales moving. The points raised by a number of Members again about the accessibility of rural roads cannot be overlooked when winter resilience issues are being discussed in this Chamber or being planned for by members of the Welsh Government.

Peter Black acknowledged that we have record levels of salt. That is fantastic, provided that that salt can be distributed, of course. I think that it was Antoinette Sandbach and Rhodri Glyn Thomas who talked about the opening of rural roads. I can remember one occasion in my campaigning history when the local authority went around raiding the grit bins on housing estates to make sure that it had enough salt to open the arterial roads. That meant that everyone living on those housing estates, including a number of young families and older people, were literally trapped in their homes. I do not think that any plan for the future should accept that as any kind of default position.

Peter Black also referred to the ambulance statistics, which should continue to worry us

cyhoeddus a'r sector gwirfoddol, ei bod yn bwysig ein bod yn paratoi ar gyfer y gaeaf. Credwn fod gennym y cynlluniau hynny ar waith. Gobeithio, fel y dywedodd Peter Black yn gwbl briodol, na chawn aeaf garw ac y bydd yr holl waith cynllunio hwn yn wastraff amser.

Suzy Davies: Hoffwn achub ar y cyfle hwn i ddiolch i bawb a gymerodd ran yn y ddadl hon heddiw. Yn amlwg, mae'n dilyn datganiad amserol iawn gan y Gweinidog ddoe, ac mae hefyd yn amserol iawn i'r bobl sy'n gwylio'r trafodion yn y Siambr hon, oherwydd bydd pawb yn poeni am effeithiau'r gaeaf ar eu bywydau, yn enwedig yn sgîl y problemau a gafodd pob un ohonom ddwy flynedd yn ôl.

Agorodd Byron Davies y ddadl gyda'r pwynt pwysig bod fforwm Cymru Gydnerth yn rhywbeth newydd i'w groesawu, ond nad yw'n mynd yn ddigon pell mewn gwirionedd. Nid yw'n ateb yr heriau sy'n ein hwynebu o ran y gwasanaeth iechyd a thlodi tanwydd, a godwyd gan Aelodau eraill yma heddiw. Credaf mai prif fyrdwn ei ran yntau o'r ddadl oedd yr angen i gadw Cymru i symud. Ni ellir diystyru'r pwyntiau a godwyd gan nifer o Aelodau unwaith eto am hygyrchedd ffyrdd gwledig pan fo materion gwrthsefyll y gaeaf yn cael eu trafod yn y Siambr hon neu pan fydd aelodau o Lywodraeth Cymru yn cynllunio ar eu cyfer.

Cydnabu Peter Black fod y cyflenwadau o halen ar eu lefelau uchaf erioed. Mae hynny'n wych, ar yr amod y gall yr halen gael ei ddosbarthu, wrth gwrs. Credaf mai Antoinette Sandbach a Rhodri Glyn Thomas a soniodd am agor ffyrdd gwledig. Cofiaf un achlysur wrth ymgyrchu pan oedd yr awdurdod lleol wedi mynd ati i gymryd graean o'r biniau graean ar ystadau tai er mwyn sicrhau bod ganddo ddigon o halen i agor y ffyrdd prifwythiennol. Golygai hynny fod pawb a oedd yn byw ar yr ystadau tai hynny, gan gynnwys nifer o deuluoedd ifanc a phobl hŷn, yn llythrennol yn gaeth i'w cartrefi. Ni chredaf y dylai unrhyw gynllun ar gyfer y dyfodol dderbyn bod sefyllfa o'r fath yn arferol.

Cyfeiriodd Peter Black hefyd at yr ystadegau am y gwasanaeth ambiwlans, a ddylai fod yn

all. It seems that both the winter and the summer are to blame for ambulance services failing to reach their targets. He rightly drew attention to the impact on accident and emergency services of the delays that are caused by ambulances not reaching their target times. That is certainly something of which we will both be conscious in South Wales West, where there is a possible centralisation of accident and emergency departments.

His final comment was that there is a huge job of planning to be done with winter resilience, and I do not think that any of us would disagree with that. This highlights point 4 of our motion about having an individual Minister to take planning and co-ordination responsibility for winter resilience planning.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas moved the Plaid Cymru amendment. I do not think that there was any real need for this amendment, Rhodri. I would have thought that any planning would ordinarily encompass working with local authorities. What is more, it seems to—

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I am now a little confused because Byron Davies said earlier that he was accepting all of the amendments, which included the Plaid Cymru amendment. It would be nice to have clarification as to whether the Conservative group accepts the amendment or not.

Suzy Davies: I am happy to offer clarification on that. We will not be supporting your amendment, and I offer any apologies for the earlier indication. It was just an error. However, I would like to point out that you wanted to restrict your—
[*Interruption.*]

The Presiding Officer: Order.

Suzy Davies: May I continue, please? The main reason as to why we will not be supporting this amendment after all, is the restriction to the reference to local authorities. It fails to acknowledge the

destun pryder inni i gyd o hyd. Mae'n debyg bod y gaeaf a'r haf fel ei gilydd yn gyfrifol am fethiant y gwasanaeth ambiwlans i gyrraedd ei dargedau. Roedd yn llygad ei le wrth dynnu sylw at effaith yr oedi a achosir pan fo ambiwlansys yn methu â chyrraedd eu hamseroedd targed ar wasanaethau damweiniau ac achosion brys. Mae hynny'n sicr yn rhywbeth y bydd y ddau ohonom yn ymwybodol ohono yn etholaeth Gorllewin De Cymru, lle mae posibilrwydd y câi'r adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys eu canoli.

Ei sylw olaf oedd bod tasg gynllunio enfawr i'w gwneud o ran gwrthsefyll y gaeaf, ac ni chredaf y byddai neb yn anghytuno â hynny. Mae hyn yn amlygu pwynt 4 o'n cynnig i sicrhau bod Gweinidog unigol yn gyfrifol am gynllunio a chydgyssylltu gwaith cynllunio i wrthsefyll y gaeaf.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas a gynigiodd welliant Plaid Cymru. Ni chredaf fod gwir angen y gwelliant hwn, Rhodri. Byddwn wedi meddwl y byddai unrhyw waith cynllunio fel arfer yn cynnwys gweithio gydag awdurdodau lleol. Yn fwy na hynny, ymddengys—

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Rwy'n drysu ychydig yn awr am fod Byron Davies wedi dweud yn gynharach ei fod yn derbyn pob gwelliant, a oedd yn cynnwys gwelliant Plaid Cymru. Byddai'n braf cael eglurhad ynghylch a yw'r grŵp Ceidwadol yn derbyn y gwelliant ai peidio.

Suzy Davies: Rwy'n fwy na pharod i roi eglurhad am hynny. Ni fyddwn yn cefnogi eich gwelliant, ac ymddiheuraf am yr awgrym cynharach. Camgymeriad ydoedd. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn nodi eich bod am gyfyngu'ch—[*Torri ar draws.*]

Y Llywydd: Trefn.

Suzy Davies: A gaf fi barhau, os gwelwch yn dda? Y prif reswm pam na fyddwn yn cefnogi'r gwelliant hwn wedi'r cyfan, yw'r cyfyngiad ar y cyfeiriad at awdurdodau lleol. Mae'n methu â chydabod rôl gynorthwyol

serious support role—and important role in any future planning—of third-party organisations, such as Help the Aged, which offers befriending services and actual practical support to people in their homes during times of difficult weather. It also excludes the opportunity that Antoinette Sandbach referred to about farmers helping to alleviate the problem with access across rural roads.

Rhodri also mentioned that there was nothing new to say in this debate. On that point, perhaps I should ask why you did not actually add anything to what Byron Davies had said. Perhaps we could have expected something new from you on that.

Darren Millar referred to the health service, perhaps unsurprisingly. There is no doubt that the financial cuts to the NHS do cause pressure problems when it comes to dealing with unplanned emergencies. Ambulance response times are sliding down the scale. It seems that we are the poorest responders in the UK. I wish to remind the Minister of one serious point regarding ambulances: some time ago in my own area, the core responder role, which is very important in rural areas, was slashed in the Gower peninsula so that resources could be concentrated in the town centres where it is easier to meet the eight-minute response time. There was a pretty swift roll-back from that position. Bearing in mind what other Members have said about pressures in rural areas, I hope that there will be no diminution in ambulance accessibility to rural areas.

Jenny Rathbone, thank you for reminding us that the UK coalition Government is working hard on dealing with energy prices. It is good to see a Government acting proactively on what matters to people. You were also right to draw attention to prevention and to the limitations of the Welsh Government policy on helping people in fuel poverty. That is not an easy nut to crack. We all accept that. I am pleased that you invited innovative thinking on this issue and that you drew attention to the winter benefits for older people, which will remain in place under the coalition

sylweddol—a rôl bwysig mewn unrhyw waith cynllunio yn y dyfodol—sefydliadau trydydd parti, megis Help the Aged, sy'n cynnig gwasanaethau cyfeillio a chymorth ymarferol gwirioneddol i bobl yn eu cartrefi yn ystod cyfnodau o dywydd garw. Nid yw'n cynnwys ychwaith y cyfle y cyfeiriodd Antoinette Sandbach ato i ffermwyr helpu i liniaru'r broblem o ran mynediad ar draws ffyrdd gwledig.

Soniodd Rhodri hefyd nad oedd dim byd newydd i'w ddweud yn y ddadl hon. O ran y pwynt hwnnw, efallai y dylwn ofyn pam na wnaethoch ychwanegu unrhyw beth mewn gwirionedd at yr hyn a ddywedodd Byron Davies. Efallai y gallem fod wedi disgwyl rhywbeth newydd gennych ar hynny.

Cyfeiriodd Darren Millar at y gwasanaeth iechyd, nad yw'n syndod o bosibl. Nid oes amheuaeth nad yw'r toriadau ariannol i'r GIG yn achosi problemau pwysau o ran ymdrin ag argyfyngau annisgwyl. Mae amseroedd ymateb ambiwlansys yn dirywio o hyd. Ymddengys mai ni yw'r ymatebwyr gwaethaf yn y DU. Hoffwn atgoffa'r Gweinidog o un pwynt difrifol ynghylch ambiwlansys: beth amser yn ôl yn fy ardal fy hun, cafpdd rôl ur ymatebwyr craidd, sy'n bwysig iawn mewn ardaloedd gwledig, ym mhenhyn Gŵyr ei chwtogi'n sylweddol er mwyn canolbwyntio adnoddau yng nghanol trefi lle mae'n haws cyflawni'r targed o ymateb o fewn wyth munud. Cafodd y sefyllfa honno ei gwrthdroi'n eithaf buan. O gofio'r hyn a ddywedodd Aelodau eraill ynglŷn â phwysau mewn ardaloedd gwledig, gobeithiaf na fydd unrhyw leihad o ran hygyrchedd ambiwlansys i ardaloedd gwledig.

Jenny Rathbone, diolch ichi am ein hatgoffa bod Llywodraeth glymblaid y DU yn gweithio'n galed i ymdrin â phrisiau ynni. Mae'n braf gweld Llywodraeth yn mynd ati i weithredu ar yr hyn sy'n bwysig i bobl. Roeddech hefyd yn iawn i dynnu sylw at atal ac at gyfyngiadau polisi Llywodraeth Cymru i helpu pobl mewn tlodi tanwydd. Nid yw hynny'n broblem hawdd ei datrys. Rydym i gyd yn derbyn hynny. Rwy'n falch ichi ofyn am syniadau arloesol ar y mater hwn, ac ichi dynnu sylw at fudd-daliadau'r gaeaf i bobl hŷn, a fydd yn parhau o dan y Llywodraeth

Government, as confirmed by Mark Isherwood, along with other mitigating schemes in England that are not mirrored in Wales.

Sandy Mewies: Do you think that looking at prevention could also include asking your colleagues in Westminster to stop throwing people on the streets and making them homeless? All the things that you are talking about now will mean nothing when we see the price that they are paying.

Suzu Davies: I do not think that the Member can seriously expect me to give an answer to that question when the past 15 years has seen her own party in Government here and at the UK level. That has resulted in the problems that we are facing, which will not be resolved by benefit reform. If you had dealt with benefit reform earlier, perhaps we would not be facing the things that you are complaining about now.

Antoinette, you talked about the off-grid fuel supply and how serious the situation is with regard to pot-hole repairs. I know that that probably sounds like a trivial issue to many people in the Chamber but if the roads are in a bad state of repair now in certain parts of Wales, what will they be like after another serious winter and how difficult will it be to meet the financial challenges of dealing with those problems at that stage? Importantly, she has referred to the double squeeze on Welsh farmers and the failure to provide them with access to dedicated less-favoured-area support. I raise that because it is a good example of the need for a cross-portfolio response to this issue and why it is important to have one cabinet voice to co-ordinate the response to winter pressures. People need to know, whatever the cause of their winter problem, where they need to go as a first port of call for their answer.

Mark Isherwood referred to the low switch rate, which is going to help people if they have the opportunity to deal with what Jenny Rathbone raised on prevention. If people can take responsibility for lowering their own bills, they should do so. We must not take our eye off the ball with regard to fuel poverty.

glymblaid, fel y cadarnhawyd gan Mark Isherwood, ynghyd â chynlluniau lliniarol eraill yn Lloegr nad ydynt yn cael eu hefelychu yng Nghymru.

Sandy Mewies: A gredwch y gallai ystyriaeth o atal hefyd gynnwys gofyn i'ch cyd-Aelodau yn San Steffan roi'r gorau i daflu pobl ar y stryd a'u gwneud yn ddigartref? Bydd yr holl bethau yr ydych yn sôn amdanynt yn awr yn golygu dim pan welwn y pris y maent yn ei dalu.

Suzu Davies: Ni chredaf y gall yr Aelod o ddifrif ddisgwyl imi roi ateb i'r cwestiwn hwnnw a'i phlaid hithau wedi bod mewn grym yma ac ar lefel y DU am y 15 mlynedd diwethaf. Dyna sydd wedi arwain at y problemau yr ydym yn eu hwynebu, na fyddant yn cael eu datrys trwy ddiwygio'r drefn budd-daliadau. Pe baech wedi mynd ati i ddiwygio'r drefn budd-daliadau yn gynharach, efallai na fyddem yn wynebu'r pethau yr ydych yn cwyno yn eu cylch yn awr.

Antoinette, bu ichi sôn am gyflenwadau o danwydd oddi ar y grid a pha mor ddifrifol yw'r sefyllfa o ran atgyweirio tyllau yn y ffordd. Gwn fod hynny'n swnio fel mater dibwys i lawer o bobl yn y Siambr yn ôl pob tebyg, ond os yw'r ffyrdd mewn cyflwr gwael erbyn hyn mewn rhai rhannau o Gymru, beth fydd eu cyflwr ar ôl gaeaf garw arall a pha mor anodd fydd ateb yr heriau ariannol i ymdrin â'r problemau hynny bryd hynny? Yn bwysig ddigon, mae wedi cyfeirio at y wasgfa ddwbl ar ffermwyr Cymru a'r methiant i sicrhau bod cymorth ardaloedd llai ffafriol penodol ar gael iddynt. Codaf hynny am ei bod yn enghraifft dda o'r angen am ymateb trawsbortffolio i'r mater hwn a pham ei bod yn bwysig cael un llais yn y cabinet i gydgyssylltu'r ymateb i bwysau'r gaeaf. Mae angen i bobl wybod, beth bynnag fo achos eu problem yn ystod y gaeaf, i ble mae angen iddynt droi yn y lle cyntaf i gael ateb.

Cyfeiriodd Mark Isherwood at y gyfradd isel o ran newid cyflenwyr, a fydd yn helpu pobl os cânt gyfle i ymdrin â'r hyn a gododd Jenny Rathbone o ran atal. Os gall pobl gymryd cyfrifoldeb dros leihau eu biliau eu hunain, dylent wneud hynny. Rhaid inni beidio â cholli golwg ar dlodi tanwydd. Fel y

As he mentioned, rural fuel poverty is more closely aligned with the state of housing stock and remoteness than areas of urban deprivation, if that is an appropriate way of putting it. Any fuel poverty strategy must take both those elements into account because the responses to the demands of both types of fuel poverty are different. I would also like to thank him for reminding us all of the value of neighbourliness. For some, good neighbours are a lifeline.

Minister, you had great fun in comparing the uptake of the flu jab with the PCC elections. I am sure that that is a great comfort to people in this Chamber and elsewhere. You had great fun in talking about tweeting, but I had hoped for some serious reassurance from you regarding how people receiving care at home will be prioritised in any future planning. With a big emphasis on care taking place in people's homes, rather than in hospitals, I really need you to take on board the number of stories that we have heard about people who receive their care at home not getting that care because carers were unable to get 4x4 vehicles to get to them, particularly in remote areas. I was also hoping to hear something about 4x4 ambulances. I hear that the number of 4x4 ambulances in the whole of the service is limited. In mid and west Wales, there are 17 new firefighting appliances with 4x4 capabilities. Surely, we should be looking at something similar for ambulances.

I can see that I am running out of time, so I would just like to say 'thank you' to everyone once again. We should not forget the importance of this subject, because regardless of which portfolio interests us or what kind of postbag we have from our constituents, the issue of winter resilience applies across the piece, and we need one person whom people can come to when they have problems.

The Presiding Officer: The proposal is to agree the motion without amendment. Are

soniodd, mewn ardaloedd gwledig mae cysylltiad agosach rhwng tlodi tanwydd a chyflwr y stoc dai a natur anghysbell yr ardaloedd nag yn achos ardaloedd o amddifadedd trefol, os yw hynny'n ffordd briodol o fynegi hynny. Rhaid i unrhyw strategaeth tlodi tanwydd gwmpasu'r ddwy elfen hynny am fod yr ymatebion i ofynion y ddau fath o dlodi tanwydd yn wahanol. Hoffwn hefyd ddiolch iddo am ein hatgoffa ni i gyd o werth bod yn gymydog da. I rai, mae cymydog da yn werth y byd.

Weinidog, cawsom dipyn o hwyl wrth gymharu nifer y bobl sy'n cael brechiad rhag y fflw ag etholiadau'r Comisiynwyr Heddlu a Throseddu. Rwy'n siŵr bod hynny'n gysur mawr i bobl yn y Siambr hon ac mewn mannau eraill. Cawsoch dipyn o hwyl wrth sôn am drydar, ond roeddwn innau wedi gobeithio cael rhyw sicrwydd pendant gennych ynghylch sut y caiff pobl sy'n derbyn gofal yn y cartref eu blaenoriaethu mewn unrhyw waith cynllunio yn y dyfodol. Gyda phwyslais mawr ar ofal yng nghartrefi pobl, yn hytrach nag mewn ysbytai, mae gwir angen ichi ystyried y straeon yr ydym wedi'u clywed am bobl sy'n derbyn eu gofal yn y cartref nad ydynt yn cael y gofal hwnnw am na allai gofalywyr gael gafaél ar gerbydau gyriant pedair olwyn i'w cyrraedd, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd anghysbell. Roeddwn hefyd yn gobeithio clywed rhywbeth am ambiwlansys gyriant pedair olwyn. Rwy'n clywed nad oes llawer o ambiwlansys gyriant pedair olwyn yn y gwasanaeth cyfan. Yn y canolbarth a'r gorllewin, mae 17 o gerbydau diffodd tân newydd sydd â gyriant pedair olwyn. Yn sicr, dylem edrych ar rywbeth tebyg ar gyfer ambiwlansys.

Gallaf weld bod fy amser yn dod i ben, felly hoffwn ddweud 'diolch yn fawr' i bawb unwaith eto. Ni ddylem anghofio pwysigrwydd y pwnc hwn, oherwydd ni waeth pa bortffolio sydd o ddiddordeb inni na pha fath o sach bost a gawn gan ein hetholwyr, mae materion gwrthsefyll y gaef yn berthnasol drwy'r cyfan, ac mae angen inni gael un person y gall pobl droi ato pan fyddant yn cael problemau.

Y Llywydd: Y cynnig yw y dylid derbyn y cynnig heb ei ddiwygio. A oes

there any objections? I see that there are, and so all voting on this item is postponed until voting time.

gwrthwynebiad? Gwelaf fod gwrthwynebiad, felly caiff y pleidleisio i gyd ar yr eitem hon ei ohirio tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.

*Gohiriwyd y pleidleisio tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.
Voting deferred until voting time.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd (David Melding) i'r Gadair am 3.55 p.m.
The Deputy Presiding Officer (David Melding) took the Chair at 3.55 p.m.*

Dadl Plaid Cymru Plaid Cymru Debate

Y Gyllideb Ewropeaidd The European Budget

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Rwyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 5, 6 a 7 yn enw William Graham a gwelliannau 2, 3 a 4 yn enw Aled Roberts.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have selected amendments 1, 5, 6 and 7 in the name of William Graham, and amendments 2, 3 and 4 in the name of Aled Roberts.

Cynnig NDM5099 Jocelyn Davies

Motion NDM5099 Jocelyn Davies

Cynnig bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales:

1. Yn cydnabod pwysigrwydd mawr cyllideb yr Undeb Ewropeaidd ar gyfer dyfodol y Polisi Amaethyddol Cyffredin a chronfeydd rhanbarthol; a

1. Recognises the vital importance of the budget of the European Union for the future of the Common Agricultural Policy and regional funds; and

2. Yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i gyflwyno sylwadau i Lywodraeth y DU i beidio â hybu na chytuno ar unrhyw ostyngiad yn y gyllideb Ewropeaidd a fydd yn cael effaith andwyol ar Gymru a'n gallu i gryfhau economi Cymru.

2. Calls on the Welsh Government to make representations to the UK Government not to promote or agree to any reduction in the European budget which will have an adverse impact on Wales and on our ability to strengthen the Welsh economy.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Cynigiaf y cynnig.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I move the motion.

Rwy'n credu bod y ddadl hon yn amserol ac yn eithriadol o bwysig. Mae'n bwysig iawn bod Cymru yn glir ynglŷn â'i rôl fel gwlad fechan o fewn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd. Nid undeb o aelod-wladwriaethau yn unig yw'r Undeb Ewropeaidd, ond undeb o wledydd a rhanbarthau ledled Ewrop. Mae'r cysylltiadau rhwng y gwledydd bychain hynny a'r rhanbarthau yn eithriadol o bwysig hefyd.

I think this debate is timely, and extremely important. It is very important that Wales is clear about its role as a small country within the European Union. The EU is a union not only of member states, but of countries and regions across Europe. The links between those small countries and the regions are extremely important as well.

Os edrychwn ar y sefyllfa yng nghyd-destun y byd fel y mae, mae ansicrwydd a

If we look at the situation in the global context as it stands, there is uncertainty and

bygythiadau potensial yn bodoli yn ein byd ni, ac mae sefyllfa'r byd yn hynod o fregus ar sawl lefel ar hyn o bryd. Rwy'n gwbl argyhoeddedig mai yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd y mae lle Cymru er mwyn sicrhau sefydlogrwydd y byd a wynebu rhai o'r cwestiynau mawr sy'n ein bygwth ni, nid yn lleiaf sut i ddiogelu ein hamgylchedd a sicrhau ei sefydlogrwydd.

Mae'r ddadl hon yn ymwneud yn benodol â'r ffaith bod Cymru yn elwa o fod yn rhan o Ewrop, oherwydd mae'r sefyllfa yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd yn un ddi-ddorol iawn. Ar y naill law, mae aelod-wladwriaethau sydd fel petaent yn poeni am y cyfraniad a wnânt i'r gyllideb Ewropeaidd, ac, ar y llall, mae gwledydd bach a rhanbarthau sy'n bodoli ar lefel is-aelod-wladwriaeth sy'n sylweddoli cymaint y maent yn ei dderbyn oddi wrth y gyllideb Ewropeaidd, ac mae Cymru yn y sefyllfa honno. Yn syml ddigon, mae pob unigolyn yng Nghymru yn cyfrannu €195 i'r gyllideb ac yn derbyn €243. Hynny yw, mae elw o tua £40 y pen o'i gymharu â'r hyn a gyfrannwn at y gyllideb Ewropeaidd. Mae'r cyfraniadau hyn wedi'u gosod mewn nifer o gronfeydd gwahanol. Rydym yn tueddu, oherwydd inni dderbyn arian o'r cronfeydd strwythurol dros y degawd diwethaf a rhagor, i feddwl am y gyllideb Ewropeaidd fel petai ddim ond yn ymwneud â chronfeydd strwythurol. Ond mae llawer iawn mwy na hynny i'w gydnabod yng nghyd-destun yr hyn a dderbyniwn, ac mae'n ymwneud â sefydlogrwydd ein hardaloedd gwledig a'r cyfraniadau a wneir i feysydd fel addysg ac iechyd. Yn wir, mae'n cyffwrdd â phob agwedd ar ein bywydau.

Mae'r ddadl hon yn amserol hefyd oherwydd, yr wythnos nesaf, bydd arweinyddion yr aelod-wladwriaethau yn ymgasglu ym Mrwsel i geisio cytuno ar y gyllideb. Mae dadl fawr yn mynd rhagddi ym Mrwsel ar hyn o bryd rhwng y bobl hynny sy'n gosod eu hunain yng ngwersyll cyfeillion cydlyniant a'r bobl hynny sy'n gosod eu hunain yng ngwersyll cyfeillion gwario yn well. Mae carfan y rheini sy'n disgrifio'u hunain fel cyfeillion gwario yn well am leihau cyfraniad aelod-wladwriaethau a sicrhau bod ad-daliadau o'r gyllideb yn cael eu diogelu. Dyma fydd dadl David Cameron. Bydd yntau'n mynd i Frwsel yr wythnos

potential threats in the world, and the global situation is very fragile on several levels at the moment. I am convinced that Wales's place is within the European Union in order to secure stability in the world and face the big questions that threaten us, not least how we safeguard the environment and how we secure its stability.

This debate specifically relates to the fact that Wales benefits from being a part of Europe, because the situation in the European Union is very interesting. On the one hand, there are member states that seem to be concerned about the contribution they make to the EU budget, and, on the other, there are smaller countries and regions that exist on a sub-member-state level that realise how much they receive from the EU budget, and Wales is in that position. Quite simply, every individual in Wales contributes €195 to the budget and receives €243. That is, there is a per capita difference of about £40 in the benefit that we receive as compared with what we contribute to the EU budget. These contributions are directed to several different funds. We tend, because we have received funding from the structural funds over the last decade or so, to think of the EU budget as though it consisted solely of the structural funds. However, there is much more that we should acknowledge in the context of what we receive, and it is to do with the stability of our rural areas and the contributions that are made to areas such as health and education. Indeed, it touches on every aspect of our lives.

This debate is timely also because next week the leaders of the member states will gather in Brussels to try to agree the budget. There is currently a big debate in Brussels between those who place themselves in the friends of convergence camp and those who place themselves in the better spending camp. Those who describe themselves as being in the better spending camp are aiming to reduce the contribution of member states and ensure that rebates from the European Union budget are safeguarded. That will be the case made by David Cameron. He will go to Brussels next week to make the case for significant cuts to the budget and ensuring

nesaf i ddadlau'r achos dros dorri'r gyllideb yn sylweddol a sicrhau bod yr ad-daliad yn cael ei ddiogelu Ni fydd hynny o unrhyw fudd o gwbl i Gymru. Byddwn ar ein colled os mai hynny sy'n digwydd, ac effeithir yn andwyol ar elfennau o fywyd Cymru.

4.00 p.m.

Felly, rwy'n mawr obeithio ac yn hyderus y cawn ni, gan y Dirprwy Weinidog sy'n gyfrifol, ddatganiad cryf a phendant y bydd Llywodraeth Cymru yn gweld sefyllfa Cymru yn glir iawn o fewn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd. Y peth pwysig yw ein bod yn peidio â sôn am dorri'r cyfraniad na diogelu'r ad-daliad, ond ein bod yn sôn am sut yn union y gallwn sicrhau bod yr hyn a nodir yng ngobeithion yr Undeb Ewropeaidd ar gyfer 2020 yn cael ei weithredu ar lawr gwlad yng Nghymru a bod y nodau hynny'n cael eu cyflawni.

Wythnos nesaf, byddaf ym Mrwsel yn trafod y datganiad rwy'n ei gyflwyno i Bwyllgor y Rhanbarthau—bydd yn mynd yn gyntaf i'r pwyllgor ad hoc ar y gyllideb—sy'n sôn am y synergedd rhwng y gyllideb Ewropeaidd, cyllideb yr aelod-wladwriaethau a'r gweithgaredd sy'n bodoli o dan lefel yr aelod-wladwriaeth, yn is-wladwriaethol. Wrth gwrs, yr hyn sy'n ganolog i hyn oll yw bod y rhan fwyaf o'r prosiectau hynny yn ymwneud â chyllidebau ar lefel is-wladwriaethol, ond ychydig iawn o sylw a roddir i hynny.

Rwy'n mawr obeithio y bydd pawb—yn drawsbleidiol—yn gallu cefnogi'r cynnig hwn. Gobeithio na fydd angen inni drafod y gwelliannau, i fod yn berffaith onest, na phleidleisio arnynt, gan nad ydynt yn cydfynd ag ysbryd y cynnig hwn. Rydym yn sôn am fuddiannau Cymru a lle y dylai Cymru leoli ei hunan o fewn Ewrop a'r byd. Mae'r gwelliannau, sy'n ceisio gwneud pwyntiau gwleidyddol ac sy'n beirniadu'r Llywodraeth am sut y mae wedi defnyddio'r arian, yn amherthnasol i'r ddadl hon. Yr hyn sydd angen inni ei ofyn y prynhawn yma yw, 'Beth sydd orau i Gymru?' Rhaid gofyn sut y gallwn sicrhau bod buddiannau Cymru yn cael eu diogelu yn y drafodaeth bwysig sy'n mynd rhagddi yn Ewrop ar hyn o bryd ynghylch cyllideb yr Undeb Ewropeaidd.

that the rebate is safeguarded. That will be of no benefit whatsoever to Wales. We will lose out if that is what happens, and there will be elements of Welsh life that are detrimentally affected.

Therefore, I sincerely hope and am confident that the Deputy Minister responsible for this will give us a clear and definite statement that the Welsh Government sees the Welsh situation clearly within the European Union. The important thing is that we do not start to talk about cutting contributions or about safeguarding the rebate, but that we discuss exactly how we ensure that what is noted in the aspirations of the European Union for 2020 are implemented at grass-roots level in Wales and that the aims are achieved.

Next week, I will be in Brussels discussing the statement that I am to make to the Committee of the Regions—it will go first to the ad hoc committee on the budget—talking about the synergies between the European budget, the member-state budget and the activities that are ongoing at the sub-member-state level. Of course, what is central to all this is that most of those projects relate to budgets at a sub-member-state level, but very little attention is paid to that.

I very much hope that everyone—on a cross-party basis—is able to support this motion. I hope that we will not need to discuss the amendments, to be perfectly honest, and that we will not need to vote on them, as they do not accord with the spirit of the motion. We are talking of the interests of Wales and where Wales should position itself within Europe and the world. The amendments, which try to make political points and criticise the Government about how it has used the money, are irrelevant to this debate. What we need to ask this afternoon is 'What is best for Wales?' We must ask how we can ensure that Wales's interests are safeguarded within the important discussion that is ongoing in Europe at present on the European Union's budget.

Gwelliant 1—William Graham

Ym mhwynt 2, dileu popeth ar ôl 'Lywodraeth y DU' a rhoi yn ei le 'i negodi cyllideb gadarn ac effeithlon i ddiwallu anghenion ariannol Cymru, gan sicrhau economi sefydlog sy'n cefnogi cyllid y Polisi Amaethyddol Cyffredin a chyllid rhanbarthol.'

Gwelliant 5—William Graham

Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

Yn croesawu ymrwymiad Llywodraeth y DU i rewi cyllideb yr Undeb Ewropeaidd ar lefel gynaliadwy a chyflawni'r fargen orau i drethdalwyr Cymru.

Gwelliant 6—William Graham

Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

Yn credu mai'r ffordd orau y caiff buddiannau Cymru eu gwasanaethu mewn trafodaethau ar gyllideb yr Undeb Ewropeaidd yw trwy fod yn aelod o'r Deyrnas Unedig.

Gwelliant 7—William Graham

Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

Yn annog Llywodraeth Cymru i wneud defnydd llawn o gronfeydd strwythurol y dyfodol i ddatblygu economi gref a chynaliadwy yng Nghymru.

Byron Davies: I move amendments 1, 5, 6 and 7 in the name of William Graham.

Initially, I found myself in agreement with some of the things that Rhodri Glyn was saying in his opening remarks, but it will not come as any great surprise to hear that my support dwindled thereafter. In this age of austerity, I would have thought that all parties in this Chamber would have supported Prime Minister David Cameron's calls to freeze the European budget. No-one can doubt the importance of the common agricultural policy and regional funds to Wales—I am

Amendment 1—William Graham

In point 2 delete all after 'UK Government' and replace with 'to negotiate a sound and efficient budget to meet the fiscal needs of Wales, ensuring a stable economy that supports CAP and regional funding.'

Amendment 5—William Graham

Add as new point at end of motion:

Welcomes the UK Government's commitment to freeze the European Union budget at a sustainable level and deliver the best deal for Welsh taxpayers.

Amendment 6—William Graham

Add as new point at end of motion:

Welcomes the UK Government's commitment to freeze the European Union budget at a sustainable level and deliver the best deal for Welsh taxpayers.

Amendment 7—William Graham

Add as new point at end of motion:

Urges the Welsh Government to make full use of future structural funds to develop a strong and sustainable Welsh economy.

Byron Davies: Cynigiau welliannau 1, 5, 6 a 7 yn enw William Graham.

I ddechrau, cefais fy hun yn cytuno â rhai o'r pethau a ddywedodd Rhodri Glyn yn ei sylwadau agoriadol, ond ni fydd yn syndod mawr i neb glywed i'm cefnogaeth bylu ar ôl hynny. Yn yr oes hon o galedi, byddwn wedi meddwl y byddai pob plaid yn y Siambr hon wedi cefnogi galwadau'r Prif Weinidog, David Cameron, i rewi'r gyllideb Ewropeaidd. Ni all neb amau pwysigrwydd y polisi amaethyddol cyffredin na'r cronfeydd rhanbarthol i Gymru—rwy'n siŵr ein bod ni i

sure that we all share a determination to get the best possible deal for Wales—but that will not be achieved by seeking to make political points. The UK Government is in a strong position to speak up for Wales and to protect not only CAP and regional funds, but also value for money for taxpayers across the nation.

Let us put the arrogance of the EU Commission's demands for a whopping budget increase for 2014-20, at a time when national Governments are being forced to slash expenditure, into context. The last time that the European Court of Auditors approved the EU's budget, John Major was Prime Minister and the late John Smith led the Labour Party. Yet, no-one seems to care—Plaid Cymru or anyone else who supports its rhetoric—about value for money for Welsh taxpayers or that the EU cannot pass a basic audit of its own accounts.

The UK Government's position on challenging the EU Commission on its budget and priorities is the right thing to do for Britain and for Wales. Let us not forget that the EU Commission has ignored British requests to examine a range of possible cuts in its administrative spending, claiming that its staff was too busy. Budget savings can be made without going anywhere near CAP, and, in these circumstances, David Cameron is right to demand a spending freeze. The Welsh Conservatives support him in his promise to veto any settlement that is not in the British interest.

I am extremely proud to represent a party that stands up to Europe—

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: When every individual in Wales contributes €195 to the budget and receives €243 back, how are Welsh interests defended by trying to cut that budget?

Byron Davies: To a degree, I have to accept what you say there. However, the fact is that this affects the UK as a whole. The UK is the negotiator. I agree with what David Cameron is doing to freeze this, otherwise there will be no end to this demand for money from the UK. I support David Cameron, as I said

gyd yn rhannu penderfyniad i sicrhau'r fargen orau bosibl i Gymru—ond ni fydd hynny'n cael ei gyflawni drwy geisio gwneud pwyntiau gwleidyddol. Mae Llywodraeth y DU mewn sefyllfa gref i siarad dros Gymru a diogelu nid yn unig arian PAC a'r cronfeydd rhanbarthol, ond hefyd werth am arian i drethdalwyr drwy'r wlad i gyd.

Gadewch inni roi haerllugrwydd Comisiwn yr UE i ofyn am gynnydd mawr yn y gyllideb ar gyfer 2014-20, ar adeg pan fo'n rhaid i Lywodraethau cenedlaethol dorri gwariant, yn ei gyd-destun. Y tro diwethaf y cymeradwyodd Llys Archwilwyr Ewrop gyllideb yr UE, John Major oedd y Prif Weinidog a'r diweddar John Smith oedd arweinydd y Blaid Lafur. Ac eto, ymddengys nad oes neb yn malio dim—Plaid Cymru nac unrhyw un arall sy'n cefnogi ei rhethreg—am werth am arian i drethdalwyr Cymru na'r ffaith na all yr UE fodloni archwiliad sylfaenol o'i chyfrifon ei hun.

Wrth herio Comisiwn yr UE am ei gyllideb a'i flaenoriaethau, mae Llywodraeth y DU yn gwneud y peth iawn i Brydain ac i Gymru. Peidied neb ag anghofio bod Comisiwn yr UE wedi anwybyddu ceisiadau Prydain i ystyried nifer o doriadau posibl yn ei wariant gweinyddol, gan honni bod ei staff yn rhy brysur. Gellir gwneud arbedion yn y gyllideb heb fynd yn agos at PAC, ac, o dan yr amgylchiadau hyn, mae David Cameron yn llygad ei le i ofyn am i wariant gael ei rewi. Mae'r Ceidwadwyr Cymreig yn ei gefnogi wrth iddo addo rhoi fetu ar unrhyw setliad nad yw er budd Prydain.

Rwy'n hynod falch o gynrychioli plaid sy'n herio Ewrop—

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Pan fydd pob unigolyn yng Nghymru yn cyfrannu €195 i'r gyllideb ac yn cael €243 yn ôl, sut mae buddiannau Cymru yn cael eu hamddiffyn drwy geisio torri'r gyllideb honno?

Byron Davies: I ryw raddau, rhaid imi dderbyn yr hyn a ddywedwch o ran hynny. Fodd bynnag, y ffaith amdani yw bod hyn yn effeithio ar y DU gyfan. Y DU sy'n cyd-drafod. Cytunaf â'r hyn y mae David Cameron yn ei wneud i rewi'r gyllideb hon, fel arall ni fydd terfyn ar y galw hwn am

earlier. I am proud to represent a party that stands up to Europe, in stark contrast to previous Labour Governments, which proved, in their time in Government in Westminster, that our sovereignty is never safe. The Labour Party stood on a platform in 2005 that included a pledge to give the Welsh people a referendum on the Lisbon treaty, but, two years later, it reneged on that key pledge. That, alongside giving away much of our rebate, is, frankly, scandalous.

arian oddi wrth y DU. Cefnogaf David Cameron, fel y dywedais yn gynharach. Rwy'n falch o gynrychioli plaid sy'n herio Ewrop, a hynny mewn gwrthgyferbyniad llwyr i Lywodraethau Llafur blaenorol, sydd wedi profi, yn ystod eu cyfnod mewn grym yn San Steffan, nad yw ein sofraniaeth fyth yn ddiogel. Yn etholiadau 2005 rhoddodd y Plaid Lafur addewid i roi refferendwm ar gytuniad Lisbon i bobl Cymru, ond, ddwy flynedd yn ddiweddarach, torrodd yr addewid allweddol hwnnw. Mae hynny, ochr yn ochr ag ildio cymaint o'n had-daliad, yn warthus, a dweud y gwir.

In closing, I want to emphasise amendment 7. Plaid Cymru would do far better tabling motions that really matter, such as urging the Welsh Government to make full use of future structural funds to develop a strong and sustainable Welsh economy. Making full use of regional funds was something that Plaid Cymru failed to do when it was in Government with Labour. I am still to be convinced that we are yet on the right track. We support all the amendments tabled in this motion, and I commend the amendments tabled in the name of William Graham.

Wrth gloi, hoffwn bwysleisio gwelliant 7. Byddai'n llawer gwell pe bai Plaid Cymru yn cyflwyno cynigion sydd o wir bwys, megis annog Llywodraeth Cymru i wneud defnydd llawn o'r cronfeydd strwythurol yn y dyfodol i ddatblygu economi gref a chynaliadwy yng Nghymru. Methododd Plaid Cymru â gwneud defnydd llawn o gronfeydd rhanbarthol pan oedd mewn grym gyda Llafur. Rwy'n dal heb fy argyhoeddi ein bod eto ar y trywydd cywir. Cefnogwn yr holl welliannau a gyflwynwyd yn y cynnig hwn, a chymeradwyaf y gwelliannau a gyflwynwyd yn enw William Graham.

Gwelliant 2—Aled Roberts

Amendment 2—Aled Roberts

Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

Add as a new point at the end of motion:

Yn gresynu bod Cymru, er ei bod wedi cael mwy na £6 biliwn mewn cyllid Undeb Ewropeaidd rhwng 2000 a 2008, wedi mynd yn gymharol dlotach ac yn dal i fod yn un o'r rhanbarthau tlotaf yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd.

Regrets that despite receiving more than £6bn in European Union funding between 2000 and 2008, Wales has become relatively poorer and is still one of the poorest regions in the European Union.

Gwelliant 3—Aled Roberts

Amendment 3—Aled Roberts

Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

Add as a new point at the end of motion:

Yn gresynu bod Llywodraeth Cymru wedi methu â defnyddio cyllid yr Undeb Ewropeaidd er budd pobl Cymru.

Regrets that the Welsh Government has failed to utilise European Union funding to the benefit of the people of Wales.

Gwelliant 4—Aled Roberts

Amendment 4—Aled Roberts

Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

Add as a new point at the end of motion:

Yn nodi bod y trafodaethau ar y cylch nesaf o Bolisi Amaethyddol Cyffredin yr Undeb Ewropeaidd mewn cyfnod allweddol ac yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i ddefnyddio'i dylanwad i sicrhau bod budd cenedlaethol hirdymor, yn hytrach na chyfleustra gwleidyddol tymor byr, yn pennu'r agwedd at gyllideb gyffredinol yr Undeb Ewropeaidd.

Eluned Parrott: I move amendments 2, 3 and 4 in the name of Aled Roberts.

I am sure that it is a source of real disappointment to Members that, in terms of economic development, Wales still lags behind many parts of Europe and significantly behind the EU average. Plaid Cymru, with its fingerprints all over this last round of spending, may not want to hear it, but the facts are indisputable. GDP is stubbornly low, relative to our neighbours. Indicators such as young unemployment are high. The impact of EU funds in many places is hard to see. Relative to the rest of Europe, Wales is poor, and getting poorer.

When the then First Minister, Rhodri Morgan, said of the first round,

'this is our big chance to bring the Welsh standard of living up to the European average',

I am sure that he imagined that such a big injection of cash would transform the Welsh economy. However, sadly, as we know, that has not yet happened. After £6 billion of European funding—£2,000 for every man, woman and child—our position has got worse. We now face yet another round of structural funds, and I applaud the Deputy Minister's stated intention that this really must be the very last time.

I am sure that, in response to this debate, the Deputy Minister will point to some of the success stories, as he sees them. Perhaps he will tell us about some of the job creation schemes and training programmes supported by EU funds and the value of those programmes to the participants. I will not go into those here—we have rehearsed those arguments many times in the past—but time

Notes that the negotiations on the next round of the European Union Common Agricultural Policy are at a critical phase and calls on the Welsh Government to use its influence to ensure that the long-term national interest, rather than short term political expediency, determines the approach to the overall European Union budget.

Eluned Parrott: Cynigiau welliannau 2, 3 a 4 yn enw Aled Roberts.

Rwy'n siŵr ei fod yn destun siom wirioneddol i'r Aelodau fod Cymru, o ran datblygu economaidd, yn dal ar ei hôl hi o'i chymharu â sawl rhan o Ewrop ac yn dipyn y tu ôl i gyfartaledd yr UE. Efallai na fydd Plaid Cymru, a'i holion bysedd i gyd ar y cylch diwethaf hwn o wariant, am glywed hyn, ond mae'r ffeithiau yn ddiamheuol. Mae CMC yn parhau i fod yn isel o'n cymharu â'n cymdogion. Mae dangosyddion megis diweithdra ieuencid yn uchel. Mae'n anodd gweld effaith cronfeydd yr UE mewn sawl man. O gymharu â gweddill Ewrop, mae Cymru yn dlawd, ac yn mynd yn dlotach.

Pan ddywedod y Prif Weinidog ar y pryd, Rhodri Morgan, am y cylch cyntaf,

Dyma ein cyfle mawr i sicrhau bod safon byw Cymru yn cyrraedd cyfartaledd Ewrop,

Rwy'n yn siŵr ei fod yn dychmygu y byddai chwistrelliad mawr o arian yn trawsnewid economi Cymru. Fodd bynnag, yn anffodus, fel y gwyddom, nid yw hynny wedi digwydd eto. Ar ôl £6 biliwn o arian Ewropeaidd—£2,000 ar gyfer pob dyn, dynes a phlentyn—mae ein sefyllfa wedi gwaethygu. Rydym bellach yn wynebu cylch arall eto o gronfeydd strwythurol, a chymeradwyaf fwriad datganedig y Dirprwy Weinidog fod yn rhaid mai hwn fydd y tro olaf un.

Rwy'n siŵr, mewn ymateb i'r ddadl hon, y bydd y Dirprwy Weinidog yn tynnu sylw at rai o'r llwyddiannau, yn ei olwg ef. Efallai y gwnaiff ddweud wrthym am rai o'r cynlluniau creu swyddi a rhaglenni hyfforddi a gefnogir gan gronfeydd yr UE a gwerth y rhaglenni hynny i'r cyfranogwyr. Nid wyf am fanylu ar y rheini yma—yr ydym wedi ailadrodd y dadleuon hynny sawl gwaith yn y

will tell whether they succeed in having a lasting impact. However, the depth and range of these schemes shows just how deeply reliant we have become, as a nation, on EU funds.

That being the case, the Deputy Minister must have been dismayed by the opportunistic and irresponsible actions of his party colleagues in Westminster in joining with the far right of the Conservative Party to demand a reduction in the EU's overall budget. That move was described by Margaret Hodge as 'hateful' and 'outrageous'. I should point out that the UK Government's position is not to ask for a cut; it is to ask for a freeze in the budget. When the Enterprise and Business Committee went to Brussels recently, that point was clearly understood.

David Rees: Will you take an intervention?

Eluned Parrott: No; I am afraid that I do not have time today.

However hard they had to hold their noses to go into the lobby for that particular vote, I am sure that the dyed-in-the-wool Eurosceptics in the room got over it and were, nevertheless, over the moon to have credence given to their separatist and anti-European agenda. Your colleagues in Westminster have done themselves no favours, but that, frankly, is their lookout. More to the point, they have done Wales no favours either. Any damage to the EU budget puts Wales's interests at risk. Whether through CAP or structural funds, our economy is now so intertwined with European funding that it could not survive without it.

CAP and the structural funds are such significant budgets that it would be nigh on impossible to cut the global EU budget without touching them. In that light, the actions of Labour in London can only be deeply damaging to Wales's interests, now and in the future. It is the scaffolding holding up the Welsh economy and removing it would have inevitable consequences.

gorffennol—ond amser a ddengys a ydynt yn llwyddo i gael effaith barhaol. Fodd bynnag, mae dyfnder ac amrywiaeth y cynlluniau hyn yn dangos pa mor ddibynnol ydym bellach, fel gwlad, ar gronfeydd yr UE.

Os felly, rhaid bod y Dirprwy Weinidog wedi cael ei siomi gan weithred fanteisgar ac anghyfrifol ei gyd-Aelodau Llafur yn San Steffan yn ymuno ag adain dde eithaf y Blaid Geidwadol i fynnu gostyngiad yng nghyfanswm cyllideb yr UE. Dywedodd Margaret Hodge fod yr ymgais hwnnw yn 'atgas' ac yn 'warthus'. Dylwn nodi nad yw Llywodraeth y DU yn gofyn am dorri'r gyllideb; gofyn am ei rhewi a wna. Pan aeth y Pwyllgor Menter a Busnes i Frwsel yn ddiweddar, deallwyd y pwynt hwnnw'n glir.

David Rees: A wnewch chi dderbyn ymyriad?

Eluned Parrott: Na; nid oes gennyf amser heddiw, mae arnaf ofn.

Waeth pa mor wrthun ydoedd iddynt fynd i mewn i'r lobi am y bleidlais benodol honno, rwy'n siŵr bod y Ewrosgeptiaid pybyr yno wedi dygymod â hynny a'u bod, er hynny, ar ben eu digon bod eu hagenda ymwahanol a gwrth-Ewropeaidd wedi cael hygrededd. Nid yw eich cyd-Aelodau yn San Steffan wedi gwneud dim cymwynas â'u hunain, ond rhyngddon nhw a'u cawl a dweud y gwir. Yn bwysicach na hynny, nid ydynt wedi gwneud cymwynas â Chymru ychwaith. Bydd unrhyw ostyngiad yng nghyllideb yr UE yn peryglu buddiannau Cymru. Boed hynny drwy PAC neu'r cronfeydd strwythurol, mae ein heconomi wedi cyd-blethu cymaint â chyllid Ewropeaidd erbyn hyn fel na allai oroesi hebdo.

Mae PAC a'r cronfeydd strwythurol yn gyllidebau mor bwysig y byddai bron yn amhosibl torri cyllideb gyffredinol yr UE heb eu cyffwrdd. Yng ngoleuni hynny, ni all gweithredoedd y Blaid Lafur yn Llundain ond bod yn niweidiol iawn i fuddiannau Cymru, yn awr ac yn y dyfodol. Y cyllid hwn yw'r sgaffaldiau sy'n cynnal economi Cymru a byddai ei dynnu yn arwain at oblygiadau anochel.

Having insulted the loony right of the Tory party and the entire parliamentary Labour Party, I will finish this exercise in making friends and influencing people by turning to the amendments. We will support all the amendments with the exception of amendment 1, which we could not support because of what it deletes rather than what it adds. However, I would thank Plaid Cymru for bringing this important and timely issue to our attention in the debate today.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I call on Dafydd Elis-Thomas.

Yr Arglwydd Elis-Thomas: Diolch yn fawr, Ddirprwy Lywydd. Mae'n bleser trafod y materion hyn o dan eich cadeiryddiaeth chi; rydych wastad wedi cael golwg gyfansoddiadol eang fel rhan o'ch ystyriaeth wleidyddol.

Nid wyf yn arfer cywirio gweinidogion gyda'r Annibynnwyr, ond rwy'n credu mai'r wythnos hon y cynhelir yr uwchgynhadledd Ewropeaidd. Rwy'n gwybod bod ambell i weinidog yn byw ar blaned arall, ond nid chi, syr.

Mae'n bwysig iawn ein bod yn dadlau hyn a'n bod yn sylweddoli'r cyd-destun rydym yn ei ganol ar hyn o bryd. Rydym wedi cael awgrymiadau yn y wasg bod rhywbeth rhyfedd arall ar fin digwydd, sef bod swyddogion yr Undeb Ewropeaidd yn gorfod cynllunio am y posibilrwydd o lunio cyllideb i lai na nifer cyflawn y gwledydd—hynny yw, y byddant yn llunio cyllideb a fydd yn rhagweld eithrio'r wladwriaeth rydym yn perthyn iddi ar hyn o bryd, sef y Deyrnas Unedig, o'r cytundeb cyllidol, a hynny cyn i'r materion hyn gael eu trafod. Yr hyn rydym yn ei drafod mewn gwirionedd yw €1 triliwn, sef y gwariant rhwng 2014 a 2020—cyfanswm yr holl wariant a fydd yn y gyllideb.

Mae hon yn gyllideb ar gyfer twf a sicrhau cydlynedd tiriogaethol a chymdeithasol o fewn yr aelod-wladwriaethau ac, yn fwy arbennig o'n safbwynt ni, o fewn y rhanbarthau. Mae'n gyllideb a fydd yn cwblhau'r farchnad sengl mewn ynni, trafnidiaeth, strwythur telathrebu a'r gyllideb bwysig—

Ar ôl difrio adain dde eithafol y blaid Doriaidd a'r Blaid Lafur seneddol gyfan, gorffennaf yr ymarfer hwn o wneud ffrindiau a dylanwadu ar bobl drwy droi at y gwelliannau. Byddwn yn cefnogi'r holl welliannau ac eithrio gwelliant 1, na allem ei gefnogi oherwydd yr hyn y mae'n ei ddileu yn hytrach na'r hyn y mae'n ei ychwanegu. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn ddiolch i Blaid Cymru am gyflwyno'r mater pwysig ac amserol hwn i'n sylw yn y ddadl heddiw.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Galwaf ar Dafydd Elis-Thomas.

Lord Elis-Thomas: Thank you, Deputy Presiding Officer. It is a pleasure to discuss these issues under your chairmanship; you have always taken a broad constitutional view as part of your political considerations.

I do not usually correct Independent ministers, but I think that the European summit is being held this week. I know that some ministers live on another planet, but not you, sir.

It is very important that we debate this issue and that we understand the context facing us at present. We have seen suggestions in the press that another strange occurrence is about to take place, namely that European Union officials are having to plan for the possibility of drawing up a budget for less than the full number of member states—that they will draw up a budget that would anticipate the exemption of the member state of which we are currently a part, the United Kingdom, from the budgetary agreement, before these issues are discussed. What we are discussing in reality is €1 trillion, which is the expenditure between 2014 and 2020—the totality of all expenditure in the budget.

This is a budget for growth and for ensuring territorial and social cohesion within the member states and, more importantly from our point of view, within the regions. It is a budget that will complete the single market in energy, transport, telecommunications structures and the important budget—

Antoinette Sandbach: Will you take an intervention?

Lord Elis-Thomas: Yes, I will give way to my colleague from the north.

Antoinette Sandbach: I am grateful to Dafydd Elis-Thomas for giving way. Would he agree that, since 1998, the budget for the European Union has already increased by 47% and that that type of increase is unsustainable? Since Britain joined the EU, our net deficit to the EU—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. This is getting to be a speech.

Antoinette Sandbach: Our net deficit to the EU has been £85 billion, which has been taken out of the Welsh economy.

Lord Elis-Thomas: The European budget still only represents 2% of total Government expenditure in the union, and is 45 times smaller than the sum of Government expenditure in member states. Do you want any more?

Mae'n rhaid delio â'r mater hwn yn ei gyddestun. Mae'r gronfa bwysig o gysylltu Ewrop yn rhan o hyn. Yn bwysicach na dim—ac rwy'n synnu at fy nghyfaill o'r gogledd yn gwrthwynebu gwariant o'r fath—mae'n effeithio'n benodol ar y gallu i gael diwydiant amaethyddol cynaliadwy a gwyrdd, gan gynnwys diogelwch cyflenwad bwyd a datblygu economaidd cynaliadwy mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Ar ben hynny, bydd yn cynnwys un o'r prosiectau pwysicaf un—Horizon 2020—sy'n rhoi gorwel newydd i ymchwil a hyrwyddo ymchwil yn Ewrop, rhywbeth mae fy nghydweithiwr o Ynys Môn a minnau wedi bod yn ei drafod mewn cynhadledd fideo gyda'r Gweinidog Busnes, Menter, Technoleg a Gwyddoniaeth ac eraill o fewn yr awr ddiwethaf. Mae'r pethau hyn yn allweddol i bobl Cymru a dyfodol Cymru.

Mae'r fframwaith cyllidol amlflwyddiannol—rwy'n hoff o'r geiriau hyn—rydym yn ei drafod yn hanfodol. Mae'n hanfodol hefyd ar gyfer y math o raglen waith i'r Comisiwn y mae'r Undeb

Antoinette Sandbach: A wnewch chi dderbyn ymyriad?

Yr Arglwydd Elis-Thomas: Gwnaf, ildiaf i'm cyd-Aelod o'r gogledd.

Antoinette Sandbach: Rwy'n ddiolchgar i Dafydd Elis-Thomas am ildio. A fyddai'n cytuno, ers 1998, fod cyllideb yr Undeb Ewropeaidd eisoes wedi cynyddu 47% ac nad yw cynnydd o'r fath yn gynaliadwy? Ers i Brydain ymuno â'r UE, ein diffyg net i'r UE—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Mae hyn yn troi'n araith.

Antoinette Sandbach: Ein diffyg net i'r UE yw £85 biliwn, sydd wedi cael ei dynnu allan o economi Cymru.

Yr Arglwydd Elis-Thomas: Er hynny, mae'r gyllideb Ewropeaidd ond yn cyfrif am 2% o gyfanswm gwariant y Llywodraeth yn yr undeb, ac yn 45 gwaith yn llai na gwariant Llywodraethau mewn aelod-wladwriaethau. A ydych chi am gael rhagor?

We must deal with this issue in context. The important budget for interconnecting Europe is part of this. More importantly—and I am shocked at my colleague from north Wales for opposing such expenditure—it specifically impacts upon our ability to have a sustainable and green agricultural industry, including the safety of our food supply and sustainable economic development in rural areas. In addition, it will include one of the most important projects—Horizon 2020—which provides a new horizon for research and the promotion of research in Europe, something that my colleague from Anglesey and I were discussing in a video-conference with the Minister for Business, Enterprise, Technology and Science and others within the last hour. These issues are key for the people of Wales and for the future of Wales.

The multi-annual financial framework—I like these words—that we are discussing is crucial. It is crucial also for the kind of work programme that the European Union is putting in place for the next year. What

Ewropeaidd yn ei wynebu yn ystod y flwyddyn nesaf. Beth yn union yw hynny? Rwyf am ganolbwyntio ar y maes rwy'n ei gefnogi'n angerddol, sef y maes amgylcheddol. Bydd adolygiad o ddeddfwriaeth gwastraff yr Undeb Ewropeaidd, a fydd yn adolygu'r prif dargedau yn y ddeddfwriaeth ar wastraff. Bydd adolygiad o'r gyfarwydddeb cynllunio gofodol morol, er mwyn cryfhau'r dimensiwn hwnnw. Mae hyn yn hanfodol i Gymru, fel bod gennym gynllunio integredig ar fôr ac ar dir. Cynlluniau pwysig iawn yn y maes morol yw'r strategaeth twf glas a strategaeth yr Iwerydd. Byddant yn effeithio'n uniongyrchol ar holl lannau môr Cymru, yn datblygu potensial môr Iwerydd, yn ymateb i sefyllfa newid hinsawdd ac yn sicrhau bod gennym ynni cynaliadwy. Mae dros 10,000 o rywogaethau goresgynnol estron yn Ewrop, gan gynnwys y canglwm Siapaneaidd sydd yng ngardd fy mwthyn i, ond nid wyf am sôn am y bwthyn gan imi fynd i drwbwl pan soniais amdano yn ddiweddar.

4.15 p.m.

Mae'r glasbrint diogelu adnoddau dŵr Ewrop hefyd yn hanfodol. Dyma'r math o raglen waith y bydd y gyllideb hon yn gwario arni yn y flwyddyn nesaf yn unig. A yw'r Aelodau yn y Siambr sy'n hyrwyddo gwrthwynebiad i'r Undeb Ewropeaidd yn credu bod y gwariant hwnnw'n ddiwerth?

Mike Hedges: First, I would like to say that I find it a bit rich when Liberal Democrats accuse Labour MPs of going through the lobby with the Conservative right, considering that it is the political party that went through the lobbies to get through tuition fee increases, benefit cuts and the one that I consider to be the worst of the lot, the bedroom tax.

However, to return to the point of the debate, Wales is a major beneficiary of European money—both support for agriculture and regional funds. European money is very important to Wales and to the Welsh economy and it is very important to the lives of very many people in Wales. However, the Westminster Government—and this is not a party-political point—is committed to cutting public expenditure as part of its economic

exactly is that? I want to concentrate on the area that I am passionate about, namely the environment. A review of European waste legislation will be held, which will review the main targets contained within the waste legislation. A review of the marine spatial planning directive will be held, in order to strengthen that dimension. This is crucial for Wales, so that we have integrated planning on land and sea. Very important schemes in the marine sector are the blue growth strategy and the Atlantic strategy. They will have a direct impact on all Welsh coastal areas, developing the potential of the Atlantic, responding to the situation of climate change and ensuring that we have sustainable energy. There are over 10,000 alien invasive species in Europe, including the Japanese knotweed that is in the garden of my home, but I am not going to mention my home because I got into trouble when I mentioned it recently.

The blueprint to safeguard Europe's waters is also essential. This is the kind of work that this budget will fund in the next year alone. Do the Members in the Chamber who are promoting opposition to the European Union believe that that expenditure is of no value?

Mike Hedges: Yn gyntaf, hoffwn ddweud ei bod yn rhyfedd braidd clywed Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn cyhuddo ASau Llafur o fynd drwy'r lobi â'r adain dde Geidwadol, o ystyried mai hon yw'r blaidd wleidyddol a aeth drwy'r lobiâu i bleidleisio dros godi ffioedd dysgu, torri budd-daliadau a thros y polisi gwaethaf oll yn fy marn i, sef y dreth ystafell wely.

Fodd bynnag, gan ddychwelyd at sylwedd y ddadl, mae Cymru yn cael budd mawr o arian Ewropeaidd—o ran cymorth i amaethyddiaeth a chronfeydd rhanbarthol. Mae arian Ewropeaidd yn bwysig iawn i Gymru ac i economi Cymru ac mae'n bwysig iawn i fywydau llawer iawn o bobl yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, mae Llywodraeth San Steffan—ac nid yw hwn yn bwynt pleidiol—wedi ymrwymo i gwtogi ar wariant

strategy, thus a substantial increase in money to the European Union, and assuming no change in Government policy, would see a serious Barnett-driven budget reduction for Wales.

Of course, Europe is like Wales in the way that it receives its money. It has no direct tax-raising powers. What do we want? As always, we want the best of both. We need a European budget that meets the needs of Wales and supports the CAP and regional funding, but does not lead to a reduction in the Welsh block grant. We need European funding for a whole array of projects for the benefit of the Welsh economy. I can only echo what Rhodri Glyn Thomas said: it is about Wales and about doing the best things for Wales.

The Welsh Government has consistently made the case for a European Union budget that focuses on job creation and the stimulation of growth across the European Union. I think that our economy desperately needs growth and we desperately need the economy to be stimulated. It has emphasised the critical role that both the structural funds and CAP will play in achieving these aims, and made it clear that a cut in the funding of these programmes would not be in the interests of Wales, the Welsh people or the Welsh economy.

I keep coming back to the key point that this is about the best interests of Wales. I believe that the European Union budget should be set at a level that benefits the people of Wales, and I would not be in favour of cutting the budget available for the common agricultural policy payments or structural funds when they come into Wales. Structural funds have already assisted 119,000 people to gain qualifications, helped 44,000 into work, helped to create over 15,800 jobs gross, and led to some 4,450 enterprises being created. These benefits will increase as European Union projects continue to deliver over the seven to nine-year programme period.

I am a member of the Finance Committee and we have been looking at some of these

cyhoeddus fel rhan o'i strategaeth economaidd, felly byddai cynnydd sylweddol yn yr arian i'r Undeb Ewropeaidd, a chan dybio na fydd unrhyw newid ym mholisi'r Llywodraeth, yn arwain at ostyngiad mawr yn y gyllideb o dan Barnett i Gymru.

Wrth gwrs, mae Ewrop fel Cymru yn y ffordd y mae'n cael ei harian. Nid oes ganddi unrhyw bwerau uniongyrchol i godi trethi. Beth rydym am ei gael? Fel bob amser, rydym am gael y gorau o'r ddau. Mae arnom angen cyllideb Ewropeaidd sy'n diwallu anghenion Cymru ac yn cefnogi'r PAC a chyllid rhanbarthol, ond nad yw'n arwain at ostyngiad yng ngrant bloc Cymru. Mae angen cyllid Ewropeaidd am bob math o brosiectau er budd economi Cymru. Ni allaf ond ategu'r hyn a ddywedodd Rhodri Glyn Thomas: mae a wnelo â Chymru a gwneud y gorau dros Gymru.

Mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi dadlau'n gyson am gyllideb gan yr Undeb Ewropeaidd sy'n canolbwyntio ar greu swyddi ac ysgogi twf ledled yr Undeb Ewropeaidd. Yn fy marn i, mae angen dybryd am dwf yn ein heconomi, ac mae angen dybryd i'r economi gael ei hysgogi. Mae wedi pwysleisio'r rôl hollbwysig y bydd y cronfeydd strwythurol a'r PAC yn ei chwarae i gyflawni'r nodau hyn, ac yn ei gwneud yn glir na fyddai gostyngiad yng nghyllid y rhaglenni hyn er budd Cymru, pobl Cymru nac economi Cymru.

Dof yn ôl at y pwynt allweddol dro ar ôl tro, sef bod a wnelo hyn â budd Cymru. Credaf y dylai cyllideb yr Undeb Ewropeaidd gael ei phennu ar lefel sydd o fudd i bobl Cymru, ac ni fyddwn o blaid torri'r gyllideb sydd ar gael ar gyfer taliadau'r polisi amaethyddol cyffredin na'r cronfeydd strwythurol pan fyddant yn dod i Gymru. Mae'r cronfeydd strwythurol eisoes wedi helpu 119,000 o bobl i ennill cymwysterau, wedi helpu 44,000 o bobl i mewn i waith, wedi helpu i greu dros 15,800 o swyddi gros, ac wedi arwain at greu tua 4,450 o fusnesau. Bydd y manteision hyn yn cynyddu wrth i brosiectau'r Undeb Ewropeaidd barhau i gyflawni dros gyfnod saith i naw mlynedd y rhaglen.

Rwy'n aelod o'r Pwyllgor Cyllid ac rydym wedi bod yn edrych ar rai o'r cynlluniau

schemes—some schemes that have made a real difference to the lives of people throughout Wales. Yesterday, it was reported that a European Union-backed project was helping businesses to pioneer medical healthcare using advanced technology that is to be rolled out across east Wales. Swansea University's Centre for NanoHealth already collaborates with businesses across west Wales and the Valleys as part of a £21 million project to drive forward nanotechnology and microtechnology in the health sector. A further £4 million will be invested, including £1.7 million from the European regional development fund through the Welsh Government to benefit small and medium-sized enterprises and larger companies in Cardiff, Newport, Wrexham, Flintshire, Powys, the Vale of Glamorgan and Monmouthshire. The remainder of that funding will come from Swansea University and the private sector. This is an example of European funding working for Wales and bringing in private sector money. This is something that we all want to see.

Another example is that, with the help of European Union funding—£70 million, matched by £30 million from the Welsh Labour Government—the Skills Growth Wales scheme has been extended to provide training support until the end of March 2015. This will mean that a further 200 companies can achieve their growth plans, supported by the creation of up to 3,000 additional jobs in Wales. These are just two examples of the way in which structural funds work for the benefit of Wales and the Welsh economy and put money in people's pockets.

The common agricultural policy is essential to Wales, not just for the benefit of farmers who receive farm subsidies, but for the very fabric of rural Wales and the continuation of food production. This becomes a judgment call so that Wales can have the benefit of European funding without facing a reduction in the Welsh block grant. For the people of Wales, I hope that the Westminster Government can achieve that. What matters is what is good for Wales and I hope that we will see a budget set in the European Union that means that our good projects can continue and we can continue getting people in Wales into work.

hyn—rhai cynlluniau sydd wedi gwneud gwahaniaeth gwirioneddol i fywydau pobl ledled Cymru. Ddoe, dywedwyd bod prosiect a gefnogir gan yr Undeb Ewropeaidd yn helpu busnesau i arloesi ym maes gofal iechyd meddygol drwy ddefnyddio uwch-dechnoleg sydd i'w chyflwyno yn nwyrain Cymru. Mae Canolfan Nanolechyd Prifysgol Abertawe eisoes yn cydweithio â busnesau yn y gorllewin a'r Cymoedd fel rhan o brosiect gwerth £21 miliwn i hyrwyddo nanodechnoleg a microdechnoleg yn y sector iechyd. Caiff £4 miliwn arall ei fuddsoddi, gan gynnwys £1.7 miliwn o gronfa datblygu rhanbarthol Ewrop drwy law Llywodraeth Cymru i helpu busnesau bach a chanolig a chwmnïau mwy o faint yng Nghaerdydd, Casnewydd, Wrecsam, sir y Fflint, Powys, Bro Morgannwg a sir Fynwy. Daw gweddill y cyllid hwnnw o Brifysgol Abertawe a'r sector preifat. Mae hon yn enghraifft o arian Ewropeaidd yn gweithio dros Gymru ac yn denu arian y sector preifat. Mae hyn yn rhywbeth yr ydym i gyd am ei weld.

Enghraifft arall, gyda chymorth arian yr Undeb Ewropeaidd—£70 miliwn, a £30 miliwn o arian cyfatebol gan y Llywodraeth Llafur yng Nghymru—yw ymestyn cynllun Sgiliau Twf Cymru i roi cymorth hyfforddi tan ddiwedd mis Mawrth 2015. Bydd hyn yn golygu y gall 200 o gwmnïau eraill gyflawni eu cynlluniau twf, gan greu hyd at 3,000 o swyddi ychwanegol yng Nghymru. Dim ond dwy enghraifft yw'r rhain o'r ffordd y mae cronfeydd strwythurol yn gweithio er budd Cymru ac economi Cymru ac yn rhoi arian ym mhocedi pobl.

Mae'r polisi amaethyddol cyffredin yn hanfodol i Gymru, nid yn unig er budd ffermwyr sy'n cael cymorthdaliadau fferm, ond i gynnal gwead cymdeithas Cymru wledig a pharhad cynhyrchu bwyd. Rhaid pwyso a mesur o ran hyn er mwyn sicrhau y gall Cymru gael budd cyllid Ewropeaidd heb wynebu gostyngiad yng ngrant bloc Cymru. Er budd pobl Cymru, gobeithiaf y gall Llywodraeth San Steffan gyflawni hynny. Yr hyn sy'n bwysig yw'r hyn sy'n fuddiol i Gymru a gobeithiaf y gwelwn gyllideb wedi'i phennu yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd sy'n golygu y gall ein prosiectau da barhau ac y gallwn barhau i gael pobl yng Nghymru i mewn i

waith.

Llyr Huws Gruffydd: Rydym wedi clywed yn barod mai'r ddwy ffrwd fwyaf arwyddocaol o fewn cyllideb yr Undeb Ewropeaidd yw'r polisi amaethyddol cyffredin a'r cronfeydd strwythurol. Rwyf yn siŵr y gallwn ni gyd dystiolaethu, neu rwyf yn gobeithio y gallwn ni gyd dystiolaethu, i'w gwerth a'u cyfraniad, a'r budd mawr y mae ein hetholwyr yn eu cael o'r ffynonellau hynny. Rydym wedi clywed eisoes gyfeiriadau at y diwydiant amaeth. Mae'r fferm deuluol yn chwarae rhan ganolog ym mywyd economaidd, amgylcheddol, cymdeithasol a diwylliannol ein cymunedau gwledig. Y realiti, serch hynny, yw bod y diffygion parhaus sydd yn y farchnad yn golygu nad yw'r ffermydd hynny yn gynaliadwy, fel mae pethau'n sefyll. Nid oes modd osgoi'r ffaith bod taliadau incwm unionyrchol i ffermwyr drwy CAP yn gwbl hanfodol i barhad y ffermydd teuluol sydd, yn eu tro, yn gonglfeini'r agweddau hynny roeddwn yn sôn amdanynt. Mae'r taliadau rheini, gyda llaw, yn cyfrannu rhwng 80% a 90% o incwm busnes ffermio yng Nghymru, gan fuddsoddi £390 miliwn bob blwyddyn yn amaethwyr a chymunedau gwledig ehangach Cymru. Dyma sy'n sicrhau bod gennym gyflenwad sefydlog o fwyd am brisiau fforddiadwy gan roi sicrwydd o safbwynt diogelwch bwyd yn y wlad hon. Dyma sy'n cynnal llawer o stiwardiaeth amgylcheddol cefn gwlad a dyma hefyd sy'n gonglfaen i gyflogaeth a swyddi yn rhai o'n cymunedau mwyaf ymylol. Heb daliadau'r polisi amaethyddol cyffredin, byddai ffermydd Cymru'n gwbl anghynaladwy. Byddai torri'r gyllideb honno yn taflu cysgod difrifol dros ddyfodol y diwydiant hwnnw.

Nid amaethwyr yn unig sy'n poeni am dorri cyllideb CAP yn benodol. Mae mudiadau amgylcheddol wedi disgrifio'r posibilrwydd o doriadau sylweddol i'r gyllideb honno fel trychineb i gynefinoedd bywyd gwylt a rhywogaethau ar draws tirweddau gwledig Cymru.

We know that agri-environment schemes support sustainable farming, which protects and enhances the countryside, providing a home for some of our most threatened wildlife and conserving our iconic landscapes

Llyr Huws Gruffydd: We have heard already that the two most significant streams within the European Union budget are the common agricultural policy and structural funds. I am sure that we could all testify, or I hope that we could all testify, to their value and contribution, and the great benefit that our constituents receive from those sources. We have already heard reference to the agriculture industry. The family farm plays a central part in the economic, environmental, social and cultural life of our rural communities. The reality, however, is that the continual deficiencies within the market mean that those farms are not sustainable as things stand. We cannot avoid the fact, therefore, that direct income payments to farmers through CAP are crucially important for the survival of those family farms that are the cornerstones of those things that I have just mentioned. Those payments, by the way, contribute between 80% and 90% of farm business income in Wales, investing £390 million per annum in the farmers and the wider rural communities of Wales. This is what ensures that we have a stable food supply at an affordable price, giving assurance in terms of food security in this country. This is what sustains much of the environmental stewardship of our rural areas and this is the cornerstone for employment and jobs in some of our most peripheral communities. Without CAP payments, the farms of Wales would be entirely unsustainable. Cutting that budget would cast a very dark shadow over the future of that industry.

It is not just farmers who are concerned about a cut in the CAP budget specifically. Environmental organisations have described the possibility of significant cuts to that budget as a disaster for wildlife habitats and species across rural landscapes in Wales.

Gwyddom fod cynlluniau amaeth-amgylcheddol yn cefnogi dulliau ffermio cynaliadwy, sy'n diogelu ac yn gwella cefn gwlad, gan roi cartref i rai o'r rhywogaethau bywyd gwylt sydd wedi'u bygwth fwyaf a

and heritage. They can safeguard natural resources, providing benefits like clean water and buffers against drought and flooding. They can also stimulate rural growth by creating opportunities and drivers for the public to visit and enjoy the countryside, creating demand for local businesses, both directly and indirectly. In short, CAP provides a good return on investment for the money provided by the taxpayer. Wales has also benefitted significantly, as we have already heard, from structural funds. I will not run through my list of projects, because we can all do that for our respective areas, I am sure.

Mae'r toriadau hyn yn mynd i gael *impact* uniongyrchol ar allu'r Llywodraeth i gyflawni ei rhaglen waith yng Nghymru. Yn gynharach, roedd y Gweinidog amgylchedd yn sôn pa mor allweddol yw rheoli perygl llifogydd fel blaenoriaeth i Lywodraeth Cymru. Pan roeddwn yn craffu ar ei gyllideb fis diwethaf, roedd y Gweinidog yn dweud y byddai'r Llywodraeth yn buddsoddi £140 miliwn mewn rheoli risg llifogydd ac erydiad arfordirol dros fywyd y Llywodraeth hon, gyda £50 miliwn o bres o Ewrop yn ategu at y swm hwnnw. Rydym yn gwybod am Arbed hefyd, y rhaglen effeithlonrwydd ynni. Mae cyfnod 2 yn cael ei ariannu'n bennaf gan arian Ewropeaidd gydag arian cyfatebol yn cael ei roi gan Lywodraeth Cymru.

Wrth graffu ar gyllideb y Dirprwy Weinidog, roedd yn dangos sut y mae modd mapio'r gyllideb yn erbyn rhaglen lywodraethu Cymru. Roedd rhestr o is-ganlyniadau, rhyw *sub-outcomes*, y mae'r Llywodraeth am eu cyflawni, gan gynnwys sicrhau economi wledig ffyniannus, amddiffyn iechyd ecosystemau a gwella gwasanaethau cyhoeddus i gymunedau gwledig. Wrth gefnogi toriad yn y gyllideb Ewropeaidd, mae hynny yn ddim byd llai nag ymosodiad ar allu'r Llywodraeth hon i ddelifro'i rhaglen. Yr eironi mawr yw mai Aelodau Seneddol Llafur sydd wedi bod yn gwthio hyn yn San Steffan. Y nhw, felly, sy'n bennaf gyfrifol am lesteirio gwaith y Llywodraeth Lafur yn y Cynulliad. Byddai torri'r gyllideb yn niweidiol i Gymru ac roedd yr Aelodau Llafur a Cheidwadol yn San Steffan a gefnogodd hynny yn gwybod hynny'n iawn.

gwarchod ein tirweddau eiconig a'n treftadaeth. Gallant ddiogelu adnoddau naturiol, gan esgor ar fuddiannau fel dŵr glân a champau diogelu rhag cyfnodau sych a llifogydd. Gallant hefyd ysgogi twf gwledig drwy greu cyfleoedd a sbardun i'r cyhoedd ymweld â chefn gwlad a'i fwynhau, gan greu galw am fusnesau lleol, yn uniongyrchol ac yn anuniongyrchol. Yn gryno, mae'r PAC yn rhoi elw da o fuddsoddiad o ran yr arian a ddarperir gan y trethdalwr. Mae Cymru hefyd wedi elwa'n sylweddol, fel yr ydym eisoes wedi clywed, o gronfeydd strwythurol. Ni af drwy fy rhestr o brosiectau, oherwydd gall pob un ohonom wneud hynny yn ein priod feysydd, mae'n siŵr gennyf.

These cuts will also have a direct impact on the ability of the Government to implement its work programme in Wales. Earlier, the Minister for environment mentioned how crucially important flood risk management is as a priority of the Welsh Government. When we were scrutinising his budget last month, the Minister was saying that the Government would invest £140 million in flood risk management and coastal erosion over the lifetime of this Government, with £50 million of European funding supplementing that particular sum. We also know about Arbed, the energy efficiency scheme. Phase 2 is being funded mainly with European money, with match funding being provided by the Welsh Government.

In scrutinising the budget of the Deputy Minister, it was demonstrated how we could map that budget against the programme for the government of Wales. There was a list of sub-outcomes that the Government hopes to achieve, including ensuring a prosperous rural economy, protecting the health of ecosystems and improving public services to rural communities. Supporting a cut to the European budget is nothing less than an attack on the ability of this Government to deliver its programme. The great irony is that it is Labour Members of Parliament who have been pushing this in Westminster. It is they, therefore, who are mainly responsible for hampering the work of the Labour Government in the Assembly. A cut to the budget would be damaging to Wales, and the Labour and Conservative Members in Westminster who supported that knew that

Mae'n cael ei gadael, felly, i Plaid Cymru amddiffyn buddiannau pobl a chymunedau Cymru.

David Rees: It is an important debate that we are going to have today on the budget. However, we are forgetting one aspect, which Rhodri Glyn Thomas mentioned in his introduction, and that is where the EU comes from and its purpose. We often forget about that in one sense. The common architectural institutions, commonality of identity and relationships have succeeded in giving Europe what its original visionaries dreamed of, not only bringing peace to a previously war-ravaged continent, but creating greater prosperity for its citizens, including Welsh citizens as well. The EU has continued to embrace the new countries that have joined it, enshrining new languages and cultures at the heart of its institutions—in essence, creating a strengthened identity based on solidarity and a common purpose. We cannot ignore that and it is one of the points that we must remember in all issues surrounding budget discussions.

However, we must also remember that we face one of the worst financial crises since the second world war, and that it is natural for that sense of solidarity to be tested at this point in time. Many people are asking if we are still convinced that staying together and working together in the twenty-first century is a pathway to prosperity. I think that it is. There are forces calling on the UK to follow a path of self-preservation and to extradite itself from the EU. It is not surprising that such opinions are never voiced so loudly as during times of EU budget negotiations. Let me make it clear: I am not one of those who support that opinion; I wholeheartedly disagree with it. I would like to hear if every Member on the opposition benches also agrees with me. Are the Welsh Conservatives saying that they support these breakaway ideas or not?

Leanne Wood: Your leader, Miliband, has warned this week that the UK is sleepwalking into EU exit. Do you agree with Plaid Cymru that the votes of Labour MPs on the EU

full well. It is left therefore to Plaid Cymru to protect the interests of the people and the communities of Wales.

David Rees: Mae'r ddadl yr ydym yn ei chael heddiw ar y gyllideb yn un bwysig. Fodd bynnag, rydym yn anghofio un agwedd, y cyfeiriodd Rhodri Glyn Thomas ati yn ei gyflwyniad, sef gwreiddiau'r UE a'i ddiben. Rydym yn aml yn anghofio am hynny ar un ystyr. Mae'r sefydliadau cyffredin pensaernïol, yr hunaniaeth gyffredin a'r cydberthnasau wedi llwyddo i roi i Ewrop yr hyn yr oedd ei gweledyddion gwreiddiol yn breuddwydio amdano, nid yn unig yn sicrhau heddwch i gyfandir lle bu cymaint o ryfela gynt, ond yn creu mwy o ffyniant i'w dinasyddion, gan gynnwys dinasyddion Cymru hefyd. Mae'r UE wedi parhau i groesawu'r gwledydd newydd sydd wedi ymuno ag ef, gan roi ieithoedd a diwylliannau newydd wrth wraidd ei sefydliadau—yn ei hanfod, creu hunaniaeth gryfach yn seiliedig ar undod a phwrpas cyffredin. Ni allwn anwybyddu hynny ac mae'n un o'r pwyntiau y mae'n rhaid inni ei gofio yn yr holl faterion sy'n ymwneud â thrafodaethau ar y gyllideb.

Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni gofio hefyd ein bod yn wynebu un o'r argyfyngau ariannol gwaethaf ers yr ail ryfel byd, a'i bod yn naturiol i'r ymdeimlad hwnnw o undod gael ei brofi ar hyn o bryd. Mae llawer o bobl yn gofyn a ydym yn dal yn argyhoeddedig bod aros gyda'n gilydd a gweithio gyda'n gilydd yn y unfed ganrif ar hugain yn llwybr i ffyniant. Credaf ei fod. Mae grymoedd yn galw ar y DU i ddilyn llwybr hunangadwraeth ac ymwahanu oddi wrth yr UE. Nid yw'n syndod mai yn ystod cyfnodau o gyd-drafod cyllideb yr UE y caiff safbwyntiau o'r fath bob amser eu mynegi grochaf. Gadewch imi fod yn glir: nid wyf yn un o'r rhai sy'n cefnogi'r farn honno; anghytunaf yn llwyr â hi. Hoffwn glywed a yw pob Aelod ar feinciau'r gwrthbleidiau hefyd yn cytuno â mi. A yw'r Ceidwadwyr Cymreig yn dweud eu bod yn cefnogi'r syniadau hyn i ymwahanu ai peidio?

Leanne Wood: Mae eich arweinydd, Miliband, wedi rhybuddio yr wythnos hon bod y DU yn cerdded yn ddjarwybod tuag at ymwahanu oddi wrth yr UE. A ydych chi'n

budget fast-tracks that exit?

David Rees: Absolutely not. I will look at the budget and I may want to talk about Plaid Cymru supporting an increase in budgets in the European Parliament—budgets that are perhaps unsustainable—but I will ignore that one as well at the moment.

I do not agree with the views of the people who want to leave the EU based purely on idealism. I see the EU as being of tangible benefit to Welsh citizens. We have benefitted from that in the budgets that we have had. From 2007-13, approximately £1.9 billion of EU funds came in through structural funds and the CAP.

I am disappointed that Liberal Democrats' amendments do not mention structural funds; they only talk about the budget discussions on the CAP. They also seem to be ignoring the impact on structural funds. The original European Council proposal was for a cut of €79 billion, which would cut structural funds from €354 billion to €309 billion, so that is a €45 billion cut in structural funds being proposed by the council. I am surprised that they did not mention that one.

To go back to where we benefit, Llyr Huws Gruffydd did not want to roll off a list of projects and I do not want to list too many projects—Mike has provided examples—but I will make a couple of points. As a lecturer, I saw the benefits to students of gaining qualifications that they would not have had the chance to pursue if it were not for funding and support from the European Union. Those post-graduate qualifications—they were not undergraduate qualifications and therefore funded—allowed them to open doors to their career pathways. We cannot ignore that.

In my constituency, we have seen great support in the Afan valley and other areas of the western Valleys. We can see those figures. We can talk about the numbers: 517 enterprises have been assisted and 145 enterprises have been created, resulting in

cytuno â Phlaid Cymru bod pleidleisiau Aelodau Seneddol Llafur ar gyllideb yr UE yn sicrhau bod hynny'n digwydd yn gynt?

David Rees: Ddim o gwbl. Edrychaf ar y gyllideb ac efallai y byddaf am sôn am Blaid Cymru yn cefnogi cynnydd mewn cyllidebau yn Senedd Ewrop—cyllidebau nad ydynt yn gynaliadwy o bosibl—ond anwybyddaf hynny hefyd am y tro.

Ni chytunaf â barn y bobl sydd am adael yr UE yn seiliedig ar ddefnyddiaeth yn unig. Ystyriaf fod yr UE o fudd amlwg i ddinasyddion Cymru. Rydym wedi elwa ar hynny yn y cyllidebau yr ydym wedi'u cael. O 2007-13, cafwyd tua £1.9 biliwn o gronfeydd yr UE drwy gronfeydd strwythurol a'r PAC.

Rwy'n siomedig nad yw gwelliannau'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn sôn am gronfeydd strwythurol; dim ond sôn am y cyd-drafodaethau cyllidebol ar y PAC y maent. Ymddengys hefyd eu bod yn anwybyddu'r effaith ar gronfeydd strwythurol. Roedd cynnig gwreiddiol y Cyngor Ewropeaidd yn golygu toriad o €79 biliwn, a fyddai wedi cwtogi cronfeydd strwythurol o €354 biliwn i €309 biliwn, felly roedd y cyngor yn cynnig torri €45 biliwn o'r cronfeydd strwythurol. Synnaf nad oeddent wedi sôn am hynny.

Gan ddychwelyd at y buddiannau i ni, nid oedd Llyr Huws Gruffydd am adrodd rhestr o brosiectau ac nid wyf innau ychwaith am restru gormod o brosiectau—mae Mike wedi rhoi enghreifftiau—ond gwnaf un neu ddau bwynt. Fel darlithydd, gwelais y manteision i fyfyrwyr o ennill cymwysterau na fyddent wedi cael y cyfle i'w hennill heblaw am gyllid a chymorth yr Undeb Ewropeaidd. Roedd y cymwysterau ôl-raddedig hynny—nid cymwysterau israddedig oeddent ac felly wedi'u cyllido—yn gyfle iddynt agor drysau at eu llwybrau gyrfaol. Ni allwn anwybyddu hynny.

Yn fy etholaeth i, rydym wedi gweld cymorth gwych yng Nghwm Afan ac ardaloedd eraill y Cymoedd gorllewinol. Gallwn weld y ffigurau hynny. Gallwn sôn am y niferoedd: mae 517 o fusnesau wedi cael cymorth ac mae 145 o fusnesau wedi cael eu creu, gan

468 new jobs. We can all quote those figures; we can all see the benefits that have been created. Without European funding, those people would not have those positions. It is critical to remind ourselves of that.

However, the real fruits of that investment will not be seen for several years. I have a harbour way development in my constituency that has been funded by European money and that will hopefully be completed in October 2013, but the benefits of the development that will follow will be seen in the years ahead. It is a long-term investment that will last for decades, and we must remember that. So, while a cut in the EU budget might seem appealing in the short term, the ramifications of the loss of such investment will be felt in the longer term.

As we heard from the opposition, the UK Government believes that there should be a real-term freeze, but it does not tell you that it is real-term freeze based on 2011 figures, which is actually a cut of €100 billion to the budget. That is the way in which the figures are broken down. You have already heard about the European Council's recommendation of a cut of €79 billion, meaning a huge cut in European structural funds. We cannot allow that to happen. It is not a freeze; these are cuts, and we must remember that.

4.30 p.m.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Conclude, please.

David Rees: My final statement, then—I will say this—is that we must not forget that EU funding has made a fundamental improvement to lives—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. I call Antoinette Sandbach.

Antoinette Sandbach: I thank Plaid Cymru for tabling this motion for debate. The way in which European funding is spent in Wales is enormously important for CAP and regional funds. The Welsh Conservatives are happy to

arwain at 468 o swyddi newydd. Gall pob un ohonom ddyfynnu'r ffigurau hyn; gallwn ni i gyd weld y manteision a gafwyd. Heb gyllid Ewropeaidd, ni fyddai'r bobl hynny wedi cael y swyddi hynny. Mae'n hanfodol ein bod yn atgoffa ein hunain o hynny.

Fodd bynnag, ni fydd ffrwyth gwirioneddol y buddsoddiad hwnnw yn cael ei weld am sawl blwyddyn arall. Mae datblygiad ffordd harbwr yn fy etholaeth a ariannwyd drwy arian Ewropeaidd a fydd, gobeithio, yn cael ei gwblhau ym mis Hydref 2013, ond bydd manteision y datblygiad a ddaw yn ei sgîl i'w gweld yn y blynyddoedd sydd i ddod. Mae'n fuddsoddiad hirdymor a fydd yn para am ddegawdau, a rhaid inni gofio hynny. Felly, er y gallai toriad yng nghyllideb yr UE ymddangos yn atyniadol yn y tymor byr, bydd goblygiadau colli buddsoddiad o'r fath i'w gweld yn y tymor hwy.

Fel y clywsom gan y gwrthbleidiau, cred Llywodraeth y DU y dylai'r gyllideb gael ei rhewi mewn termau real, ond nid ydynt yn dweud wrthy ch ei bod am rewi'r gyllideb mewn termau real yn seiliedig ar ffigurau 2011, sydd mewn gwirionedd yn doriad o €100 biliwn i'r gyllideb. Dyna'r dadansoddiad o'r ffigurau. Rydych wedi clywed eisoes am argymhelliad y Cyngor Ewropeaidd am doriad o €79 biliwn yn y gyllideb, sy'n golygu toriad enfawr mewn cronfeydd strwythurol Ewropeaidd. Ni allwn ganiatáu i hynny ddigwydd. Nid rhewi'r gyllideb ydyw; toriadau yw'r rhain a rhaid inni gofio hynny.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Gorffenwch, os gwelwch yn dda.

David Rees: Fy natganiad olaf, felly—fe ddywedaf hyn—yw bod yn rhaid inni gofio bod arian yr UE wedi arwain at welliant sylfaenol i fywydau—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Galwaf ar Antoinette Sandbach.

Antoinette Sandbach: Hoffwn ddiolch i Blaid Cymru am gyflwyno'r cynnig hwn i'w drafod. Mae'r ffordd y caiff arian Ewropeaidd ei wario yng Nghymru yn hynod bwysig o ran y PAC a chronfeydd

support the first point of the motion, but we believe that it is right and proper to expect the EU budget to be managed efficiently and properly. We believe that the UK Government has taken the right approach to achieving this by arguing for a budget freeze. Given that the UK, which is a member state, has paid £85 billion more to the EU than it has received since being a member—that is money that has been taken out of the UK economy and out of Wales, through Barnett consequentials for money that could have been spent but went to Europe—it would be irresponsible not to expect and demand that British taxpayers' money be spent efficiently and in a way that delivers value for money. I hope that Members from across the Chamber would share our concern that, for the eighteenth year in a row, auditors have been unable to sign off the EU's account due to the scale of errors and fraud.

The UK does not stand alone in its position. Latvia, Italy, Denmark, France, Sweden, Finland, Germany, Austria, the Netherlands and Romania have all said that they are unhappy with the current budget proposals. The Netherlands has said that it is opposed to an annual or long-term increase in the budget and will use its veto if necessary. The need to deliver a sound and efficient EU budget is all the more important given the serious economic challenges facing the eurozone. Plaid Cymru does not seem to understand the difference between a negotiating position and a negotiated outcome.

Alun Ffred Jones: When we talk about a freeze, does that mean a freeze on the 2011 budget or the later budget? There is a huge difference. When we were out in Brussels, it was made perfectly clear to us that any freeze would mean a cut in structural funds and, possibly, in CAP funds. Are you willing to accept that?

Antoinette Sandbach: Well, certainly from the UK's point of view, we do not get our fair share of pillar 2 funding. If there is an opportunity to look at restructuring pillar 2 funding so that we get our fair share as a

rhanbarthol. Mae'r Ceidwadwyr Cymreig yn barod i gefnogi pwynt cyntaf y cynnig, ond credwn ei bod yn gwbl briodol disgwyl i gyllideb yr UE gael ei rheoli'n effeithlon ac yn briodol. Credwn fod Llywodraeth y DU wedi mynd ati yn y ffordd gywir i gyflawni hyn drwy ddadlau dros rewi'r gyllideb. O gofio bod y DU, sy'n aelod-wladwriaeth, wedi talu £85 biliwn yn fwy i'r UE nag y mae wedi'i dderbyn ers bod yn aelod—sef arian sydd wedi cael ei dynnu allan o economi'r DU a Chymru, drwy gyfrwng symiau canlyniadol Barnett am arian a allai fod wedi cael ei wario, ond a aeth i Ewrop—byddai'n anghyfrifol peidio â disgwyl a mynnu bod arian trethdalwyr Prydain yn cael ei wario'n effeithlon ac mewn ffordd sy'n sicrhau gwerth am arian. Gobeithiaf y byddai Aelodau o'r ochr arall i'r Siambr yn rhannu ein pryder, am y ddeunawfed flwyddyn yn olynol, na allai archwilwyr gymeradwyo cyfrif yr UE oherwydd maint y gwallau a thwyll.

Nid yw'r DU ar ei phen ei hun yn hynny o beth. Mae Latfia, yr Eidal, Denmarc, Ffrainc, Sweden, y Ffindir, yr Almaen, Awstria, yr Iseldiroedd a Romania oll wedi dweud eu bod yn anfodlon ar y cynigion cyllidebol presennol. Mae'r Iseldiroedd wedi dweud ei bod yn gwrthwynebu cynnydd blynyddol neu hirdymor yn y gyllideb a bydd yn defnyddio ei feto os oes angen. Mae'r angen i bennu cyllideb gadarn ac effeithlon i'r UE hyd yn oed yn bwysicach o ystyried yr heriau economaidd difrifol sy'n wynebu ardal yr ewro. Ymddengys nad yw Plaid Cymru yn deall y gwahaniaeth rhwng safbwynt cyddrafod a chanlyniad wedi'i gyd-drafod.

Alun Ffred Jones: Wrth sôn am rewi'r gyllideb, a yw hynny'n golygu rhewi cyllideb 2011 neu'r gyllideb ddiweddarach? Mae gwahaniaeth enfawr. Pan oeddem ym Mrwsel, fe'i gwnaed yn berffaith glir inni y byddai unrhyw benderfyniad i rewi'r gyllideb yn golygu cwtogi cronfeydd strwythurol, ac, o bosibl, arian PAC. A ydych yn barod i dderbyn hynny?

Antoinette Sandbach: Wel, yn sicr o safbwynt y DU, nid ydym yn cael ein cyfran deg o arian piler 2. Os bydd cyfle i edrych ar ailstrwythuro arian piler 2 er mwyn sicrhau ein bod yn cael ein cyfran deg o ganlyniad i'r

result of those negotiations, there may be the prospect of it not having the kind of impacts that you are talking about.

I would be interested to know whether Plaid Cymru's position is that is still committed to joining the single currency. Looking at the experience of Ireland, Spain, Greece and other eurozone countries, that loss of sovereignty and freedom would be economically disastrous for Wales. I would also be interested to hear how Wales's negotiating position could ever be stronger than it currently is as part of the UK member state. Again, the Plaid Cymru approach has been to favour separatism and independence, which is a position that could leave it without any cards on the EU negotiating table and would almost certainly lead to a poorer deal for Wales.

The way in which European funding is spent in Wales also deserves oversight if those funds are to be effective in developing a strong and sustainable Welsh economy. The Welsh Government has an extremely poor track record with Objective 1 and convergence funding. Amendment 2 from the Liberal Democrats rightly points out that, after eight years and £6 billion in funding, the west Wales and the valleys region is poorer and set to qualify again as one of Europe's poorest regions in 2013. It is a damning indictment of the Welsh Government's use of this funding that, despite the huge sums spent, the poorest Welsh communities get poorer, while, elsewhere in Europe, in countries such as Slovakia and Latvia, this funding has brought growth and prosperity that has lifted those areas out of poverty. Across Europe, the economies of member states are in a fragile state. More than ever, this situation demands restraint and responsibility from the European Union and better accountability and oversight of how the Welsh Government spends this money in Wales. I urge Members to support the Welsh Conservatives' amendments to this motion.

William Powell: I start today by thanking Plaid Cymru for tabling this important debate and, in doing so, to pay tribute my neighbour

cyd-drafodaethau hynny, gall fod posibilrwydd na welwn y fath effeithiau yr ydych yn sôn amdanynt.

Hoffwn wybod a yw Plaid Cymru yn dal o blaid ymuno â'r arian sengl. O edrych ar brofiad Iwerddon, Sbaen, Gwlad Groeg a gwledydd eraill yn ardal yr ewro, byddai colli sofraniaeth a rhyddid yn y fath fodd yn drychineb economaidd i Gymru. Hoffwn hefyd glywed sut y gallai sefyllfa Cymru mewn cyd-drafodaethau byth fod yn gryfach nag ar hyn o bryd fel rhan o aelod-wladwriaeth y Deyrnas Unedig. Unwaith eto, mae Plaid Cymru wedi bod o blaid ymwahanu ac annibyniaeth, sef safiad a allai ei gadael heb unrhyw ddylanwad mewn cyd-drafodaethau yn yr UE a fyddai bron yn sicr o arwain at fargen waeth i Gymru.

Mae'r ffordd y mae arian Ewropeaidd yn cael ei wario yng Nghymru hefyd yn haeddu cael ei goruchwyllo er mwyn i'r arian hwnnw fod yn effeithiol o ran datblygu economi gref a chynaliadwy yng Nghymru. Mae gan Lywodraeth Cymru record wael iawn gydag Amcan 1 ac arian cydgyfeirio. Mae gwelliant 2 y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn nodi'n gwbl gywir, ar ôl wyth mlynedd a £6 biliwn o arian, fod gorllewin Cymru a'r cymoedd yn dlotach ac yn debygol o fod yn gymwys i gael arian unwaith eto fel un o ranbarthau tlotaf Ewrop yn 2013. Mae'n gondemniad o ddefnydd Llywodraeth Cymru o'r arian hwn, sef, er gwaethaf y symiau enfawr a wariwyd, fod cymunedau tlotaf Cymru yn mynd yn dlotach, ond, mewn mannau eraill yn Ewrop, mewn gwledydd fel Slofacia a Latfia, fod yr arian hwn wedi sicrhau twf a ffyniant sydd wedi codi'r ardaloedd hynny allan o dlodi. Ledled Ewrop, mae economïau aelod-wladwriaethau mewn cyflwr bregus. Yn fwy nag erioed, mae'r sefyllfa hon yn gofyn am ymatal a chyfrifoldeb ar ran yr Undeb Ewropeaidd a gwell atebolrwydd a goruchwyliaeth o ran y ffordd y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn gwario'r arian hwn yng Nghymru. Anogaf yr Aelodau i gefnogi gwelliannau'r Ceidwadwyr Cymreig i'r cynnig hwn.

William Powell: Rwyf am ddechrau heddiw drwy ddiolch i Blaid Cymru am gyflwyno'r ddadl bwysig hon ac, wrth wneud hynny,

Rhodri Glyn Thomas for his ongoing work as a member of the Committee of the Regions, which gives him additional credibility in this area. Wales and its economy depend heavily on the European Union, as we have heard, and it is essential that this Chamber becomes a strong and consistent advocate for Wales in Europe, ensuring that Wales makes the most of the benefits that UK membership brings to us as a nation.

I wish to focus my contribution on amendment 4 and the critical importance of the common agricultural policy to the wider Welsh economy. It is essential that we all speak with one voice on this issue to deliver the best deal for Wales when it comes to the CAP. I am glad to see that the Deputy Minister has, once again, been engaging energetically with this issue earlier in the week, both in Westminster and in Brussels. As our amendment states, the negotiations on the current round are at a critical phase. United Kingdom Ministers and Ministers from the devolved administrations must work together, regardless of party affiliation, to ensure that our farmers and the wider rural economy get a fair deal.

It is clear, as has already been mentioned by colleagues around the Chamber, that the Welsh and UK Governments' position have been somewhat undermined by the recent political opportunism of the parliamentary Labour Party in London in voting for a reduction in the budget without even consulting key people, some of whom are in this Chamber today. However, it is paramount that we move forward together now, setting aside previous indiscretions, so that negotiations can move forward in a constructive and positive way.

As Members will be aware, the current set of reforms expects to see the CAP budget fall to around 32% of the total EU budget. While still a substantial amount, that is around a 10% drop from its current proportion, and it will still have to deliver the same standard of support to farmers and to support wider rural development in our communities. While it is

dalun teyrnged i'm cymydog Rhodri Glyn Thomas am ei waith parhaus fel aelod o Bwyllgor y Rhanbarthau, sy'n rhoi hygredded ychwanegol iddo yn y maes hwn. Mae Cymru a'i heconomi yn dibynnu'n fawr iawn ar yr Undeb Ewropeaidd, fel y clywsom, ac mae'n hanfodol bod y Siambr hon yn dod yn eiriolwr cryf a chyson dros Gymru yn Ewrop, gan sicrhau bod Cymru yn gwneud y gorau o'r manteision a ddaw i ni fel cenedl o ganlyniad i aelodaeth y DU.

Yn fy nghyfraniad, hoffwn ganolbwyntio ar welliant 4 a phwysigrwydd hanfodol y polisi amaethyddol cyffredin i economi ehangach Cymru. Mae'n hanfodol ein bod i gyd yn siarad ag un llais ar y mater hwn er mwyn sicrhau'r fargen orau i Gymru o ran y PAC. Rwy'n falch o weld bod y Dirprwy Weinidog, unwaith eto, wedi bod yn ymwneud yn egniol â'r mater hwn yn gynharach yn yr wythnos, yn San Steffan ac ym Mrwsel. Fel y noda ein gwelliant, mae'r cyd-drafodaethau ar y cylch presennol wedi cyrraedd cam allweddol. Rhaid i Weinidogion y Deyrnas Unedig a Gweinidogion y gweinyddiaethau datganoledig weithio gyda'i gilydd, waeth beth fo'u plaid, er mwyn sicrhau bod ein ffermwyr a'r economi wledig ehangach yn cael bargaen deg.

Mae'n amlwg, fel y crybwyllwyd eisoes gan gyd-Aelodau yn y Siambr, fod sefyllfa Llywodraeth Cymru a Llywodraeth y DU wedi cael ei thanseilio braidd gan oportiwnistiaeth wleidyddol ddiweddar y Blaid Lafur seneddol yn Llundain wrth iddi bleidleisio dros ostyngiad yn y gyllideb heb hyd yn oed ymgynghori â phobl allweddol, y mae rhai ohonynt yn y Siambr hon heddiw. Fodd bynnag, mae'n hollbwysig ein bod yn symud ymlaen gyda'n gilydd yn awr, gan anghofio am lithriadau blaenorol, fel y gall y cyd-drafodaethau fynd rhagddynt mewn ffordd adeiladol a chadarnhaol.

Fel y gwyr yr Aelodau, o dan y gyfres gyfredol o ddiwygiadau, disgwylir i'r PAC ostwng i oddeutu 32% o gyfanswm cyllideb yr UE. Er ei fod yn dal yn swm sylweddol, mae hynny'n ostyngiad o oddeutu 10% o'i gyfran bresennol, a bydd angen o hyd iddo gynnig yr un safon o gymorth i ffermwyr a chefnogi datblygu gwledig ehangach yn ein

difficult to contemplate, we know that it is unlikely that many of our farms, particularly our smaller farms, could survive without this policy—reformed as it will be in coming years—remaining in place. We are therefore highly dependent upon it. In pushing for effective reform, we must, however, ensure that issues such as the implications of greening measures do not adversely affect the farming industry and that farmers are afforded an appropriate amount of time to adjust their businesses to the new funding regime without jeopardising productivity or the future viability of their farms. While the specifics of the EU budget are often neglected by Eurosceptics and Europhobes in our media and in our political institutions, those specifics, as David Rees eloquently pointed out, nonetheless tell the true story of what the European Union has been designed to achieve from the days of Schuman onwards and, indeed, does achieve year on year. That must not be jeopardised for the short-term interest of a by-election or to appease a grumpy leadership rival. In this case, it is fair to say that two Eds are not better than one.

While the case for Welsh farmers has been weakened by recent events, I urge Welsh Ministers to stand up to their counterparts on the other side of the M4, just as we in this party have to counter the dogmatic Europhobes who sit on the coalition benches to work in the joint national interest.

The Deputy Minister for Agriculture, Food, Fisheries and European Programmes (Alun Davies): It is good to follow my old friend from Wales in Europe days, when we campaigned together on some of these issues. I hope that, in the debate this afternoon, we will see a cross-party consensus supporting the role that we play as a country in Europe.

I will first outline the Government's approach to the amendments to this motion. Our recognition of the significance to Wales of the EU and EU budget leads us to support amendment 1 on the budget, to oppose

cymunedau. Er ei bod yn anodd dygymod ag ef; gwyddom ei bod yn annhebygol y gallai llawer o'n ffermydd, yn enwedig ein ffermydd bach, oroesi oni fydd y polisi hwn—er ar ei ffurf ddiwygiedig yn y blynyddoedd sydd i ddod—yn parhau. Rydym felly yn ddibynnol iawn arno. Wrth annog diwygiadau effeithiol, rhaid inni, fodd bynnag, sicrhau nad yw materion megis goblygiadau mesurau gwyrdd yn cael effaith andwyol ar y diwydiant ffermio a bod ffermwyr yn cael amser priodol i addasu eu busnesau at y drefn ariannu newydd heb beryglu cynhyrchiant na hyfywedd eu ffermydd yn y dyfodol. Er bod manylion cyllideb yr UE yn aml yn cael eu hesgeuluso gan Ewrosgetigiaid ac Ewroffobiaid yn ein cyfryngau a'n sefydliadau gwleidyddol, mae'r manylion hynny, fel y nododd David Rees yn huawdl, serch hynny yn dweud y gwir stori o'r hyn y mae'r Undeb Ewropeaidd wedi cael ei gynllunio i'w gyflawni o ddyddiau Schuman ymlaen ac, yn wir, yr hyn y mae'n llwyddo i'w gyflawni flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn. Ni ddylid peryglu hynny er mwyn sicrhau mantais yn y tymor byr oherwydd isetholiad neu i dawelu cystadleuydd blin am arweinyddiaeth y blaid. Yn yr achos hwn, teg dweud nad yw dau Ed yn well nag un.

Er bod achos ffermwyr Cymru wedi cael ei wanhanu gan y digwyddiadau diweddar, anogaf Weinidogion Cymru i herio eu cymheiriaid ar ben arall yr M4, yn union fel yr ydym ni yn y blaid hon yn gorfod gwrthsefyll y Ewroffobiaid dogmatig sy'n eistedd ar feinciau'r glymblaid er mwyn gweithio er y budd cenedlaethol ar y cyd.

Y Dirprwy Weinidog Amaethyddiaeth, Rhaglenni Bwyd, Pysgodfeydd a Rhaglenni Ewropeaidd (Alun Davies): Mae'n braf dilyn fy hen ffrind o'm dyddiau Cymru yn Ewrop, pan oeddem yn ymgyrchu gyda'n gilydd ar rai o'r materion hyn. Gobeithiaf, yn y ddadl y prynhawn yma, y byddwn yn gweld consensws trawsbleidiol o blaid y rôl yr ydym yn ei chwarae fel gwlad yn Ewrop.

Yn gyntaf amlinellaf ymagwedd y Llywodraeth tuag at y gwelliannau i'r cynnig hwn. Mae ein cydnabyddiaeth o bwysigrwydd yr UE a chyllideb yr UE i Gymru yn ein harwain i gefnogi gwelliant 1

amendments 2 and 3 on structural funds, to support amendment 4 on the CAP and the budget, to oppose amendment 5 on the level of the budget and to support amendments 6 and 7 on the importance of engagement with the UK Government on EU issues and the future of structural funds.

I will start my substantive contribution today by describing briefly the approach of the Welsh Government to engagement with the European Union. All too often, those who dislike the whole concept of the European Union dominate the debate on its future. We in Wales must be forthright in challenging the nay-sayers by continuing to make the case, not least in this important week of the summit on the long-term budget, that the EU has made a massive contribution to peace and prosperity in Europe. We are a pro-European Government. We want our relationship with the European Union to be far more than simply a transactional relationship, whereby we are the recipients of EU funding streams. We actively seek to broaden and deepen Wales's relationship with all of the institutions of the European Union. We do this because we share the vision and values of that union and because our ambitions for Wales are for Wales to play a positive and constructive role, strengthening both our place in the European Union and that of the United Kingdom as a whole. I want Wales to contribute to the union in terms of thinking and sharing our experience and knowledge with our friends across the whole of the continent.

In emphasising this positive role for Wales, I take this opportunity to put on record my gratitude to the Foreign Office and to UKrep for their help and support, without which our role in representing Wales would be impossible. I am particularly grateful to the Foreign Secretary and to David Lidington, the Minister for Europe, for their positive support in enabling our contribution to ministerial councils as a part of the UK ministerial team. Members will be aware that yesterday I attended the General Affairs Council alongside David Lidington. Next week, I will be attending further meetings of the Agriculture and Fisheries Council.

ar y gyllideb, i wrthwynebu gwelliannau 2 a 3 ar gronfeydd strwythurol, i gefnogi gwelliant 4 ar y PAC a'r gyllideb, i wrthwynebu gwelliant 5 ar lefel y gyllideb ac i gefnogi gwelliannau 6 a 7 ar bwysigrwydd ymgysylltu â Llywodraeth y DU ar faterion yr UE a dyfodol y cronfeydd strwythurol.

Dechreuaf fy mhrif gyfraniad heddiw drwy ddisgrifio'n fyr sut y mae Llywodraeth Cymru am ymgysylltu â'r Undeb Ewropeaidd. Yn rhy aml, y rhai nad ydynt yn hoffi cysyniad yr Undeb Ewropeaidd o gwbl sydd uchaf eu cloch yn y ddadl ar ei ddyfodol. Rhaid inni yng Nghymru fod yn bendant o ran herio'r gwrthwynebwyr drwy barhau i gyflwyno'r achos, yn enwedig yn yr wythnos bwysig hon yn ystod yr uwchgynhadledd ar y gyllideb hirdymor, bod yr UE wedi gwneud cyfraniad enfawr at heddwch a ffyniant yn Ewrop. Rydym yn Llywodraeth sydd o blaid Ewrop. Rydym am i'n perthynas â'r Undeb Ewropeaidd fod yn llawer mwy na pherthynas drafodaethol yn unig, lle rydym ond yn derbyn ffrydiau cyllid yr UE. Rydym yn mynd ati i geisio ehangu a dwysáu perthynas Cymru â phob un o sefydliadau'r Undeb Ewropeaidd. Rydym yn gwneud hyn am ein bod yn rhannu gweledigaeth a gwerthoedd yr undeb hwnnw ac am ein bod yn arddel uchelgais dros Gymru sy'n chwarae rhan gadarnhaol ac adeiladol, gan gryfhau ein lle yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd a lle'r Deyrnas Unedig yn ei chyfanrwydd. Rwyf am i Gymru gyfrannu at yr undeb o ran syniadau a rhannu ein profiad a'n gwybodaeth gyda'n ffrindiau dros y cyfandir cyfan.

Wrth bwysleisio'r rôl gadarnhaol hon i Gymru, hoffwn achub ar y cyfle hwn i ddiolch i'r Swyddfa Dramor ac UKrep am eu cymorth a'u cefnogaeth, y byddai ein rôl o ran cynrychioli Cymru yn amhosibl hebddynt. Rwy'n arbennig o ddiolchgar i'r Ysgrifennydd Tramor, ac i David Lidington, y Gweinidog dros Ewrop, am eu cefnogaeth gadarnhaol i'w gwneud yn bosibl inni gyfrannu at gynghorau gweinidogol fel rhan o dîm gweinidogol y DU. Gŵyr yr Aelodau imi fynychu'r Cyngor Materion Cyffredinol ddoe ochr yn ochr â David Lidington. Yr wythnos nesaf, byddaf yn mynychu cyfarfodydd pellach o'r Cyngor Amaethyddiaeth a Physgodfeydd.

I believe that the UK is strengthened, not weakened, by having strong ministerial representation from all UK administrations. In addition to our joint ministerial meetings to discuss forthcoming EU business, we have the opportunity to discuss the UK approach and policy on both the budget and other EU issues, from CAP to transport to regional policy.

Members may be aware that my colleague, the Minister for Finance and Leader of the House, has spoken directly to the Financial Secretary to the Treasury, Greg Clark, who will be leading for the United Kingdom Government on the EU budget debate and is doing so today. We welcome the UK Government's agreement that it will actively discuss the UK's position with us during this week's summit.

I am also anxious today, for the avoidance of any doubt, to emphasise and restate the Welsh Government's position on the EU budget negotiations. This position has already been articulated by the First Minister and the Minister for Finance in a number of arenas and on a number of occasions. We have made crystal clear during these negotiations that a cut in the EU budget would not be in Wales's interest. We want spending maintained at current levels, both within the CAP and structural funds, to help us through the current economic climate. Any delay in approving the budget would mean delays in implementing the new programmes in 2014.

So, to be clear, any delay in agreeing this budget and any cuts to either CAP or structural funds would not be in Wales's best interests. I would like to use the opportunity of this debate to again urge the UK Prime Minister to reach agreement with other heads of Government on a new budget later this week, and on a budget that helps us to invest in jobs and growth.

The Welsh Government shares a strong focus on economic growth with our friends in the European Union. More than 500 businesses

Credaf fod y DU yn cael ei chryfhau, nid ei gwanhau, drwy gael cynrychiolaeth weinidogol gref gan bob un o weinyddiaethau'r DU. Yn ogystal â'n cyfarfodydd gweinidogol ar y cyd i drafod busnes arfaethedig yr UE, cawn gyfle i drafod ymagwedd a pholisi'r DU o ran y gyllideb a materion eraill yr UE, o'r PAC i drafnidiaeth i bolisi rhanbarthol.

Efallai fod yr Aelodau'n ymwybodol bod fy nghyd-Aelod, y Gweinidog Cyllid ac Arweinydd y Tŷ, wedi siarad yn uniongyrchol ag Ysgrifennydd Ariannol y Trysorlys, Greg Clark, a fydd yn arwain y ddadl ar gyllideb yr UE ar ran Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig ac bydd yn gwneud hynny heddiw. Rydym yn croesawu cytundeb Llywodraeth y DU y bydd yn mynd ati i drafod safbwynt y DU gyda ni yn ystod yr uwchgynhadledd yr wythnos hon.

Rwyf hefyd yn awyddus heddiw, er mwyn osgoi amheuaeth, i bwysleisio ac ailddatgan safbwynt Llywodraeth Cymru ar y cyd-drafodaethau ar gyllideb yr UE. Mae'r safbwynt hwn eisoes wedi cael ei fynegi gan y Prif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog Cyllid ar nifer o lwyfannau ac ar sawl achlysur. Rydym wedi'i gwneud yn gwbl glir yn ystod y cyd-drafodaethau hyn na fyddai toriad yng nghyllideb yr UE er budd Cymru. Hoffem weld gwariant yn parhau ar y lefelau presennol, o fewn y PAC a'r cronfeydd strwythurol, er mwyn ein helpu drwy'r hinsawdd economaidd bresennol. Byddai unrhyw oedi cyn cymeradwyo'r gyllideb yn golygu oedi o ran gweithredu'r rhaglenni newydd yn 2014.

Felly, er mwyn bod yn glir, ni fyddai unrhyw oedi cyn cytuno ar y gyllideb nac unrhyw doriadau i'r PAC na'r cronfeydd strwythurol o fudd i Gymru. Hoffwn fanteisio ar y cyfle yn y ddadl hon i annog Prif Weinidog y DU unwaith eto i ddod i gytundeb â phenaethiaid y Llywodraethau eraill ar gyllideb newydd yn nes ymlaen yr wythnos hon, ac ar gyllideb sy'n ein helpu i fuddsoddi mewn swyddi a thwf.

Mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn rhannu ffocws cryf ar dwf economaidd gyda'n ffrindiau yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd. Mae mwy na 500 o

in Wales export goods worth over £5 billion annually to other EU member states, with some 150,000 jobs in Wales depending on that trade. Additionally, more than 450 firms from other member states are located in Wales, employing over 50,000 people. It has already been stated by many Members across all parts of the Chamber this afternoon that Wales derives great advantages from EU programmes. We understand that, during the current programme period, Wales is benefiting from the support of £1.8 billion from structural funds which, together with match funding, is worth over £3.5 billion of investment in total. This investment has had a direct impact on the lives of people across Wales and in our most vulnerable communities. Any cuts in structural funds would hit the most fragile communities the hardest.

Members have spoken about individual programmes and projects that have affected them and their constituents. I know, as the Member for Blaenau Gwent, how important the structural funds programmes are to many of our communities. I know, from my own constituency, that almost 100 businesses and 500 new jobs have been created with the assistance of the structural funds programme. I also know that almost 4,000 previously economically inactive and unemployed people in my constituency have been helped into work over the last five years. In addition, EU projects have assisted over 7,000 people in Blaenau Gwent to gain qualifications and over 3,000 people to enter further learning. We are transforming lives in communities up and down Wales. I also know how important it has been to long-term investment in economic growth and in supporting the creation of jobs. The new innovative learning facility in Blaenau Gwent, which opened to students in September this year, received support from the European regional development fund.

4.45 p.m.

The economy and communities of all parts of Wales benefit from our EU membership. Many speakers have spoken about the importance of CAP. The Welsh Government

fusnesau yng Nghymru yn allforio nwyddau gwerth dros £5 biliwn y flwyddyn i aelod-wladwriaethau eraill yr UE, gyda rhyw 150,000 o swyddi yng Nghymru yn dibynnu ar y fasnach. Yn ogystal, mae mwy na 450 o gwmnïau o aelod-wladwriaethau eraill wedi'u lleoli yng Nghymru, gan gyflogi dros 50,000 o bobl. Datganwyd hyn eisoes gan nifer o Aelodau o bob rhan o'r Siambr y prynhawn yma bod Cymru yn cael manteision mawr o raglenni'r UE. Rydym ar ddeall, yn ystod cyfnod y rhaglen gyfredol, y bydd Cymru yn elwa o gael £1.8 biliwn o arian o'r cronfeydd strwythurol sydd, ynghyd ag arian cyfatebol, yn werth cyfanswm o fwy na £3.5 biliwn o fuddsoddiad. Mae'r buddsoddiad hwn wedi cael effaith uniongyrchol ar fywydau pobl ledled Cymru ac yn ein cymunedau mwyaf agored i niwed. Ar y cymunedau mwyaf bregus y byddai unrhyw doriadau mewn cronfeydd strwythurol yn effeithio fwyaf.

Mae Aelodau wedi sôn am raglenni a phrosiectau unigol sydd wedi effeithio arnynt hwy a'u hetholwyr. Gwn, fel yr Aelod dros Flaenau Gwent, pa mor bwysig yw'r rhaglenni cronfeydd strwythurol i lawer o'n cymunedau. Gwn, o'm hetholaeth fy hun, fod bron 100 o fusnesau a 500 o swyddi newydd wedi cael eu creu gyda chymorth y rhaglen cronfeydd strwythurol. Gwn hefyd fod bron i 4,000 o bobl a fu gynt yn economaidd anweithgar ac yn ddi-waith yn fy etholaeth wedi cael eu helpu i mewn i waith dros y pum mlynedd diwethaf. Yn ogystal, mae prosiectau'r UE wedi helpu dros 7,000 o bobl ym Mlaenau Gwent i ennill cymwysterau a thros 3,000 o bobl i gael addysg bellach. Rydym yn trawsnewid bywydau mewn cymunedau ar hyd a lled Cymru. Gwn hefyd pa mor bwysig y bu i fuddsoddiadau hirdymor mewn twf economaidd ac i helpu i greu swyddi. Cafodd y cyfleuster dysgu arloesol newydd ym Mlaenau Gwent, a agorodd i fyfyrwyr ym mis Medi eleni, gymorth gan gronfa datblygu rhanbarthol Ewrop.

Mae economi a chymunedau o bob rhan o Gymru yn elwa ar ein haelodaeth o'r UE. Soniodd sawl siaradwr am bwysigrwydd y PAC. Mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn cydnabod

recognises that and believes that CAP should be maintained at current levels. The £260 million that is paid each year in the form of direct payments to over 16,000 farmers not only secures the future of those individual businesses, but also ensures the future of an essential part of the economy and community of rural Wales. The Welsh Government will stand firm with rural Wales and will seek to oppose further cuts to the CAP budget. I want to make that absolutely clear this afternoon.

For all the reasons that I have given and that we have debated this afternoon, we have been proactive in making the case for the EU's long-term budget for the funding of these programmes to be maintained. Our work on the EU budget has not simply been through the UK Government. We have made our case directly to the European Commission and the European Parliament. The First Minister met with the budget commissioner, Commissioner Lewandowski, and the regional policy commissioner, Commissioner Hahn, in Brussels earlier this year. Both Commissioner Hahn and the agriculture commissioner, Commissioner Ciolos, have visited Wales this year. The European Commission recognises that the Welsh Government is a constructive partner and a firm, positive and passionate advocate of the wider benefits of EU membership. I have met with the lead MEPs on the structural funds and the CAP on several occasions to state the Welsh Government's view on both programmes and the overall budget. I will be doing so again in the next few weeks.

I believe that many Members across all parts of the Chamber will share my views. There is more that unites us than divides us. We are better together, and that applies to both the UK and EU contexts. I hope that this afternoon we will reaffirm that this Chamber, this Government and this institution are firmly pro-Europe and support the contribution that the EU makes to Wales, but also, underpinning that, the contribution that Wales can make to the EU.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Diolch yn gynnes iawn i bawb sydd wedi cymryd rhan yn y ddatl hynod bwysig ac amserol hon. Mae 11 o

hynny ac yn credu y dylai'r PAC barhau ar y lefelau presennol. Mae'r £260 miliwn a delir bob blwyddyn ar ffurf taliadau uniongyrchol i dros 16,000 o ffermwyr nid yn unig yn sicrhau dyfodol y busnesau unigol hynny, ond hefyd yn sicrhau dyfodol rhan hanfodol o economi a chymuned y Gymru wledig. Bydd Llywodraeth Cymru yn sefyll yn gadarn â Chymru wledig a bydd yn ceisio gwrthwynebu toriadau pellach i gyllideb y PAC. Rwyf am wneud hynny'n gwbl glir y prynhawn yma.

Am yr holl resymau yr wyf wedi'u rhoi, ac yr ydym wedi'u trafod y prynhawn yma, rydym wedi bod yn rhagweithiol o ran cyflwyno'r achos y dylai cyllideb hirdymor yr UE barhau i ariannu'r rhaglenni hyn. Nid dim ond drwy Lywodraeth y DU yr ydym wedi bod yn gweithio ar gyllideb yr UE. Rydym wedi cyflwyno ein hachos yn uniongyrchol i'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd a Senedd Ewrop. Cyfarfu'r Prif Weinidog â chomisiynydd y gyllideb, y Comisiynydd Lewandowski, a'r comisiynydd polisi rhanbarthol, y Comisiynydd Hahn, ym Mrwsel yn gynharach eleni. Mae'r Comisiynydd Hahn a'r comisiynydd amaethyddiaeth, y Comisiynydd Ciolos, wedi ymweld â Chymru eleni. Mae'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd yn cydnabod bod Llywodraeth Cymru yn bartner adeiladol ac yn eiriolwr cadarn, cadarnhaol a brwdfrydig dros fanteision ehangach aelodaeth o'r UE. Rwyf wedi cyfarfod â'r ASEau arweiniol ar y cronfeydd strwythurol a'r PAC ar sawl achlysur i ddatgan barn Llywodraeth Cymru ar raglenni a'r gyllideb gyffredinol. Gwnaf hynny eto yn yr ychydig wythnosau nesaf.

Credaf y bydd llawer o Aelodau o bob rhan o'r Siambr yn rhannu fy marn. Mae mwy yn ein huno nag sy'n ein rhannu. Rydym yn well gyda'n gilydd, ac mae hynny'n berthnasol i gyd-destun y DU a'r UE. Gobeithiaf y prynhawn yma, y byddwn yn cadarnhau bod y Siambr hon, y Llywodraeth hon a'r sefydliad hwn yn gadarn o blaid Ewrop ac yn cefnogi'r cyfraniad y mae'r UE yn ei wneud i Gymru, ond hefyd, yn sail i hynny, y cyfraniad y gall Cymru ei wneud i'r UE.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: I sincerely thank everyone who has contributed to this very important and timely debate. Eleven

Aelodau o bob plaid wedi cymryd rhan, ac mae hwnnw'n ffigur sylweddol, gan ddangos ein bod ni i gyd yn derbyn bod hon yn ddadl hynod bwysig.

Agorwyd y ddadl gan Rhodri Glyn Thomas, gan ein cynorthwyo i roi'r ddadl hon yn ei chyd-destun, ac nid yn unig cyd-destun ariannol y gyllideb, ond cyd-destun rôl Cymru o fewn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd a phwysigrwydd hynny a lle rydym yn sefyll ar y cynfas Ewropeaidd. Cyfeiriodd yn benodol at y buddiannau y mae Cymru yn eu cael o'r Undeb Ewropeaidd, a rhyddhawyd ffigurau gan swyddfa Jill Evans heddiw sy'n awgrymu bod pob person yng Nghymru yn cyfrannu €195, ond rydym yn cael gwerth €243 o fuddiannau. I drosglwyddo hynny i'n harian ni, mae'n golygu bod Cymru yn elwa £40 y pen. Mae'r ddadl honno yn un bwysig, ac eglurodd hefyd yr holl feysydd lle mae hynny'n digwydd—y polisi amaethyddol cyffredin, y rhaglen datblygu rhanbarthol, y cronfeydd strwythurol ac yn y blaen.

Cyfeiriodd Rhodri Glyn at y ffaith yr oeddem wedi gobeithio cael cefnogaeth Llywodraeth Cymru i'r cynnig hwn, ac rwy'n hynod falch am gyfraniad y Dirprwy Weinidog yn yr achos hwn. Mae wedi rhoi safbwynt Llywodraeth Cymru yn ddiamwys ac yn glir, sef bod Cymru'n elwa o fod yn aelod o'r Undeb Ewropeaidd a bod angen inni amddiffyn y cronfeydd sydd mor bwysig i Gymru. Mae wedi bod yn ddigon dewr i ddilyn lein sydd efallai'n wahanol i'r hyn a roddwyd gan ei gyfeillion yn San Steffan. Dyna pam yr ydym wedi cael ein hethol i gynrychioli pobl Cymru: am ein bod yn amddiffyn buddiannau pobl Cymru. Dyna'r hyn yr oeddwn yn gobeithio y byddai'r Blaid Geidwadol yn ei wneud hefyd, sef cynrychioli pobl Cymru.

Antoinette Sandbach: We did. I stood up and supported the role—

Simon Thomas: You did, but what about Byron?

Antoinette Sandbach: He did, too. He recognised the role that Europe plays. Where we have an issue is with setting the level of the budget, not our role in Europe.

Members from all parties have contributed, which is a substantial number, and shows that we all accept that this is an exceptionally important debate.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas opened the debate, and assisted us by placing the whole debate in context, and not just the financial context of the budget, but the context of Wales's role within the European Union and the importance of that, and where we stand on the European canvas. He made specific reference to the benefits that accrue to Wales from the European Union, and figures released from Jill Evans's office today suggest that Wales's contribution is €195 per capita, but we get benefits worth €243 per capita. To translate that into our money, that means that Welsh people benefit to the sum of £40 a head. That is an important case to make, but he also explained all the areas in which that happens—the common agricultural policy, the regional development programme, structural funds and so on.

Rhodri Glyn also referred to the fact that we had hoped to get the support of the Welsh Government for this motion, and I am exceptionally pleased about the Deputy Minister's contribution, in that case. He has placed the Welsh Government's position on record unambiguously and clearly, namely that Wales benefits from being a member of the European Union and we need to defend the funds that are so important to Wales. He has been courageous enough to follow a line that is perhaps different from that adopted by his colleagues at Westminster. That is why we were elected to represent the people of Wales: to safeguard the interests of the people of Wales. That is what I had hoped the Conservative Party would do, too, namely represent the people of Wales.

Antoinette Sandbach: Gwnaethom. Sefais i fyny a chefnogi'r rôl—

Simon Thomas: Do, ond beth am Byron?

Antoinette Sandbach: Gwnaeth yntau hefyd. Cydnabu'r rôl y mae Ewrop yn ei chwarae. Y broblem i ni yw'r ffordd y pennir lefel y gyllideb, nid ein rôl yn Ewrop.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Byron also said that he was not supporting Wales, he was supporting David Cameron. Those were the precise words that he used. If we follow what David Cameron wants, there would be a freeze, which is effectively a cut in the budget, because it is fixed. What I had hoped for today was that the Welsh Conservatives would be brave enough to speak for Wales and stand up for Wales. That is what we want in the Chamber.

Felly, gadewch imi symud ymlaen. Rwy'n derbyn bod Eluned Parrott wedi gwneud rhai pwyntiau am y defnydd a wnaed o arian Ewropeaidd yn y gorffennol, ac mae pwyntiau y gallai rhywun eu gwneud i wrthbwysu hynny, ond y realiti yw ei bod hi hefyd yn gweld pwysigrwydd y cronfeydd i Gymru. Cyfeiriodd Dafydd Elis-Thomas at y cynfas ehangach, a phwysigrwydd arian yr Undeb Ewropeaidd—nid oherwydd yr arian ei hun, ond am yr hyn y byddai'r arian hwnnw yn ei wneud inni, o safbwynt ein hamgylchedd ni, a'r economi wledig.

Mike Hedges referred to the benefits that come to Wales as a result of EU projects and the way in which we want to protect the skills budget, for example. He mentioned skills specifically, and we are very proud of the fact that, in our negotiations with the Government this year, we ensured that there was £20 million extra for apprenticeships. We very much hope that the European social fund will help us to extend the reach of that kind of project. Any cut in the budget would mean that that would be much more difficult in the future.

Soniodd Llyr Huws Gruffydd am daliadau'r CAP wrth danlinellu mor hanfodol i ddyfodol ffermydd teuluol yng Nghymru yw'r arian sy'n dod o'r Undeb Ewropeaidd—gwerth £39 miliwn y flwyddyn. Soniodd hefyd am y cynlluniau amaeth-amgylcheddol yn gysylltiedig â hynny.

David Rees talked about the benefits of European funding, as well, and made a very thoughtful contribution, if I may say so, about Wales's position within the European Union. Antoinette made a contribution, some

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Dywedodd Byron hefyd nad oedd yn cefnogi Cymru, ei fod yn cefnogi David Cameron. Dyna'r union eiriau a ddefnyddiodd. Os ydym yn dilyn yr hyn y mae David Cameron am ei gael, byddai'r gyllideb yn cael ei rhewi, sydd, i bob pwrpas, yn doriad yn y gyllideb, oherwydd ei fod yn sefydlog. Yr hyn yr oeddwn wedi gobeithio ei weld heddiw oedd y byddai'r Ceidwadwyr Cymreig yn ddigon dewr i siarad dros Gymru a sefyll i fyny dros Gymru. Dyna beth yr ydym am ei weld yn y Siambr.

Therefore, let us move on. I accept that Eluned Parrott made some points about the use made of European funds in the past, and there are arguments that one could make to counter those points, but the reality is that she also knows the importance of these funds to Wales. Dafydd Elis-Thomas made reference to the bigger picture, and to the importance of European funding—not because of the funding itself, but because of what can be achieved with that funding, from the point of view of our environment and the rural economy.

Cyfeiriodd Mike Hedges at y manteision a ddaw i Gymru o ganlyniad i brosiectau'r UE a'r ffordd yr ydym yn awyddus i warchod y gyllideb sgiliau, er enghraifft. Soniodd am sgiliau penodol, ac rydym yn falch iawn o'r ffaith, yn ein trafodaethau â'r Llywodraeth y flwyddyn hon, ein bod wedi sicrhau bod £20 miliwn yn ychwanegol ar gyfer prentisiaethau. Rydym yn mawr obeithio y bydd y gronfa gymdeithasol Ewropeaidd yn ein helpu i ymestyn cyrhaeddiad y math hwnnw o brosiect. Byddai unrhyw doriad yn y gyllideb yn golygu y byddai hynny'n llawer mwy anodd yn y dyfodol.

Llyr Huws Gruffydd talked about the CAP payments in underlining just how crucial the money that comes from the European Union is to the future of family farms in Wales—a value of £39 million per annum. He also talked about the agri-environment schemes related to that.

Soniodd David Rees am fanteision arian Ewropeaidd, yn ogystal, a gwnaeth gyfraniad meddylgar iawn, os caf ddweud, am sefyllfa Cymru o fewn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd. Gwnaeth Antoinette gyfraniad, yr oedd

of which was quite positive—particularly when she congratulated us on the debate. That was very helpful. However, I must confess that, when Antoinette was driven to talk about things like the single currency and independence, I thought, ‘Well, Antoinette has lost it, really’. What we are here to talk about today is the budget—the budget for the European Union—not the single currency. We can have another debate about that sometime in the future. We are here to get a united voice from Wales in relation to the budget of the European Union.

Cyfeiriodd William Powell wedyn at bwysigrwydd yr Undeb Ewropeaidd, gan longyfarch Rhodri Glyn, fel y dylem oll ei wneud, am ei waith ar Bwyllgor y Rhanbarthau. Gwelodd bwysigrwydd yr Undeb Ewropeaidd i'r economi wledig unwaith eto, a dangosodd hynny yn glir. Rhaid inni gydnabod bod economi'r Gymru wledig yn hynod fregus. Mae wedi cael ei tharo'n sylweddol gan y dirwasgiad economaidd, ac rydym yn gwybod bellach mor bwysig yw cronfeydd Ewrop iddi.

The Deputy Minister talked about the need for cross-party consensus here, and said that the Government is very much in favour of Wales's relationship with Europe. He could not have been clearer about the position that the Government will take in relation to the budget. We hope that, as a result of this debate, even at this late stage, we can have a unanimous vote on our motion. That is what I am asking Members for today. Yes, there are amendments, and we understand that people want to make some political points here and there, but let us unite around the motion. Let us say that there is a message coming from the National Assembly that we want to protect the EU budget because we are standing up for the interests of the people of Wales. If all parties are prepared to do that, we will have spoken with one voice, and the Deputy Minister can take that message to the UK Government and say that Wales wants that budget protected, because it is in our interests to do so.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The proposal is to agree the motion without

rhywfaint ohono'n eithaf cadarnhaol—yn enwedig pan wnaeth ein llongyfarch ar y ddadl. Roedd hynny'n ddefnyddiol iawn. Fodd bynnag, rhaid imi gyfaddef, pan aeth Antoinette ati i sôn am bethau fel yr arian sengl ac annibyniaeth, meddyliais, ‘Wel, mae Antoinette wedi'i cholli hi, mewn gwirionedd’. Yr hyn yr ydym yma i'w drafod heddiw yw'r gyllideb—cyllideb yr Undeb Ewropeaidd—nid yr arian sengl. Gallwn gael dadl arall am hynny rywbryd yn y dyfodol. Rydym yma i gael llais unedig o Gymru mewn perthynas â chyllideb yr Undeb Ewropeaidd.

William Powell then made reference to the importance of the European Union, congratulating Rhodri Glyn, as we all should, on his work on the Committee of the Regions. He identified the importance of the European Union to the rural economy once again, and demonstrated that quite clearly. We must recognise that the economy of rural Wales is extremely fragile. It suffered severe blows because of the recession, and we now know how important European funds are to that economy.

Soniodd y Dirprwy Weinidog am yr angen am gonsensws trawsbleidiol yma, a dywedodd fod y Llywodraeth yn gadarn o blaid perthynas Cymru ag Ewrop. Ni allai fod wedi bod yn gliriach am safbwynt y Llywodraeth mewn perthynas â'r gyllideb. Gobeithiwn, o ganlyniad i'r ddadl hon, hyd yn oed ar y cam hwyr hwn, y gallwn gael pleidlais unfrydol ar ein cynnig. Dyna'r hyn yr wyf yn ei geisio gan yr Aelodau heddiw. Oes, mae gwelliannu, ac rydym yn deall bod pobl yn awyddus i wneud rhai pwyntiau gwleidyddol yma ac acw, ond gadewch inni uno o gwmpas y cynnig. Gadewch inni ddweud bod neges yn dod o'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ein bod am amddiffyn cyllideb yr UE oherwydd ein bod yn sefyll i fyny dros fuddiannau pobl Cymru. Os bydd pob plaid yn barod i wneud hynny, byddwn wedi siarad ag un llais, a gall y Dirprwy Weinidog gyflwyno'r neges honno i Lywodraeth y DU a dweud bod Cymru am weld y gyllideb honno yn cael ei diogelu, oherwydd mae gwneud hynny o fudd inni.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Y cynnig yw y dylid derbyn y cynnig heb ei ddiwygio. A oes

amendment. Does any Member object? I see that there are objections, and so voting under this item is deferred until voting time.

unrhyw Aelod yn gwrthwynebu? Gwelaf fod gwrthwynebiadau, ac felly caiff pleidleisio ar yr eitem hon ei ohirio tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.

*Gohiriwyd y pleidleisio tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.
Voting deferred until voting time.*

Dadl Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru Welsh Liberal Democrats Debate

Y Cod Gweinidogol The Ministerial Code

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Rwyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw William Graham.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have selected amendment 1 in the name of William Graham.

Cynnig NDM5097 Aled Roberts

Motion NDM5097 Aled Roberts

Cynnig bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales:

Yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i sefydlu system sy'n golygu bod modd plismona'r Cod Gweinidogol yn annibynnol ar Lywodraeth Cymru a Chynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru.

Calls on the Welsh Government to establish a system that allows the Ministerial Code to be policed independently of the Welsh Government and the National Assembly for Wales.

Kirsty Williams: I move the motion on behalf of the Welsh Liberal Democrat group.

Kirsty Williams: Cynigiau y cynnig ar ran grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru.

We will also accept the amendment tabled by William Graham on behalf of the Welsh Conservatives.

Byddwn hefyd yn derbyn y gwelliant a gyflwynwyd gan William Graham ar ran y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig.

One of the fundamentals of justice is that no man should be judge in his own cause. In recent years, confidence and public respect for politics and politicians have suffered heavy blows. No political party can claim to be immune, and I believe that we all have a responsibility to do what we can, to take whatever steps we can to restore public trust in the political process and the way in which we behave.

Un o hanfodion cyfiawnder yw na ddylai neb fod yn farnwr yn ei achos ei hun. Yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf, mae hyder a pharch y cyhoedd tuag at wleidyddiaeth a gwleidyddion wedi dioddef ergydion trwm. Ni all yr un blaid wleidyddol hawlio imiwnedd rhag hynny, a chredaf fod gan bob un ohonom gyfrifoldeb i wneud yr hyn a allwn, i gymryd pa gamau bynnag a allwn i adfer ymddiriedaeth y cyhoedd yn y broses wleidyddol a'r ffordd yr ydym yn ymddwyn.

In some ways, this institution and its Members have escaped some of the worst news about politics and politicians' behaviour. From its earliest days, the Assembly has had an independent adviser on

Mewn rhai ffyrdd, mae'r sefydliad hwn a'i Aelodau wedi dianc rhag y newyddion gwaethaf am wleidyddiaeth ac ymddygiad gwleidyddion. O'i ddyddiau cynharaf, mae'r Cynulliad wedi cael cynghorydd annibynnol

standards who has sought, at every turn, to create a culture of standards within this institution. We unanimously took the earliest opportunity to put the role of that adviser on a statutory basis. We recognised the difficulties and conflicts involved in allowing politicians to vote for their own pay and allowances and, collectively and again unanimously, we took steps to address that.

As Assembly Members, we are all subject to a code of conduct, and there is a clear and transparent process by which any potential breach of that code is investigated and judged. That process is carried out by the National Assembly for Wales Commissioner for Standards. His views are subject to public scrutiny, both at the Committee on Standards of Conduct and subsequently in Plenary. His reports on the behaviour of Assembly Members are open to public scrutiny through their publication. This leads me on to the following question: if all of us in the Chamber believe that that is the correct way in which we should be monitored and our standards regulated, why do we not have comparable levels of independence and transparency for Assembly Members when they are acting in a ministerial capacity? At present, any complaint of a breach of the ministerial code must be made to the First Minister and any decision on whether a breach has occurred is decided by the First Minister.

Lord Elis-Thomas: I am grateful to Kirsty Williams for setting out that history of our work in securing independence of judgment here, of which we are all rightly proud. It might interested her to know that, during the course of my attempt to get a more independent system, I suggested informally to a succession of First Ministers that they consider using the services of the independent adviser on standards to determine cases relating to Cabinet members. However, as is evident, I did not succeed.

Kirsty Williams: I am sorry that you did not succeed. I know that this apparent discrepancy between how Assembly Members are regulated and how Ministers are

ar safonau sydd wedi ceisio, ar bob cyfle, i greu diwylliant o safonau o fewn y sefydliad hwn. Yn unfrydol, gwnaethom achub ar y cyfle cyntaf i roi rôl y cynghorydd hwnnw ar sail statudol. Gwnaethom gydnabod yr anawsterau a'r gwrthdaro sy'n gysylltiedig â chaniatáu i wleidyddion bleidleisio dros eu cyflog a'u lwfansau eu hunain ac, ar y cyd ac unwaith eto yn unfrydol, gwnaethom gymryd camau i fynd i'r afael â hynny.

Fel Aelodau'r Cynulliad, rydym oll yn ddarostyngedig i god ymddygiad, ac mae proses glir a thryloyw ar waith ar gyfer ymchwilio i unrhyw achos posibl o dorri'r cod hwnnw a'i farnu. Cyflawnir y broses honno gan Gomisiynydd Safonau Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru. Mae ei farn ef yn destun craffu cyhoeddus, yn y Pwyllgor ar Safonau Ymddygiad ac yn dilyn hynny yn y Cyfarfod Llawn. Mae'r adroddiadau ar ymddygiad Aelodau'r Cynulliad a gyhoeddir ganddo yn destun craffu cyhoeddus. Mae hyn yn fy arwain at y cwestiwn canlynol: os cred pob un ohonom yn y Siambr mai dyna'r ffordd y dylem gael ein monitro ac y dylai ein safonau gael eu rheoleiddio, pam nad oes gennym lefelau cymharol o annibyniaeth a thryloywder ar gyfer Aelodau'r Cynulliad pan maent yn gweithredu yn rhinwedd eu swydd weinidogol? Ar hyn o bryd, rhaid i unrhyw gŵyn ynghylch torri'r cod gweinidogol gael ei gwneud i'r Prif Weinidog a'r Prif Weinidog fydd yn gwneud unrhyw benderfyniad ynghylch p'un a dorwyd y cod.

Yr Arglwydd Elis-Thomas: Rwy'n ddiolchgar i Kirsty Williams am nodi'r gwaith yr ydym wedi'i wneud i sicrhau annibyniaeth barn yma, yr ydym oll yn falch ohono. Gallai fod o ddiddordeb iddi wybod, wrth geisio sicrhau system fwy annibynnol, fy mod wedi awgrymu'n anffurfiol i nifer o Brif Weinidogion y dylent ystyried defnyddio gwasanaethau'r cynghorydd annibynnol ar safonau i benderfynu ar achosion sy'n ymwneud ag aelodau'r Cabinet. Fodd bynnag, fel sy'n amlwg, ni lwyddais i wneud hynny.

Kirsty Williams: Mae'n flin gennyf na wnaethoch lwyddo. Gwn fod yr anghysondeb ymddangosiadol hwn rhwng y ffordd y caiff Aelodau'r Cynulliad eu rheoleiddio a'r ffordd

regulated has been a source of concern for previous commissioners for standards and standards committees. This matter has been addressed and debated for some time.

As I was saying, a complaint has to be made to the First Minister and any decision about whether a breach has occurred is decided by the First Minister. If you are lucky, the steps taken by the First Minister in coming to that conclusion might be outlined on one side of A4 paper. If the First Minister takes any independent advice, it is not clear from whom that advice is sought or on what basis. Surely such a system is neither appropriate nor desirable. Surely it is not desirable for the holder of the office of First Minister, given that they could be accused of not investigating these matters properly. Surely, it is neither desirable nor appropriate for individual Ministers to not be able to enjoy full clearance of their name because there will always be doubt about levels of independent scrutiny. Surely, it cannot be desirable for the Welsh Government, as an institution, to be operating in such a matter.

5.00 p.m.

Perhaps the sheer absurdity of the current system is best illustrated by a previous example that included two Assembly Members; they are no longer Members of the Chamber, which is why I chose them—so that we do not rehash old arguments. Jenny Randerson AM complained about the former First Minister, Rhodri Morgan, regarding a potential breach of the ministerial code after it appeared that he had already made up his mind on a school reorganisation issue that his Government was later expected to reach a quasi-judicial conclusion about. In this instance, the First Minister was duly investigated by the First Minister and, subsequently, cleared by the First Minister—the same said Rhodri Morgan.

As I said earlier, the limitations of the current system are not just a cause of concern for the Welsh Liberal Democrats; they have been a cause of concern for previous standards commissioners. The matter has been discussed at length by previous standards

y caiff Gweinidogion eu rheoleiddio wedi bod yn destun pryder i gomisiynwyr safonau a phwyllgorau safonau blaenorol. Mae'r mater hwn wedi cael sylw ac wedi bod yn destun trafod ers peth amser.

Fel yr oeddwn yn ei ddweud, rhaid i gŵyn gael ei gwneud i'r Prif Weinidog a'r Prif Weinidog fydd yn gwneud unrhyw benderfyniad ynghylch p'un a dorwyd y cod. Os ydych yn ffodus, efallai y caiff y camau a gymerwyd gan y Prif Weinidog wrth ddod i'r casgliad hwnnw eu hamlinellu ar un ochr papur A4. Os yw'r Prif Weinidog yn cymryd unrhyw gyngor annibynnol, nid yw'n glir gan bwy y mae'n cael y cyngor hwnnw nac ar ba sail. Siawns nad yw system o'r fath yn briodol nac yn ddymunol. Yn sicr, nid yw'n ddymunol i ddeiliad swydd y Prif Weinidog, o gofio y gellid ei gyhuddo o beidio ag ymchwilio i'r materion hyn yn briodol. Siawns nad yw'n ddymunol nac yn briodol ychwaith i Weinidogion unigol fetu â chlririo'u henwau'n llawn am fod ansicrwydd cyson ynghylch lefelau craffu annibynnol. Yn sicr, ni all fod yn ddymunol i Lywodraeth Cymru, fel sefydliad, fod yn gweithredu yn y fath fodd.

Efallai mai drwy enghraifft flaenorol yn ymwneud â dau Aelod Cynulliad y dangosir gwiriondeb llwyr y system bresennol orau; nid ydynt bellach yn Aelodau o'r Siambr, a dyna pam y dewisais hwy—fel nad ydym yn ailgynnau hen ddadleuon. Gwnaeth Jenny Randerson AC gŵyn am y cyn Brif Weinidog, Rhodri Morgan, ynghylch achos posibl o dorri'r cod gweinidogol ar ôl iddo ymddangos ei fod eisoes wedi gwneud penderfyniad ar fater ad-drefnu ysgolion yr oedd disgwyl i'w Lywodraeth ddod i gasgliad lled-farnwrol yn ei gylch yn ddiweddarach. Yn yr achos hwn, cafodd y Prif Weinidog ei ymchwilio'n briodol gan y Prif Weinidog ac wedyn ei glirio gan y Prif Weinidog—sef yr un Rhodri Morgan.

Fel y dywedais yn gynharach, nid dim ond Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru sy'n pryderu am gyfyngiadau'r system gyfredol; buont yn bryder i gomisiynwyr safonau blaenorol hefyd. Mae'r mater wedi'i drafod yn fanwl gan bwyllgorau safonau blaenorol,

committees, all of which have been on a cross-party basis. However, we are yet to come forward with a satisfactory conclusion to those discussions, because, ultimately, it is something that only the First Minister and the Welsh Government can make progress on.

I want to be clear: I do not believe that it would be appropriate to take the ultimate sanction as to who serves in the Cabinet away from the First Minister. That is not what I seek to do. It would be nice, for once in public life, to take these steps before the proverbial horse bolts from the stable. We are bringing forward this debate now because there is no question over the conduct of any Minister or Deputy Minister in the current Government. It is in these circumstances, when there are no such questions being raised, that it is best to have this debate, so that nobody can be accused of trying to undermine anybody's political career. It would be nice, as I said, for once in public life, to ensure that this is addressed before we get to a situation where the system is truly being questioned and undermined.

The Welsh Liberal Democrats would like to see the Welsh Government appointing an independent person to look at whether any potential breaches of the ministerial code have occurred. That person would be suitably qualified and of a suitable status to have the confidence of not only the First Minister and Welsh Ministers, but Welsh society as a whole. Unlike the previous Presiding Officer, I believe that it is best that that person is completely independent of processes within the Assembly. I think that there is merit in having a completely different person in charge of the ministerial code, as opposed to the code for individual Assembly Members. However, I would be interested to hear other people's comments. I believe that there should be a separate system for the ministerial code, as opposed to the general Assembly Members' code.

Simon Thomas: The Member said earlier that she does not want to control the First Minister's appointments to the Cabinet. Does she see this independent adjudicator on the code as somebody who gives advice to the First Minister as regards the running of the

gyda phob un ohonynt wedi bod yn drawsbleidiol. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r trafodaethau hynny wedi arwain at ganlyniad boddhaol eto, oherwydd, yn y pen draw, y Prif Weinidog a Llywodraeth Cymru yn unig all wneud cynnydd mewn perthynas ag ef.

Rwyf am fod yn glir: ni chredaf y byddai'n briodol cymryd y gosb eithaf o ran pwy sy'n gwasanaethu yn y Cabinet i ffwrdd oddi wrth y Prif Weinidog. Nid dyna yr wyf yn ceisio'i wneud. Byddai'n braf, am unwaith mewn bywyd cyhoeddus, i gymryd y camau hyn cyn i'r ceffyl diarhebol foltio o'r stabl. Rydym yn cyflwyno'r ddatl hon yn awr oherwydd does dim amheuaeth ynghylch ymddygiad unrhyw Weinidog neu Ddirprwy Weinidog yn y Llywodraeth bresennol. Mae'n well bod y ddatl hon yn cael ei chynnal yn yr amgylchiadau hyn, pan nad oes unrhyw gwestiynau o'r fath yn cael eu codi, fel na all neb gael ei gyhuddo o geisio tansellio gyrfa wleidyddol unrhyw un. Byddai'n braf, fel y dywedais, am unwaith mewn bywyd cyhoeddus, sicrhau bod hyn yn cael sylw cyn i ni gyrraedd sefyllfa lle mae'r system wir yn cael ei hamau a'i thanseilio.

Hoffai Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru weld Llywodraeth Cymru yn penodi person annibynnol i ymchwilio i weld a fu unrhyw achosion posib o dorri'r cod gweinidogol. Byddai'r person hwnnw yn meddu ar y cymwysterau priodol ac o statws addas i ennyn, nid yn unig hyder y Prif Weinidog a Gweinidogion Cymru, ond hyder y gymdeithas Gymreig yn ei chyfanrwydd. Yn wahanol i'r Llywydd blaenorol, credaf ei bod yn well bod y person hwnnw yn gwbl annibynnol ar brosesau o fewn y Cynulliad. Credaf ei fod yn werth cael person hollol wahanol i fod yn gyfrifol am y cod gweinidogol, yn hytrach na'r cod ar gyfer Aelodau Cynulliad unigol. Fodd bynnag, byddai'n dda gennyf glywed sylwadau pobl eraill. Credaf y dylai fod system ar wahân ar gyfer y cod gweinidogol, yn hytrach na chod cyffredinol Aelodau'r Cynulliad.

Simon Thomas: Soniodd yr Aelod yn gynharach nad yw'n dymuno rheoli penodiadau'r Prif Weinidog i'r Cabinet. A fyddai'r dyfarnwr annibynnol hwn ar y cod yn rhywun a fyddai'n rhoi cyngor i'r Prif Weinidog ynghylch rhedeg y cod, yn hytrach

code, rather than instructing the First Minister as to the administration of that code? I just want to be clear.

Kirsty Williams: This independent person would carry out any investigations into a potential breach of the ministerial code. They would conduct the investigation and write a report that would subsequently be given to the First Minister outlining whether that person thought a breach of the code had occurred. Subsequently, it would be for the First Minister to decide what happens to that individual Minister—similar to the situation we have for individual Assembly Members where the standards commissioner investigates and provides a report, but, ultimately, it is for the standards committee and this Chamber to decide what action subsequently takes place. Any reports that the independent adviser carries out for the First Minister should be published and the role should be on a statutory basis.

Yesterday, we discussed the Silk report and questioned the First Minister on it. The Silk commission set out a clear road map of how we can make this institution and the Welsh Government into a more mature democracy in Wales. I believe that an independent adviser on standards and the ministerial code is one way in which we can further that journey. Scotland and Westminster do it, and local government and other public bodies have an independent way of judging whether or not their members have behaved properly. It is now time for the Welsh Government to take this step.

Gwelliant 1—William Graham

Cynnwys ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

‘, gydag amserlen glir ar gyfer ymgynghori a gweithredu’.

Andrew R.T. Davies: I move amendment 1 in the name of William Graham.

I do not want to detain the Assembly any longer than I need to, because the motion is straightforward and simple. I find no issue with it, and I hope that other Members will find little or no issue with it. As was outlined

na roi cyfarwyddyd i'r Prif Weinidog ynghylch gweinyddu'r cod hwnnw yn ei barn hi? Rwyf am fod yn glir.

Kirsty Williams: Byddai'r person annibynnol hwn yn cynnal unrhyw ymchwiliadau i achosion posibl o dorri'r cod gweinidogol. Byddai'n cynnal yr ymchwiliad ac yn ysgrifennu adroddiad a fyddai'n cael ei roi i'r Prif Weinidog maes o law yn amlinellu a oedd y person hwnnw'n credu bod y cod wedi cael ei dorri. Wedyn, mater i'r Prif Weinidog fyddai penderfynu beth fyddai'n digwydd i'r Gweinidog hwnnw—fel y sefyllfa sydd gennym ar gyfer Aelodau Cynulliad unigol, gyda'r comisiynydd safonau yn ymchwilio ac yn darparu adroddiad, ond gyda'r pwyllgor safonau a'r Siambr hon yn penderfynu pa gamau i'w cymryd yn y pen draw. Dylai unrhyw adroddiadau a gaiff eu llunio gan y cynghorydd annibynnol ar gyfer y Prif Weinidog gael eu cyhoeddi a dylai'r rôl fod ar sail statudol.

Ddoe, buom yn trafod adroddiad Silk ac yn holi'r Prif Weinidog arno. Nododd comisiwn Silk fap ffordd clir ar gyfer gwneud y sefydliad hwn a Llywodraeth Cymru yn ddemocratiaeth fwy aeddfed yng Nghymru. Credaf fod cynghorydd annibynnol ar safonau a'r cod gweinidogol yn un ffordd o fwrw ymlaen â'r daith honno. Mae'r Alban a San Steffan yn gwneud hynny, ac mae gan lywodraeth leol a chyrrff cyhoeddus eraill ffordd annibynnol o benderfynu a yw eu haelodau wedi ymddwyn yn briodol ai peidio. Mae bellach yn bryd i Lywodraeth Cymru gymryd y cam hwn.

Amendment 1—William Graham

Insert at the end of motion:

‘, with a clear timetable for consultation and implementation’.

Andrew RT Davies: Cynigiau welliant 1 yn enw William Graham.

Nid wyf am gadw'r Cynulliad yn hwy nag sydd raid, gan fod y cynnig yn un syml. Ni allaf weld unrhyw broblem ag ef, ac rwy'n gobeithio na fydd Aelodau eraill yn gweld problem o gwbl. Fel yr amlinellwyd gan

by the leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrats in her opening remarks, it seems somewhat odd in today's world that you can act as judge, jury, prosecutor and defence for any complaints made, as is the case with the current system. In his remarks, I hope that the First Minister, if he is not inclined to support today's motion, will outline how people can have confidence in a system that, to me and many others, does not seem independent and does not seem to serve the public trust as well as it should.

There is significant merit in the way that the leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrats outlined how she sees the role of the commissioner or ombudsman—call this individual what you will—developing. Whoever serves in the Cabinet is entirely at the discretion of the First Minister. That is the political narrative and the world that we live in: if you have the most votes, you govern and it is the leader of that governing party who determines the individuals that he or she would like to execute the policies of the Government. However, I think there is merit in having someone to look at complaints who is removed from the process, to formulate a report and then advise the First Minister and the public of their judgment. It would then be the judgment of the First Minister whether that complaint merited sanction against the individual Minister or, indeed, the holder of the office of First Minister.

If today's motion is agreed and the First Minister indicates his support for it, I hope that, with the amendment that we have introduced, a timetable to consult and to implement will be put forward. This could easily be one of those motions that gains support but goes nowhere. That would be a real shame, because I think that it would carry greater transparency in our public life and our dealings in the National Assembly for Wales.

With those few words, the Welsh Conservatives will be supporting this motion

arweinydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn ei sylwadau agoriadol, mae'n ymddangos braidd yn rhyfedd yn y byd sydd ohoni eich bod yn gallu gweithredu fel barnwr, rheithgor, erlynydd ac amddiffyniad ar unrhyw gwynion a wneir, fel yn achos y system bresennol. Yn ei sylwadau, rwy'n gobeithio y bydd y Prif Weinidog, os nad yw'n teimlo y gall gefnogi'r cynnig heddiw, yn amlinellu sut y gall pobl gael hyder mewn system sy'n ymddangos i mi, ac i lawer o bobl eraill, fel nad yw'n annibynnol nac yn ennyn ymddiriedaeth y cyhoedd cystal ag ydylai.

Mae cryn rinwedd yn y modd y mae arweinydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru wedi amlinellu sut y mae'n gweld rôl y comisiynydd neu'r ombwdsmon—beth bynnag y dymunwch ei alw—yn datblygu. Gwneir y penderfyniad ynghylch pwy fydd yn gwasanaethu yn y Cabinet yn ôl disgrisiwn llwyr y Prif Weinidog. Dyna'r naratif gwleidyddol a'r byd yr ydym yn byw ynddo: os mai chi sydd â'r nifer fwyaf o bleidleisiau, chi sy'n rheoli ac arweinydd y blaid lywodraethol sy'n penderfynu pa unigolion y byddai ef neu hi yn dymuno eu gweld yn gweithredu polisiau'r Llywodraeth. Fodd bynnag, credaf ei fod yn werth cael rhywun sy'n annibynnol ar y broses i edrych ar gwynion, llunio adroddiad ac yna roi gwybod i'r Prif Weinidog a'r cyhoedd am ei farn. Yna, mater i'r Prif Weinidog fyddai penderfynu a fyddai'r Gweinidog unigol neu, yn wir, ddeiliad swydd y Prif Weinidog, yn haeddu cael cosb mewn perthynas â'r gŵyn honno.

Os derbynnir y cynnig heddiw ac os bydd y Prif Weinidog yn dangos ei gefnogaeth iddo, gobeithiaf, gyda'r gwelliant yr ydym wedi'i gyflwyno, y bydd amserlen ymgynghori a gweithredu yn cael ei chyflwyno. Gallai hwn yn hawdd fod yn un o'r cynigion hynny y rhoddir cefnogaeth iddo ond na fydd yn cyflawni dim. Byddai hynny'n drueni mawr, oherwydd credaf y byddai'n sicrhau mwy o dryloywder yn ein bywyd cyhoeddus a'n hymwneud â Chynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru.

Gyda hynny o eiriau, bydd y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig yn cefnogi'r cynnig hwn a

and I hope that the First Minister will indicate his support for creating a more transparent way of governing Wales. It would drive confidence among the public that they can have confidence that, when they put a complaint forward, it is taken seriously, it is dealt with and, above all, they will be given sound reasoning for the action that is going to be taken on their behalf.

Eluned Parrott: I would like to begin by reiterating the fact that our motion is driven by a desire to see our processes as a legislature become as clear and transparent as possible. It is important to have this debate at a time when there is not the suggestion of a complaint against any Minister, so that it is a non-politically driven debate. For that reason, I want to reflect on parallel arrangements in other legislatures. As Kirsty Williams mentioned, neither the UK Government nor the Scottish Government operate such a closed system as we do in Wales. Under Governments of all colours, the UK Government has moved towards greater independence of the policing of their own ministerial codes. Over the last few decades, it has moved away from a system with very little oversight of the Prime Minister or Ministers; first, to one where ad hoc independent appointees were asked to investigate each complaint, to a situation now where there is a permanent independent adviser on Ministers' interests. In Scotland, Alex Salmond has appointed a panel to advise him on potential breaches. Further afield, in Canada, there is a statutory conflict of interest and ethics commissioner, who polices both the ministerial code and the code of conduct.

Returning to look at the situation in Scotland, which has many parallels for the situation in Wales, it is clear that the First Minister there recognises that the process needs to be seen to be providing justice as well as actually doing so. Members will, of course, be aware of the recent debate about whether Alex Salmond himself breached the ministerial code when he told both the BBC and the Scottish Parliament that he had sought some form of legal advice about an independent Scotland's position in the EU. He reported

gobeithiaf y bydd y Prif Weinidog yn dangos ei gefnogaeth i greu ffordd fwy tryloyw o lywodraethu Cymru. Byddai'n ennyn hyder ymysg y cyhoedd y gallant fod yn hyderus, pan fyddant yn gwneud cwyn, y caiff ei chymryd o ddifrif, yr ymdrinnir â hi ac, yn anad dim, y rhoddir rhesymau cadarn iddynt am y camau a gymerir ar eu rhan.

Eluned Parrott: Hoffwn ddechrau drwy ailadrodd y ffaith bod ein cynnig yn cael ei ysgogi gan awydd i sicrhau y bydd ein prosesau fel deddfwrfa mor glir a thryloyw â phosibl. Mae'n bwysig cael y ddadl hon ar adeg pan nad oes awgrym o gŵyn yn erbyn unrhyw Weinidog, fel nad yw'n ddadl a gaiff ei gyrru'n wleidyddol. Am y rheswm hwnnw, hoffwn fyfyririo ar drefniadau cyfochrog mewn deddfwrfeydd eraill. Fel y soniodd Kirsty Williams, nid yw Llywodraeth y DU na Llywodraeth yr Alban yn gweithredu system mor gaeddig ag y gwnawn yng Nghymru. O dan Lywodraethau o bob lliw, mae Llywodraeth y DU wedi symud tuag at fwy o annibyniaeth o ran y modd y caiff ei chodau gweinidogol eu plismona. Dros yr ychydig ddegawdau diwethaf, mae wedi symud i ffwrdd oddi wrth system lle na cheir fawr ddim goruchwyliaeth o'r Prif Weinidog na Gweinidogion: yn gyntaf, i un lle y gofynnwyd i'r unigolion annibynnol a benodwyd ar sail ad hoc ymchwilio i bob cwyn, at sefyllfa yn awr lle mae cynghorydd annibynnol parhaol ar fuddiannau Gweinidogion. Yn yr Alban, mae Alex Salmond wedi penodi panel i roi cyngor iddo ar achosion posibl o dorri'r cod. Ymhellach i ffwrdd, yng Nghanaada, ceir comisiynydd gwrthdaro buddiannau a moeseg statudol, sy'n plismona'r cod gweinidogol a'r cod ymddygiad.

Gan ddychwelyd at y sefyllfa yn yr Alban, sy'n debyg i'r sefyllfa yng Nghymru mewn sawl ffordd, mae'n amlwg bod y Prif Weinidog yno yn cydnabod bod angen i'r broses gael ei gweld yn darparu cyfiawnder yn ogystal â gwneud hynny. Bydd Aelodau, wrth gwrs, yn ymwybodol o'r ddadl ddiweddar ynghylch p'un a dorrodd Alex Salmond ei hun y cod gweinidogol pan soniodd wrth y BBC a Senedd yr Alban ei fod wedi gofyn am ryw fath o gyngor cyfreithiol ynghylch sefyllfa Alban

himself to be investigated. As well as this, he felt that the current make-up of the panel, including former presiding officers and law officers of the Scottish Parliament was not sufficiently removed from the process to provide independent advice on the issue and, as a result, he has appointed another individual to oversee the investigation and report publicly. Surely, this is because the investigation, especially over such a high-profile issue as potentially misleading Parliament on the core issue of his party's belief, needs to be completely above reproach, completely clear and gain the complete confidence of the public in Scotland.

There are also greater moves towards transparency in other areas of Government business, and I believe that this should be no different. The Liberal Democrats have consistently campaigned for the reform of the rules on lobbying, which is why the UK Government now routinely publishes details of all meetings that Ministers and civil servants have with lobbyists. Once again, it is my belief that the Welsh Labour Government here could look to do likewise so that the public can have confidence that the balance between access and influence is appropriately struck. In the past, we have been successful in pressing the Welsh Government to publish details of expenditure over £25,000 in the interests of transparency and accountability, and I genuinely hope that we can persuade you of the logic of our argument in this instance as well.

This could be part and parcel of the same reform agenda to ensure that the people feel that the process of government in Wales is open, honest and accessible. That is really the nub of the issue for us. However dispassionately or independently the First Minister acts in a case that is brought to him, a system where politicians police themselves will not be seen by the public to be open, honest and accessible. As a mature democracy, we must be mindful of the opinion of the electorate and seek to improve systems that, frankly, have outlived their usefulness, as this, to my mind, now has.

Leanne Wood: I speak as one of the co-lead

annibynnol yn yr UE. Cyflwynodd ei hun i gael ei ymchwilio. Yn ogystal â hyn, teimlai nad oedd cyfansoddiad presennol y panel, gan gynnwys cyn lywyddion a swyddogion cyfraith Senedd yr Alban, yn ddigon pell oddi wrth y broses i roi cyngor annibynnol ar y mater ac, o ganlyniad, mae wedi penodi unigolyn arall i oruchwyllo'r ymchwiliad ac adrodd yn gyhoeddus. Yn sicr, y rheswm am hyn yw bod angen i'r ymchwiliad, yn enwedig i fater mor uchel ei broffil ag achos posibl o gamarwain y Senedd ar fater craidd, sef cred ei blaid, fod yn gwbl ddiylchwin, yn gwbl glir ac ennill hyder llwyr y cyhoedd yn yr Alban.

Mae yna hefyd fwy o weithredu tuag at sicrhau tryloywder mewn meysydd eraill o fusnes y Llywodraeth, a chredaf na ddylai hyn fod yn wahanol. Mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol wedi ymgyrchu'n gyson dros ddiwygio'r rheolau ar lobio, a dyna pam mae Llywodraeth y DU bellach yn cyhoeddi manylion yr holl gyfarfodydd rhwng Gweinidogion a gweision sifil a lobiwyr fel mater o drefn. Unwaith eto, credaf y gallai Llywodraeth Lafur Cymru yma ystyried gwneud yr un peth fel y gall y cyhoedd fod yn hyderus bod cydbwysedd priodol rhwng mynediad a dylanwad. Yn y gorffennol, rydym wedi llwyddo i bwysu ar Lywodraeth Cymru i gyhoeddi manylion gwariant dros £25,000 er budd tryloywder ac atebolrwydd, a gobeithiaf yn wirioneddol y gallwn eich darbwyllo ynghylch rhesymeg ein dadl yn yr achos hwn hefyd.

Gallai hyn fod yn rhan annatod o'r un agenda diwygio er mwyn sicrhau bod y bobl yn teimlo bod y broses o lywodraethu yng Nghymru yn agored, yn onest ac yn hygyrch. Dyna wir hanfod y mater i ni. Ni waeth pa mor bwylllog neu annibynnol y bydd y Prif Weinidog yn gweithredu mewn achos a gyflwynir iddo, ni fydd y cyhoedd yn ystyried system lle mae gwleidyddion yn plismona eu hunain yn un agored, onest a hygyrch. Fel democratiaeth aeddfed, rhaid inni ystyried barn yr etholwyr a cheisio gwella systemau sydd, a bod yn onest, ymhell o fod yn ddefnyddiol mwyach, fel y system hon yn fy marn i.

Leanne Wood: Siaradaf fel un o gyd-

signatories on the statement of opinion on this issue. This place, our building, our Senedd, represents the transparency in our actions and our dealings, but sadly, on this occasion, that transparency has become clouded.

The Nolan principles of public life are taught to all elected officials throughout Wales. Those principles include openness, integrity and accountability. Here, there is a substantial deficit. This issue is not just about what is wrong with the present system, but about how the system can be improved. The first course of action is acceptance by the First Minister and the Welsh Government that the current system is unacceptable. We can then work on a cross-party basis towards reform.

The situation here in the National Assembly for Wales is an anachronism compared with the UK and Scottish Governments, but I would not argue that we should slavishly follow those models either. The UK has an independent adviser on ministerial interests who has the duty to investigate allegations of breaches of the code at the instigation of the Prime Minister. In March, the UK's Public Affairs Committee published a report that highlighted the lack of independence in three areas. The report said that the independent adviser lacks independence in practice as it is an appointment made personally by the Prime Minister and supported from within the Cabinet Office. The office holder cannot instigate their own investigations.

The appointment process was criticised, and it was said that the closed process by which the adviser is appointed is not suitable for an independent role. The choice of candidate was also criticised, as the new adviser is a recently retired civil servant, which has raised questions about the demonstrable independence of the Government. These are all findings that should be taken into consideration in identifying the way in which we can improve the transparency of our own Government here.

The situation in Scotland has already been outlined. In Scotland, the findings of the

lofnodwyr arweiniol y datganiad barn ar y mater hwn. Mae'r lle hwn, ein hadeilad, ein Senedd, yn cynrychioli'r tryloywder yn ein gweithredoedd ac yn ein hymwneud, ond yn anffodus, ar yr achlysur hwn, mae'r tryloywder hwnnw wedi'i gymylu.

Mae egwyddorion Nolan o fywyd cyhoeddus yn cael eu haddysgu i bob swyddog etholedig ledled Cymru. Mae'r egwyddorion hynny'n cynnwys bod yn agored, gonestrwydd ac atebolrwydd. Yma, ceir diffyg sylweddol. Nid mater ynghylch beth sydd o'i le ar y system bresennol yn unig mohono. Mae a wnelo hefyd â sut y gellir gwella'r system. Y cam cyntaf yw cydnabyddiaeth gan y Prif Weinidog a Llywodraeth Cymru bod y system bresennol yn annerbyniol. Gallwn weithio wedyn tuag at ddiwygio'r system ar sail drawsbleidiol.

Mae'r sefyllfa yma yng Nghynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn anacroniaeth o gymharu â Llywodraeth y DU a Llywodraeth yr Alban, ond ni fyddwn yn dadlau y dylem ddilyn y modelau hynny yn slafaidd ychwaith. Mae gan y DU gynghorydd annibynnol ar fuddiannau gweinidogol sydd â dyletswydd i ymchwilio i honiadau o dorri'r cod ar anogaeth y Prif Weinidog. Ym mis Mawrth, cyhoeddodd Pwyllgor Materion Cyhoeddus y DU adroddiad a dynnodd sylw at y diffyg annibyniaeth mewn tri maes. Nododd yr adroddiad nad oedd y cynghorydd annibynnol yn ddigon annibynnol yn ymarferol gan ei fod yn cael ei benodi'n bersonol gan y Prif Weinidog a'i gefnogi o fewn Swyddfa'r Cabinet. Ni all deiliad y swydd gychwyn ei ymchwiliadau ei hun.

Beirniadwyd y broses benodi a nodwyd nad yw'r broses gaeedig a ddefnyddir i benodi cynghorydd yn addas ar gyfer rôl annibynnol. Beirniadwyd y dewis o ymgeisydd hefyd, gan fod y cynghorydd newydd yn was sifil sydd wedi ymddeol yn ddiweddar. Mae hyn wedi codi cwestiynau ynghylch annibyniaeth amlwg y Llywodraeth. Mae'r canfyddiadau hyn i gyd yn rhai y dylid eu hystyried wrth nodi'r ffordd y gallwn wella tryloywder ein Llywodraeth ein hunain yma.

Mae'r sefyllfa yn yr Alban eisoes wedi cael ei hamlinellu. Yn yr Alban, mae

independent advisers are published. Since 2008, five reports have been published in total and one is currently under way. The Scottish First Minister was, in fact, criticised for his choice of independent adviser in the most recent case. Imagine the reaction from the press and opposition if he had announced that he would be investigating his own activities. There would have been uproar. Yet, that is the situation that is in place in Wales. Therefore, as far as I am concerned, reform of the system really is a no-brainer.

5.15 p.m.

We need cross-party agreement on reform, which will show that Wales is prepared to take the lead. We also need a genuinely independent adviser, separate, I think, from the Welsh Government and the National Assembly for Wales. I hope that the issue can be resolved in the Assembly soon, and I call on the First Minister, as a next step, to be prepared to discuss this issue with all party leaders. If he is not amenable to this, I would be interested to see the views of the second part of the Silk Commission; I wonder whether it might want to pass comment on the Welsh Government's failure to step up to the plate.

Peter Black: The case that has been set out by my colleagues Kirsty Williams and Eluned Parrott is very strong. Kirsty has set out the reasons why we think change is necessary, and Eluned has drawn the comparison with other institutions and how they operate—although, as Leanne Wood made clear, we do not necessarily want to duplicate what is happening elsewhere. We need our own system, which is suitable for the National Assembly and for the Welsh Government. It seems to me that the principle of a body or a person passing judgment on themselves is difficult to defend in any circumstances. If we are in favour of transparency and accountability, we need to put that principle to one side and talk about independent arbitration and a transparent process that everyone understands and has confidence in. This motion is not an attack on any Minister or any part of the Government. It is a clear means of expressing our concern

canfyddiadau'r cynghorwyr annibynnol yn cael eu cyhoeddi. Ers 2008, mae pump adroddiad wedi'u cyhoeddi ac mae un wrthi'n cael ei lunio. Yn wir, cafodd Prif Weinidog yr Alban ei feirniadu am ei ddewis o gynghorydd annibynnol yn yr achos mwyaf diweddar. Dychmygwch yr ymateb gan y wasg a'r gwrthbleidiau pe bai wedi cyhoeddi y byddai'n ymchwilio i'w weithgareddau ei hun. Byddai hynny wedi achosi cryn stŵr. Eto i gyd, dyna'r sefyllfa sydd ohoni yng Nghymru. Felly, o'm safbwynt i, mae'n gwbl amlwg bod angen diwygio'r system.

Mae angen inni gael cytundeb trawsbleidiol ar ddiwygio, a fydd yn dangos bod Cymru yn barod i gymryd yr awenau. Mae angen cynghorydd gwirioneddol annibynnol arnom hefyd, a hynny ar wahân, i Lywodraeth Cymru a Chynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn fy marn i. Rwy'n gobeithio y gall y mater gael ei ddatrys yn y Cynulliad yn fuan, a galwaf ar y Prif Weinidog, fel cam nesaf, i fod yn barod i drafod y mater hwn gyda phob un o arweinwyr y pleidiau. Os nad yw'n barod i wneud hyn, byddai gennyf ddiddordeb mewn clywed barn ail ran Comisiwn Silk; tybed a fyddai'n hoffi rhoi sylw ar fethiant Llywodraeth Cymru i gamu i fyny.

Peter Black: Mae'r achos a nodwyd gan fy nghyd-Aelodau, Kirsty Williams ac Eluned Parrott, yn gryf iawn. Mae Kirsty wedi nodi'r rhesymau pam y credwn fod angen newid, ac mae Eluned wedi tynnu cymhariaeth â sefydliadau eraill a sut maent yn gweithredu—er, fel yr eglurodd Leanne Wood, nid ydym o reidrwydd am ddyblygu'r hyn sy'n digwydd mewn mannau eraill. Mae angen ein system ein hunain arnom, sy'n addas ar gyfer y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a Llywodraeth Cymru. Mae'n ymddangos i mi bod yr egwyddor o gorff neu berson yn lleisio barn arnynt hwy eu hunain yn anodd i'w hamddiffyn mewn unrhyw amgylchiadau. Os ydym o blaid tryloywder ac atebolrwydd, mae angen i ni roi'r egwyddor honno i'r naill ochr a siarad am gyflafareddu annibynnol a phroses dryloyw sy'n ddealladwy i bawb ac y mae pawb yn ymddiried ynddi. Nid yw'r cynnig hwn yn ymosodiad ar unrhyw Weinidog nac unrhyw ran o'r Llywodraeth.

that the present system is not fit for purpose. It is regrettable that, despite many conversations—Kirsty referred to conversations around the Jenny Randerson complaints of some years ago—we have had to bring a motion forward to try to make progress on this issue.

When I first started cutting my political teeth, in the 1980s, there was a huge controversy about the police and the fact that they were often judge and jury on complaints against themselves. Again, that is not directly comparable, but the principle of being judge and jury on yourself had to be cast aside and an independent police complaints system brought in. There is no direct comparison between the Welsh Government or even the National Assembly and the local council code of conduct and, particularly, the stringent requirements put on local councillors as part of that. We have a much more relaxed code of conduct. Councillors are not allowed to sit in judgment on themselves; that is dealt with by the public service ombudsman, and a standards committee with independent members takes account of the public service ombudsman's reports. There is also a larger body, at an all-Wales level, which can deal with more serious complaints.

It seems to me that the case for change is compelling. We have a situation where the Welsh Government seems to be unique in being the only body, institution, or group of people in Wales that still sits as judge and jury on complaints against itself. I would hope, therefore, that the First Minister is prepared to listen to this motion, even if he is not prepared to vote in favour of it at this point—although I would like to see unanimous support for it. I would hope that he takes on board the points of view that have been put across today, and considers entering into talks with the other parties to bring forward some changes in which we can have confidence, ensuring that there is transparency, accountability and independence in how complaints are dealt

Mae'n ffordd glir o fynegi ein pryder nad yw'r system bresennol yn addas at y diben. Mae'n anffodus, er gwaethaf llawer o sgysiau—cyfeiriodd Kirsty at sgysiau'n ymwneud â chwynion Jenny Randerson rai blynyddoedd yn ôl—y bu'n rhaid inni gyflwyno cynnig i geisio gwneud cynnydd ar y mater hwn.

Pan ddechreuais fagu profiad yn y byd gwleidyddol am y tro cyntaf, yn y 1980au, roedd dadlau mawr am yr heddlu a'r ffaith eu bod yn aml yn chwarae rôl y barnwr a'r rheithgor wrth ymdrin â chwynion yn erbyn hwy eu hunain. Unwaith eto, ni ellir cymharu hynny'n uniongyrchol, ond bu'n rhaid taflu'r egwyddor o fod yn farnwr ac yn rheithgor arnoch chi eich hun i'r neilltu a chyflwyno system cwynion annibynnol ar gyfer yr heddlu. Nid oes unrhyw gymhariaeth uniongyrchol rhwng Llywodraeth Cymru, neu hyd yn oed y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, a chod ymddygiad cynghorau lleol ac, yn arbennig, y gofynion llym a osodwyd ar gynghorwyr lleol fel rhan o hynny. Mae gennym ni god ymddygiad llawer mwy hamddenol. Nid yw cynghorwyr yn cael eistedd mewn barn arnynt hwy eu hunain; yr ombwdsmon gwasanaethau cyhoeddus sy'n gwneud hynny, ac mae pwyllgor safonau gydag aelodau annibynnol yn ystyried adroddiadau'r ombwdsmon gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Ceir hefyd gorff mwy o faint, ar lefel Cymru gyfan, a all ddelio â chwynion mwy difrifol.

Mae'n ymddangos i mi fod achos cryf dros newid. Mae gennym sefyllfa lle mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn ymddangos fel petai yn unigryw gan mai hi yw'r unig gorff, sefydliad, neu grŵp o bobl yng Nghymru sy'n dal i eistedd fel barnwr a rheithgor wrth fynd i'r afael â chwynion yn ei herbyn hi ei hun. Byddwn yn gobeithio, felly, bod y Prif Weinidog yn barod i wrando ar y cynnig hwn, hyd yn oed os nad yw'n barod i bleidleisio o'i blaid ar hyn o bryd—er y byddwn yn hoffi gweld cefnogaeth unfrydol iddo. Byddwn yn gobeithio y bydd yn ystyried y safbwyntiau a gyflwynwyd heddiw, ac yn ystyried dechrau trafodaethau gyda'r pleidiau eraill i gyflwyno rhai newidiadau y gallwn gael hyder ynddynt, gan sicrhau bod tryloywder, atebolrwydd ac

with.

The First Minister (Carwyn Jones): I thank Members for their contributions this afternoon to what is—on the face of it—an attractive argument, but perhaps I could just outline some of the issues from my point of view, as First Minister. First of all, it is wrong to say that we are the only part of the UK that does not have a system where there is an independent adviser; Northern Ireland does not either. It is right to say that, at a UK level and in Scotland, there is a different system, but that system is far from independent.

Let us look at the UK system to begin with. It is true that there is an independent adviser to the Prime Minister when it comes to the ministerial code. That adviser, as the leader of Plaid Cymru pointed out, has no right at all to investigate as of right. The adviser is only engaged when the Prime Minister refers a matter to that adviser.

Eluned Parrott: Thank you for your comments, First Minister. Could I conclude, from that, that you would be in favour of an even more independent system in Wales?

The First Minister: No, I would not, and I will come to those reasons in a second. The UK system is a smoke-and-mirrors system, in reality, because the Prime Minister holds control over what is referred in the first place. For example, was Jeremy Hunt referred? No. Was Liam Fox referred? No. An independent adviser has been in place at a UK level for two years, and he has done absolutely nothing in that time. It shows that the system at a UK level is not quite the system that it appears to be.

No-one has answered this question yet, but would an independent adviser be paid? If that person was to be paid, what would they be doing most of the time? Bear in mind that, over the past 13 years, a grand total of five complaints have been made under the ministerial code. Employing someone as an independent adviser would mean that they

annibyniaeth o ran y modd y caiff cwynion eu trin.

Y Prif Weinidog (Carwyn Jones): Diolchaf i'r Aelodau am eu cyfraniadau y prynhawn yma i'r hyn sy'n ymddangos yn ddadl ddeniadol, ond efallai y gallwn amlinellu rhai o'r materion o'm safbwynt i, fel Prif Weinidog. Yn gyntaf oll, mae'n anghywir dweud mai ni yw'r unig ran o'r DU lle nad oes system lle ceir cynghorydd annibynnol; nid oes system o'r fath yng Ngogledd Iwerddon ychwaith. Mae'n gywir dweud bod system wahanol ar lefel y DU ac yn yr Alban, ond mae'r system honno ymhell o fod yn annibynnol.

Gadewch inni edrych ar system y DU i ddechrau. Mae'n wir bod gan y Prif Weinidog gynghorydd annibynnol mewn perthynas â'r cod gweinidogol. Fel y nododd arweinydd Plaid Cymru, nid oes gan y cynghorydd hwnnw unrhyw hawl o gwbl i ymchwilio fel hawl. Dim ond pan fydd y Prif Weinidog yn cyfeirio mater at y cynghorydd hwnnw y bydd yn mynd ati i gynnal ymchwiliad.

Eluned Parrott: Diolch ichi am eich sylwadau, Brif Weinidog. A allaf gymryd, o hynny, y byddech o blaid system hyd yn oed fwy annibynnol yng Nghymru?

Y Prif Weinidog: Na, ni fyddwn, a dof at y rhesymau hynny yn y man. Mae system y DU yn system mwg a drychau, mewn gwirionedd, gan fod y Prif Weinidog yn cadw rheolaeth dros yr hyn a atgyfeirir yn y lle cyntaf. Er enghraifft, a gafodd Jeremy Hunt ei atgyfeirio? Na. A gafodd Liam Fox ei atgyfeirio? Na. Mae cynghorydd annibynnol wedi bod ar waith ar lefel y DU ers dwy flynedd, ac nid yw wedi gwneud dim o gwbl yn ystod yr amser hwnnw. Mae'n dangos nad yw'r system ar lefel y DU yn gweithredu fel yr ymddengys ei bod yn ei wneud.

Nid oes neb wedi ateb y cwestiwn hwn eto, ond a fyddai cynghorydd annibynnol yn cael ei dalu? Pe bai'r person hwnnw yn cael ei dalu, beth fyddai'n ei wneud y rhan fwyaf o'r amser? Dylid cofio, dros y 13 mlynedd diwethaf, bod cyfanswm o bum cwyn wedi cael eu gwneud o dan y cod gweinidogol. Byddai cyflogi rhywun fel cynghorydd

would be doing absolutely nothing for most of the time that they were paid. To my mind, that is not good use of public money.

The other question that I draw the Assembly's attention to is this: what exactly is wrong with the current system? No-one has yet come forward with an example of a complaint that was not dealt with properly. In other words, there is no evidence to back up the case that the Lib Dems have put forward.

Eluned Parrott: Do you have any evidence that the system is working effectively?

The First Minister: Yes, I do, and I will explain why. I take independent advice on every complaint that is investigated. I take advice from the Permanent Secretary where appropriate, and from senior civil servants, particularly within my office. They are independent because they are civil servants. In that case, what is the difference between them and an independent adviser? We know that a parliamentary committee recommended the removal of the word 'independent' from 'independent adviser' to the Prime Minister on the ministerial code. Effectively, the adviser is a paid civil servant, and nothing else. There is no more independence attached to the independent adviser than to senior civil servants within the Welsh Government. Therefore, what is the difference?

As far as complaints are concerned, we know that there have been relatively few. The leader of the Liberal Democrats offered one example, of Jenny Randerson making a complaint about the former First Minister prejudging a school reorganisation. That is not a complaint under the ministerial code—that is a matter for the courts. If a Minister has prejudged a quasi-judicial matter, it is entirely a matter for the courts; no-one would deal with that under the ministerial code. The most serious allegation made against a Minister—an allegation that was subsequently found to be unfounded—was made against a Liberal Democrat Minister, in Mike German. That would not have been reported under the ministerial code. We have to bear in mind that this is not the panacea

annibynol yn golygu na fyddai'n gwneud unrhyw beth o gwbl am y rhan fwyaf o'r amser y byddai'n cael tâl. Yn fy marn i, nid yw'n hynny ffordd dda o ddefnyddio arian cyhoeddus.

Y cwestiwn arall y tynnaf sylw'r Cynulliad ato yw hyn: beth yn union sydd o'i le ar y system bresennol? Nid oes neb eto wedi nodi enghraifft o gŵyn nad ymdriniwyd â hi'n briodol. Mewn geiriau eraill, nid oes unrhyw dystiolaeth i gefnogi'r achos a gyflwynwyd gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol.

Eluned Parrott: A oes gennych unrhyw dystiolaeth bod y system yn gweithio'n effeithiol?

Y Prif Weinidog: Oes, ac egluraf pam. Caf gyngor annibynol ar bob cwyn yr ymchwiler iddi. Cymeraf gyngor gan yr Ysgrifennydd Parhaol lle bo hynny'n briodol, a chan uwch weision sifil, yn enwedig o fewn fy swyddfa. Maent yn annibynol oherwydd eu bod yn weision sifil. Yn yr achos hwnnw, beth yw'r gwahaniaeth rhyngddynt hwy a chynghorydd annibynol? Gwyddom fod pwyllgor seneddol wedi argymhell y dylid dileu'r gair 'annibynol' o 'cynghorydd annibynol' i'r Prif Weinidog ar y cod gweinidogol. I bob pwrpas, mae'r cynghorydd yn was sifil cyflogedig, a dim byd arall. Nid oes mwy o annibyniaeth ynghlwm wrth y cynghorydd annibynol nag i uwch weision sifil o fewn Llywodraeth Cymru. Felly, beth yw'r gwahaniaeth?

Cyn belled ag y mae cwynion yn y cwestiwn, gwyddom na chafwyd llawer ohonynt. Cynigiodd arweinydd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol un enghraifft, sef Jenny Randerson yn gwneud cwyn am y cyn Brif Weinidog yn rhagfarnu proses o ad-drefnu ysgolion. Nid yw hynny'n gŵyn o dan y cod gweinidogol—mater i'r llysoedd ydyw. Os yw Gweinidog wedi rhagfarnu mater lled-farnwrol, mater i'r llysoedd yn unig ydyw; ni fyddai unrhyw un yn delio â hynny o dan y cod gweinidogol. Yr honiad mwyaf difrifol a wnaed yn erbyn Gweinidog—honiad y canfuwyd nad oedd sail iddo'n ddiweddarach—oedd yr un yn erbyn un o Weinidogion y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Weinidog, sef Mike German. Ni fyddai hynny wedi cael ei adrodd o dan y cod

that it appears to be.

There is already a system in place under which I have to consider what Ministers have done. I take independent advice on that, and it is then my decision as to what sanctions, if any, should be applied against a Minister. I notice that the Liberal Democrats do not suggest that there should be a different system—well, Peter Black did, but the leader of the Liberal Democrats did not suggest that there should be an independent system beyond what is already proposed there.

The leader of Plaid Cymru seemed to say—and bear in mind that Plaid Cymru Ministers, when they were in Government, did not push the idea of an independent adviser on the ministerial code—that there should be an independent adviser who is so independent of Government and this Assembly that there should be no connection between them. In that case, who would appoint the independent adviser? Someone would have to. That clearly would not work. If an independent adviser needed to be appointed, there are ways of doing so, if that was felt to be the right way forward.

Peter Black's comments troubled me. He talked about arbitration. Arbitration is a formal hearing where a decision—a binding judgment—is passed down by an arbitrator following formal submissions by both parties to an argument. That is what arbitration means. Is he suggesting that the independent adviser should be an arbitrator, passing binding judgments that are binding not just on me, as First Minister, but on all parties concerned? That is what arbitration means, in law. It may be that he did not mean that; if he did, it is certainly not a system that anyone here could accept—that an independent person would have control over who sits and who does not sit in Cabinet. That has to be a matter for the First Minister, whoever that person might be.

I listened carefully to the arguments that were put forward, but it struck me that what was

gweinidogol. Rhaid inni gofio nad yw hyn yn ateb pob problem, fel yr ymddengys.

Mae yna system ar waith eisoes lle y mae'n rhaid imi ystyried yr hyn y mae Gweinidogion wedi'i wneud. Caf gyngor annibynnol ynghylch hynny, ac wedyn penderfynaf pa gosbau, os o gwbl, y dylid eu rhoi i Weinidog. Sylwaf nad yw'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn awgrymu y dylid cael system wahanol—wel, fe wnaeth Peter Black, ond ni wnaeth arweinydd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol awgrymu y dylid cael system annibynnol y tu hwnt i'r hyn a gynigir yno eisoes.

Ymddengys fod arweinydd Plaid Cymru wedi dweud—a dylid cofio na wnaeth Gweinidogion Plaid Cymru, pan oeddent mewn Llywodraeth, wthio'r syniad o gynghorydd annibynnol ar y cod gweinidogol—y dylid cael cynghorydd annibynnol sydd mor annibynnol ar y Llywodraeth a'r Cynulliad hwn fel na ddylai fod unrhyw gysylltiad rhyngddynt. Felly, pwy fyddai'n penodi'r cynghorydd annibynnol? Byddai'n rhaid i rywun wneud hynny. Yn amlwg, ni fyddai hynny'n gweithio. Pe bai angen penodi cynghorydd annibynnol, byddai ffyrdd o wneud hynny, pe teimlid mai dyna'r ffordd gywir ymlaen.

Roedd sylwadau Peter Black yn peri pryder imi. Soniodd am gyflafareddu, sef gwrandawriad ffurfiol lle y caiff penderfyniad—dyfarniad rhwymol—ei wneud gan gyflafareddwr yn dilyn cyflwyniadau ffurfiol gan y ddwy ochr mewn dadl. Dyna'r hyn y mae cyflafareddu yn ei olygu. A yw'n awgrymu y dylai'r cynghorydd annibynnol fod yn gyflafareddwr, gan wneud dyfarniadau rhwymol sydd nid yn unig yn fy rhwymo i, fel Prif Weinidog, ond pawb dan sylw? Dyna ystyr cyflafareddu, yn ôl y gyfraith. Efallai nad oedd yn golygu hynny; os oedd, yn sicr, nid yw'n system y gallai unrhyw un yma ei derbyn—y byddai gan berson annibynnol reolaeth dros bwy sy'n eistedd a phwy nad yw'n eistedd yn y Cabinet. Rhaid i hynny fod yn fater i'r Prif Weinidog, pwy bynnag y gallai'r person hwnnw fod.

Gwrandewais yn astud ar y dadleuon a gyflwynwyd, ond roedd yn fy nharo i nad

being suggested was not particularly different to what is already in place, which is a system where independent advice is made available. I take on board, perhaps, the views expressed that there should be a greater explanation of reasons given when a decision is taken—that much I am willing to investigate. However, the reality is that the independent adviser to the Prime Minister is no different to the advice that is given to me by senior civil servants here or, indeed, by the Permanent Secretary, where appropriate. Therefore, I fail to see how the system that exists in London is any better than the system that exists here, especially given the fact that two Ministers accused of far greater misdemeanours than any Member of this Welsh Government were not even referred to the independent adviser in the first place. In that case, what is the point of having an independent adviser?

We have to bear in mind, of course—and I will draw my remarks to a close at this point—that the ministerial code is a matter for me. It is right to say that Ministers are answerable and accountable to the Assembly and, in their professional performance, to me. I am, in turn, accountable to the Assembly and, ultimately, to the people of Wales. We do not have a system where nobody is accountable in any way. There is clear chain of accountability through this Assembly and, ultimately, to the people of Wales. In the absence of any examples of where the system has failed, in the absence of any suggestions as to why a presumably paid independent adviser should be put in place to deal with an exceptionally small number of complaints, and in the absence of any argument that suggests that an independent adviser would be in a different position to the civil servants currently providing independent advice to me, the Government is not able to support the motion as presently proposed. There are sufficient checks and balances in the current system. There is no suggestion that the current system is, in some way, not working. There is no suggestion that the current system has, in some way, failed to discover any wrongdoing by Ministers. On that basis, we will reject the motion and the amendment.

Aled Roberts: Hoffwn ddiolch i'r Aelodau

oedd yr hyn a oedd yn cael ei awgrymu yn wahanol iawn i'r hyn sydd eisoes ar waith, sef system lle mae cyngor annibynnol ar gael. Rwy'n derbyn, efallai, y safbwyntiau a fynegwyd y dylid rhoi mwy o esboniad o'r rhesymau a roddir pan wneir penderfyniad—rwy'n barod i dderbyn hynny. Fodd bynnag, y realiti yw nad yw'r cynghorydd annibynnol i'r Prif Weinidog yn wahanol i'r cyngor a roddir i mi gan uwch weision sifil yma nac, yn wir, gan yr Ysgrifennydd Parhaol, lle bo hynny'n briodol. Felly, ni allaf weld sut y mae'r system sydd ar waith yn Llundain yn well na'r system sydd ar waith yma, yn enwedig o ystyried y ffaith na chafodd dau Weinidog a gyhuddwyd o gamymddygiad llawer mwy difrifol nag unrhyw Aelod o'r Llywodraeth hon yng Nghymru eu cyfeirio at y cynghorydd annibynnol yn y lle cyntaf. Yn yr achos hwnnw, beth yw diben cael cynghorydd annibynnol?

Rhaid inni gofio, wrth gwrs—a byddaf yn terfynu fy sylwadau yn y fan hon—mai mater i mi yw'r cod gweinidogol. Mae'n gywir dweud bod Gweinidogion yn atebol i'r Cynulliad ac, o ran eu perfformiad proffesiynol, i mi. Rwyf innau, yn fy nhro, yn atebol i'r Cynulliad ac, yn y pen draw, i bobl Cymru. Nid oes gennym system lle nad oes unrhyw un yn atebol mewn unrhyw ffordd. Mae cadwyn atebolrwydd clir drwy'r Cynulliad hwn ac, yn y pen draw, i bobl Cymru. Yn absenoldeb unrhyw enghreifftiau o fethiannau'r system, yn absenoldeb unrhyw awgrymiadau ynghylch pam y dylai cynghorydd annibynnol, a delir yn ôl pob tebyg, gael ei roi ar waith i ddelio â nifer eithriadol o fach o gwynion, ac yn absenoldeb unrhyw ddadl sy'n awgrymu y byddai cynghorydd annibynnol mewn sefyllfa wahanol i'r gweision sifil sy'n rhoi cyngor annibynnol imi ar hyn o bryd, ni all y Llywodraeth gefnogi'r cynnig fel y mae ar hyn o bryd. Mae digon o brosesau gwirio a chydbwysio yn y system bresennol. Nid oes unrhyw awgrym nad yw'r system bresennol yn gweithio, mewn unrhyw ffordd. Nid oes unrhyw awgrym bod y system bresennol wedi methu â darganfod unrhyw ddrwgweithredu gan Weinidogion, mewn unrhyw ffordd. Ar y sail honno, byddwn yn gwrthod y cynnig a'r gwelliant.

Aled Roberts: I thank those Members who

hynny sydd wedi cymryd rhan yn y ddadl y prynhawn yma. Rwy'n teimlo bod y ddadl hon yn berthnasol oherwydd rwy'n siŵr bod pob Aelod yn cyfaddef erbyn hyn nad yw'r ffordd y mae gwleidyddion yn cael eu gweld gan y cyhoedd wedi gwella yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf. Roedd rhaglen nos Fawrth ar Channel 4 yn dangos yn glir nad yw'r gyfundrefn newydd yn San Steffan wedi gwella'r sefyllfa yn hynny o beth.

Gwnaeth Kirsty Williams gydnabod bod y Cynulliad yn sefydliad tryloyw a bod gennym rai agweddau sy'n annibynnol, megis y comisiynydd safonau a'r Pwyllgor Safonau. Fodd bynnag, os yw pawb yn y Siambr hon yn credu hynny, dylai'r un safonau ar annibyniaeth fod yn berthnasol i'r Aelodau hynny wrth iddynt gyflawni dyletswyddau fel Gweinidogion hefyd. Mae'r gofidiau ynglŷn â'r sefyllfa bresennol, fel y dywedodd Dafydd Elis-Thomas, wedi bod yn destun trafod yn y Cynulliad o'r blaen ac yn y Pwyllgor Safonau.

Diolchaf i Andrew R.T. Davies a'r grŵp Ceidwadol. Roeddent hwy hefyd yn cwestiynu sut roedd y Prif Weinidog yn gallu cyfiawnhau'r gyfundrefn bresennol ac yn glir o'r farn y dylid cael cyfundrefn annibynnol ond hefyd yn credu—a dyna'r rheswm dros y gwelliant—bod yn rhaid cael amserlen benodol.

Dywedodd Eluned Parrott ein bod yn derbyn, wrth gymharu'r sefyllfa yng Nghymru â'r sefyllfa yn yr Alban, yn y Deyrnas Unedig ac yng Nghanaada, bod gwelliannau i'w gwneud, ac nad ydym yn credu bod safbwynt San Steffan yn un y dylid cael ei fabwysiadu yma yng Nghaerdydd. Fodd bynnag, rydym yn credu bod angen i'r Llywodraeth edrych ar y sefyllfa. Rwy'n gobeithio y bydd yn gwneud hynny hyd yn oed os nad yw'n cefnogi'r cynnig hwn heddiw. Rwyf hefyd yn credu bod y pwyntiau a wnaeth Eluned ynglŷn â'r system lobiö yn y Cynulliad yn rhywbeth sydd werth sôn amdano yn y dyfodol.

5.30 p.m.

Diolch i Leanne Wood a wnaeth sôn am egwyddorion Nolan. Rwy'n siŵr bod pob plaid sydd yma yn eu derbyn a'r ffaith y

have participated in this afternoon's debate. We feel that this debate is relevant because I am sure that every Member would now admit that the way in which politicians are regarded by the public has not improved over the past few years. There was a programme on Tuesday evening on Channel 4 that clearly demonstrated that the new regime in Westminster had not improved the situation in that regard.

Kirsty Williams acknowledged that the Assembly is a transparent institution and that we have some aspects that are independent, such as the commissioner for standards and the Standards of Conduct Committee. However, if everyone in this Chamber believes that, surely the same standards in terms of independence should relate to Members as they carry out their responsibilities as Ministers. The concerns about the current situation, as Dafydd Elis-Thomas said, have been a topic for debate in the Assembly in the past and in the Standards of Conduct Committee.

I thank Andrew R.T. Davies and the Conservative group. They also questioned the way in which the First Minister could justify the current regime and he was clear that there should be an independent system in place, but also believed—and perhaps that is the reason behind the amendment—that we must have a specific timetable.

Eluned Parrot said that we accept, in comparing the situation in Wales with situation in Scotland, the wider United Kingdom and Canada, that improvements need to be made, and that we do not believe that the practices of Westminster are the ones that should be adopted here in Cardiff. However, we believe that the Government needs to look at the situation. I hope that it will do so even if it cannot support today's motion. I also believe that the points that Eluned made on the lobbying system in the Assembly are worthy of further discussion in the future.

I thank Leanne Wood who mentioned the Nolan principles. I am sure that every party here would accept them and the fact that we

dylid gwella'r gyfundrefn drwy symud, gobeithio, yn y pen draw at gyfundrefn annibynnol. Ni ddylid derbyn y gyfundrefn bresennol. Rwy'n gofyn i'r Prif Weinidog, os nad yw'n barod i gefnogi'r cynnig hwn heddiw, i sylweddoli bod pryder gwirioneddol ymysg y gwrthbleidiau ynglŷn â'r gyfundrefn bresennol a bod yn rhaid gweithio yn drawsbleidiol yn y Cynulliad i geisio gwella'r sefyllfa. Gwnaeth Leanne ein hatgoffa hwyrach fod rôl i gomisiwn Silk yn y rhan hon os nad ydym yn symud ymlaen yn y fath fodd.

Yn ogystal, roedd Peter Black yn poeni bod cyn lleied o symud o ran y Llywodraeth ar y mater hwn. Rwy'n difaru, Brif Weinidog, nad ydych yn gallu cefnogi'r cynnig. Wrth ymateb, rydym yn cyfaddef nad yw'r sefyllfa yn San Steffan yn hollol annibynnol, ond rwy'n siŵr bod nifer o siaradwyr heddiw wedi dweud nad ceisio ail-greu'r sefyllfa yn San Steffan yr ydym. Rydym yn ceisio creu cyfundrefn sydd yn gwneud y job i Gymru. Nid wyf yn credu ei bod yn dderbyniol bod Aelodau Cynulliad unigol yn destun ymchwiliad annibynnol ond bod hynny ddim yn wir o ran Gweinidogion. Nid oes modd i ni fel Aelodau Cynulliad unigol i weld y dystiolaeth sydd yn cael ei rhoi i chi o ran barn y gweision sifil sydd yn cymryd gafael o unrhyw ymchwiliad i Weinidogion. Rhaid creu cyfundrefn yng Nghymru lle mae Gweinidogion yn atebol nid yn unig mewn etholiad, ond yn y cyfnod rhwng etholiadau hefyd. Rwy'n gobeithio, hyd yn oed os nad ydych yn pleidleisio o blaid y cynnig heddiw, y byddwch yn ail-gysidro'r sefyllfa yn y pen draw.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Y cynnig yw y dylid derbyn y cynnig heb ei ddiwygio. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Gwelaf fod. Felly, gohiriaf y pleidleisio ar yr eitem hon tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.

*Gohiriwyd y pleidleisio tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.
Voting deferred until voting time.*

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Are there three Members who wish for the bell to be rung? There are not, so we will proceed to voting time.

should improve the regime by moving, hopefully, towards an independent system in due course. We should not accept the current arrangements. I ask the First Minister, if he is not willing to support our motion today, to realise that there is real concern among the opposition parties about the current regime and that we have to work on a cross-party basis in the Assembly to try to improve the situation. Leanne reminded us that there may be a role for the Silk commission if we do not make progress here.

Peter Black also expressed concern that there was so little movement from the Government on this issue. I regret the fact, First Minister, that you are unable to support our motion. In responding, we accept that the situation in Westminster is not entirely independent, but I am sure that many of the contributors to today's debate would say that we are not trying to mirror the situation in Westminster. We are trying to create a system that will work for Wales. I do not think that it is acceptable that individual Assembly Members can be the subject of an independent review, but that that is not true of Ministers. There is no way for us as individual Assembly Members to see the evidence that is put before you regarding the opinion of the civil servants who may be progressing any inquiry into Ministers. We need to create a system in Wales whereby Ministers are accountable not only in an election but between elections also. I hope that, even if you do not vote in favour of our motion today, you will reconsider the situation in due course.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The proposal is to agree the motion without amendment. Is there any objection? I see that there is. Therefore, I defer all voting on this item until voting time.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: A oes tri Aelod sy'n dymuno i'r gloch gael ei chanu? Nid oes, felly awn ymlaen i'r cyfnod pleidleisio.

Cyfnod Pleidleisio Voting Time

*Cynnig NDM5098: O blaid 39, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 13.
Motion NDM5098: For 39, Abstain 0, Against 13.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Antoniw, Mick
Asghar, Mohammad
Burns, Angela
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davies, Alun
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Byron
Davies, Paul
Davies, Suzy
Drakeford, Mark
Evans, Rebecca
Finch-Saunders, Janet
George, Russell
Gething, Vaughan
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hedges, Mike
Hutt, Jane
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Mewies, Sandy
Millar, Darren
Morgan, Julie
Neagle, Lynne
Price, Gwyn R.
Ramsay, Nick
Rathbone, Jenny
Rees, David
Sandbach, Antoinette
Sargeant, Carl
Skates, Kenneth
Thomas, Gwenda
Watson, Joyce

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Black, Peter
Gruffydd, Llyr Huws
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Parrott, Eluned
Powell, William
Roberts, Aled
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Thomas, Simon
Whittle, Lindsay
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion agreed.*

*Cynnig NDM5099: O blaid 34, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 18.
Motion NDM5099: For 34, Abstain 0, Against 18.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Antoniw, Mick
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davies, Alun
Drakeford, Mark
Evans, Rebecca

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Asghar, Mohammad
Black, Peter
Burns, Angela
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Byron
Davies, Paul

Gething, Vaughan
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Griffiths, Lesley
 Gruffydd, Llyr Huws
 Hart, Edwina
 Hedges, Mike
 Hutt, Jane
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Lewis, Huw
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Julie
 Neagle, Lynne
 Price, Gwyn R.
 Rathbone, Jenny
 Rees, David
 Sargeant, Carl
 Skates, Kenneth
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Thomas, Simon
 Watson, Joyce
 Whittle, Lindsay
 Wood, Leanne

Davies, Suzy
 Finch-Saunders, Janet
 George, Russell
 Graham, William
 Isherwood, Mark
 Millar, Darren
 Parrott, Eluned
 Powell, William
 Ramsay, Nick
 Roberts, Aled
 Sandbach, Antoinette
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion agreed.*

*Cynnig NDM5097: O blaid 26, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 26.
 Motion NDM5097: For 26, Abstain 0, Against 26.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Asghar, Mohammad
 Black, Peter
 Burns, Angela
 Davies, Andrew R.T.
 Davies, Byron
 Davies, Paul
 Davies, Suzy
 Finch-Saunders, Janet
 George, Russell
 Graham, William
 Gruffydd, Llyr Huws
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Millar, Darren
 Parrott, Eluned
 Powell, William
 Ramsay, Nick
 Roberts, Aled
 Sandbach, Antoinette
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Thomas, Simon
 Whittle, Lindsay
 Williams, Kirsty
 Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
 Antoniw, Mick
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davies, Alun
 Drakeford, Mark
 Evans, Rebecca
 Gething, Vaughan
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Griffiths, Lesley
 Hart, Edwina
 Hedges, Mike
 Hutt, Jane
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Lewis, Huw
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Julie
 Neagle, Lynne
 Price, Gwyn R.
 Rathbone, Jenny
 Rees, David
 Sargeant, Carl
 Skates, Kenneth
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Dirprwy Lywydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.20(ii)

As there was an equality of votes, the Deputy Presiding Officer used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order No. 6.20(ii)

*Gwrthodwyd y cynnig.
Motion not agreed.*

*Gwelliant 1 i NDM5097: O blaid 26, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 26.
Amendment 1 to NDM5097: For 26, Abstain 0, Against 26.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Asghar, Mohammad
Black, Peter
Burns, Angela
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Byron
Davies, Paul
Davies, Suzy
Finch-Saunders, Janet
George, Russell
Graham, William
Gruffydd, Llyr Huws
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Millar, Darren
Parrott, Eluned
Powell, William
Ramsay, Nick
Roberts, Aled
Sandbach, Antoinette
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Thomas, Simon
Whittle, Lindsay
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Antoniw, Mick
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davies, Alun
Drakeford, Mark
Evans, Rebecca
Gething, Vaughan
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hedges, Mike
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Julie
Neagle, Lynne
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Rees, David
Sargeant, Carl
Skates, Kenneth
Thomas, Gwenda
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Dirprwy Lywydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.20(ii)

As there was an equality of votes, the Deputy Presiding Officer used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order No. 6.20(ii)

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment not agreed.*

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Daw hynny â **The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That brings thrafodion heddiw i ben. today's proceedings to a close.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.36 p.m.
The meeting ended at 5.36 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau
Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)
Antoniw, Mick (Llafur – Labour)
Asghar, Mohammad (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)

Burns, Angela (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)
 Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
 Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)
 Davies, Alun (Llafur – Labour)
 Davies, Andrew R.T. (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Davies, Byron (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Davies, Keith (Llafur – Labour)
 Davies, Paul (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Davies, Suzy (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Drakeford, Mark (Llafur – Labour)
 Elis-Thomas, Yr Arglwydd/Lord (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Evans, Rebecca (Llafur – Labour)
 Finch-Saunders, Janet (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 George, Russell (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Gething, Vaughan (Llafur – Labour)
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)
 Griffiths, Lesley (Llafur – Labour)
 Gruffydd, Llyr Huws (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)
 Hedges, Mike (Llafur – Labour)
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 James, Julie (Llafur – Labour)
 Jenkins, Bethan (Plaid Cymru Annibynnol – Independent Plaid Cymru)
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)
 Millar, Darren (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Morgan, Julie (Llafur – Labour)
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)
 Parrott, Eluned (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Powell, William (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Price, Gwyn R. (Llafur – Labour)
 Ramsay, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Rathbone, Jenny (Llafur – Labour)
 Rees, David (Llafur – Labour)
 Roberts, Aled (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Sandbach, Antoinette (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)
 Skates, Kenneth (Llafur – Labour)
 Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Thomas, Simon (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Watson, Joyce (Llafur – Labour)
 Whittle, Lindsay (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)